

OLIVER B. LANGWORTHY

Gregory of Nazianzus'
Soteriological
Pneumatology

*Studien und Texte zu
Antike und Christentum*

Mohr Siebeck

Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum
Studies and Texts in Antiquity and Christianity

Herausgeber/Editors

CHRISTOPH MARKSCHIES (Berlin) · MARTIN WALLRAFF (München)
CHRISTIAN WILDBERG (Pittsburgh)

Beirat/Advisory Board

PETER BROWN (Princeton) · SUSANNA ELM (Berkeley)
JOHANNES HAHN (Münster) · EMANUELA PRINZIVALLI (Rom)
JÖRG RÜPKE (Erfurt)

117



Oliver B. Langworthy

Gregory of Nazianzus'
Soteriological Pneumatology

Mohr Siebeck

Oliver B. Langworthy, born 1988; 2010 MTheol (Hons); 2012 MLitt; 2016 PhD in Historical Theology from the University of St Andrews; since 2017 Associate Lecturer in the School of Divinity at the University of St Andrews.
orcid.org/0000-0002-9382-0600

ISBN 978-3-16-158951-5 / eISBN 978-3-16-158952-2

DOI 10.1628 / 978-3-16-158952-2

ISSN 1436-3003 / eISSN 2568-7433 (Studien und Texte zu Antike und Christentum)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.dnb.de>.

© 2019 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany. www.mohrsiebeck.com

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was printed on non-aging paper by Laupp & Göbel in Gomaringen and bound by Buchbinderei Nädele in Nehren.

Printed in Germany.

Preface

This book argues that soteriological operation of the Holy Spirit, or soteriological pneumatology, of Gregory of Nazianzus is a coherent, essential, but underexamined area of his thought. Gregory's soteriological pneumatology is surprisingly absent from scholarship, particularly in light of a resurgent interest in pneumatology, and in Gregory's use of *θέωσις*. A few authors in the vanguard, particularly Christopher Beeley, pointed towards the problem: Gregory's theology depends on his commitment to the divinity and action of the Spirit. The desire to better understand this commitment formed the impetus for the present study, which was submitted as a doctoral dissertation at the University of St Andrews in 2016. Questions of the context, technical language, and development of Gregory's soteriological pneumatology presented a fascinating thread that ran throughout his career, touching on innumerable other areas and colouring his engagement with both friends and enemies. The depth of his investment in the experience of the process of salvation, realised by and in the individual with the Spirit, was at its clearest when Gregory rejected illustrations and an economy of language to declare "God the Spirit," but also shone through in Gregory's self-expression of how he came to be who and what he was. By recovering Gregory's emphasis on a "truly holy" Spirit, operative in the perfection of the believer, and examining it in detail, I hope that this book will contribute, in some way, to the ongoing discussion on the depth of meaning to be found in *θέωσις*, and even more so to the place of the Holy Spirit as a subject of primary theological reflection.

I would not have been able to complete this work without the toleration and guidance of, particularly, Prof Mark Elliott, Prof Ivor Davidson, and Dr Rebecca Langworthy. Each in their own way contributed invaluable insight and support and without whom I would never have had the chance to pursue these questions. I am exceedingly grateful to Dr Rebekah Dyer and Dr Terry Wright for their assistance with proofreading and indexing. Finally, I would like to extend my thanks to those at Mohr Siebeck who helped guide this volume from a doctoral dissertation to a monograph. I owe great thanks to all these people, and to many more, but I alone lay claim to any mistakes.

Oliver B. Langworthy, Kirkton of Largo, 2019

Table of Contents

Preface	V
Abbreviations	XI
Chronology	XI
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Salvation and the Spirit in the Fourth Century	14
<i>A. Mind and the Trinity</i>	14
I. Monarchy and Creation	15
II. Movement and Identity	19
III. Knowledge and the Spirit	23
<i>B. Trajectories in the Fourth Century</i>	27
I. Soteriological Pneumatologies	27
1. Marcellus of Ancyra	29
2. Cyril of Jerusalem	33
3. Athanasius of Alexandria	37
4. Didymus and a Contemporary Spirit	41
II. Conclusion	44
Chapter 2: Salvation and the Spirit Between Athens and Nazianzus	46
<i>A. Early Metaphors for Salvation</i>	46
I. Assessing Metaphor in Gregory	46
II. Language and the Individual	50
III. Language and the Community	54

<i>B. Questioning Technical Language</i>	59
I. Bounding Θεώσις	59
II. Conclusion.....	67
Chapter 3: Salvation and the Spirit in Gregory and Basil’s Divisions	69
<i>A. Issues at Stake between Basil and Gregory</i>	69
I. Audience and Tension	69
1. Relevance of the Spirit	72
2. Gregory’s Commitment to Basil.....	74
<i>B. Before “God the Spirit”</i>	75
I. Fear of the Spirit.....	75
II. Bonds of the Spirit	78
III. Teachings of the Spirit	81
<i>C. A Divine Spirit</i>	87
I. Declaring the Spirit God	87
II. Basil on the Spirit.....	88
III. Dispute with Basil	91
<i>D. Mediation Between Christ and the Spirit</i>	95
I. The Spirit in Gregory the Elder and Julian the Tax-Collector	95
II. Conclusion.....	96
Chapter 4: Salvation and the Spirit in the Perfect Temple	99
<i>A. The Church in Gregory’s Early Constantinople Orations</i>	99
I. Approaching Constantinople.....	99
1. Seeking Salvation in Luke 19:9	102
2. Living Temples	103
II. Peace in the Temple	106
<i>B. Deification, Harmony, and the Spirit</i>	109
I. Hierarchy and the Believer	109
II. Equality in Authority	114

<i>C. Salvation in Christ and the Spirit</i>	118
I. The Agency of the Spirit	118
II. The Life of Christ as Context	123
III. Interrogating the Golden Chain	130
IV. Conclusion	132
 Chapter 5: Salvation and the Spirit in Essence.....	 134
<i>A. Holiness and the Spirit</i>	134
I. The Holy Spirit is Truly Holy	134
II. Knowledge as Sealed and Secure	141
<i>B. Reflecting on Himself and on Basil's The Holy Spirit</i>	146
I. The Spirit as Agent in the Self-Representational Poems	146
II. The Spirit as Inaugurator	147
III. The Spirit as Jailor	150
IV. The Spirit as Guide	152
<i>C. The Spirit as Glorifier, Illuminator, Purifier, Deifier, but not Saviour</i> ..	156
I. The Spirit as the Agent of Human Good	156
II. Vindicating Basil's Soteriological Pneumatology	159
 Conclusion.....	 162
 Bibliography	 167
Index of References.....	177
Subject Index	184

Abbreviations

Primary Sources

Athanasius of Alexandria

Ep. Serap. *Epistulae ad Serapionem* (Letters to Serapion)

Gent. *Contra gentes* (Against the Gentiles)

Inc. *De incarnatione verbi* (On the Incarnation)

Or. c. Ar. *Orationes contra Arianos* (Against the Arians)

Cyril of Jerusalem

Cat. *Catecheses ad illuminandos* (Catechetical Lectures)

M. Cat. *Mystagogiae* (Mystagogic Catechesis)

Didymus of Alexandria

Spir. *De Spiritu Sancto* (On the Holy Spirit)

Trin. *De Trinitate* (On the Trinity)

Gregory of Nazianzus

Carm. *Carmen* (Poem)

DVS *De vita sua* (On his own life)

DRS *De rebus suis* (On his own affairs)

Ep. *Epistula* (Letter)

Or. *Oratio* (Oration)

Gregory Thaumaturgus

Pan. *In Origenem oratio panegyrica* (Panegyric for Origen)

Gregory the Presbyter

Vita *Vita Sancti Gregorii* (The Life of Saint Gregory)

Marcellus of Ancyra

Ast. *Contra Asterius* (Against Asterius)

Fr. *Fragmenta* (Fragment)

Inc. Ar. *De incarnatione et contra Arianos* (On the Incarnation Against the Arians)

Basil of Caesarea

Hom. *Homilia* (Homily)

DSS *De Spiritu Sancto* (On the Holy Spirit)

Secondary Sources

<i>ACO</i>	<i>Acta concilliorum oecumenicorum</i>
<i>ANF</i>	<i>The Ante-Nicene Fathers</i>
CCSG	Corpus Christianorum: Series graeca
FC	Fathers of the Church
<i>JSNTSup</i>	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement
<i>NPNF</i>	<i>The Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers</i>
<i>PG</i>	<i>Patrologia graeca</i>
PGL	Patristic Greek Lexicon
SC	Sources chrétiennes
StPatr	Studia patristica
<i>VC</i>	<i>Vigiliae christianae</i>

Chronology

	325	Council of Nicaea
Chapter 1	329–330	Gregory of Nazianzus is born.
	336	Marcellus of Ancyra, <i>Ast.</i>
	351	Cyril of Jerusalem, <i>Cats.</i> 16–17
Chapter 2	359–360	Athanasius of Alexandria, <i>Ep. Serap.</i>
	361	<i>Ep.</i> 6
	362	Gregory ordained. <i>Ors.</i> 1–3
	362–363	<i>Ors.</i> 4–5, 6
	368	<i>Or.</i> 14
Chapter 3	371	<i>Ors.</i> 7–8
	372	Gregory made bishop of Sasima.
	372–373	<i>Ors.</i> 9–12
	373	<i>Ep.</i> 45; <i>Or.</i> 13; Basil of Caesarea, <i>Hom.</i> 15; <i>Ep.</i> 58
	374	<i>Ors.</i> 18–19
Chapter 4	379	Gregory made bishop of Constantinople.
	380	<i>Ors.</i> 21–22, 24, 30, 32, 34, 29–31, 41
Chapter 5	380–381	<i>Ors.</i> 25–26, 37, 38–40.
	381	Council of Constantinople <i>Carms.</i> 2.1.1, 2.1.11. <i>Or.</i> 42 <i>Or.</i> 43
	390	Gregory of Nazianzus dies.

Introduction

Gregory of Nazianzus' contributions to the doctrine of the Spirit are among the most significant of any Christian theologian. Along with his fellow Cappadocians, Basil of Caesarea and Gregory of Nyssa, he is regarded as having been formative in the Trinitarian debates of the fourth century C.E.¹ In later reception, he is seen as a pivotal figure in the debate over the divinity of the Holy Spirit. Alone among the florilegia on the nature of Christ in the *Address to Marcion*, appended to the acts of the Council of Chalcedon, he is given the honorific "the Theologian."² With his works having circulated widely among the Byzantines, his coining of *θέωσις* and widespread adaptation of earlier deification terminology established the language around which Eastern soteriology would come to be organised.³ These Trinitarian, pneumatological, and soteriological developments have been understood as closely related on the basis of Gregory's own question: "If [the Spirit] is ranked with me, how can he make me God, or unite me to the Godhead?"⁴ Despite this close association between the Spirit and salvation, their interrelationship has received little sustained attention. Many studies relegate Gregory's contributions to footnotes or cast him only as a contributor to a broadly-defined Cappadocian theology, often exemplified by Basil of Caesarea. Those that recognise Gregory's contributions have largely studied the relationship between Spirit and salvation – his soteriological pneumatology – only as part of Gregory's larger

¹ All dates, unless otherwise noted, are C.E.

² Richard Price et al., trans, *The Acts of the Council of Chalcedon*, vol. 3 (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2005), 117. See also Oliver Langworthy, "Theodoret's Theologian: Assessing the Origin and Significance of Gregory of Nazianzus' Title," *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 70, no. 3 (2019), 455–71.

³ On Gregory's reception into Byzantine hymnography see Bogdan G. Bucur et al, "Gregory Nazianzen's Reading of Habbakuk 3:2 and Its Reception: A Lesson From Byzantine Scripture Exegesis," *Pro Ecclesia* 20, no. 1 (2011): 87.

⁴ *Or.* 31.4. SC 250, 282. Εἰ τέτακται μετ' ἐμοῦ, πῶς ἐμὲ ποιεῖ Θεόν, ἢ πῶς συνάπτει θεότητι; Quotations will include English and Greek with a reference to the relevant version of the Greek text. Where third party translations have been used, such as in clarifying disputed language or where good translations already exist, the translators are noted. Subsequent references to primary sources will not include the Greek unless necessary for comprehension.

“Trinitarian project.”⁵ This soteriological pneumatology has particularly been read in light of his Christology, leading to the summation of Gregory’s soteriological pneumatology as “[w]hat Christ accomplishes universally, the Spirit perfects particularly.”⁶ This project does not seek to overturn this consensus view of the Spirit’s activity in salvation, following as it does from Gregory’s own assertion that the “order of theology [τάξις θεολογίας]” is best adhered to: the progressive revelation of God clearly and the Son obscurely in the Hebrew Bible, Christ and the intimation of the Spirit in the New Testament, and “now” the indwelling of the Spirit.⁷ However, this project does seek to address a gap in the literature that has resulted from Gregory’s soteriological pneumatology having been studied only as part of his Trinitarian project or without reference to context and chronology. While it is not appropriate to completely separate the persons of the Trinity in Gregory’s thought, it is necessary to recognise that the Gregory of 381 who argued for adherence to the “order of theology” was himself a product of reflection and debate in an ongoing “now” of the revealed Spirit. While it was never his sole focus, the place of the Spirit in salvation is found throughout Gregory’s corpus, acting as a touchstone for reflections on broader themes throughout the course of his life, alongside and integral to his defence of the Trinity and the divinity of Christ.⁸ A consideration of the historical context of Gregory’s early life, his family, and its historical context is therefore instructive.

⁵ The phrase “soteriological pneumatology” is being used here to encompass a number of ideas expressed by deification language such as *θεωσις*, or, as in Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen’s *One With God: Salvation as Deification and Justification* (Collegeville: Unitas, 2003), 32 “pneumatological soteriology.” The intent is to highlight Gregory’s attribution of saving activity to the Spirit in essence, rather than as a requirement of an abstract theology. It originates in Robert P. Menzies, *The Development of Early Christian Pneumatology with Special Reference to Luke-Acts*, *JSNTSup* 54 (Sheffield: JSOT Press, 1991), 283, where it is used to express the “soteriological dimension of the Spirit’s activity.”

⁶ This version of the formulation derives from Donald Winslow, *The Dynamics of Salvation: A Study in Gregory of Nazianus* (Cambridge: The Philadelphia Patristics Foundation, 1979), 129. Others are to be found in Vladimir Lossky, “Redemption and Deification,” in *In the Image and Likeness of God* (Crestwood: St Vladimir’s Seminary Press, 1974), 55; and Christopher Beeley, *Gregory of Nazianus on the Trinity and the Knowledge of God: In Your Light We Shall See Light* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 178. See also Gregory Hillis, “Pneumatology and Soteriology according to Gregory of Nazianus and Cyril of Alexandria,” *StPatr* 67 (2013), 189–90 for a further recapitulation of this idea, based on Winslow and Beeley.

⁷ *Or.* 31.27. SC 250, 328.

⁸ The following makes mention of those works which will be the subject of this project. For a more comprehensive, but relatively compact, account of the place of all Gregory’s works in his life and their context see Beeley, *Knowledge*, 3–62.

Gregory of Nazianzus was born to an aristocratic family of landowners at Arianzus in Cappadocia around 330.⁹ The moment into which Gregory was born was marked by the end of the Diocletian persecution in 311, the legalisation of Christianity in 313, and the Council of Nicaea in 325. It was a time of ascendancy for Christianity, broadly understood.¹⁰ This had direct consequences on his family when his father, Gregory the Elder, was converted to Christianity by his wife Nonna.¹¹ Gregory the Elder and Nonna were wealthy, with the former having been a member of the local Hyspistarian Jewish-pagan sect and most probably a member of the aristocracy.¹² Gregory the Elder exerted both temporal and spiritual authority on a diverse community, and the effects of this were apparent in a son who enjoyed the privileges of an expansive education. The young Gregory was tutored in grammar at Nazianzus, before continuing his studies in Caesarea Mazica in Cappadocia, and expanding into philosophy and rhetoric in Caesarea Maritima in Palestine.¹³ After two years there, he spent a further ten in Athens pursuing an education in rhetoric alongside Basil.¹⁴ Gregory departed shortly after his contemporary, and was called by his father to be ordained and to assist him in the management of the see in the face of schism.¹⁵

If the historical moment of Gregory's birth was defined by the growth of Christianity with its legalisation under Constantine I and the convocation of the Council of Nicaea, his youth and the beginning of his manhood were similarly defined by the ascent of Constantius II as first Caesar, then Augustus in the East, and finally sole emperor until his death in 361. Constantius

⁹ There is an excellent biography of Gregory of Nazianzus, which deals thoroughly with Gregory's life, in the form of McGuckin's intellectual biography. It deals more completely with Gregory's life than the short biographies that preface most works on Gregory, including this one. See John McGuckin, *Gregory of Nazianzus: An Intellectual Biography* (New York: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 2001), 1–83 for Gregory's early life. See also Gregory the Presbyter, *Vita Sancti Gregorii Theologi*, 2, in CCSG 44 *Corpus Nazianzenum* 11 (Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2001), 123.

¹⁰ Martin Wallraff, *Sonnenkönig der Spätantike: die Religionspolitik Konstantins des Großen* (Freiburg: Herder, 2013), 135.

¹¹ *Carm.* 2.1.11.55–58. Carolinne White, trans. and ed., *Gregory of Nazianzus: Autobiographical Poems*, Cambridge Medieval Classics 11 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 14. Closer analysis of *De Vita Sua*, the principle source of biographical detail on Gregory's life, will be reserved to later chapters alongside contemporary works.

¹² Debate over the social status of all the Cappadocian Fathers has been ongoing. See in particular Thomas Kopecek, "The Social Class of the Cappadocian Fathers," *Church History* 42:4 (1973), 453–66; Ernst Kirsten, "Cappadocia," *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*, 2:861–91; Stanislas Giet, "Basile, était-il Sénateur," *Revue d'Histoire Ecclésiastique* 60 (1965): 429–44.

¹³ *Vita*, 3.

¹⁴ *Carm.* 2.1.11.211–22.

¹⁵ *Carm.* 2.1.11.345.

II's support of Arian Christianity had a further role in shaping Gregory's early adulthood.¹⁶ The cause for the schism within his father's church, and thus the need for Gregory's summoning and ordination, was Gregory the Elder's apparent acceptance of an Arian doctrine of the Trinity.¹⁷ Gregory initially fled his father's call, and spent time with Basil in the latter's monastic community before returning to Nazianzus, where he reluctantly took up his place as an ordained priest in his father's episcopacy.¹⁸ Although Gregory's interest in the action of the Spirit is often located later, in his episcopal orations, it is in reflecting on this period of his life (in 361 and after his ordination) that he first began to write about the guidance of the Spirit and the deification of Basil's monks.¹⁹ The Spirit as guide to Christ and agent of renewal is apparent throughout his earliest orations on Easter and in defence of his flight from ordination in 362.²⁰ The same implicit interest in salvation and deification is found in those works that are the highlight of this period of his life, *Ors.* 4 and 5, delivered in 362 to 363. The impact of the wider historical context on Gregory's life did not end with the reign of Constantius II, and nor did the schism in Gregory's church that the former emperor's support for Arianism occasioned. Even as Gregory was still attempting to quell discontent in his father's see, he was directly contending with Constantius II's pagan convert successor, Julian, in *Ors.* 4 and 5. *Or.* 4 has received extensive attention for Gregory's coining of $\theta\acute{\epsilon}\omega\sigma\iota\varsigma$, but is itself a product of his reflection on how the place of the Spirit in the believer's salvation is worked out in the Christian life.²¹ This ongoing reflection can be seen in the final years of Gregory's first tenure at Nazianzus, in his *Ors.* 14, 7, and 8 in the period between 363 and 370. During this time, he was responsible for a see troubled by famine and disaster, and was himself beset by the deaths of his brother and sister.²² The death of Julian in 363 did not occasion an end to the political, social, and religious turmoil that impacted Gregory's life so strongly. The ascent of Valens brought an end to Julian's pagan revivalism but also continued imperial support for Arianism.

The intellectual groundwork of Gregory's soteriological pneumatology was laid out in this early period; but it began to flourish after his ordination to

¹⁶ See especially Hanns Christof Brennecke, *Ecclesia est in re publica* (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2007), 52–54 on the theological situation around Constantius II.

¹⁷ McGuckin, *Intellectual Biography*, 107–9.

¹⁸ *Carm.* 2.1.11.351–53.

¹⁹ *Ep.* 6.3–4.

²⁰ *Or.* 1.2; *Or.* 2.7.

²¹ For developed treatments of the context of this oration, see Jean Bernardi, *Grégoire de Nazianze, Discours 4–5* (SC 309); Alois Kurmann, *Gregor von Nazianz, Oratio IV gegen Julian, ein Kommentar* (Basel: F. Reinhardt, 1988); Leonardo Lugaesi, *Gregorio di Nazianzo, Contro Giuliano l'Apostata, Orazione IV* (Firenze: Nardini Editore, 1993).

²² *Carm.* 2.1.11.371.

the episcopacy in 372. Gregory initially fled from this as well, seeing little value in the see of Sasima to which he was to be appointed, and apparently resenting what he would later characterise as further coercion by Basil in an effort to support the latter's episcopacy of Caesarea.²³ After briefly withdrawing, Gregory's father's entreaties to return drew the younger Gregory back, though ultimately to Nazianzus as an assistant and not to Sasima.²⁴ The first orations he delivered as a bishop, *Ors.* 9–12, are laden with pneumatological and soteriological material. Between 372 to 373 Gregory asserted that to reveal the Spirit was his work in an oration delivered with Basil in the audience.²⁵ This identification of himself with the Spirit, and the work of the Spirit in the believer, presaged a rupture in the relationship between Basil and Gregory over the former's unwillingness to make an open declaration of the divinity of the Spirit.²⁶ Between 373 and 374, Gregory delivered an encomium for his father, and following a short tenure as sole bishop of Nazianzus after effectively rejecting his see of Sasima, again fled, entering seclusion at the monastery of St Thecla in Seleucia.²⁷ This withdrawal from public life lasted until 379. In the interim, Basil had published his *DSS*, and taken up the public defence of the divinity of the Spirit that Gregory had abandoned during his retreat from Nazianzus.

While Gregory had withdrawn from Basil's attempts to elevate him to the see of Sasima to support Basil's own efforts against Arian bishops, the ascent of Theodosius I to the imperial throne and his efforts to oppose Arianism seems to have wrought a change in Gregory. Gregory returned to public life as the bishop of Constantinople, elevated to the post as part of an effort to counter-act so-called Arian influence in the Eastern capital. This was not an end to the development of his soteriological pneumatology.²⁸ On the contrary, nine orations, delivered between 379 and 380, are the most consistently constructive sermons he delivered on the nature of the Spirit and its relationship to the church. Gregory himself conceived of his installation as by the grace of the Spirit.²⁹ Throughout these, there is a focus on how the Spirit acts as the

²³ *Carm.* 2.1.11.446–51.

²⁴ *Carm.* 2.1.11.490–98.

²⁵ *Or.* 10.2.

²⁶ *Ep.* 58.

²⁷ *Carm.* 2.1.11.547–49. White notes that Gregory's specific reference to his failure to perform his episcopal duties in Sasima serves to reinforce an argument that he was never really a bishop before his election to Constantinople. See Carolinne White, *Gregory of Nazianzus: Autobiographical Poems* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 51, n. 51.

²⁸ McGuckin's extensive consideration of the events leading up to Gregory's appointment, and the parties involved, is instructive. See McGuckin, *Gregory*, 234–40.

²⁹ *Carm.* 2.1.11.591–92.

foundation not just of the believer, but through the harmonisation of believers as the foundation of the body of Christ in the world.³⁰

The next five works Gregory delivered, the *Theological Orations* of 381, represent not so much greater development of his soteriological pneumatology as a full exposition of that which had come before. *Or.* 31, and its “order of theology” are part of this great exposition, but the situation into which it was spoken needs to be kept in sight to understand it. At this point, Gregory was at the height of his authority – delivering orations to the Emperor Theodosius, nominally supported by Alexandrian bishops, and successful at combating the heresies which had brought about his appointment to Constantinople. They were intended to persuade and to defend Gregory’s then strong position. The same cannot be said of those works which follow the *Theological Orations*, delivered just before and during the sitting of the Council of Constantinople and immediately afterwards.³¹ Even before the Council, Gregory found his position nearly usurped, and then floundered in his attempt to have the Council affirmatively adopt language on the divinity of the Spirit.³² Despite these losses, culminating in his withdrawal from the Council’s presidency and the see of Constantinople in exchange for Nazianzus, as well as the delivery of a climactic oration delivered before Theodosius, his soteriological pneumatology remained the subject of ongoing reflection.³³

This applies not just to his prose, but to Gregory’s poetry as well. Two major poetic works produced during this period, *DRS* and *DVS*, were intended to establish the narrative of his time in Constantinople, and although they display few flashes of new insight into his pneumatology, still return to the Spirit’s intervention in order to explain Gregory’s actions. His withdrawal from Constantinople and return to Nazianzus between late 381 and 382 marked an end to the restraint of his later Constantinopolitan works on the Spirit’s action in salvation. His valedictory oration, supposedly a recounting of what he said to the council as he stepped down, and the *Poemata Arcana*, are the full flowering of reflection on soteriological pneumatology decades in

³⁰ *Ors.* 20, 22, 24, 32, 33, 23, 21, 34, 41. The order is debatable. This represents the ordering offered by Beeley for Gregory’s Constantinopolitan orations and those that follow. See Beeley, *Trinity*, 34–60.

³¹ *Ors.* 25, 26, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40.

³² *Carm.* 2.1.11.1703.

³³ The exact reason for Gregory’s withdrawal from the Council of Constantinople is not certain. Meredith, at least, identifies it as having been Gregory’s insistence on the divinity of the Spirit. Gregory himself is evasive and attributes his removal to the moral shortcomings of those who engineered his downfall rather than any specific aspect question of doctrine. See Anthony Meredith, “The Pneumatology of the Cappadocian Fathers and the Creed of Constantinople,” *Irish Theological Quarterly* 48 (1981), 210. The absence of any defence of the Spirit or of deification, as for example in *Or.* 11, in *DVS*, is addressed in Chapter 5 here.

the making. Gregory continued as bishop of Nazianzus, writing until his death around 389. His funeral oration for Basil, later poetry, orations, and letters all point towards an intellectual whose public defeat did not dampen his enthusiasm for either his “work” in service of the Spirit or the rich theology which emerged from it.³⁴ Alongside these personal investments, it is important to remember how much of Gregory’s life was directly influenced by, and directly interacting with, the wider historical context of the time. He was born into the liberation of Christianity from the threat of persecution, came to adulthood during the ascendancy of Arianism supported by Constantine’s heirs, and spent the first years of his priesthood combating both the consequences of that support and Julian’s efforts to revive paganism. That Gregory saw himself as husbanding a vital but beleaguered cause in support of the Spirit is no surprise – the action of the Spirit was, for him, essential to resolving the political and spiritual crises with which he was confronted. This view of Gregory’s life highlights the Spirit as the foundation of his wider theology, rather than as its outworking.³⁵

On the contrary, scholarship on Gregory has usually regarded his pneumatology as the conclusion of a broader “Trinitarian project,” when it has anything to say about it at all, despite the substantial amount of literature available. Gregory’s work has been a subject of study and inquiry since at least as early as Maximus the Confessor’s *Ambigua* but has only in the last few decades seen renewed attention in Western scholarship.³⁶ This is not to say that there has not been scholarship on Gregory’s pneumatology or soteriology. Two monographs dedicated solely to his soteriology were produced in the twentieth century. Donald Winslow’s *Dynamics of Salvation* has been the most influential upon later Western scholarship, but this is to neglect Heinz Althaus’ *Die Heilslehre des heiligen Gregor von Nazianz*. Althaus produced this extensive treatment of Gregory’s soteriology before Winslow.³⁷ Winslow

³⁴ On *In suos versus*, but providing a very useful general overview of Gregory’s poetry through it see Celica Milovanovic-Barham, “Gregory of Nazianzus: Ars Poetica (In suos versus: Carmen 2.1.39),” *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 5, no. 4 (1997): 497ff.

³⁵ Phillip Rousseau’s reflection on the works in *Gregory of Nazianzus: Images and Reflections* is offers a valuable summary, where he notes that whatever is made of Gregory he was “recognizably typical but unlivened by a new mobility” and that his “field of discovery was the homeland he never left.” Phillip Rousseau, “Retrospect: Images, Reflections and the ‘Essential’ Gregory,” in *Gregory of Nazianzus: Images and Reflections* (ed. Jostein Børtnes et al; Copenhagen: Museum Tusulanum Press, 2006), 295.

³⁶ Christopher Beeley, ed., *Re-Reading Gregory of Nazianzus: Essays on History, Theology, and Culture* (Washington, D.C.: The Catholic University of America Press, 2012), ix. Susanna Elm, *Sons of Hellenism, Fathers of the Church: Emperor Julian, Gregory of Nazianzus and the Vision of Rome* (London: University of California Press, 2012).

³⁷ Winslow (1979); Heinz Althaus, *Die Heilslehre des heiligen Gregor von Nazianz* (Münster: Aschendorff, 1974). Few reviewers at the time seem to have been aware of this,

was himself quite aware of Althaus, writing in his preface that “This present study and that of Althaus cover much of the same ground (conceptually) but are quite different methodologically, and the conclusions as to what, for Gregory, consists of “salvation” also diverge.”³⁸ Without being too simplistic, the divergence to which Winslow points is that Althaus is concerned about the “final destiny” of humanity, while Winslow wants to locate a more metaphorical *θέωσις* in the contours of the Christian life.³⁹ On Gregory’s pneumatology, Daniel Opperwall’s doctoral thesis “The Holy Spirit in Gregory of Nazianzus” identifies itself as the only monograph-length study on the Spirit in Gregory, but this overlooks Thomas A. Noble’s own doctoral thesis, “The Deity of the Holy Spirit According to Gregory Nazianzus.”⁴⁰ Noble and Opperwall cover similar territory, in much the same way as Althaus and Winslow do. However, Noble’s aims are more limited than those of Opperwall, who has more to say concerning Gregory’s soteriological pneumatology – the scope of Opperwall’s project being such that reference to the subject is almost inevitable. In addition to these texts, there are a large number of articles, chapters, and monographs which treat with the same subjects in brief.⁴¹ Winslow, Meredith, Norris, and to a lesser extent Hanson, all noted the importance of deification by the Spirit for Gregory’s wider theological thought; but even these relegate Gregory’s pneumatology to a subsidiary position either in his own thinking or with regard to his immediate contemporaries.⁴²

despite Althaus’ publication appearing only five years before, and Winslow’s own acknowledgment of it.

³⁸ Winslow, *Dynamics of Salvation*, v.

³⁹ Althaus, *Heilslehre des heiligen*, 208; Winslow, *Dynamics of Salvation*, 191.

⁴⁰ See Daniel Opperwall, “The Holy Spirit in the Life and Writings of Gregory of Nazianzus” PhD Thesis (McMaster University, 2012) *Open Access Dissertations and Theses*, Paper 7349; Thomas A. Noble, “The Deity of the Holy Spirit According to Gregory of Nazianzus” PhD Thesis. (Edinburgh University, 1989). Noble’s contribution is absent from Opperwall and Beeley’s bibliographies, but notably present in McGuckin, *Gregory*.

⁴¹ Henry Swete, *The Holy Spirit in the Ancient Church* (London: MacMillan and Co., Limited, 1912); G.L. Prestige, *God in Patristic Thought* (London: William Heinemann, 1936); Jean Plagnieux, *Saint Grégoire de Nazianze théologien* (Paris: Éditions franciscaines, 1952); Adolf von Harnack, *History of Dogma* (ed. Neil Buchanan, 3rd ed.; Gloucester: Peter Smith, 1976); Meredith, *Pneumatology*, 196–211; Thomas F. Torrance, *The Trinitarian Faith* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1988); R.P.C. Hanson, *The Search for the Christian Doctrine of God* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1988); Claudio Moreschini, int., *Grégoire de Nazianze Discours 38–41*, SC 358 (Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf, 1990); Frederick Norris, *Faith Gives Fullness to Reasoning: The Five Theological Orations of Gregory Nazianzen* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1991); McGuckin, *Gregory*; Lewis Ayres, *Nicaea and Its Legacy: An Approach to Fourth-Century Trinitarian Theology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004) have been the works most influential on the study of Gregory’s pneumatology and soteriology outside of those we have already discussed.

⁴² These interactions are all extensively noted by Beeley. See Beeley, *Trinity*, 176.

The work most influential on recent studies of Gregory's pneumatology was that of Beeley, whose claim that Gregory's pneumatology has been under-examined has been repeated in the succession of works that have commented on Gregory's pneumatology after Beeley.⁴³ The paucity of work on Gregory's pneumatology, let alone its soteriological implications, is exemplified in the further reading suggested by Sykes in his commentary on Gregory's *Poemata Arcana*. Whereas he has exhaustive reading lists before the other poems, he directs readers to "books referred to for his Trinitarian thinking," and to 13 pages of Schermann's *Die Gottheit des heiligen Geistes nach den griechischen Vätern des vierten Jahrhunderts* and six pages of Galtier's *Le Saint-Esprit en nous d'après les Pères Grecs* – works written 96 and 51 years prior to Sykes' own, respectively.⁴⁴ Beeley's monograph, *Gregory of Nazianzus on the Trinity and the Knowledge of God: In Your Light We Shall See Light*, as well as shorter works on the subject, "The Holy Spirit in Gregory Nazianzen: The pneumatology of Oration 31" and "The Holy Spirit in the Cappadocians: Past and Present," have encouraged new work on Gregory's pneumatology and soteriology.⁴⁵ Beeley not only identified the soteriological underpinnings of Gregory's pneumatology that these imply but argued for Gregory's Holy Spirit as the "ontic and epistemic basis of the entire doctrine of grace" and to clarify the difference between "not universal and particular salvation, but between the ideal or potential salvation embodied in Christ and the actual salvation that the Holy Spirit realises in the Christian life."⁴⁶ In short, Beeley places the Spirit at the foundation not only of Gregory's thinking on salvation generally but also of its expression in the world. While these

⁴³ Andrew Hofer, *Christ in the Life and Teaching of Gregory of Nazianzus* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 191, n. 196: "Gregory's pneumatology has been underappreciated, a fact Christopher Beeley brings out well and partly rectifies..." Or in Opperwall, "Holy Spirit," 3, n. 11: "Beeley is quick to note the pressing need for further scholarship on Gregory's pneumatology." In Beeley's own words, "A surge of new interest in the Holy Spirit has touched on many areas of Christian theology... This renewal follows a long period of neglect, particularly though not exclusively in the mainstream Christian West." Christopher Beeley, "The Holy Spirit in the Cappadocians: Past and Present," *Modern Theology* 26:1 (2010), 90.

⁴⁴ See Theodor Schermann, *Die Gottheit des heiligen Geistes nach den griechischen Vätern des vierten Jahrhunderts* (Freiburg: Herder, 1901), 145–67; Paul Galtier, *Le Saint-Esprit en nous d'après les Pères grecs* (Rome: Apud Aedes Universitas Gregoriana, 1946), 175–80. Sykes' commentary, and his clear sighted identification of the unique character of Gregory's thinking apart from Basil, can be found in Donald A. Sykes, ed. and trans., *Gregory of Nazianzus: Poemata Arcana* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 114.

⁴⁵ Beeley, *Knowledge*; Christopher Beeley, "The Holy Spirit in Gregory Nazianzen: The pneumatology of Oration 31," in *God in Early Christian Thought: Essays in Honor of Lloyd Patterson* (ed. Brian Daley et al; Leiden: Brill, 2009); Beeley, "The Holy Spirit."

⁴⁶ Beeley, *Knowledge*, 180.

ideas inform his conclusions, they are a minor part of Beeley's larger project in *Trinity and the Knowledge of God* and he does not dwell on them at great length; also, they are not developed beyond this in his two further articles.⁴⁷ While Beeley is concerned to demonstrate the significance of the Spirit to Gregory's theology, Beeley's interpretation of Gregory's pneumatological soteriology is limited by his assignment of "potential salvation" to Christ and "individual salvation" to the Spirit. Neither of these concepts are as fixed in Gregory's thinking as that assessment would suggest.

One area on which there has been an increasing amount of discussion, and which is central to this project, is the idea of *θέωσις*. To speak of Gregory's soteriological pneumatology is, to many, to speak of deification broadly defined. However, this catch-all language tends to also invoke all the ideas which have adhered to *θέωσις* in its long history since Gregory coined it.⁴⁸ Approaches to the integration of deification, broadly, into Gregory's wider soteriological pneumatology are nearly as common as the different perspectives on deification. Variations on these include Beeley's description of the individualising activity of the Spirit and Opperwall's claims about the novelty of Gregory's integration of deification in baptism.⁴⁹ Although he principally locates salvation in the work of Christ, Winslow's *Dynamics of Salvation* has been a central text for readings of deification in Gregory. While it did understate the role of the Spirit, Winslow strongly contributed to the axiomatic understanding of the Spirit's activity in salvation as individualising.⁵⁰ Winslow's thinking is strongly beholden to that of Lossky on the subject of *θέωσις*. As a consequence, both of these figures, and many of those who followed on from them, broadly equate it with deification.⁵¹ Russell's widely received study on deification relies heavily on Winslow when it comes to Nazianzus and further picks up on the idea of individualisation. Russell characterises Gregory's use of deification language as purely metaphorical, but gives low priority to what Winslow referred to as the "corporate and social" dimensions of *θέωσις* and what Russell himself described as the "realistic

⁴⁷ Beeley, "The Holy Spirit," 90–91 is something of an exception. Beeley is particularly concerned with distinguishing the pneumatologies of the three Cappadocians there, and offers a number of comments concerning the function of the church in those systems.

⁴⁸ A problem only amplified by the use of "deification" as a totalising translation for *θέωσις*. On Gregory's fondness for neologisms see Frederick Norris, "Gregory Contemplating the Beautiful: Knowing Human Misery and Divine Mystery through and Being Persuaded by Images," in *Gregory of Nazianzus: Images and Reflections* (ed. Jostein Bortnes et al; Copenhagen: Museum Tusulanum Press, 2006, 33, n. 40.

⁴⁹ Beeley, *Knowledge*, 178; Opperwall, "Holy Spirit," 213.

⁵⁰ Winslow, *Dynamics of Salvation*, 87.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 130. See also Vladimir Lossky, *The Mystical Theology of the Eastern Church* (Crestwood: St Vladimir's Seminary Press, 1976), 196–216.

Index of References

Ancient Authors

Athanasius of Alexandria	17.29	35
	17.33	35
<i>Epistulae ad Serapionem</i>	Didymus of Alexandria	
1.2	38 n. 86	
1.22	38	
1.23	38	
1.24–25	40	
1.26	38	
1.27	38	
1.30	39 n. 89, 40 n. 93	
1.31	38 n. 88	
2.4	40	
3.4	39	
4.23	40	
	<i>De Spiritu Sancto</i>	
	10	42
	13	42
	16	42
	19	42
	26	43
	55	41 n. 99
	84	43
	85	43
	86	43
	117	43
	121	43
<i>De incarnatione verbi</i>	122	43
9–10	39 n. 90	
	123	43
Basil of Caesarea	124	43
	143	43
<i>Homilia</i>		
15	12, 69, 71, 88–91, 92, 94, 97, 162, 165	
15.3	89, 90	
Cyril of Jerusalem		
<i>Catecheses ad illuminandos</i>		
16	33–36	
16.2	35	
16.3	35	
16.3–4	35	
16.5	35	
16.22	35 n. 78	
16.24	34 n. 74, 35 n. 77	
17	33–36	
17.2	35	
17.5	35	
	Gregory of Nazianzus	
	<i>Carmen</i>	
	1.1.3	163
	1.1.3.19–21	23
	1.1.3.29–31	25
	1.1.4	51
	1.1.4.92	120 n. 60
	1.1.5.34–40	151
	1.1.6.53–67	120 n. 60
	1.1.7	15, 16 n. 8
	1.1.7.55–56	15
	1.1.7.73	15 n. 4
	1.1.7.74–75	15
	1.1.7.76–77	15
	1.1.7.78	15
	1.1.7.79	15

- | | | | |
|-----------------|--|---------------|---|
| 1.1.7.91 | 15 | 58.7 | 92 |
| 1.2.34 | 15 n. 7 | 58.8 | 93 |
| 2.1.11.53 | 148 n. 45 | 58.11 | 93 |
| 2.1.11.55–58 | 3 n. 11 | 58.14 | 94, 97 |
| 2.1.11.90 | 147 n. 43 | 71 | 98 n. 87 |
| 2.1.11.112 | 148 n. 48 | 71.1 | 94 n. 76 |
| 2.1.11.113–14 | 150 n. 57 | 164.1 | 74 n. 20 |
| 2.1.11.116 | 150 n. 56 | | |
| 2.1.11.119–20 | 150 n. 56 | <i>Oratio</i> | |
| 2.1.11.164–65 | 148 | 1 | 53 n. 28, 63, 67 |
| 2.1.11.195–99 | 148 | 1.1 | 52 n. 23 |
| 2.1.11.205–08 | 148–49 | 1.2 | 4 n. 20, 52, 53, 66,
67 |
| 2.1.11.211–22 | 3 n. 14 | 1.4–5 | 61 |
| 2.1.11.274 | 150 n. 58 | 1.5 | 53 |
| 2.1.11.310–11 | 150 | 1.6 | 53, 54 |
| 2.1.11.343 | 150 | 2 | 42 n. 100, 54–55,
58, 60, 61, 63, 67,
83, 104, 110, 133,
136 n. 5, 140 n. 18 |
| 2.1.11.345 | 3 n. 15 | | 55 |
| 2.1.11.347 | 150 n. 61 | 2.3 | 55 |
| 2.1.11.351–53 | 4 n. 18 | 2.7 | 4 n. 20, 55–56, 60,
64 |
| 2.1.11.371 | 4 n. 22 | | 56, 61 |
| 2.1.11.446–51 | 5 n. 23 | 2.22 | 57 n. 42 |
| 2.1.11.490–98 | 5 n. 24 | 2.28 | 61 |
| 2.1.11.547–49 | 5 n. 27 | 2.33 | 58 |
| 2.1.11.591–92 | 5 n. 29 | 2.39 | 57 n. 42, 61 n. 59 |
| 2.1.11.592 | 151, 157 n. 78 | 2.40 | 74 n. 20 |
| 2.1.11.1310–12 | 152 | 2.72 | 57 |
| 2.1.11.1322–24 | 152 | 2.73 | 56 n. 39 |
| 2.1.11.1680 | 153 n. 69 | 2.97 | 58 n. 48 |
| 2.1.11.1703 | 6 n. 32 | 2.105 | 55, 58, 63, 67 |
| 2.1.11.1703–11 | 153 | 3 | 58, 62 |
| 2.1.11.1865–68 | 146 | 3.1 | 4, 58, 59, 60, 61, 62,
63, 64, 68, 75 |
| 2.1.11.1919–22 | 154 | 4 | 60 n. 58, 65 n. 74 |
| 2.1.11.1943–99 | 154 | 4.54 | 61, 62 |
| 2.1.12.1–3 | 155 n. 74 | 4.71 | 61 n. 59 |
| | | 4.88 | 45 |
| <i>Epistula</i> | | 5 | 74 n. 20 |
| 1 | 83 | 5.35 | 63, 64, 66, 68, 73,
78 |
| 2 | 83 | 6 | 63 |
| 6 | 51, 58, 63, 67 | 6.1 | 63 |
| 6.3–4 | 4 n. 19, 50–51, 52,
55 n. 33 | 6.7 | 63 |
| 6.4 | 61 | 6.8 | 63 |
| 20 | 145 n. 35 | 6.9 | 73, 74, 80, 97 n. 84 |
| 45 | 72 n. 10, 73, 80 | 6.17 | 66 n. 80 |
| 45.1 | 74, 97 n. 84 | 7 | 4 |
| 48.9–10 | 74–75 | | |
| 58 | 5 n. 26, 51 n. 19, 69,
71, 84, 91, 96,
98 n. 87, 162 | | |

7.9	66	16.5	151 n. 62
7.15	66, 145 n. 35, 149 n. 54	16.8	86 n. 61
7.23	66 n. 81, 67	16.11	86 n. 61
7.24	66	16.15	85
8	4, 66 n. 82	17	85, 97
8.15	67 n. 83	17.8	86
8.20	67	17.9–10	86–87
9	5, 75, 76, 82	18.1	96
9.1	76	18.2	95 n. 78
9.2	77, 86	18.12	95
9.2–3	76	18.13	95
9.6	77	18.34	151 n. 62
10	5, 75, 79, 80, 81, 88, 112 n. 42, 136 n. 5	18.36	95
10.1	80	19.2	96
10.2	5 n. 25, 80	20	6 n. 30, 99, 102 n. 11
10.3	74 n. 20, 80 n. 43	20.1	56 n. 35, 104
10.4	79–80	20.4	103–04, 105
11	5, 6 n. 33, 75 n. 26, 78–79, 136 n. 5	20.12	104–05, 106
11a	75, 78, 79	21	6 n. 30, 99, 109
11b	75, 78, 79	21.2	116
11.2	78 n. 33	21.7	115
11.3	78	21.31	74 n. 20
11.4	79 n. 36	22	6 n. 30
11.5	78	22.1	108
11.6	79 n. 36, 84	22.4	107–08
12	5, 75, 81, 83, 88, 91, 97, 112 n. 42, 136 n. 5	22.13	106 n. 20, 107 n. 27
12.4	81–83	22.15	106, 107, 124 n. 74
12.5	83	23	6 n. 30, 20
12.6	74, 83–84, 87, 91, 93, 94, 99, 102	23.4	114
13	71, 81, 87, 88, 91, 93, 97, 112 n. 42	23.11	20, 21, 22, 26 n. 45
13.4	84, 87, 88 n. 65	23.13	106 n. 20
14	4, 68, 109, 124	24	6 n. 30
14.2	64 n. 72	24.8	106
14.5	64	25	6 n. 31, 134–35, 143, 145
14.7	64	25.6	138
14.14	64	25.15	16–17
14.27	65, 67, 90	25.16	135, 137, 138, 139, 140
14.30	65	25.17	18 n. 14
16	85, 97	26	6 n. 31, 134, 135, 139–40, 143, 145
16.1	86	26.2	139, 140 n. 17
16.2	86 n. 61	29	126
16.4	85–86	29.2	19 n. 16, 21 n. 26, 22, 23 n. 33
		29.19	124 n. 72, 145 n. 36
		29.19–20	126–27

29.20	127–28, 129, 131	37.1	141 n. 24
30.1	123 n. 68	37.7	141 n. 24
30.2	124 n. 72	37.13	141 n. 24
30.4	124, 125, 129	37.17	141
30.14	125, 132	37.16	141
31	6, 12, 31 n. 28, 51, 88, 90, 99, 113, 117, 118, 123, 124, 129, 130, 133, 137, 140, 145, 155	38	6 n. 31, 15–16
		38.8	20, 21, 126 n. 77
		38.9	120 n. 60
		38.12	15
		38.12–13	16 n. 8
31.2	23 n. 36, 26–27, 136–37, 138–39	38.18	142
		39	6 n. 31, 143
31.3	22	39.9	143 n. 28
31.4	1, 62 n. 65, 124, 125, 135, 137, 138, 140 n. 21	39.11	18 n. 13
		39.17	148 n. 46, 149
		39.20	143
31.6	21	40	6 n. 31, 80 n. 39, 143, 149
31.8	17, 123, 136 n. 4		
31.9	18	40.1	144 n. 31
31.10	45 n. 110, 45 n. 111	40.6	144 n. 31
31.12	18	40.9	109 n. 31, 144
31.14	21	40.15	144 n. 33
31.25	145 n. 35	40.26	144 n. 31
31.26	102 n. 9, 153 n. 68	40.29	145
31.26–27	101 n. 8	40.30	131
31.27	2, 123	40.33	144 n. 31
31.28	84 n. 52, 88 n. 65, 100 n. 4, 131	40.41	19
		40.43	19
31.28–29	100–01	40.44	144 n. 31
31.29	24, 130, 131, 132	40.45	26, 143, 145 n. 37
32	6 n. 30, 109, 111	40.46	144 n. 31
32.1	109 n. 31, 110	41	6 n. 30, 51, 88, 99, 113, 117, 118, 123, 125, 133, 145
32.11	110		
32.24	110–11		
33	6 n. 30, 109, 111	41.4	74 n. 20
33.9	111–12	41.6	122
33.12	112	41.8	122
33.13	112	41.9	118
33.15	112–13	41.10	118
33.16	84 n. 52, 88 n. 65	41.11	119, 120–21, 129 n. 97, 139
33.17	113		
34	6 n. 30, 109	41.14	118, 121
34.6	116	42	156, 158
34.12	116	42.1	156–57
34.13	117	42.2	156 n. 75
36	6 n. 31	42.8	156 n. 75, 158
36.12	109 n. 31	42.14	156 n. 75
37	6 n. 31, 134, 135, 141	42.16	159
		42.18	156 n. 75

43	73 n. 13, 97 n. 86, 156	43.11	159–60
43.40	160 n. 85	43.37	73 n. 14
43.43	160 n. 85	61	30 n. 58
43.63	144 n. 31	63	30 n. 56
43.68	160	66	30 n. 56, 30 n. 59, 31
45	53 n. 28	67	30 n. 59, 30 n. 60
45.1	73	68	31, 61 n. 63
45.6	109 n. 31	69	30 n. 56
Gregory Thaumaturgus		73	31 n. 63
<i>In Origenem oratio panegyrica</i>		74	30 n. 56
11	59–60, 162 n. 1	81–83	30 n. 56
Gregory the Presbyter		96	30 n. 56
<i>Vita Sancti Gregorii</i>		97	30 n. 56
1.1	101 n. 7	107	30
3	3 n. 13	110	30
Marcellus of Ancyra		111	30
<i>Fragmenta</i>		117	30
52	30 n. 58	<i>De incarnatione et contra Arianos</i>	
		9	31 n. 65

Scriptural Texts

Old Testament

<i>Genesis</i>		<i>Psalms</i>	
3:1	112 n. 38	32 (33):6	119 n. 58
3:6	112 n. 38	36 (37)	117 n. 55
3:22	112 n. 38	82:1	124 n. 73
<i>Exodus</i>		99:6	78 n. 33
4:16	78 n. 33	103 (104):30	119 n. 58
7:1	78 n. 33	<i>Isaiah</i>	
17:8–13	78 n. 33	53:5	128 n. 96
<i>1 Samuel</i>		61:1	52
1:28	147	61:6	52 n. 25
10:6	76	66:1	158 n. 80
<i>Job</i>		<i>Jeremiah</i>	
33:4 (LXX)	119 n. 58	23:24	158 n. 80

Deuterocanonical Books

Wisdom

7:26 56

New Testament

Matthew

1:18–25 126 n. 81
 2:1–12 126 n. 83
 3:14–17 127 n. 87
 4:1–11 127 n. 88
 4:21 74 n. 19
 5:15 73 n. 18, 74, 80, 83–
 84, 93, 97
 5:18 58 n. 48
 8:28–34 128 n. 93
 9:35 128 n. 96
 12:34 126 n. 85
 14:13–21 127 n. 88
 14:22–27 128 n. 91
 14:28–33 128 n. 91
 19:24 127 n. 86
 26:15 128 n. 95
 27:34 129 n. 99
 27:45 129 n. 98
 27:50 129 n. 100
 27:51–52 129 n. 100
 28:19 113 n. 45
 28:20 43

Mark

1:9–11 127 n. 87
 5:1–20 128 n. 93
 6:30–44 127 n. 88
 6:45–52 128 n. 91
 15:23 129 n. 99
 15:33 129 n. 98
 15:37 129 n. 100

Luke

1:41 126 n. 82
 2:8–20 126 n. 83
 3:21–22 127 n. 87

4:1–13 127 n. 88
 4:18 52
 8:16 74 n. 19
 8:26–39 128 n. 93
 9:12–27 127 n. 88
 11:33 74 n. 19
 12:11–12 43
 19:9 103, 104
 20:19–25 128 n. 92
 21:14–15 43
 23:36 129 n. 99
 23:43 129 n. 98
 23:46 129 n. 100

John

1:1 128 n. 96
 1:13 52 n. 22
 1:23 128 n. 96
 1:26–36 127 n. 87
 2:7–9 129 n. 100
 3:4 126 n. 85
 3:5 119 n. 58
 5:21 129 n. 100
 6:1–14 127 n. 88
 6:1–35 127 n. 88
 6:19 128 n. 91
 6:57 127 n. 86
 7:37 127 n. 89
 7:38 127 n. 90
 8:48 128 n. 93
 8:59 128 n. 94
 10:17–18 129 n. 100
 11:1–46 128 n. 94
 14:2 124 n. 73
 14:26 123 n. 70

15:26	30, 31, 32–33, 61, 123 n. 70, 124	15:42	112 n. 38
16:13–14	31, 35	15:45	112 n. 38
16:15	127 n. 86	15:49	112 n. 38
17:10	127 n. 86		
17:11	43	<i>2 Corinthians</i>	
19:29	129 n. 99	3:18	56
19:30	129 n. 100	5:17	52 n. 22
20:22	31	5:18–21	79 n. 38
		6:16	113 n. 43
<i>Acts</i>		<i>Galatians</i>	
17:28	156	2:2	156
27	148	3:27	64 n. 73
		5:26	156
<i>Romans</i>		<i>Ephesians</i>	
5:1–2	79	1:13–14	43
5:2	79–80, 82	4:4	64 n. 71
5:11	79	4:15	55
6:4	52 n. 22, 113 n. 45	4:16	110
8:17	64 n. 73	4:24	52 n. 22
8:26–27	43, 115	4:30	43
12:5	110		
13:14	64 n. 73	<i>2 Timothy</i>	
<i>1 Corinthians</i>		1:14	156
1:24	43	2:5	122 n. 67
2:6	63 n. 69	<i>Hebrews</i>	
2:13	110	8:2	78 n. 33
3:13	110 n. 32	<i>2 Peter</i>	
3:16–17	116 n. 54	1:4	50
4:1	96 n. 82	<i>1 John</i>	
6:9	116 n. 54	4:12–13	108–09
6:19	139 n. 13	<i>Revelation</i>	
8:6	158 n. 80	21:10	56
12:15	64 n. 71		
13:2	56 n. 38		
14:32	157		
15:22	112 n. 38		

Subject Index

- Alfeyev, Hilarion 126 n. 78
Althaus, Heinz 7–8, 46, 106, 165 n. 6
Anatolios, Khaled 39, 40 n. 92
angels 37, 56, 89, 119, 120, 121, 122, 139
anthropology 15–16, 51 n. 21, 62, 89, 110, 116, 132
Apollinarians, the 151
apothēōsis 59–60, 162
Arianism 4, 5, 7
asceticism 57, 58, 61, 62, 83, 111, 150
Athanasius of Alexandria 11, 14, 27, 28 n. 51, 29 n. 55, 37–41, 42, 43–44, 45, 61, 99, 109, 110, 114–15, 116, 140 n. 20
Augustine of Hippo 107 n. 26
Awad, Najeeb G. 25 n. 41
Ayres, Lewis 16 n. 9, 20 n. 22, 29 n. 55, 30 n. 57, 30 n. 61, 33 n. 71, 36 n. 79, 43, 45 n. 111
- Baghos, Mario 145 n. 35
baptism 10, 15, 24, 25, 26, 27, 33, 50, 54, 56–57, 67, 95, 100, 102, 113–14, 117, 127, 142, 143, 144–45, 148–49, 154, 155, 159, 163, 166
Barnes, Michel René 20 n. 22, 40 n. 95, 140 n. 20
Basil of Caesarea 1, 3, 4, 5, 7, 10 n. 47, 12, 14, 20, 45 n. 111, 49, 50, 51 n. 18, 58, 65, 69–98, 99, 102, 140, 150, 152 n. 64, 156, 159–61, 162, 163, 164 n. 4, 165
Bayliss, Grant 42
Beeley, Christopher 6 n. 30, 9–10, 19, 45 n. 110, 53 n. 28, 71, 75, 80, 84 n. 52, 88 n. 65, 106, 136, 137, 138, 152 n. 67, 153 n. 68, 164 n. 4, 165 n. 5, 165 n. 7
- Behr, John 101 n. 8
Berkhof, Hendrikus 138 n. 12
Bernardi, Jean 56–57, 58, 157
Börtnes, Jostein 15 n. 7
Browne, Charles Gordon 49–50, 92
Burgess, Stanley 72 n. 8
- Caesarius 5, 65–66, 145 n. 35
Calvet-Sebasti, Marie-Ange 73, 74 n. 19, 84 n. 52
child-birth imagery 86
Christensen, Michael 48 n. 13
Christology 2, 10, 11, 24–25, 30–31, 32, 38–40, 41, 42, 44, 47, 52, 56, 79, 81, 82, 88, 95, 100, 101, 104, 105, 110, 111–12, 117, 118–33, 134, 142–43, 144, 145, 152–53, 154, 155, 164, 165, 166
Chryssavgis, John 154 n. 72
church 5, 12, 31, 51, 54–58, 60 n. 57, 63–64, 83, 85, 86, 95, 97, 99–109, 129, 132, 133, 147 n. 44, 158–59, 163, 165, 166
– unity of 106, 109–11, 114, 115
citizenship 112
Clement of Alexandria 154 n. 72
Constantine I 3, 7, 29
Constantius II 3–4
contemplation *see theōria*
cosmology 15
councils
– Chalcedon 1, 101
– Constantinople 6, 134, 145, 146, 153, 155, 156, 161, 163, 164
– Nicaea 3, 29
Cross, Richard 16 n. 9
Cyprian of Antioch 106
Cyril of Alexandria 164 n. 4

- Cyril of Jerusalem 11, 14, 27, 28 n. 51,
33–37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 45,
139 n. 13
- Daley, Brian 92 n. 72, 136, 137, 138,
163 n. 3
- Day, Juliette 34 n. 75, 35 n. 76, 36 n. 80
- deification *see theōsis*
- Demoen, Kristoffel 147 n. 42
- Diadochos of Photike 49
- Didymus of Alexandria 11, 14, 27,
28 n. 51, 41–44, 45
- duty 81–83
- ecclesiology *see church*
- Egyptian bishops 99, 109, 114–15
- Ellverson, Anna-Stina 165 n. 6
- Elm, Susanna 11, 15, 46, 57 n. 43, 59,
82 n. 47
- engraving 53–54
- Enomius of Cyzicus 28
- eschatology 103, 105, 106, 109, 110,
112, 116, 117, 124, 126 n. 78, 130,
155, 166
- Eupychius of Caesarea 92
- Eusebians, the 33
- Eusebius of Caesarea 28, 30 n. 59, 32, 35
- Evagrius Ponticus 49
- exorcisms 120–21
- experience 24, 27, 44, 47–48, 49, 50, 60,
61, 67–68, 71, 85, 92, 94, 95, 99–100,
102, 105, 108, 117, 118, 119, 124–25,
129, 131–32, 134, 135, 140, 144, 147,
150, 154, 156, 160–61, 162, 164, 165,
166
- fear 76–77, 83
- Fialon, Eugène 72 n. 11, 73 n. 13
- Finch, Jeffrey 40 n. 96
- Fulford, Ben 126 n. 80
- Gallay, Paul 137 n. 8, 138
- Gautier, Francis 27 n. 47
- Gifford, James 139 n. 14
- glorification 86, 114
- golden chain, the 100, 101, 104, 106,
116, 131–32
- Golitzin, Alexander 100 n. 4
- Gorgonia 5, 65, 66–67
- Gregory the Elder 3, 5, 51, 73, 83, 85,
95–96, 147–48, 150
- Gregory of Nazianzus
– autobiography 146–55
– biography 3–7
- Gregory of Nyssa 1, 10 n. 47, 14, 20,
45 n. 111, 49, 74 n. 22, 78, 152 n. 64,
164 n. 4
- Gregory of Palamas 49
- Gregory the Presbyter 101 n. 7
- Gregory of Sinai 49
- Gregory Thaumaturgus 28, 59–60, 162
- Gross, Jules 41 n. 98
- Hägg, Tomas 96 n. 81
- Hanson, R.P.C. 8, 16 n. 9, 34 n. 73, 39,
40 n. 94, 42 n. 104, 45 n. 111, 115 n.
50
- harmony, harmonisation 6, 55, 63, 67,
72, 78, 88, 97, 102, 103, 105, 109–17,
132, 133, 163, 165
- Harrison, Verna 20 n. 22, 21, 131 n. 103
- Haykin, Michael A.G. 92 n. 72
- healings 120–21
- hierarchy 109–14
- Hilary of Poitiers 85 n. 56
- Hillis, Gregory 24–25, 164 n. 4
- Hofer, Andrew 131 n. 103, 147 n. 41,
152 n. 67, 165 n. 7
- holiness 134–41, 143, 144, 145, 147,
159, 163
- Holman, Susan R. 78 n. 35
- Holy Spirit
– divinity of 1, 5, 6, 12, 17, 24–25,
27 n. 47, 29, 31, 32, 33, 35, 36, 38–
39, 40, 42, 61, 69, 70, 71–72, 74, 75,
78, 80, 81, 84–85, 87–95, 96, 97, 98,
99, 100, 101, 102, 105, 112, 113, 122,
123, 129, 130, 134, 137, 141, 152,
153, 157, 159, 160–61, 162, 163, 164,
165
– and holiness 134–41, 158, 164, 166
- Homoians, the 29
- Homoiousians, the 33
- hymnography 1 n. 3
- Iliad*, the 132
- illumination 26, 63, 82, 86, 97, 105, 108,
119–20, 121, 122, 143–44

- image of God 16, 26, 27, 86, 117
 imitation 51, 53–54, 64, 83, 87, 104, 109,
 125, 135, 142, 155 n. 74
 individualisation 10
 Irenaeus of Lyons 11, 28 n. 48
 Isaac the Syrian 49
- Jerome 41
 John Cassian 49
 John Climacus 49
 Johnson, Mark 47–48
 judgement 124–25, 129, 165
 Julian II 4, 7, 59, 60, 62, 65, 66
 Julian the tax-collector 95
- Kariatlis, Philip 165 n. 5
 Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti 46 n. 1
 Kharlamov, Vladimir 34 n. 73, 118 n. 57
 knowledge 11, 14, 23–27, 80, 94, 95,
 100, 103, 105, 106, 108, 109, 118,
 141–45, 155, 159
- Lakoff, George 47–48
 Lampe, Geoffrey W.H. 92
 language *see* theological language
 Leahy, Brendan 28 n. 48
 Lienhard, Joseph 29–30, 31 n. 64,
 31 n. 68
 light 56, 73–74, 80, 83–84, 91, 93, 94,
 97, 143–44
 Lossky, Vladimir 10, 18, 49, 50, 54
 Lössl, Josef 153 n. 68
 Lucifer 120 n. 60
- Macarius of Scetis 49
 Macaskill, Grant 15 n. 5
 Macedonians, the 41, 42, 134
 Mantzaridis, Georgios 77 n. 31
 Marcellus of Ancyra 11, 14, 27, 28 n. 51,
 29–33, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 44,
 61
 Mark the Hermit 49
 Marksches, Christoph 153 n. 68
 Maslov, Boris 42 n. 100, 46, 58, 59, 61–
 62, 120 n. 61
 Maximus the Confessor 7, 49, 164 n. 4
 Maximus the Cynic 135, 139, 140, 151
 McConnell, Timothy P. 74 n. 22
- McGuckin, John 3 n. 9, 5 n. 28, 42 n.
 100, 47, 71, 72–73, 75, 81, 84 n. 52,
 98 n. 87, 102 n. 11
 mediation 43, 44, 87, 144, 150
 Meijering, Eginhard P. 16 n. 9, 140 n. 20
 Menzies, Robert P. 2 n. 5
 Meredith, Anthony 6 n. 33, 8
 metaphor 46–58, 59, 65, 67, 68, 82, 86,
 89, 102, 144, 162, 164, 166 *see also*
 theological language
 Miller, Patricia 147 n. 44
 Milovanovic-Barham, Celica 7 n. 34
 mirror 56, 60
 Moreschini, Claudio 111, 116 n. 54
 mystery 52–54, 65, 66, 67, 118, 145
- Narkevics, Edgar 22, 84 n. 55
 Nicephorus 49
 Nicobulus 75
 Noble, Thomas A. 8, 138 n. 10
 Nonna 3, 96, 147
 Norris, Frederick 8, 16 n. 9, 28, 45
- Opperwall, Daniel 8, 10, 44–45, 57–58,
 137, 138, 146, 152 n. 67
 Origen of Alexandria 27, 28, 42, 59–60,
 126 n. 84, 149 n. 54, 164 n. 4
- pagan philosophy 59
paideia 59
 participation 42, 43, 44, 113, 113 n. 44,
 164 n. 4
 patriarchs 52, 119, 120, 121, 122, 139
 peace 107–10, 132
 Pentecost 118
 perfecting, perfection 55, 63, 64, 82, 83,
 105, 109, 113–14, 120, 132, 138, 139,
 140, 141, 144, 159, 163, 164, 166
 Platonism 11, 58, 120 n. 60
 poetry 6, 7, 9, 12, 42 n. 100, 146–55,
 156–57, 163
 poor, the 64, 111
 prayer 26–27, 129, 148
 priests, priesthood 55, 57–58, 63, 72, 77,
 150
 prophets 52, 65, 119, 120, 121, 122, 139,
 158
 providence 61, 150–51, 152, 153–54

- purity, purification 26–27, 51, 55, 61, 63, 64, 67, 72, 79, 82, 83, 86, 89, 97, 103, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 110, 115, 119, 120, 121, 122, 131, 132, 135, 139, 141, 142, 143, 144, 145, 151, 155, 163, 166
- Radde-Gallwitz, Andrew 71, 84, 89, 91, 92 n. 72
- Rebillard, Suzanne Abrams 146 n. 40, 158 n. 79, 159 n. 81
- resurrection 24, 31, 32, 52, 82, 89, 120–21
- revelation 2, 11, 14, 27, 55, 65, 116 n. 52, 123, 142
– day of revelation 110
- Rousseau, Phillip 7 n. 35
- Ruether, Rosemary Radford 16 n. 8
- Russell, Norman 10–11, 46, 49, 57, 60 n. 55, 164 n. 4
- Sabellianism 29, 33
- Schermann, Theodor 9
- Scripture 11, 34–35, 42–43, 51, 52, 55, 56, 58, 65, 71, 76–77, 90, 100–01, 103, 110, 111–12, 116–17, 119, 138–39, 147–48, 152, 154, 157
- Scully, Ellen 85 n. 56
- selfishness 81–83
- Seraphim of Sarov 49
- Serapion of Thmuis 37
- Socrates 29 n. 52
- Soskice, Janet 48 n. 10
- spiritual circumcision 142, 143
- Stead, Christopher 120 n. 61
- Stoicism 11, 120 n. 61
- suffering 65–68, 77, 82, 85–87, 154 n. 72
- Swallow, James Edward 49–50, 92
- Swete, Henry 42 n. 103
- Sykes, Donald A. 9, 51 n. 19
- Symeon the New Theologian 49
- Tabbernee, William 28 n. 48
- teaching 57
- temple 103–09, 113, 116–17, 132–33, 158–59
- terminology *see* theological language
- Theodosius I 5, 6, 135, 141
- theological language 1, 6, 10, 12, 16, 21, 29–30, 32, 34, 36, 37–40, 42, 44, 46–68, 70, 79, 82, 86, 88, 94, 97, 98, 100, 115–16, 153 n. 68, 156, 162, 164 *see also* metaphor
- Theophanes the Recluse 49
- theopoiēsis* 48, 50, 56, 61–62, 63, 67, 88, 97, 116, 162
- theōria* 25–27, 83, 105, 111
- theōsis* 1, 4, 8, 10–11, 12, 24, 30, 32, 40, 46–47, 48–50, 51, 54, 57–58, 59–63, 68, 72, 75, 76, 78, 83, 87, 88, 97, 100 n. 3, 102, 105 n. 19, 109–17, 118, 124, 125, 126 n. 78, 129, 131, 132, 138, 144, 152, 154, 155, 162, 164 n. 4, 165, 166
- Thomas Aquinas 102 n. 9
- Tollefsen, Torstein 60 n. 56, 111 n. 36
- tongues of fire 120–21
- Torrance, Thomas F. 16 n. 9, 25 n. 41
- Tsamis, Dimitrios 152 n. 64
- Trinity, the 2, 4, 7, 11, 14–27, 29–30, 35–36, 38, 40–41, 43, 44, 71, 73, 77, 79, 80, 87, 89, 92, 95, 100, 106, 112–13, 114, 116, 117, 118, 122, 132, 135–36, 137, 138–39, 140, 144, 151, 159, 163, 165, 166
– and divine causality 16–19, 20, 22, 25
– and intellect 19–23, 25, 27
– and movement 20–23, 27
– and will 15, 16, 19, 22–23, 25, 27, 61, 108, 150
- tropikoi*, the 37
- Tzamalikos, Panayiotis 56 n. 37
- universalism 64
- Valens 4
- Vinson, Martha 138
- virtue 50, 51, 54, 59, 64, 66, 114, 124
- Wessel, Susan 87 n. 64
- Winslow, Donald 7–8, 10, 26 n. 44, 46, 47, 49, 50, 54, 57, 100, 102 n. 10, 106, 148 n. 47, 154 n. 73, 155 n. 74, 165 n. 6
- worship 27, 100, 131, 159
- Zizioulas, John D. 25