Antioch II

Edited by
SILKE-PETRA BERGJAN
and SUSANNA ELM

Civitatum Orbis MEditerranei Studia
3

Mohr Siebeck

Civitatum Orbis MEditerranei Studia

herausgegeben von

3

Antioch II

The Many Faces of Antioch: Intellectual Exchange and Religious Diversity, CE 350–450

edited by

Silke-Petra Bergjan
and Susanna Elm

Mohr Siebeck

Silke-Petra Bergjan, born 1962; 1992 Dr. theol. Ludwig-Maximilians-University Munich; 1999 Habilitation in Church History at the Humboldt University Berlin; since 2000 Professor of Church History (from the Early Church to the Time of Reformation) at the University of Zurich.

Susanna Elm, born 1959; 1986 D. Phil. in literae humaniores with a specialization in Ancient History, Oxford University; since 2002 Professor, since 2015 Sidney H. Ehrman Professor of History and Classics at the University of California, Berkeley; Spring 2017 Hedi-Fitz-Niggli Professor at the University of Zurich.
orcid.org/0000-0001-9306-8490

ISBN 978-3-16-155126-0 / eISBN 978-3-16-156267-9
DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-156267-9

ISSN 2196-9264 / eISSN 2569-3891 (Civitatum Orbis MEditerranei Studia)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at *http://dnb.dnb.de.*

The book was printed by Gulde Druck in Tübingen on non-aging paper and bound by Buchbinderei Spinner in Ottersweier.

Printed in Germany.

Table of Contents

Visions of Antioch Painted with Words

The Antiochenes – Creating Communities

List of Abbreviations

AASy	*Les annales archéologiques de Syrie*
ACED	*Acta conciliorum et epistolae decretales, ac constitutiones summorum pontificum*. Edited by Jean Hardouin. 11 vols. Paris: Ex typographia regia, 1714–1715
ACO	*Acta conciliorum oecumenicorum*. Edited by Eduard Schwartz. Berlin: De Gruyter, 1914ff.
AE	*L'année epígraphique*
AHR	*American Historical Review*
AIPh	*Annuaire de l'Institut de Philologie et d'Histoire Orientales (et Slaves)*
AJA	*American Journal of Archaeology*
AJP	*The American Journal of Philology*
AKG	Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte
ALW	*Archiv für Liturgiewissenschaft*
ANRW	*Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt. II. Principat.* Edited by Wolfgang Haase and Hildegard Temporini. Berlin: De Gruyter, 1.1974ff.
AOAT	Alter Orient und Altes Testament
APAW.PH	*Abhandlungen der Preußischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Philosophisch-historische Klasse*
ArKB	*Archäologisches Korrespondenzblatt*
ASEs	*Annali di storia dell'esegesi*
AuA	*Antike und Abendland*
Aug.	*Augustinianum*
AW	*Athanasius Werke*
BAH	Bibliothèque archéologique et historique
BBKL	*Biographisch-bibliographisches Kirchenlexikon*. Edited by Traugott Bautz. Nordhausen: Bautz, 1.1975ff.
BBLAK	Beiträge zur biblischen Landes- und Altertumskunde
BEFAR	Bibliothèque des Écoles Françaises d'Athènes et de Rome
BEO	*Bulletin d'études orientales de l'Institut Français de Damas*
BGBE	Beiträge zur Geschichte der biblischen Exegese
BGL	Bibliothek der griechischen Literatur
BHTh	Beiträge zur historischen Theologie
Bib	*Biblica*
BJSt	Brown Judaic Studies
BLE	*Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique*
BoJ	*Bonner Jahrbücher des Rheinischen Landesmuseums in Bonn und des Vereins von Altertumsfreunden im Rheinlande*
BSGRT	Bibliotheca scriptorum Graecorum et Romanorum Teubneriana
BSRel	Biblioteca di scienze religiose
ByA	Byzantinisches Archiv

ByS(P)	Byzantine Studies. Études byzantines (Pittsburgh)
ByZ	*Byzantinische Zeitschrift*
Byz.	*Byzantion*
CEFR	Collection de l'École Française de Rome
CFHB	Corpus fontium historiae Byzantinae
ChH	*Church History*
CIL	*Corpus inscriptionum Latinarum*
CM	*Classica et Mediaevalia*
CMG	Corpus Medicorum Graecorum
CNRS	Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique
CollLat	Collection Latomus
CP	*Classical Philology*
CQ	*The Classical Quarterly*
CRAI	*Comptes-rendus des séances de l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-Lettres*
CSCO	Corpus scriptorum Christianorum orientalium
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
CSHB	Corpus scriptorum historiae Byzantinae
CSCT	Columbia Studies in the Classical Tradition
CStS	Collected Studies Series (Variorum Reprints)
CUFr	Collection des universités de France
DOP	*Dumbarton Oaks Papers*
EeC	Études et commentaires
EnAC	Entretiens sur l'Antiquité classique de la Fondation Hardt
EpiSt	Epigraphische Studien
EThL	*Ephemerides theologicae Lovanienses*
FaCh	Fathers of the Church
FKDG	Forschungen zur Kirchen- und Dogmengeschichte
ThQ	*Theologische Quartalschrift*
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten Jahrhunderte
GCS NF	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten Jahrhunderte. Neue Folge
GOF.S	Göttinger Orientforschungen, Reihe 1: Syriaca
GRBS	*Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies*
GrTS	Grazer theologische Studien
HR	*History of Religions*
HRWG	*Handbuch religionswissenschaftlicher Grundbegriffe*. Edited by Hubert Cancik, Burkhard Gladigow and Matthias Laubscher. 5 vols. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1988–2001
HSCP	*Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*
HThR	*Harvard Theological Review*
HUTh	Hermeneutische Untersuchungen zur Theologie
IASH.P	*The Israel Academy of Sciences and Humanities: Proceedings*
IDR	*Inscripţiile Daciei Romane*. Parts 1–3/4. Bucharest: Ed. Academiei RSR, 1975–1988
IFAO	Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale
IGLS	*Inscriptions grecques et latines de la Syrie*. Edited by Louis Jalabert. Paris: Geuthner, and Beyrouth: Institut Français du Proche-Orient, 1.1929ff.

ILS	*Inscriptiones Latinae selectae*. Edited by Hermann Dessau, Berlin: Weidmann, 1892–1916
IM	*Istanbuler Mitteilungen*
JAC	*Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum*
JAC.E	Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum. Ergänzungsband
JBL	*Journal of Biblical Literature*
JdI	*Jahrbuch des (Kaiserlich) Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts*
JdI.E	Jahrbuch des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts. Ergänzungsheft
JEA	*Journal of Egyptian Archaeology*
JECS	*Journal of Early Christian Studies*
JEH	*Journal of Ecclesiastical History*
JHP	*Journal of the History of Philosophy*
JLA	*Journal of Late Antiquity*
JÖAI	*Jahreshefte des Österreichischen Archäologischen Instituts in Wien*
JRA	*Journal of Roman Archaeology*
JRS	*Journal of Roman Studies*
JSNT.S	Journal for the Study of the New Testament. Supplement Series
JThS	*Journal of Theological Studies*
KL	*Kirchen-Lexikon oder Encyklopädie der katholischen Theologie und ihrer Hilfswissenschaften*. Edited by Heinrich Joseph Wetzer and Benedikt Welte. 12 vols. Freiburg i. Br.: Herder, 1847–1860
Klio.B	Klio Beihefte. Neue Folge
LCL	The Loeb Classical Library
LWQF	Liturgiewissenschaftliche Quellen und Forschungen
MEFRA	*Mélanges de l'École Française de Rome*. Série Antiquité
MH	*Museum Helveticum*
MLJb	*Mittellateinisches Jahrbuch*
MoTh	*Modern Theology*
MThSt	Marburger theologische Studien
NPNF	*A Select Library of the Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church*. Edited by Philip Schaff. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1886–1905
NTA	Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen. Neue Folge
NT.S	Supplements to *Novum Testamentum*
NTS	*New Testament Studies*
OCA	Orientalia Christiana analecta
OCP	*Orientalia Christiana periodica*
OCT	Oxford Classical Texts
OECS	Oxford Early Christian Studies
OLA	Orientalia Lovaniensia analecta
PaP	*Past and Present. A Journal of Scientific History*
PAPS	*Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*
PatSt	Patristic Studies. Catholic University of America
PG	*Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Graeca*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. 167 vols. Paris: Migne, 1857–1866
Ph.S	Philologus. Supplementband
PL	*Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Latina*. Edited by Jacques-Paul Migne. 217 vols. Paris: Migne, 1841–1855

PLRE	*The Prosopography of the Later Roman Empire*. Edited by Arnold Hugh Martin Jones, John Robert Martindale and John Morris. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1971ff.
PMAAR	Papers and Monographs of the American Academy in Rome
PO	Patrologia orientalis
POC	*Proche-orient chrétien*
POxy	*The Oxyrhynchus Papyri*. London: Egypt Exploration Society, 1.1898ff.
PRE	*Paulys Realencyclopädie der classischen Alterthumswissenschaft*. Stuttgart: Metzler, 1894ff.
PSI	*Papiri della società italiana*
RAC	*Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum.* Edited by Theodor Klauser. Stuttgart: Hiersemann, 1.1950ff.
RAM	*Revue d'ascétique et de mystique*
RB	*Revue biblique*
RBPh	*Revue belge de philologie et d'histoire*
RE^{3}	*Realencyklopädie für protestantische Theologie und Kirche*. 3rd edition. Edited by Albert Hauck. 24 vols. Leipzig: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 1896–1913
REG	*Revue des études grecques*
RevSR	*Revue des sciences religieuses*
RPh	*Revue de philologie, de littérature et d'histoire anciennes*
RSTh	Regensburger Studien zur Theologie
SAC	Studi di antichità cristiana
SAPERE	Scripta Antiquitatis Posterioris ad Ethicam REligionemque pertinentia
SBibSt	Sources for Biblical Study
SC	Sources chrétiennes
SE	*Sacris Erudiri*
SEAug	Studia ephemeridis Augustinianum
SJLA	Studies in Judaism in Late Antiquity
SMSR	*Studi e materali di storia delle religioni*
SQAW	Schriften und Quellen der Alten Welt
STAC	Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum
StBi	Studi biblici (Brescia)
StLi	*Studia liturgica*
StPatr	*Studia Patristica*
SUC	*Schriften des Urchristentums*. Erster Teil: *Die Apostolischen Väter*. Edited by Joseph A. Fischer. Zweiter Teil: *Didache (Apostellehre), Barnabasbrief, Zweiter Klemensbrief, Schrift an Diognet*. Edited by Klaus Wengst. Darmstadt: Wissenschaftliche Buchgesellschaft, 1956–1984
SVigChr	Supplements. Vigiliae Christianae
Syr.	*Syria: Revue d'art oriental et d'archéologie*
Theoph.	Theophaneia
ThH	Théologie historique
ThZ	*Theologische Zeitschrift*. Theologische Fakultät der Universität Basel
TMCB	*Travaux et Mémoires*. Centre de Recherche d'histoire et civilisation byzantines

TPAPA	*Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association*
TSAJ	Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism
TU	Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur
TuscBü	Tusculum-Bücherei
UALG	Untersuchungen zur antiken Literatur und Geschichte
VigChr	*Vigiliae Christianae*
WdF	Wege der Forschung
ZAC	*Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum*
ZKG	*Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte*
ZNW	*Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft*
ZPE	*Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik*
ZSRG.R	*Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtsgeschichte, Romanistische Abteilung*

Introduction – The Many Faces of Antioch

Susanna Elm

Between 350 and 450, Antioch on the Orontes was, as any cursory reading of Libanius's works reveals, a flourishing metropolis.[1] The aftermath of the city's third century crisis had been mostly overcome and many of the structures then damaged had been rebuilt at least in part. Antioch's standing as imperial residence, by then already established, became preeminent from Diocletian onward, with more emperors residing in the city for longer than in all other residences combined.[2] Antioch continued to be the administrative center of the region, now the seat of the *comes Orientis* in addition to that of the *consularis Syriae*, and since the city was the staging post for successive military campaigns against the new and newly aggressive Sassanians in Persia, it also housed the highest military commander in the East, the *magister militum per Orientem*, and his staff. Antioch, always privileged thanks to its location as the gateway from the East to the Mediterranean and vice-versa to Palestine and Egypt as well as the regions between the Euphrates and the Tigris, rose to real prominence during the fourth and early fifth century, contributing to and profiting from the economic boom of its vast Syrian hinterlands.[3]

The century between 350 and 450 thus witnessed a robust revival. Antioch competed head to head with Alexandria, Milan, and Rome, outpacing the slowly rising Constantinople, and attracted courtiers, teachers, students, philosophers, and poets from everywhere and from all religious backgrounds, becoming a true magnet for the elites from all walks of life of the later

[1] The present volume assembles papers presented at a conference on Antioch held at the Kloster Kappel am Albis from July 9–12, 2014. For their indispensable contributions to this volume the editors would like to thank Samuel C. Zinsli and Clara A. Leon. The conference and this volume have been supported by the Swiss National Foundation, the University of Zurich, the Programm für Chancengleichheit of the University of Zurich, the Sidney H. Ehrman Fund, and the Department of History at the University of California at Berkeley.

[2] Expositio totius mundi et gentium 23 (SC 124, 160 Rougé).

[3] Antioch's territory was vast, comprising about 7,000 square kilometers, see Andrea U. De Giorgi, *Ancient Antioch: From the Seleucid Era to the Islamic Conquest*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016, 67–132, 172–175; Michael Decker, *Tilling the Hateful Earth: Agriculture in the Early Byzantine East*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.

Roman Empire. If there was a complete prosopography of the members of the intellectual, military, and administrative elites who we knew resided at Antioch either permanently or temporarily during that period, it would be lengthy and impressive. To name but a few, between 350 and the earthquake of 458, those living at least for some time at Antioch included the young Constantius II, the Caesar Gallus, the emperors Julian, Jovian, and Valens, historians such as Festus, Eutropius, Ammianus Marcellinus, and Theodoret of Cyrrhus, and other intellectuals such as Libanius, Aetius, Acacius, Eudoxius, Eunomius, Apollinaris, Meletius, Flavian, Paulinus, Diodore of Tarsus, John Chrysostom, Theodore of Mopsuestia, and many more. Remarkably, we possess writings, at times extensive ones, from nearly all of these men, including one of the emperors.[4] Not surprisingly, many of the most dramatic intellectual debates of the late fourth and early fifth century eastern Empire originated in Antioch or found their most intense expression there.[5]

---

[4] The writings of Libanius after his return to Antioch from Constantinople in 354 and those of John Chrysostom prior to his departure to Constantinople in 397 are particularly rich and hence central to every analysis of the city during this time. They also form the basis of the classic works on Antioch by Paul Petit, *Libanius et la vie municipale à Antioche au IV^e^ siècle après J.-C.*, BAH 62, Paris: Geuthner, 1955; André-Jean Festugière, *Antioche païenne et chrétienne: Libanius, Chrysostome et les moines de Syrie*, BEFAR 194, Paris: 1959; Glanville A. Downey, *A History of Antioch in Syria from Seleucus to the Arab Conquest*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1961; and John H. W. G. Liebeschuetz, *Antioch: City and Imperial Administration in the Later Roman Empire*, Oxford: Clarendon, 1972. See now Lieve Van Hoof (ed.), *Libanius: A Critical Introduction*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014; Rafaella Cribiore, *Libanius the Sophist: Rhetoric, Reality, and Religions in the Fourth Century*, Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2013; Jutta Tloka, *Griechische Christen – Christliche Griechen: Plausibilisierungsstrategien des antiken Christentums bei Origenes und Johannes Chrysostomos*, STAC 30, Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005; Wendy Mayer/Pauline Allen (eds.), *John Chrysostom*, New York: Routledge, 2000. See also Nicholas J. Baker-Brian/Shaun Tougher (eds.), *Emperor and Author: The Writings of Julian 'the Apostate,'* Swansea: The Classical Press of Wales, 2012; Susanna Elm, "The Letter Collection of the Emperor Julian," in Cristiana Sogno/Bradley K. Storin/Edward J. Watts (eds.), *Late Antique Letter Collections: A Critical Introduction and Reference Guide*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2017, 54–68.

[5] Dayna S. Kalleres, *City of Demons: Violence, Ritual, and Christian Power in Late Antiquity*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2015, 25–50; Christine Shepardson, *Controlling Contested Places: Late Antique Antioch and the Spatial Politics of Religious Controversy*, Berkeley/Los Angeles/London: University of California Press, 2014; Isabella Sandwell, *Religious Identity in Late Antiquity: Greeks, Jews, and Christians in Antioch*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007; Jaclyn Maxwell, *Christianization and Communication in Late Antiquity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006; Emmanuel Soler, *Le sacré et le salut à Antioche au IV^e^ siècle apr. J.-C.: Pratiques festives et comportements religieux dans le processus de christianisation de la cité*, BAH 176, Beirut: Institut français du Proche-Orient, 2006; Johannes Hahn, *Gewalt und religiöser Konflikt: Studien zu den Auseinandersetzungen zwischen Christen, Heiden und Juden im Osten des*

Antioch's relevance for the later Roman Empire as a whole, and not only for the Eastern empire, is undeniable and well-known. Nevertheless, the city in its own right has only recently once more become the focus of intense scholarly attention. In part this is due to an unusual bifurcation of our sources that has led to a corresponding bifurcation of scholarly interests. On the one hand, we have a great deal, indeed almost an overabundance, of written sources composed by Antiochene authors, a rarity in the study of the Roman world, while at the same time the material and archaeological record has been very difficult to reconstruct and interpret. As far as the latter is concerned, natural conditions such as the topography of Antioch within the alluvial plane of the Orontes river and the Amuq Valley, combined with frequent earthquakes, but also devastations due to military engagements and, further, the complexities of the region's modern history have made it difficult to reconstruct the dynamic evolution of Antioch's topography and that of its surroundings, including Daphne and Antioch's harbor Seleucia Pieria.[6] However, recent studies by Gunnar Brands, Catherine Saliou, Andrea De Giorgi, Pauline Allen and Wendy Mayer, and others, are in the process of reversing this picture, so that Christine Kondoleon's wistful subtitle, *The Lost Ancient City*, is no longer quite as apt a description as it was in 2000.[7]

Indeed, as will easily become apparent in the footnotes throughout the volume, Antioch, its archaeology, and its leading intellectuals, have seen a true renaissance in scholarship, sparked in part by the treasures presented in the exhibitions Christine Kondoleon's catalogue discussed. Somewhat paradoxically, however, the increase in scholarship combined with the enormous amount of research still required to reconstruct, on the one hand, the archaeology of Antioch and that of its vast hinterland and the connections between both, and to engage fully, on the other hand, with the formidable literary output of authors such as Libanius and John Chrysostom, encourages a splintering of

---

Römischen Reiches (von Konstantin bis Theodosius II.), Klio.B 8, Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 2004, 121–189; Bernadette Cabouret/Pierre-Louis Gatier/Catherine Saliou (eds.), *Antioche de Syrie: Histoire, images et traces de la ville antique; actes du colloque organisé à Lyon, Maison de l'Orient et de la méditerranée, 4, 5, 6 octobre 2001*, Topoi Supplément 5, Lyon/Paris: Maison de l'Orient Méditerranéen, 2004.

[6] De Giorgi, Ancient Antioch (see fn. 3), 1–33; Shepardson, Controlling Contested Places (see fn. 5), 161–162; for a list of natural and man-made disasters see Wendy Mayer/Pauline Allen, *The Churches of Antioch (300–638 CE)*, Leuven: Peeters, 2012, Table I, 262–267.

[7] Christine Kondoleon (ed.), *Antioch: The Lost Ancient City*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000; Gunnar Brands, *Antiochia in der Spätantike: Prolegomena zu einer archäologischen Stadtgeschichte*, Hans-Lietzmann-Vorlesungen 14, Berlin: De Gruyter, 2016; Catherine Saliou (ed.), *Les sources de l'histoire du paysage urbain d'Antioche sur l'Oronte: Actes des journées d'études des 20–21 septembre 2010*, Paris: Publication électronique, 2012; Mayer/Allen, Churches of Syrian Antioch (see fn. 6), 1–29.

scholarly interest into discrete communities of experts. As a consequence, potential connections, different angles of approach, and important developments in each discreet area of expertise risk falling between the intra-disciplinary cracks that separate archaeologists, historians, theologians, and literary scholars, despite their common interest in things Antiochene.

It is the aim of this volume to assemble, to the extent possible, experts on individual authors who resided and wrote in Antioch during the period in question, and experts on its topography and archaeology, with the aim of directing focus from different angles onto the city itself, examining its different facets, with the hope of gaining new insights into old questions, such as what, if anything, made Antioch distinct; whether the divisions among its diverse populations were as stark as they are often portrayed; what role the built environment played in shaping this late Roman metropolis. Gunnar Brands opens the volume with a discussion of the *status quaestionis* with regard to the city's built environment, beginning with its revitalization under Diocletian and the construction of the new imperial residence on the island in the Orontes, to then direct his focus onto the largest infrastructure program in our period, the Forum of Valens, tangible archaeologically mainly through two sophisticated drainage channels. As Brands emphasizes, the complex archaeological record shows that Valens and his city planners and architects integrated the existing urban structures, including the sports complex for the Olympic Games, into their newly built forum. They thus accommodated changing religious sensibilities. Further, Brands makes clear that even though Valens's successors undertook no project of a similar scale, Antioch continued to flourish well into the fifth century and beyond, as demonstrated by Theodosius I's renovation of the imperial residence in Daphne and Theodosius II's wall, which connected the city and its southward expansion toward Daphne, and attest to a significant growth in the urban population. In fact, Brands suggests that the period between Libanius's return to his home and the death of Theodosius II signified, from an urban planning perspective, the flourishing of the Hellenistic and imperial Antioch until the earthquake of 458.

Catherine Saliou's re-reading of Libanius' *Antiochicus*, his famous encomium, in which he presents the city and Daphne at their ideal best, adds finer grain to Brands's reconstruction. Saliou reveals that the rhetorician's carefully constructed, exquisite model of the genre nevertheless contains instances where the actual urban space penetrates the rhetorical sheen. Through descriptions of street networks, specific monuments at precise intersections, and through the almost instinctive use of local toponyms, Libanius, according to Saliou, evoked a far more concrete cityscape than has been assumed, one consciously tailored to a religiously diverse audience.

This diverse audience might be one factor in determining whether Antioch was indeed unique among its Eastern rivals and might have contributed to its

fame as the *Orientis apex pulcher*, to use the words of Ammianus Marcellinus.[8] Antioch, as Brands suggests, was densely populated, a density that only increased during our period. It is well known that this densely packed population was characterized by numerous different affiliations and allegiances, including different religious affiliations and allegiances. In fact, Antioch's history has often been told through the tensions between these groups.[9] However, and this is an important observation emerging from the contributions to this volume, until the early 450s, life in Antioch was characterized by successful coexistence.[10] Even in times where severe stressors such as food shortages, political purges, or spikes in taxation exacerbated tensions, actual violence was exceedingly rare.[11]

One aspect that may have fostered such relatively peaceful coexistence, so Brands and Saliou, may well have been a built environment that consciously or accidentally neutralized or accommodated religious diversity.[12] Johannes Hahn's discussion of the Olympic Games corroborates the suggestion that the built environment did indeed facilitate coexistence, even if, on occasion, as an unintended consequence. Hahn argues that Diocletian's expansion of the Olympic Games to include Daphne, and hence the sanctuary of Apollo, contributed to their long survival, because this move separated the games from a specific site, Antioch, and thus from the dominant religious connotation of

---

[8] Ammianus Marcellinus, Res gestae 22,9,14 (LCL 315, 293 Rolfe).

[9] Kalleres, City of Demons (see fn. 5); Shepardson, Controlling Contested Places (see fn. 5); Hahn, Gewalt (see fn. 5), 161–171; Hanns-Christof Brennecke, *Studien zur Geschichte der Homöer: Der Osten bis zum Ende der homöischen Reichskirche*, BHTh 73, Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1988, 87–157, with further bibliography.

[10] An observation borne out by recent scholarship, though it is important to keep in mind the many different ways to read such coexistence, see Peter Van Nuffelen, "Not the Last Pagan: Libanius between Elite Rhetoric and Religion," and Jan R. Stenger, "Libanius and the 'Game' of Hellenism," in Van Hoof, Libanius (see fn. 4), 293–314 and 268–292; Lieve Van Hoof/Peter Van Nuffelen, "Monarchy and Mass Communication: Antioch AD 362/3 Revisited," *JRS* 101 (2011), 166–184; Hahn, Gewalt (see fn. 5), 119; Sandwell, Religious Identity (see fn. 5), 137–139.

[11] For a discussion of the food shortages in 362 see e.g. Hans-Ulrich Wiemer, *Libanius und Julian: Studien zum Verhältnis von Rhetorik und Politik im 4. Jahrhundert n. Chr.*, Munich: Beck, 1995, 260–340; on the treason trials see Kelly in this volume (below, pp. 137–162) and Noel E. Lenski, *Failure of Empire: Valens and the Roman State in the Fourth Century A.D.*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002, 218–234, and on the riot of the statues see e.g. Hartmut Leppin, "Steuern, Aufstand und Rhetoren," in Hartwin Brandt (ed.), *Gedeutete Realität: Krisen, Wirklichkeiten, Interpretationen (3.–6. Jh. n. Chr.)*, Historia Einzelschriften 134, Stuttgart: Steiner, 1999, 103–123; and Pierre-Louis Malosse, "Comment arrêter un massacre: Une leçon de rhétorique appliquée (Libanius, Discours XIX)," *REG* 120 (2007), 107–141.

[12] It is worth noting in this context that there are no traces of monasteries within the city of Antioch itself; Hahn, Gewalt (see fn. 5), 152–156, esp. n. 144.

that site, Zeus. As a consequence, the games became an increasingly civic form of entertainment, one of enormous and enduring popularity.[13] Their long *durée* was further fostered, however, by their specific combination of the local and the imperial. Emperors and their representatives, well into the sixth century, sponsored Antioch's Olympic Games, eventually re-"Christened" Heraclean games, to showcase their regional and supra-regional interests.[14]

Indeed, Antioch's role as an imperial and thus military and frontier city cannot be overestimated, even if from the Theodosian dynasty onward emperors ceased to reside there. Interestingly, most of our written sources linger on the consequences of such sustained imperial presence only occasionally. However, as the contributions of Jorit Wintjes, Claudia Tiersch, Gavin Kelly, and Susanna Elm suggest, the frequent presence of the emperor and his court may well have contributed to the overall cohesion of Antioch's citizens, as they reacted to both the positive and the negative consequences of this presence. On the one hand, as Wintjes shows, the emperor, his court, and his military provided significant economic opportunities for the city, its hinterland, and its harbor, rarely mentioned in our sources, and manifold occasions to access the imperial power directly.[15] On the other hand, recurrent and occasionally heavy-handed imperial attempts to interfere in Antioch's local affairs elicited a spirit of resistance and independent debate which crossed many other potential divides and appears to have soldered the city together. This is shown by Tiersch's discussion of Julian's Antiochene sojourn, Kelly's analysis of Ammianus's conspicuous silence regarding Valens's stay, and Elm's description of attitudes toward a potential retaliatory move against Persia after emperor Julian's defeat, reflected in the writings of Libanius, Gregory of Nazianzus, Eutropius, and Festus. In sum, despite significant and sustained imperial impact, the citizens of Antioch formed much of their city, its built environment included, according to their own notions, thus forcing the emperors and their representatives to read the temperature of the citizens as

[13] Fritz Graf, *Roman Festivals in the Greek East: From the Early Empire to the Middle Byzantine Era*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015, 128–146, and 219–225, also highlights the longevity of other festivals celebrated at Antioch.

[14] Palladius Monachus, Dialogus de vita Joannis Chrysostomi 16,102 (SC 431, 312 Malingrey/LeClerq).

[15] For example, only Joannes Malalas, Chronicon 12,38 (Ioannis Malalae chronographia ex recensione Ludovici Dindorfi [Bonn: Weber, 1831], 307) and the Notitia dignitatum, oriens 11,18 (ed. Otto Seeck, *Notitia dignitatum: Accedunt Notitia urbis Constantinopolitarum et laterculi provinciarum*, Berlin: Weidmann, 1876, 32) mention that Antioch from the time of Diocletian onward housed important facilities for the production of weapons and military equipment.

accurately as possible and to communicate their wishes well if they wanted their impact to be more than ephemeral.[16]

While the contributions in the first two sections of the volume center on the topography of Antioch, Daphne, and Seleucia Pieria and their importance as imperial residence and Roman frontier city vis-à-vis Persia, those in section three more specifically address the literary creation of various vistas of Antioch, that is, the ongoing literary contest over the symbolic significance of Antioch and its monuments, designed to persuade each author's particular audience to see Antioch, and hence themselves, in a specific manner. As these contributions show, however, the focus on the city as the central player reveals the extent of the communalities shared by our authors, despite the agonistic character of their rhetoric. Thus Jan Stenger's comparison of Libanius's presentation of the sanctuary of Apollo in Daphne in his *Monody*, under the direct impact of emperor Julian's demise, with John Chrysostom's point by point rebuttal of that very *Monody* showcases a direct and ongoing dialogue: without Libanius's insistence that the fate of the Apollo sanctuary presaged Julian's death, Chrysostom's insistence that it instead represented Christian triumph – at a time when Libanius regained his position as an influential Antiochene voice – loses much of its argumentative power. Edward Watts's focus on the same time period, Libanius's resurgence as a public voice late in his life, paints the picture of Antioch as seen from a generational perspective, in this case as not a city for old men.

Regardless of religious or other affiliations, an old man's city is no longer the playing field of a man in the prime of his life. Though located within the same physical space, children, the young, the old, men, women, slaves, and free inhabit and hence see the city differently. As Watts shows, the seventy-year-old Libanius knew this perfectly well and strove to break out of the Antioch where old men were confined, a city he liked far less than the one he knew in his prime.

Christine Shepardson instead draws our attention to the fact that old and young bodies were not the only ones that populated and hence viewed ancient cities in their own distinct way: ancient cities were also home to "the stone and bronze crowd."[17] Shepardson illustrates how distinct groups envisioned the city by demonstrating how Antiochene authors, emperor Julian included, sought to direct religious devotion to special bodies, better bodies, such as the statues of the gods, the sanctified bodies of martyrs, and the extraordinary bodies of ascetics still among the living. In the contribution concluding this section, Blake Leyerle returns to the topic engaged at the outset by Jan

[16] De Giorgi, Ancient Antioch (see fn. 3), 171; Van Hoof/Van Nuffelen, Monarchy and Mass Communication (see fn. 10), 166–184.

[17] Peter Stewart, *Statues in Roman Society: Representation and Response*, New York: Oxford University Press, 2003, 118.

Stenger, the exquisite rhetorical techniques employed by Libanius and John Chrysostom to create distinct visual impressions of their shared city in direct response to each other.[18] While Libanius, in high style, paints the picture of an Antioch of the leisure class enjoying luxury in their glowing, bustling, cosmopolitan, and sophisticated city and its corresponding suburb, John Chrysostom, in equally sophisticated style, creates *arte povera*, rebuffing Libanius's vision of Antioch to produce instead verbal sketches which force the eye to see a city often overlooked, that of the destitute, the beggars, and those staggering under their obligations; a tale of two cities in the physical space of one Antioch.

Section 4 focuses on the various communities which drew such distinct vistas of the city, showcasing how the authors of our sources sought to create and foster these communities. First, Jaclyn Maxwell recovers the voices of those whose city John Chrysostom painted, that is, his attempts (and those of Libanius) "to speak in the voice of ordinary Antiochenes."[19] Maxwell, complementing Leyerle, shows that both authors, despite significant differences, painted a portrait of the poor and the workers as agents in their own right, engaged in debating the role of government, the laws, economic conditions, and the chores of everyday life in very similar ways, quite independently of religious distinction. Rudolf Brändle's article equally highlights the communalities of Antioch's many inhabitants as the foil against which to read John Chrysostom's eight sermons *Adversus Judaeos*, dating to 386/387. As Brändle emphasizes, Jewish customs and religious views were highly attractive to many in Antioch and the general popularity of festivals, including those with religious connotations, applied to Passover as well as the Olympic Games. It is such common practices and exchanges John sought to dissolve and separate with much rhetorical violence, but apparently little immediate success, as also indicated, so Brändle, by the anonymous compiler of the *Apostolic Constitutions*, the text central to Adam Schor's contribution. As Schor convincingly argues, the compiler of the *Apostolic Constitutions*, which should be read with Antioch specifically in mind, created a deliberately anachronistic and hence aspirational image of the way in which a relatively new community in the city should comport itself, that of ordinary Christian clergy. Using techniques analogous to those found, for example, in the *Palestinian Talmud*, the compiler sought to train and organize the clergy as a distinct and disciplined group of experts within a highly competitive environment of different Christian leaders.

---

[18] Henri Lefebvre, *The Production of Space*, trans. Donald Nicholson-Smith, Oxford: Blackwell, 1991, 73.

[19] Jaclyn Maxwell, "The Voices of the People of Antioch in John Chrysostom's Sermons and Libanius's Orations," in this volume, below, pp. 281–296, at 281.

Techniques to create and cement community cohesion are also the focus of Yannis Papadogiannakis's discussion of John Chrysostom's skillful use of the emotions of fear and awe, but also of enthusiasm, joy, and compassion, emotions for which Chrysostom developed finely nuanced scripts in his various sermons which provided his audience with new ways to visualize their neighbors, especially those less fortunate. Papadogiannakis thus illustrates the ways in which John Chrysostom molded emotions anew, so that his audience could also experience their city as a new one, no longer as the classic *politeia* united through euergetism, but as a Christian city shaped by pity and compassion. Addressing some of the very same texts, Wendy Mayer emphasizes the extent to which this project, the use of emotions and other means to guide the soul to create new Christian citizens in a new Christian city through a new Christian *paideia*, is rooted in the very *paideia* it seeks to overturn, namely a particular practice of diagnosing and curing inflictions of the soul. Mayer points out that John Chrysostom shares this particular view of human psychology and his role as its therapist with Libanius and Theodoret to conclude that this represents a quintessentially Antiochene form of Late Antique *paideia* common to all three of its sons, whether Christian or not.

Silke-Petra Bergjan likewise sketches the contours of a specifically Antiochene way of creating distinct community through processes of competition and confrontation. She takes her cue from and deconstructs the account Theodoret and other fifth-century Church historians presented of the crucial schism of the Nicene Christians at Antioch in the fourth century.[20] By situating the schism firmly in its Antiochene context and by reassessing the role of the so-called *Tomus ad Antiochenos* found under the writings of Athanasius of Alexandria, Bergjan shows that the split emerged out of a history of peaceful coexistence and was caused primarily by disagreements over church order at a time when the situation of the Christian communities in Antioch was still entirely in flux.

Antioch on the Orontes was a unique late Roman metropolis. Our literary sources leave no doubt about the city's – and hence their own – distinction. The degree to which Antioch was distinct from or, rather, representative of other late Roman *metropoleis* is harder to ascertain from a modern, scholarly perspective in the absence of comparable sources from other cities. Yet, it seems fair to conclude that Antioch's location as the gateway to the East, its corresponding relevance as a military center and an imperial residence, and the self-confidence of its wealthy and well-connected inhabitants, both permanent and temporary, gave it a special character. To be an Antiochian, a citizen of this metropolis, provided a self-confidence leading to cohesion that often overrode the many different ways of being Antiochene. Though the city

[20] Theodoretus Cyrrhensis, Historia ecclesiastica 5,35,3–4 (GCS, 337,19–338,3 Parmentier/Hansen).

offered many faces to its inhabitants, rich and poor, old and young, Christian of different stripes, and all those of other religious persuasions, these many faces merged, ultimately, into one, that of Antioch, the *apex pulcher* of the East. Antioch was able to integrate many contested views of the city and hence permitted its inhabitants, in all their diversity, means for a largely peaceful coexistence. The built environment fostered such cohesion and may well have been designed with it in mind; it is important to note, in this context, that Christian monasteries emerged in the surrounding countryside rather than in the city itself, thus presumably reducing the presence of potential flashpoints. As the contributions in this volume suggest, a distinct Antiochene matrix of civic pride and cohesion permitted the coexistence of competition and diversity among Antioch's citizens, which allowed the city to flourish well beyond the end of the fifth century.

Index of Sources

Anonymous writings are classified unter their titles, pseudonymous writings under (or at the end of) their pseudonyms.

Bible

Qumran and Rabbinic Literature

Ancient Authors and Writings

Imperial Codes and Synodal Acts

Inscriptions and Papyri

Index of Subjects

For entries on ancient authors, compare also the Index of Sources.