JAN N. BREMMER

Jews, Pagans and Christians in the Roman Empire

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 547

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

Herausgeber/Editor Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber/Associate Editors

Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala) Christina M. Kreinecker (Leuven) · Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) Janet Spittler (Charlottesville, VA) · J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)





Jan N. Bremmer

Jews, Pagans and Christians in the Roman Empire

Collected Essays III

Jan N. Bremmer, born 1944; 1979 PhD; 1978–90 Associate Professor for ancient history at the University of Utrecht; 1990–2009 Chair of Religious Studies at the Faculty of Theology and Religious Studies of the University of Groningen; 2024–2025 Fellow at the Centre for Advanced Studies "Beyond Canon," Regensburg.

ISBN 978-3-16-170562-5/eISBN 978-3-16-170563-2 DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-170563-2

ISSN 0512-1604/eISSN 2568-7476

(Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available at https://dnb.dnb.de.

© 2025 Mohr Siebeck, Tübingen.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The right to use the content of this volume for the purpose of text and data mining within the meaning of Section 44b UrhG (Urheberrechtsgesetz) is expressly reserved.

Printed on non-aging paper. Typesetting: Laupp & Göbel, Gomaringen.

Mohr Siebeck GmbH & Co. KG, Wilhelmstraße 18, 72074 Tübingen, Germany www.mohrsiebeck.com, info@mohrsiebeck.com

In gratitude

Laura Feldt Tobias Nicklas

Preface

The third volume of my *Collected Essays* continues in many ways the first in its focus on early Christianity.¹ There are some important differences, however, in that I devote more, though still limited, attention to Roman-period Judaism,² to the interplay of early Christianity with its pagan environment, and to religious developments in Late Antiquity.

It will be useful to give a brief outline of the contents of this book. The first section focuses on Judaism in the Roman imperial period. While the emphasis on diversity is hardly divorced from our contemporary concerns,³ recent studies rightly analyse early Christianity in all its diversity and with due regard to its relationship to its Jewish background and Jewish contemporaries.⁴ Here I first discuss an early example of one of the ways in which Judeans/Jews appropriated Greek traditions to improve their place in the world (Ch. 1),⁵ but also a case in which they were attacked for political, social and religious reasons (Ch. 3). These chapters focus on the Greek part of the Mediterranean, but it is too often forgotten that in the crucible of the Mediterranean not only the Greek world but also Rome is of interest for the study of Judaism in the centuries around the turn of the era, as I argue in a study of Vergil (Ch. 2).

However, all these cases occurred before the emergence of the Christ followers as separate organisations. It is one of the problems of early Christianity that it is impossible to trace this development in detail. What we can say is that the early Christ followers, who were not ethnically *Ioudaioi*, never called themselves *Ioudaioi*. Nor do the Roman authors of the late first and early second centuries, such

¹ J.N. Bremmer, Maidens, Magic and Martyrs in Early Christianity = Collected Essays I (Tübingen, 2017).

² But see also J.N. Bremmer, 'The Manifest and Hidden Heritage of Judaism', *JSJ* 31 (2000) 47–64.

³ M. Sommer, 'Wie westlich ist das frühe Christentum? Modelle frühchristlicher Diversität und die Entwicklung diversitäts-sensibler Kleingruppenmodelle in der empirischen Soziologie', ZNT 26 (2023) 71–90.

⁴ H. Leppin, *Die frühen Christen: Von den Anfängen bis Konstantin* (Munich, 2019¹, 2021³), to be read with my review in *ARYS* 17 (2019) 402–16, translated as *The Early Christians from the Beginnings to Constantine* (Cambridge, 2023), to be read with the review by A.K. Petersen, *Numen* 72 (2025) 93–104. Note that Leppin is not mentioned at all by P. Fredriksen, *Ancient Christianities: the first 500 years* (Princeton and London, 2024), whose 'Supplementary Reading' does not mention a single non-English work and hardly any non-Anglo-Saxon scholars.

⁵ For the debate over translating *Ioudaioi/Iudaei* as Judeans or Jews, see this volume, Chapter 4.1.

VIII Preface

as Pliny, Tacitus and Suetonius, mention Jews in connection with the followers of Christ.⁶ The major *Apocryphal Acts* of the later second century, that is, the *Acts of John, Acts of Andrew, Acts of Peter* and the *Acts of Paul*, also pay no attention to the Jews, except for the *Acts of Peter*, which suggests a clear distance between the Jews and the followers of Christ at this point.⁷

I therefore assume that the latter were already meeting in separate places, mostly houses (Ch. 17), by the beginning of the early second century, although they had begun as one of the many different currents of the Judaism operative at that time. However, the slow acceptance of the name 'Christian' as a self-designation and the coining of *Christianismos* as an emic term only around the middle of the second century, while *Ioudaismos* predates the Christian era (Ch. 4), suggest that the 'parting of the ways' on an ideological/religious level was much slower. The inclusion of the Hebrew Bible/Old Testament in the emerging canon and the presence of Judeans/Jews in local communities meant that the separation was never absolute. However, the lack of evidence that would allow us to study developments at the local level means that our knowledge of the process of separation as a whole will always remain severely deficient.

Let us now turn to the interplay between pagans and Christians, which I explore in the second section first by looking at various aspects of the Greek novel or of Christian literature influenced by it (Chs. 5–9). Although the walls between the study of early Christianity and its surrounding pagan world have become less solid in recent decades, it is still the case that our insights into the world of the first centuries of the common era are hampered by disciplinary traditions of studying these worlds separately. One can see this clearly, for example, in a recent authoritative handbook of Greek literature, the title of which, *Die pagane Literatur der Kaiserzeit und Spätantike*, ¹⁰ implies that Christian literature was a completely sep-

⁶ J. Barclay, "Jews" and "Christians" in the Eyes of Roman Authors c. 100 CE', in P.J. Tomson and J. Schwartz (eds), *Jews and Christians in the First and Second Centuries: how to write their histories* (Leiden, 2014) 313–26.

⁷ J.N. Bremmer, 'Jews, Pagans and Christians in the Apocryphal Acts', in S. Alkier and H. Leppin (eds), Juden – Heiden – Christen? Religiöse Inklusion und Exklusion in Kleinasien bis Decius (Tübingen, 2019) 333–62. For the middle of the second century, see M. den Dulk, Between Jews and Heretics: refiguring Justin Martyr's Dialogue with Trypho (London and New York, 2018); M. Niehoff, 'Jews and the Emergence of Christianity', in C. Hezser (ed.), The Routledge Handbook of Jews and Judaism in Late Antiquity (London and New York, 2024) 95–110 (also on the first century).

⁸ This does not mean that we should say with J. Rüpke, 'Religion in, for, and against the Roman Empire', in J. Rüpke *et al.* (eds), *Empires and Gods I* (Berlin and Boston, 2024) 101–34 at 108 that Christianity 'is to be addressed as a Jewish subgroup at least for the first two centuries CE', since this view insufficiently takes into account the growing distance between Christ followers and Judeans/Jews in these two centuries and the changing composition of the Christ followers from Judeans to non-Judeans/Jews.

⁹ See now also M. den Dulk et al. (eds), Jews and Christians in the First and Second Centuries: mapping the second century (Leiden, 2024).

¹⁰ B. Zimmermann and A. Rengakos (eds), *Die pagane Literatur der Kaiserzeit und Spät-antike* (Munich, 2022).

Preface

arate phenomenon. Consequently, such a choice prevents us from seeing the new developments of the first centuries, such as the emergence of the Apologies or the Gospels, in the context of their time. Such a choice also suggests that Christian literature was something exceptional, whereas it would have been more fruitful to present an innovative picture of these first centuries, in which all literary works, regardless of their religious background, are seen as being part of the same period and influenced by the same cultural, political and religious environment. Such an approach would have been much more productive, especially since some novelists seem to have been influenced by (Ch. 6), and even satirised, Christian literature, while the contemporary authors of the *Apocryphal Acts* were clearly reading Greek novels.

Although the study of the novel has flourished in recent times, the genre has been less discussed in relation to the religious developments of the period. However, a study of the priests in the novel shows the diversity of this function in comparison with that of Christian bishops (Ch. 5), and an analysis of sacrifice in the novel suggests that sacrifice became increasingly simplified in Roman times (Ch. 7).14 Although not a novelist, but certainly influenced by the novel, Lucian paid much attention to miracles, a phenomenon of course very well known from the New Testament. Again, this interest in miracles is a characteristic of the period shared by everyone, high or low, Christian or not (Ch. 9). ¹⁵ Another aspect of the same period is the 'mysterification' of religion (Chs. 10-14). A number of cults, even the imperial cult (Ch. 10), took on features originally associated with the famous Mystery cults of ancient Greece, Eleusis and Samothrace. At the same time, we can see that pagan philosophers and Christian theologians, such as Celsus and Origen, were very interested in the Mysteries, although they evaluated them in rather different ways (Chs. 11–12). A look at the historiography of the Mysteries shows that the interpretation of these cults proved to be a challenge for earlier scholars, even great ones (Chs. 13-14).

¹¹ This is rightly argued by R.F. Walsh, *The Origins of Early Christian Literature: contextualizing the New Testament within Greco-Roman literary culture* (Cambridge, 2021).

¹² This volume, Chapter 8.5; N. Kanavou, 'Satirizing Christianity in Lucian's *Peregrinus* and Achilles Tatius' *Leucippe and Clitophon'*, *NovT* 67 (2025) 99–123.

¹³ Bremmer, *MMM*, 219–34.

¹⁴ See also J.N. Bremmer, 'The Beginning and End of Animal Sacrifice in the Ancient World: some observations', in C. Facchini et al. (eds), Sacrifice and Sacred Violence: history, comparisons, and the early modern world (Turnhout, 2025) 47–58.

¹⁵ H. Leppin, 'Imperial Miracles and Elitist Discourses', in S. Alkier and A. Weissenrieder (eds), Miracles Revisited: New Testament miracle stories and their concepts of reality (Berlin and Boston, 2013) 233–48; R. Zimmermann (ed.), Kompendium der frühchristlichen Wundererzählungen, 2 vols (Gütersloh, 2013–2017); K. ní Mheallaigh, Reading Fiction with Lucian: fakes, freaks and hyperreality (Cambridge, 2014); S. Grau, 'Philosophers as θεῖοι ἄνδρες between Diogenes Laertius and Eunapius of Sardis. Tradition and Discontinuities in the Shaping of Miracle Workers', in M. Alviz Fernández and D. Hernández de la Fuente (eds), Shaping the "Divine Men". Holiness, Charisma and Leadership in the Graeco-Roman World (Stuttgart, 2023) 177–90.

X Preface

In the third section, I look at a number of features of, particularly, early Christianity in the second century. Again, largely because of a lack of sufficient sources, this is a difficult period to analyse. It has been described as a 'laboratory', 16 and there is some truth in this, although the term itself could easily be applied as well to other periods of Christian history. But it is clear that in the second century we begin to see Christians confronting their pagan environment (Chs. 15-16), organising places of worship (Ch. 17), looking back at the first century (Ch. 18) and expressing their intense love for Christ (Ch. 19). However, in line with the emphasis of recent studies on the diversity of early Christianity (see notes 3 and 4 above), it is still difficult to see how widespread these characteristics were or how widely their writings were read. Even if we now speak of the citification of Jesus or stress the influence of literate freelance experts, ¹⁷ it must be said that we see second-century Christianity only through a mirror darkly, with little idea of how it spread and how far its initial influence extended beyond the larger cities, except perhaps in Roman Phrygia. 18 Admittedly, the rapidity of the rise of Christianity has recently been disputed again by Stanley Stowers, and he is certainly right that previous estimates, including my own, have not always been based on reliable data. 19 Nevertheless, without such a growth it is hard to imagine the impressive literary production of early Christianity, 20 or its mention in the later second century by prominent pagan figures, such as Galen, ²¹ Lucian (Chs. 9 and 27) and Marcus Aurelius. ²²

This rise has also to be connected to the persecutions of the early second century, which we hear about in pagan sources, such as Tacitus (Ch. 20) and Pliny, ²³ but

¹⁶ For the metaphor, see J.M. Lieu, Explorations in the Second Christian Century: texts, groups, ideas, voices (Leiden, 2025) 157-73.

¹⁷ E.R. Urciuoli, *Citifying Jesus* (Tübingen, 2024); S.K. Stowers, *History and the Study of Religion: the ancient Mediterranean as a test case* (Oxford, 2024) 227–84; for such freelance entrepreneurs, see this volume, Chapter 14 note 12 and Chapter 29 note 36.

¹⁸ S. Mitchell, *The Christians of Phrygia from Rome to the Turkish Conquest* (Leiden, 2023); R. Parker, *Religion in Roman Phrygia: from polytheism to Christianity* (Oakland, 2023) 118–62.

¹⁹ Stowers, History and the Study of Religion, 285–336.

²⁰ Literary production: L.W. Hurtado, *Destroyer of the Gods* (Waco, 2016) 105–41; this volume, Chapter 29.2, but note also Eus. *HE*. 5.27.

²¹ R. Fleming, 'Galen and the Christians: texts and authority in the second century AD', in J. Carleton Paget and J. Lieu (eds), *Christianity in the Second Century* (Cambridge, 2017) 171–87; T. Tieleman, 'Galen on Disagreement: sects, philosophical methods and Christians', in A. Joosse and A. Ulacco (eds), *Dealing with Disagreement: the construction of traditions in later ancient philosophy* (Turnhout, 2022) 45–58.

²² For Marcus Aurelius, see C. Motschmann, *Die Religionspolitik Marc Aurels* (Stuttgart, 2002) 220–71; N. Huttunen, *Early Christians Adapting to the Roman Empire: mutual recognition* (Leiden, 2020) 52–57.

²³ For Pliny, see most recently G.M. Oliveiro Niglio, 'La "diversità" dei Cristiani nel carteggio tra Plinio e Traiano', in A. Maffi and L. Gagliardi (eds), *I diritti degli altri in Grecia e a Roma* (Sankt Augustin, 2011) 373–93; J. Corke-Webster, 'Trouble in Pontus: the Pliny-Trajan correspondence on the Christians reconsidered', *TAPA* 147 (2017) 371–411; M. Öhler, 'Pliny and the Expansion of Christianity in Cities and Rural Areas of Pontus et Bithynia', in M. Tiwald and J. Zangenberg (eds), *Early Christian Encounters with Town and Countryside: essays on the urban and rural worlds of early Christianity* (Göttingen, 2021) 269–97; M.H. Williams, *Early Classical Authors on Jesus* (London, 2023) 35–49.

Preface XI

also in contemporary Christian sources, such as 1 Peter (4.14–15) and Hermas' Shepherd (Vis. 3.2.1, Sim. 9.28.3–4). The legal reasons for these persecutions are still unclear. Since Christians could hardly hide their faith from their neighbours, ²⁴ one wonders why more were not executed than we hear about. We also remain largely in the dark about who was responsible for arresting Christians. In a thought-provoking article, James Corke-Webster has suggested that many Christians were accused by their fellow Christians. ²⁵ However, he has not produced a single clear case of someone being put to death because of accusations made by a fellow Christian. In short, more evidence is needed before internal accusations can be seen as a major factor in the Roman persecutions.

In any case, there can be no doubt that those intellectuals who produced accounts of the trials and executions of fellow Christians, who were not called martyrs until the middle of the second century (Ch. 21), were inspired by current historiography and biography to record important events in their community in order to encourage fellow Christians to endure under duress, to combat apostasy and to offer models for imitation. Admittedly, a proper understanding of the remaining testimonies has often been bedevilled by the search for authentic accounts. In fact, the surviving texts are media products that have been cut, edited and adapted to new circumstances in their subsequent reception, for example when used in the liturgy or in polemics against other Christians.

This does not mean, however, that they can be written off as a 'form of discourse, a literary genre' or that they 'owed much to the violence against the Jews'. The earliest examples of martyr Acts were not yet part of a genre because such a genre did not yet exist,²⁷ and the Christian appropriation of the Maccabees and their writings does not seem to have influenced their beliefs or their accounts, which do not mention a Jewish background, except sometimes for a comparison with the Maccabean mother;²⁸ more elaborate references come only in the third century.²⁹ Instead, the Christian accounts focus on the martyrs' endurance, their

²⁵ J. Corke-Webster, 'By Whom Were Early Christians Persecuted?', *Past & Present* 261 (2023) 3-46; a similar suggestion already in M. Clauss, *Klio* 94 (2012) 553-55 at 554 (in a review of T.D. Barnes, *Early Christian Hagiography and Roman History*, Tübingen, 2010¹).

²⁴ A. Luijendijk, 'Did Early Christians Keep Their Identity Secret? Neighbors and Strangers in Dionysius of Alexandria, Presbyter Leon, and Flax Merchant Leonides of Oxyrhynchus', in M. Brand and E. Scheerlinck (eds), *Religious Identifications in Late Antique Papyri*, 3rd–12th Century Egypt (London and New York, 2023) 95–123.

²⁶ W. Ameling, 'From Persecution to Martyrdom: changes in the Christian perception of the past', in A. Bettenworth *et al.* (eds), *For Example: martyrdom and imitation in early Christian texts and art* (Paderborn, 2020) 77–98.

²⁷ Contra Fredriksen, Ancient Christianities, 70 (quotations), cf. Bremmer, MMM, 350-52; this volume, Chapter 22.1 (genre).

²⁸ Maccabees: T. Hilhorst, 'Four Maccabees in Christian Martyrdom Texts', in C. Kroon and D. den Hengst (eds), *Ultima Aetas. Time, Tense and Transcience in the Ancient World. Studies in Honour of Jan den Boeft* (Amsterdam, 2000) 107–21; T. Rajak, 'The Maccabean Mother between Pagans, Jews, and Christians', in C. Harrison *et al.* (eds), *Being Christian in Late Antiquity: a Festschrift for Gillian Clark* (Oxford, 2014) 39–56.

²⁹ J.W. van Henten, 'The Maccabean Martyrs as Models in Early Christian Writings', in

XII Preface

love for Christ and their reward in heaven. It is only by treating these documents like any other historical document that we can advance our knowledge of martyrdom accounts and, consequently, of the ideas and practices of the early Christians. But this requires a detailed study of these texts, as I have tried to do before, and again here in an analysis of the *Passion of the Scillitan Martyrs* and the trial of the Egyptian bishop Phileas (Chs. 22–23). Only such detailed analysis can free us from sweeping statements about the authenticity or inauthenticity of these accounts. These trials are also examples of religious violence, a phenomenon which became increasingly common under the Roman Empire, but which remains difficult to analyse properly (Ch. 24).

Where were the intellectual centres of early Christianity? It is one of the problems of our study of the second century that this period is really too late for most New Testament scholars but too early for Patristic scholars. This is evident from the fact that the date and place of many writings of this century have often been debated without much recent advance in our knowledge. That is why, in the first volume of my Collected Essays, I devoted a great deal of attention to the five major Apocryphal Acts, which I have been able to date from about the 160s to the 220s, when the Acts of Thomas and the Grundschrift of the Pseudo-Clementines were written.33 But while the latter two were plausibly authored in Edessa, the Acts of John, the Acts of Andrew and the Acts of Peter were written in Asia Minor, plausibly in Bithynia, perhaps Nicomedia, and the Acts of Paul in its south-western region, not unlikely in Iconium. I have tried to advance our knowledge further by looking at the onomastic evidence of the latter Acts, which certainly supports the location in the south-west of Asia Minor, without allowing us to pinpoint a specific city (Ch. 25). A similar onomastic analysis of Ignatius supports his later dating, which is now increasingly accepted, but also suggests that the place of composition was not Rome, as is sometimes thought, but the region of Ephesus and Smyrna (Ch. 26), the latter of which also gave us the famous Martyrdom of Polycarp, dated before about 180 (Ch. 27).

D.J. Wertheim (ed.), The Jew as Legitimation: Jewish-Gentile relations beyond antisemitism and philosemitism (London, 2017) 17-32; N. Baumann, "Die durch den siebenfältigen Geist fruchtbare Mutter Kirche" (vgl. Hrabanus Maurus, in 2 Mach. 7). Christliche Deutungen der "makkabäischen Märtyrer" im frühen Mittelalter', in P. Bruns et al. (eds), Sterben und Töten für Gott? Das Martyrium in Spätantike und frühem Mittelalter (Münster, 2022) 1-18.

³⁰ This is not always the case: see J.N. Bremmer, 'Method and Madness in Dating the *Passion of Perpetua*', ASE 40 (2023) 85–98; F. Dolbeau, REAug 70 (2024) 348.

³¹ Bremmer, MMM, 349–454 (on the Passion of Perpetua).

³² For an excellent recent example of such an analysis, see J.M. Petitfils, 'Disfigurement and Deliverance: Eusebian portrayals of martyrdom and the *Letter of the Churches of Lyons and Vienne*', *JECS* 32 (2024) 341–65; see also J.N. Bremmer, 'The *Passion of Dioscorus* and the Authenticity of Martyrdom Accounts', in J. Borsje *et al.* (eds), *Tyrants, Heroes, Prophets, and Martyrs – Shifting Images from the Past to the Present* (Leiden, 2025), forthcoming.

³³ Bremmer, MMM, 219–34 and 'Third- and Fourth-Century Aspects of the Homilies: bishops, statues and sacrifice', in B.M.J. De Vos and D. Praet (eds), In Search of Truth in the Pseudo-Clementine Homilies (Tübingen, 2022) 351–74.

Preface XIII

These dates and places suggest that western Asia Minor was an important intellectual centre for the emergence of Christianity in the second century. On the other hand, there is also growing evidence that Alexandria was an equally, if not more important intellectual centre in the second century, since it produced not only the *Apocalypse of Peter*, but also, with varying degrees of plausibility, 2 Peter, the *Second Sibylline Oracle* (all three: Ch. 21), the *Protevangelium of James* (Ch. 28), the *Infancy Gospel of Thomas*, the *Gospel of Thomas* and the *Book of Thomas*. ³⁴ It remains unclear, however, how Christianity developed in this metropolis after the 'pogrom' of 38 (Ch. 3) and the Jewish revolt under Trajan of 115–117. ³⁵ In any case, the increasingly convincing identification of the Celsus of Origen's *Contra Celsum* as an Alexandrian philosopher allows us to see that the growth of Christianity in Alexandria worried both pagans like Celsus and, presumably, local Jews, given the Jewish pamphlet used by Celsus (Ch. 27).

However important these urban centres were, it is much more difficult to get a grip on rural Christianity, and the fact that Phrygia remains the only region where we have a reasonably good idea of some rural Christianity, thanks to the inscriptions and the 'orthodox' attention given to Montanism,³⁶ should warn us against seeing emerging Christianity as primarily an urban phenomenon. Our sources are very much biased towards the cities and so we tend to underestimate the extent of Christianity's influence on the hinterland of the great cities,³⁷ even though the vast majority of texts will have been produced in the cities.

In the fourth and final section, I turn to Late Antiquity. The rise of early Christianity remains a complicated issue that is still not easy to explain. It should be clear that we need to look at all the actors involved. Obviously, after the fall of Jerusalem in AD 70 and the devastating wars under Trajan (115–117) and Hadrian (Bar Kokhba revolt: 132–135/6), Judaism was greatly weakened: one of the results of all this was the abandonment of Greek, which must have contributed to a further loss of influence. As far as traditional Greco-Roman religion is concerned, it can be shown that it gradually changed in the centuries before Constantine, due to various factors, such as the transition into the global Roman Empire, but also the growing impact of literacy and *Intellektualisierung* on religion, the gradual loss of

³⁴ M.D. Litwa, 'Thomas in Alexandria: arguments for locating the Gospel and Book of Thomas in Alexandria', *JBL* 143 (2024) 163–83; J.N. Bremmer, 'The *Infancy Gospel of Thomas*: date, provenance, readership, education, literacy, and *Sitz im Leben*', in D. Cielontko *et al.* (eds), *The Infancy Gospel of Thomas* (Leuven, 2025) 27–52.

³⁵ See B. Schliesser, 'Jewish Beginnings: earliest Christianity in Alexandria', in B. Schliesser et al. (eds), Alexandria (Tübingen, 2021) 367–97.

³⁶ For the inscriptions, see the bibliography above, note 18. The literature on Montanism is voluminous, but, most recently, see P. Lampe and H. Mader (eds), "Montanism" in the Roman World: the New Prophecy movement from historical, sociological, and ecclesiological perspectives (Göttingen, 2024).

³⁷ Th.A. Robinson, Who Were the First Christians? Dismantling the Urban Thesis (Oxford, 2017); A. Cadwallader et al. (eds), The Village in Antiquity and the Rise of Early Christianity (London, 2023).

³⁸ As noted by Leppin, *The Early Christians*, 370.

XIV Preface

interest in or even rejection of sacrifice, changing ideas about the gods and the widening gap in religious practice between local elites and the rest of the population (Ch. 29).

It was Constantine, however, who managed to turn the Roman administration in a lasting Christian direction (Ch. 30). His longevity, the Christian education of his children, but also his generally moderate rule (although there was a shift from recognition to tolerance of non-Christian religions), combined with a stable government, laid the foundations for the development of the Christian hegemony in matters of religion.³⁹ This led to new religious developments, such as the rise of the ascetic movement as exemplified by Antony the Hermit (Ch. 31),⁴⁰ although fragments of traditional religion continued to survive in the more rural areas (Ch. 32).

In the last half-century, the study of Late Antiquity has been completely renewed by the work of Peter Brown. ⁴¹ But even Brown stands on the shoulders of his predecessors. One of them was the great Adolf von Harnack (1851–1930) who, admittedly, is not one of the giants of the study of the period, but whose contribution is not negligible either. Von Harnack's great love was the beginnings of Christianity, but his interests extended to early Islam (Ch. 33). As such, he was also a forerunner of those scholars who today include early Islam in the study of Late Antiquity, thus transcending an overly Eurocentric view of the period. Indeed, it is this period from Jesus to Muhammad that laid the roots for our ideas of religion and therefore remains a source of inspiration and contestation. ⁴²

I would like to thank the friendly and efficient staff of Mohr Siebeck, especially Jutta Thumm, for once again making this such a nicely produced book. My thanks also go to ANHIMA (Anthropologie et histoire des mondes antiques: Paris [Mètis]), Brepols (Turnhout), Brill (Leiden), the Centre for Classical Studies at the Institute of Philosophy of the Czech Academy of Sciences in Prague (Eirene), De Gruyter (Berlin), Habelt (Bonn), Harrassowitz (Wiesbaden), Peeters (Leuven), Taylor & Francis (London: Religion), Universitätsverlag Winter (Heidelberg), the Vergilian Society (Vergilius), and Wilhelm Fink (Munich) for their permission to reprint the articles mentioned in the Acknowledgements. As I noted in the prefaces to the previous volumes of my Collected Essays, it is impossible to completely redo one's own research of two decades. However, I do not wish to reprint views that I

fänge "moderner" Religion in der Spätantike (Freiburg, 2024).

³⁹ For a balanced evaluation of Constantine in this respect, see J. Wienand, 'Religiöse Toleranz als politisches Argument. Konzeptionelle Überlegungen zur konstantinischen Wende', in M. Wallraff (ed.), *Religiöse Toleranz: Moderne Ideale im Spiegel antiker Realien* (Berlin and Boston, 2016) 67–100.

⁴⁰ See also J.N. Bremmer, 'The City a Desert: the case of Jerome's *Paul the First Hermit'*, *EThL* 97 (2021) 385–409; 'A Moderate Ascetic and Wonder Worker: Hilarion of Gaza', in A. Merkt *et al.* (eds), *Provokateure, Tabubrüche und Denkabenteuer* (Göttingen, 2023) 65–85 and 'Innovative Reception: the case of Jerome's *Life of Hilarion*', in J. Meister *et al.* (eds), *Die Spätantike als Rezeptionsepoche* (Basel, 2025), forthcoming.

⁴¹ See his autobiography: P. Brown, *Journeys of the Mind: a life in history* (Princeton, 2023). ⁴² See now the fascinating study of A. Merkt, *Die religiöse Verwandlung der Welt. Die An*-

Preface XV

no longer support or to provide the reader with outdated references. I have therefore once again updated the bibliography, made a number of minor changes and corrections, occasionally added new evidence, and removed overlaps where possible. Of course, this has not been possible in every case, but I have always tried to bring the volume up to date on the more important issues.

I dedicate this volume to Laura Feldt and Tobias Nicklas, two friends who have been very important to my research since I retired at the end of 2009. Laura has been a constant source of inspiration with her projects on marginality, wilderness and total devotion, projects with which it has been a pleasure to collaborate. Tobias made it possible for me to continue with my research on apocryphal literature, when it was no longer possible in Groningen, and this has resulted in a number of books that we have edited with various other colleagues. As Director General, together with his co-directors Harald Buchinger, Andreas Merkt and Laura Lieber, he has turned the Research Centre Beyond Canon' at the University of Regensburg into a vibrant meeting place where experienced and beginning scholars, inspired not least by Tobias' own exemplary studies, do cutting-edge research in the biblical traditions beyond the canon. Having enjoyed the hospitality of these two friends on many occasions, together with my ever supportive wife Christine, I hope that this will continue to be the case in the years to come.

The many debts I have incurred over the years in writing these articles are listed at the end of each chapter. However, I owe a special debt of gratitude to Raphael Brendel. Not only did he read many of the first versions of my articles, but he has (re-)read them all for the book. In the process, he has corrected more typos than I would have liked, forced me to be more precise in a number of places and contributed many references from his unrivalled bibliographical knowledge. There can be no doubt that this book is much better than it would have been without his help!⁴⁶

⁴³ See especially L. Feldt and J.N. Bremmer (eds), Marginality, Media, and Mutations of Religious Authority in the History of Christianity = Studies in the History and Anthropology of Religion 6 (Leuven, 2019); thematic issues on wilderness and saints in Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses 97/3 (2021) and on total devotion in Religion 53/1 (2023).

⁴⁴ I mention here: The Ascension of Isaiah (2016), Thecla: Paul's Disciple and Saint in the East and West (2016), Figures of Ezra (2018), The Protevangelium of James (2020), The Apostles Peter, Paul, John, Thomas and Philip with their Companions in Late Antiquity (2021) and The Infancy Gospel of Thomas (2025), all books in the series Studies on Early Christian Apocrypha (Leuven: Peeters).

⁴⁵ Most recently, T. Nicklas, *The Canon and Beyond* (Tübingen, 2024) and *Spätantike Apostelerzählungen* (Tübingen, 2025); T. Nicklas and J. Spittler, *Reading Christian Apocrypha: tradition, interpretation, practice* (Minneapolis, 2025).

⁴⁶ I am very grateful to my friends Andreas Bendlin, Raphael Brendel and James Rives for their comments on the Preface.

Contents

Pr	eface	VII
Al	bbreviations	XXI
	Section I Jews and Judaism	
1.	Spartans and Jews: Abrahamic Cousins?	3
2.	Virgil and Jewish Literature	15
3.	The First Pogrom? Religious Violence in Alexandria in AD 38?	23
4.	Ioudaismos, Christianismos and the Parting of the Ways	37
	Section II Pagans and Christians (1. The novel: Pagan and Christian)	
5.	Priests and Priestesses in the Pagan and Christian Novel	61
6.	Ghosts, Resurrections and Empty Tombs in the Gospels, the Greek Novel and the Second Sophistic	79
7.	Animal Sacrifice in the Novel and Late Antiquity	97
8.	Eucharist and <i>Agapê</i> in the Later Second Century: The <i>Apocryphal Acts</i> and the Pagan Novel	115
9.	Hellenistic and Roman Miracle Tales	139

XVIII Contents

Section II Pagans and Christians (2. Mysteries)

10. Imperial Mysteries	161
11. Philosophers and the Mysteries	173
12. Celsus and Origen on the Mysteries	195
13. Richard Reitzenstein's Die Hellenistischen Mysterienreligionen	209
14. Religion and the Mysteries in Arthur Darby Nock's Conversion	229
Section III Early Christianity (1. Various themes)	
15. Early Christian Human Sacrifice between Fact and Fiction	253
16. God against the Gods: Early Christians and the Worship of Statues	265
17. Where Did the Early Christians Meet?	279
18. The Portrait of the Apostle Paul in the Acts of Paul	303
19. Total Devotion in the Acts of Peter	317
Section III	
Early Christianity (2. Martyrdom and Religious Violence)	
20. Tacitus and the Persecution of the Christians: An Invention of Tradition?	349
21. The <i>Apocalypse of Peter</i> as the First Christian Martyr Text: Its Date, Provenance and Relationship with 2 Peter	373
22. Imitation of Christ in the Passion of the Scillitan Martyrs?	389
23. Roman Judge vs. Christian Bishop: The Trial of Phileas during the Great Persecution	407
24. Religious Violence between Greeks, Romans, Christians and Jews	431

Contents	XIX
----------	-----

Section III Early Christianity (3. Dating and locating)

25. The Onomastics and Provenance of the Acts of Paul	453
26. The Place, Date and Author of the Ignatian Letters: An Onomastic Approach	467
27. Lucian's <i>Peregrinus</i> , Celsus, the <i>Letters</i> of Ignatius and the <i>Martyrdom</i> of <i>Polycarp</i>	487
28. Author, Date and Provenance of the <i>Protevangelium of James</i>	499
Section IV Late Antiquity	
29. How Do We Explain the Quiet Demise of Graeco-Roman Religion?	517
30. The Conversion Vision of Constantine	547
31. Athanasius' Life of Antony: Marginality, Spatiality and Mediality	565
32. Paganism in the Hagiography of Asia Minor	585
33. Harnack and Late Antiquity	605
Acknowledgements	629
Index of Names, Subjects and Passages	633

Abbreviations

AB Analecta Bollandiana AC L'Antiquité Classique

AfP Archiv für Papyrusforschung
AJA American Journal of Archaeology
AJPh American Journal of Philology

ANRW Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt

ARG Archiv für Religionsgeschichte

BABesch Bulletin Antieke Beschaving – Annual Papers on Mediterranean

Archaeology

BASP
Bulletin of the American Society of Papyrologists
BBKL
Biographisch-Bibliographisches Kirchenlexikon
BCH
Bulletin de Correspondance Hellénique
BICS
Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies

BN Biblische Notizen

Bremmer, MMM J.N. Bremmer, Maidens, Magic and Martyrs in Early

Christianity = Collected Essays I (Tübingen, 2017)

Bremmer, The World J. N. Bremmer, The World of Greek Religion and Mythology =

Collected Essays II (Tübingen, 2019)

C&M Classica & Mediaevalia
CBQ Catholic Biblical Quarterly

CGRN J.-M. Carbon, S. Peels and V. Pirenne-Delforge, A Collection of

Greek Ritual Norms (Liège, 2016-) = http://cgrn.ulg.ac.be/

ClAnt Classical Antiquity
CPh Classical Philology
CQ Classical Quarterly
CR Classical Review

CSEL Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum

DHA Dialogues d'Histoire Ancienne
DOP Dumbarton Oak Papers
EA Epigraphica Anatolica
EC Early Christianity

EThL Ephemerides Theologicae Lovanienses

F. Jacoby, Die Fragmente der griechischen Historiker

(Berlin and Leiden, 1923–1958)

G&R Greece & Rome

GRBS Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies

HR History of Religions

HSCP Harvard Studies in Classical Philology

HThR Harvard Theological Review HZ Historische Zeitschrift

XXII Abbreviations

IC Inscriptiones Creticae
ICS Illinois Classical Studies
IG Inscriptiones Graecae

JbAC Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum

JBL Journal of Biblical Literature

JDAI Jahrbuch des deutschen archäologischen Instituts

JEA Journal of Egyptian Archaeology
JECS Journal of Early Christian Studies
JHS Journal of Hellenic Studies
JLA Journal of Late Antiquity

JNG Jahrbuch für Numismatik und Geldgeschichte

JÖAI Jahreshefte des österreichischen archäologischen Instituts

in Wien

JQRJewish Quarterly ReviewJRAJournal of Roman ArchaeologyJRSJournal of Roman Studies

JSHJ Journal for the Study of the Historical Jesus

JSJ Journal for the Study of Judaism

JSNT Journal for the Study of the New Testament

ISS Journal of Semitic Studies

JSNT Journal for the Study of the New Testament

JThS Journal of Theological Studies

JWCI Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes

LÄ Lexikon der Ägyptologie LEC Les Études Classiques

LIMC Lexicon iconographicum mythologiae classicae

(Zürich and Düsseldorf, 1981–2009)

MH Museum Helveticum
NovT Novum Testamentum
NTS New Testament Studies

NTT Nederlands Theologisch Tijdschrift/Journal for Theology and

the Study of Religion

PIR² Prosopographia Imperii Romani (Berlin, 1933–2015²) RAC Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum (Stuttgart, 1950–)

RB Revue Biblique

RE Paulys Realenzyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft

(Stuttgart, 1884–1973)

REA Revue des études anciennes

REAug Revue d'études augustiniennes et patristiques

REG Revue des études grecques REJ Revue des études juives

RFIC Rivista di Filologia e di Istruzione Classica

RhM Rheinisches Museum

RHPR Revue d'Histoire et de Philosophie religieuses

RHR Revue de l'histoire des religions

RPh Revue de philologie, de littérature et d'histoire anciennes RQ Römische Quartalschrift für christliche Altertumskunde und

Kirchengeschichte

RRE Religion in the Roman Empire

Abbreviations XXIII

SCI Scripta Classica Israelica

SEG Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum SMEA Studi Micenei and Egeo-Anatolici SMSR Studi e Materiali di Storia delle Religioni

SO Symbolae Osloenses TAM Tituli Asiae Minoris

TAPA Transactions of the American Philological Association
ThesCRA Thesaurus Cultus et Rituum Antiquorum (Los Angeles,

2004-2012)

ThLL Thesaurus Linguae Latinae

VigChris Vigiliae Christianae

WJA Würzburger Jahrbücher für die Altertumswissenschaft

WS Wiener Studien

ZAC Zeitschrift für Antikes Christentum/Journal of Ancient

Christianity

ZfR Zeitschrift für Religionswissenschaft
ZKG Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte
ZKTh Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie

ZNW Zeitschrift für die Neutestamentliche Wissenschaft ZPE Zeitschschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik ZRGG Zeitschrift für Religions- und Geistesgeschichte

ZThK Zeitschrift für Theologie und Kirche

Section I Jews and Judaism

Chapter 1

Spartans and Jews: Abrahamic Cousins?

The connections between the Spartans and the Jews,¹ authentic or not, have often been analysed,² but in this chapter I will confine myself to the more recent literature, in particular the studies by Arnaldo Momigliano (1908–1987), Erich Gruen and Christopher Jones.³ No new documents have come to light since the debate on the relationship began in the eighteenth century,⁴ and the results of my discussion are in the nature of a synthesis of existing knowledge rather than an entirely new approach.

Our earliest, if indirect, source is Hecataeus of Abdera's treatise *On Egypt*, which is also the oldest surviving work on the Jews in Greek literature, although they were already known in Peripatetic circles.⁵ Hecataeus probably wrote his work on Egypt around 315 BC.⁶ Jews had been in Egypt for many centuries, but after the conquest of Egypt by Alexander the Great and the consolidation of Ptolemy's power there was a great influx of Jewish immigrants, military and otherwise. Hecataeus, who came to Egypt in the wake of Ptolemy, must soon have met some of these Jews in Alexandria. They will have stood out in the Egyptian society as people who were clearly non-Egyptian and non-Greek.⁷ Shaye Cohen has asked the question: 'How do you know a Jew in antiquity when you see one?'. The answer would surely have varied according to geography, but it is clear from papyri

¹ For the problem of whether to write Judeans or Jews, see this volume, Chapter 4.1. I have retained my original writing of Jews in this chapter, as the religious aspect is obviously important here, but in some cases 'Judean' would probably be more appropriate.

² For the older literature see the bibliography in R. Katzoff, 'Jonathan and Late Sparta', AJPh 106 (1985) 485–9 at 485 note 1, updated in id., On Jews in the Roman World (Tübingen, 2019) 288 note 1; add C. Orrieux, 'La "parenté" entre Juifs et Spartiates', in R. Lonis (ed.), L'étranger dans le monde grec (Nancy, 1988) 169–91.

³ A. Momigliano, Alien Wisdom (Cambridge, 1975); E. Gruen, Heritage and Hellenism (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London, 1998) 253–68, which is rather similar to his The Construct of Identity in Hellenistic Judaism (Berlin and Boston, 2016) 153–66; C. P. Jones, Kinship Diplomacy in the Ancient World (Cambridge MA, 1999) 73–79.

⁴ P.E. Jablonski, *Opuscula III* (Leiden, 1810) 261-86 ('De Lacedaemoniorum cum Iudaeis cognatione', 1744').

⁵ F. Dirlmeier, review of Jaeger (note 11), *Deutsche Literaturzeitung* 59 (1938) 1830–36 at 1836. For Hecataeus, see J. Campos Daroca and P. P. Fuentes González, '(no.) 12 Hécatée d'Abdère', in R. Goulet (ed.), *Dictionnaire des philosophes antiques III* (Paris, 2000) 505–25; W. Ruppenthal Neto, 'O relato de Hecateu de Abdera sobre os judeus', *Hypnos* 41 (2018) 166–92.

⁶ P.M. Fraser, Ptolemaic Alexandria, 3 vols (Oxford, 1972) 2.719-20.

⁷ See also this volume, Chapter 3.

that Jews in Egypt were often described as 'honey-coloured', 8 which is not surprising since the Egyptians themselves were not infrequently of a darker complexion. 9

However, Hecataeus did not single out physical differences or describe what he saw in Egypt, but concentrated more on the situation in Palestine than in Egypt. In his discussion, which has come down to us in an excerpt by Diodorus Siculus (40.3), ¹⁰ he describes how the Jews had been thrown out of Egypt, but had reorganised themselves in Palestine under the leadership of Moses to whose wisdom and courage he attributes the present state of the country and its legislation. For our purposes the most interesting notice is the following:

The lawgiver (Moses) laid down many rules about military training, making the young practise courage, endurance, in short bear every kind of hardship. He also led expeditions against the neighbouring tribes and divided the large amount of land he had won into allotments. He gave lots of equal size to ordinary persons, but larger ones to the priests, so that they might enjoy larger incomes, and thus perform the service of God without cessation or distraction. Ordinary persons were forbidden to sell their own lots, in any case anybody was led by greed to buy lots, oppress the poor, and cause depopulation (Diod. Sic. 40.30.6–7, tr. Jones, slightly adapted)

The features noted strongly suggest the situation in Sparta, even if its name is not mentioned. This similarity cannot be chance and has often been noted, ¹¹ but the reason for this comparison has insufficiently been thought through until now. Hecataeus' source about the Jews must have been twofold. On the one hand, we can see the influence of Egyptians, probably priests, ¹² who are responsible for the beginning of Hecataeus' report, in which he relates the Jewish expulsion from Egypt. On the other, there must have been Jews with a much more sympathetic take on their past. This is clear from the fact that Hecataeus can even quote the Torah, as he says at the end of his excursus: 'At the end of their Laws there is even written that Moses spoke these words to the Jews having heard them from God' (Diod. Sic. 40.3.6). The quote is not literal, although it seems to echo Deuteronomy (29.1), but it is hard to imagine an Egyptian priest coming up with these words.

S.J.D. Cohen, The Beginnings of Jewishness (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London, 1999) 29–30.
 For the (dark) colour of the Egyptians see A. Cameron, Callimachus and His Critics (Princeon, 1995) 233–36; J. den Boeft et al., Philological and Historical Commentary on Ammianus

ton, 1995) 233–36; J. den Boeft et al., Philological and Historical Commentary on Ammianus Marcellinus XXII (Groningen, 1995) 310; S. Walker and M. Bierbrier, Ancient Faces. Mummy Portraits from Roman Egypt (London, 1997); T. Samuels, 'Herodotus and the Black Body: a critical race theory analysis', Journal of Black Studies 46/7 (2015) 723–41.

¹⁰ Sometimes we can supplement Diodorus' excerpt. For example, Theophrastus (F 584A Fortenbaugh = Porphyry, *Abst.* 2.26) seems to have derived his information about Jewish sacrificial practice from Hecataeus, cf. W. Jaeger, *Diokles von Karystos* (Berlin, 1938) 134–53, although this is contested by Dirlmeier (note 5).

¹¹ For example: M. Hengel, *Judentum und Hellenismus* (Tübingen, 1973²) 465 (hesitatingly); Momigliano, *Alien Wisdom*, 84; Gruen, *Heritage and Hellenism*, 261: 'the parallel ... seems quite incontestable'; Jones, *Kinship Diplomacy*, 73–74; K. Berthelot, 'A New Perspective on the Kinship between Jews and Spartans: the issue of ancestral territory', in R. Brody *et al.* (eds), *A Vision of the Days: studies in early Jewish history and historiography in honor of Daniel R. Schwartz* (Leiden, 2024) 359–75 at 365.

¹² Jacoby on Hecataeus FGrH 264 F 6 (p. 50).

In passing, we may also note that we have here one of the earliest passages in post-Alexander the Great literature where the Pentateuch is referred to as a whole. On the basis of a comparison of the Wisdom of Jesus ben Sira 39.1–3 and the Prologue to the same book, Arie van der Kooij has noted a tripartite division of 'the Law, the prophets and the other books of our ancestors' at that time,¹³ but our passage already suggests the existence of the Pentateuch as a separate whole in the late fourth century BC. Momigliano even thought that 'a pre-Septuagint translation of some sections of the Torah is not altogether incredible',¹⁴ but to presuppose such translations within a good two decades after Alexandria's foundation is hardly believable.

The earliest Alexandrian Jews must soon have faced the problem of how to explain and to justify their different lifestyle, religious and secular. Hecataeus' words that Moses 'as a result of their own expulsion (xenêlasian) had introduced a way of life that was somewhat unsocial (apanthrôpon tina) and xenophobic (misoxenon)' (Diod. Sic. 40.3.4) show that even at a very early stage of Alexandrian life the Jews had to counter Greek accusations that they did not mix with other people and kept themselves separate. To defend themselves, they seem to have developed the interesting strategy of comparing their way of life to that of the Spartans. Not only did the latter also have a famous lawgiver, Lycurgus, 15 but they were also known in Greece as people who did not like foreigners and even expelled them. 16 By comparing themselves to the xenophobic but illustrious Spartans, the Jews thus cleverly, albeit clearly not always successfully, sought to legitimise their own particular way of life. From Hecataeus' description of Moses' military training, we can even conclude that some Jews must have gone quite far in elaborating the comparison, though from a historical point of view clearly much too far.

Yet the comparison must have been successful and was probably sustained by continuing Greek charges of misanthropy against the Jews. At least this conclusion is hardly avoidable from the notice in 2 Macc 5.9 that the high-priest Jason (175–172 BC), after unsuccessful attempts at finding refuge among the Nabataeans and Egyptians, finally took ship to Sparta 'because of their kinship (*syngeneian*)' and seems to have perished during this journey. We cannot be hundred percent certain that the words quoted were already in the source of our present text, the original by Jason of Cyrene which was probably written in the 150s BC, but it seems not implausible. Martin Hengel (1926–2009), followed by Christian Habicht (1926–2018) in his much praised translation and commentary on 2 Macc, suggests

¹³ A. van der Kooij, 'The Canonization of Ancient Books Kept in the Temple of Jerusalem', in id. and K. van der Toorn (eds), *Canonization and Decanonization* (Leiden, 1998) 17–40 and 'Canonization of Ancient Hebrew Books and Hasmonean Politics', in J.-M. Auwers and H. J. de Jonge (eds), *The Biblical Canons* (Leuven, 2003) 27–38.

¹⁴ Momigliano, Alien Wisdom, 84.

¹⁵ For Moses as lawgiver see especially D. Timpe, 'Moses als Gesetzgeber', *Saeculum* 21 (1980)

¹⁶ All sources for Spartan *xenêlasia*: T. Figueira, 'Xenelasia and Social Control in Classical Sparta', CQ 53 (2003) 44–74 at 45 note 6.

that the legend only originated in the time of Jason and in the circles of *Reform-judentum*, ¹⁷ but this is improbable in the light of our discussion. Anyway, if the legend would have been of such recent origin, Jason would have hardly taken it that seriously. The fact that his successor as high priest was called Menelaus (171-c.161 BC), the name of the mythological king of Sparta during the Trojan War, is probably another indication of the legend. ¹⁸

Our next testimonies are three letters in 1 Macc, a book that is to be dated to the decades around 100 BC, ¹⁹ and I will discuss them in their chronological order. The oldest two letters occur in Chapter 12 in connection with an embassy, consisting of Numenius and Antipater (12.16), sent by Jonathan (161–143 BC) around 143 BC to the Romans and Spartans. The names of the ambassadors are indicative of the early process of hellenisation of Palestine. ²⁰ Antipater is a typically Macedonian name, inspired by Alexander the Great's first successor, Antipater. ²¹ Numenius, on the other hand, was equally a proper Greek name, inspired by the celebration of the new moon, but also a Greek name borne by many Syrians and Phoenicians, where it translates the epichoric name (Ben-)Chodesch. ²² As we also find the name Chodesh in 1 Chron (8.9), a similar process seems to have taken place in Palestine.

Immediately following the text of the letter that Jonathan purportedly sent to the Spartans, we find a letter from the Spartan king Areus. The letter is also quoted by Josephus who not only adapts the style to the phraseology of a genuine Greek letter,²³ but also adds a new end.²⁴ I will give here first the text as we find it in 1 Macc and add the Josephan end:

To Onias the high priest, Areus, king of the Spartans, greeting. It has been found in a document concerning the Spartans and the Jews that they are brothers and that they are of the stock (*genos*) of Abraham. Now that we know these things, you will do well to write us concerning your peace. We in turn write to you: your livestock and your belongings are ours, and ours are yours. We therefore command that they (the letter-carriers) apprise you concerning these things (1 Macc 12.19–23). Demoteles the letter-carrier will transmit this letter. The writing is square: the seal is an eagle clutching a serpent (Jos. AJ. 12.227, tr. Jones).

¹⁷ Hengel, *Judentum und Hellenismus*, 134, 410 note 682; C. Habicht, 2. *Makkabäerbuch* (Gütersloh, 1976) 226 note 9a, who rightly rejects the idea that Jason's last journey points to the existence of a Jewish colony in Sparta, as Momigliano, *Alien Wisdom*, 89 still seems to accept.

So, persuasively, Hengel, Judentum und Hellenismus, 139; Jones, Kinship Diplomacy, 77.
 Gruen, Heritage, 265 ('probably at the end of the second century BCE'); K. Berthelot, In

Search of the Promised Land? (Göttingen, 2018) 68-71.

20 For early Greek names among the Jews see also Hengel, Judentum und Hellenismus, 118-

For early Greek names among the Jews see also Hengel, Judentum und Hellenismus, 118–20, 139

²¹ T. Ilan, Lexicon of Jewish Names in Late Antiquity (Tübingen, 2002) 264-65.

²² O. Masson, Onomastica Graeca Selecta III (Geneva, 2000) 173-4, overlooked by Ilan, Lexicon, 300.

²³ T. Nisula, ""Time Has Passed Since You Sent Your Letter": letter phraseology in 1 and 2 Maccabees', *J. Stud. Pseudepigr.* 14 (2005) 201–22 at 212–5.

²⁴ For a useful juxtaposition of letters from 1 Maccabees in Josephus' *Jewish Antiquities*, but with a superficial analysis, see F. Francis, 'The Parallel Letters of Josephus' Antiquities and 1 Maccabees', in id. and R. Wallace (eds), *Tradition as Openness to the Future* (Lanham, New York, London, 1984) 161–74.

The protagonists of this letter are the Spartan king Areus (309/8–265) and, probably, the high priest Onias I. Gruen considers Onias II more likely, but the negative picture of the latter in Josephus (AJ 12.157–67) makes this less plausible. In any case, it is beyond any reasonable doubt that this letter is not authentic. First, there are the typical Semitic formulations of putting the name of the recipient first (20), for asking after somebody's peace (22: Gen. 37.14, 43.27; Ex 18.7 etc.) and the offering of the livestock (23: 1 Kg 22.4, 2 Kg 3.7), as if Sparta was still a nomadic society, like Israel at the times of Abraham. Second, it is unthinkable that a Spartan king would have claimed to be a descendant of Abraham. The lack of authenticity is confirmed, somewhat paradoxically, by Josephus' end. As Cardauns has well noted, such detailed information is not evidence of authenticity but of forgery. Moreover, the letter-carrier with his Spartan name and several expressions of Josephus are taken straight from Xenophon (Hell. 7.1.32, 39). Even the motif of the serpent-clutching eagle is probably derived from Greece, although it has also been found on the lintels of synagogues in the Golan.

However, there is a significant difference between Areus' letter in 1 Macc and Josephus that has not received the attention it deserves. In the Maccabean version Areus claims to have read in a document, which is of course not specified, that Spartans and Jews both have Abraham as their ancestor. Naturally, the forger could not let Areus say that this was traditional knowledge, but Areus' lack of surprise at suddenly finding a new ancestor is rather striking; participants in modern television programs such as 'Who do you think you are?' would not get away with such a diffident attitude! Yet his belonging to Abraham's genos perfectly fits the notice that Jason sailed to Sparta because of their syngeneia. This clearly was the current legend among the Jewish upper-class in the first half of the second century BC. Josephus, however, speaks of an intimate relationship (oikeiotês: AJ 10.226). In the Greek world both terms, syngeneia and oikeiotês, denoted relationships between cities or peoples. However, syngeneia was used in the case of

²⁵ Areus: G. Marasco, *Sparta agli inizi dell'età ellenistica: il regno di Areo I* (Florence, 1980); P. Cartledge and A. J. Spawforth, *Hellenistic and Roman Sparta* (London, 1989) 28–37; Gruen, *Heritage*, 254–6. Onias I/II: Gruen, *Heritage*, 254 note 32 and the detailed discussion by J. Vanderkam, *From Joshua to Caiaphas: High Priests after the Exile* (Minneapolis, 2004) 124–37, with an unconvincing discussion of Areus' letter.

²⁶ The best analysis is by B. Cardauns, 'Juden und Spartaner', *Hermes* 95 (1967) 317–24 at 317–19, with previous bibliography. U. von Wilamowitz-Moellendorff, *Hellenistische Dichtung in der Zeit des Kallimachos*, 2 vols (Berlin, 1924) 1.43 note 1, already noted: 'eine freche Fälschung'; this negative judgment is not refuted by O. Amitay, 'The Correspondence in I Maccabees and the Possible Origins of the Judeo-Spartan Connection', *SCI* 32 (2013) 79–105, who unconvincingly argues their authenticity.

²⁷ This is well observed by J. Goldstein, *1 Maccabees* (New York, 1976) 460, who refers to J. A. Fitzmeyer, 'Some Notes on Aramaic Epistolography', *JBL* 93 (1974) 201–25 at 211.

²⁸ Cardauns, 'Juden und Spartaner', 319; the connection with Xenophon had already been noted by F.-M. Abel, *Les Livres des Maccabées* (Paris, 1949) 222.

²⁹ M. Schmidt, 'Adler und Schlange. Ein griechisches Bildzeichen für die Dimension der Zukunft', *Boreas* 6 (1983) 61–71; Y. Turnheim, 'The Eagle and the Snake on Synagogue Lintels in the Golan', *Rivista di Archeologia* 24 (2000) 106–13.

blood relationship or common ancestry, whereas *oikeiotês* indicated just close relationships.³⁰ Josephus clearly lived in a different world from Jason and Cleodemus, and he knew it. In his time, claims of *syngeneia* would no longer be acceptable, and that is why he, much more subtly, opted for the Greek term *oikeiotês*.

Let us now move on to the second letter. Given that Areus' letter is a fake, albeit an interesting one, any letter that refers to it must by necessity be suspect too. Is this also the case with Jonathan's letter? Let us take a closer look:

Jonathan the high priest, the senate of the nation, 31 the priests, and the remaining Jewish people to their brothers the Spartans, greeting. Already in time past a letter was sent to Onias the high priest from Areus, your king, that you are our brothers, as the appended copy shows. Onias welcomed the envoy with honour, and received the letter, which contained a clear declaration of alliance and friendship. Therefore, though we have no need of such relations, since we have as encouragement the holy books which are in our hands, we have endeavoured to send this letter to renew our brotherhood and friendship with you, so that we may not become alienated from you, for it is a long time ago since you sent your letter to us. We therefore remember you constantly on every occasion, both at our feasts and the other appropriate days, at the sacrifices which we offer and in our prayers, as it is right and proper to remember brothers. And we rejoice at your glory. But as for ourselves, many afflictions and many wars have encircled us and the kings around us have made war against us. We did not want to annoy you, the other allies and our friends in these wars, for we have the help from heaven coming to our aid, and we were rescued from our enemies, and our enemies were humbled. We therefore have chosen Numenius the son of Antiochus and Antipater the son of Jason, and have sent them to Rome to renew the former friendship and alliance with them. We have commanded them to go also to you, to greet you and deliver to you this letter from us concerning the renewal and our brotherhood. And now we would very much appreciate it if you send us a reply to this (1 Macc 12.6–18).

As with his report of the letter of Areus, Josephus supplies us with a version that is much more like the decrees of Greek cities in the Hellenistic period and does not contain embarrassing sentences (*AJ* 13.166–70). However, unlike Christopher Jones, I would not conclude from this more tactful composition that Josephus' version is more authentic.³² As with the letter of Areus, he was just better informed and more sensitive to the world around him.

In fact, as especially Gruen has argued, the idea that the Jews would have any advantage by approaching Sparta around that time, is hard to sustain.³³ It is also difficult to imagine that the author of 1 Macc would have concentrated on the Spartans only and not mentioned anything from the letter to the Romans, if both letters would

³⁰ For the terms, see Ed. Will, 'Syngeneia, oikeiotès, philia', *RPh* 69 (1995) 299–325; O. Curty, 'La parenté légendaire à l'époque hellénistique: précisions méthodologiques', *Kernos* 12 (1999) 167–94 and 'Les parentés entre cités chez Polybe, Strabon, Plutarque et Pausanias', in V. Fromentin and S. Gotteland (eds), *Origines gentium* (Paris, 2001) 49–56; D. Musti, 'La "syngheneia" e la "oikeiotes": sinonimi o nuances?', in M.G. Angeli Bertinelli and L. Piccirilli (eds), *Antiqua et mediaevalia.* 4, *Linguaggio e terminologia diplomatica dall'Antico Oriente all'Impero Bizantino* (Rome, 2001) 43–63.

³¹ On the gerousia see Hengel, Judentum und Hellenismus, 48-51.

³² Jones, Kinship Diplomacy, 77–79.

³³ Gruen, *Heritage*, 257–58.

have been available in the Jerusalem archives. Moreover, the letter is puzzling from a practical point of view, as Jonathan does not require any specific help, is patently insincere, as it is hard to imagine that the Jews would remember the Spartans during their sacrifices and festivals, and demonstrates a lack of awareness of the Spartan position after the Roman destruction of Corinth in 146 BC.³⁴ Finally, the letter is couched in terms that clearly go far beyond what was possible in contemporary diplomatic relations. Surely, if one wants good diplomatic contacts, the last thing to write is: we do not need your help for we have a much better, supernatural ally.

A noteworthy passage in the letter is that Jonathan claims that the Jews have bagia biblia, 'holy books', to encourage them (1 Macc. 12.9). The combination of hagia with biblia is unique and not found in earlier Greek literature. Like the translators of the Septuagint, 35 the author of 1 Macc clearly avoided the term hieros, which reminded him probably too much of the Greek cultic usage, whereas the much rarer hagios has more the connotations of 'pre-eminently respectable' and 'ancient'. But which books were they? According to 1 Maccabees (3.48), before a decisive battle during the war against Antiochus IV Epiphanes, the Jews under Judas the Maccabee 'unrolled the Book of the Law' in order to inquire about the outcome of the battle, and in 2 Maccabees (8.23), Judas publicly read 'the Holy Book' and gave out as watchword 'God is my help'. 37 The latter words frequently recur in 1 and 2 Maccabees and will have been Judas' battle cry, 38 a reflection of which we also find in our letter's 'for we have the help from heaven coming to our aid' (12.15). The main focus of the Maccabees clearly was the Pentateuch, and we may presuppose these books also in our case. Although at that time the Pentateuch was already called the 'Holy Book', there has not yet been found a single scroll containing all the five books of Moses, the exceptions perhaps (but not certainly) being 4Q365, which contains fragments of all five books of the Pentateuch, and Mur 1, which contains fragments from Genesis, Exodus and Numbers. 39 If such scrolls did indeed exist, the scroll(s?) of the Pentateuch that was taken from the Temple by the Romans may well have been one too. The fact that it was displayed at the triumphal procession of Vespasian and Titus as well as afterwards kept in the imperial palace itself, together with the purple hangings of the Temple, surely suggests a very special scroll.40

³⁴ J. R. Bartlett, 1 Maccabees (Sheffield, 1998) 96.

³⁵ The exceptions are Jos 6.8 and Dan 1.2.

³⁶ J. Nuchelmans, 'A propos de *hagios* avant l'époque hellénistique', in A. Bastiaensen *et al.* (eds), *Fructus centesimus. Mélanges G. J. M. Bartelink* (Steenbrugge and Dordrecht, 1989) 239–58.

³⁷ The exact text of the verse is debated, but the expression 'Holy Book' is not in doubt, cf. Habicht *ad loc*.

³⁸ J.T. Nelis, *I Makkabeeën uit de grondtekst vertaald en uitgelegd* (Roermond, 1972) 214 compares 1 Macc 3.18–22, 4.8–11; 16.3; 2 Macc 8.20, 23, 35; 12.11; 13.13; 15.8, 35; Habicht, on 2 Macc 8.23, also compares 1QM IV 13 (the War Scroll).

³⁹ E. Tov, Scribal Practices and Approaches Reflected in the Texts Found in the Judean Desert (Leiden, 2004) 74–79.

⁴⁰ Jos. *BJ* 7.121–57, 162.

What about the third letter? According to the author of 1 Macc (14.16), the Romans and 'even the Spartans' were highly distressed when they heard about Jonathan's death. Once again, the mention of Sparta looks like an afterthought, as the place in the sentence indicates and the fact that the verbs in the next two verses regard only the Romans.⁴¹ In fact, after mentioning the letter the Romans sent on brass tablets to renew the friendship and alliance with the Jews, which in itself is a pretty improbable detail, the transition to the letter of the Spartans is rather abrupt:

And this is a copy of the letter which the Spartans sent: 'The magistrates and the city of the Spartans to Simon the high priest, the elders, the priests and the rest of the Jewish people, our brothers, greeting. The envoys who were sent to our people have told us about your glory and honour, and we rejoiced at their coming. And what they said in the councils of the people we have recorded as follows: "Numenius the son of Antiochus and Antipater the son of Jason, envoys of the Jews, came to us to renew their friendship with us. It has pleased the people to receive these men with honour and to place a copy of their words in the State Archives, so that the people of the Spartans may have a record of them". And they have sent a copy of this to Simon the high priest' (1 Macc 14.20–23).

Although some scholars still seem inclined to accept the authenticity of this letter, 42 this is rather unlikely: when the two earlier letters are not authentic, the third one can hardly be authentic either, as Gruen reasonably observes. 43 And indeed, there are several questionable expressions in the letter. Although the letter mentions the envoys of Jonathan, the letter is addressed to Simon. Goldstein suggests that a private Jewish traveller reported the news of Jonathan's execution while the envoys were in Sparta, but this ingenious suggestion clearly constitutes special pleading, just as his earlier, rather fantastic suggestion that Areus employed an Aramaic scribe to translate his letter into Aramaic.⁴⁴ The suggestion also passes over the fact that the vocabulary of the letter does not look Spartan at all and does not contain any specific Spartan expression. Moreover, the Greek is sometimes rather convoluted and employs typically Jewish-Greek expressions. 45 To start with, the combination of archontes and polis (20) is unique for Sparta, where we would expect mention of the ephors, but the combination does occur in early second-century Seleucid royal letters. 46 The same is true for the combination 'glory and honour' (21), which we find from the middle of the third century BC onwards in Seleucid royal letters. ⁴⁷ Jewish influence can be seen in the term used for the high

⁴¹ See also the commentaries of Nelis and Schunck *ad loc*.

⁴² Momigliano, Alien Wisdom, 113-14; Jones, Kinship Diplomacy, 78.

⁴³ Gruen, Heritage, 258-59.

⁴⁴ Goldstein, 1 Maccabees, 456-7 (Aramaic scribe), 492 (traveller).

⁴⁵ See especially the commentary of Nelis *ad loc*.

⁴⁶ Compare C.B. Welles, *Royal Correspondence in the Hellenistic Period* (New Haven, 1934) no. 43.2 (Nysa: early second century BC); 45.2 (Pieria: 186 BC), no. 75.1 (Susa: AD 21 = F. Canali de Rossi, *Iscrizioni dello Estremo Oriente Greco* (Bonn, 2004) no. 218.2).

⁴⁷ Welles, *Royal Correspondence*, no. 15.12 (after 261 BC: Erythrae = *I. Erythrae* 31.11); 42.6 (ca. 196 BC: Ilion = *I. Ilion* 37.6); 44.19–20 (189 BC: Daphne); 52.37 (167/6 BC: Miletus = *I. Miletus* 306.Ib.37); note also *I. Ilion* 32.33 (decree for Antiochus I: ca. 280 BC).

Index of Names, Subjects and Passages

Abercius - epitaph 323, 612 - Life of Abercius 319, 323 Achilles Tatius - date/place 67, 88–89, 100 - and Eucharist 128 - and Protevangelium of James 505–06		Acts of John - agapê 119 - and Chariton 116 - date/place 65, 116–17, 295 - Eucharist 118–20, 296 - and Lucius Verus 116–17 - and Xenophon of Ephesus 116		
- 1.1.2	100	- 18.37-45	593	
1.13.5	100	30	116	
2.2.5 - 2.3.1	128	31	65	
2.12.2	100	42-47	66	
2.14.2	100	42	156	
2.15.1	100	44	275	
2.18.2-3	100	46	296	
3.9.13	67	48	118	
3.12.1	69	56	65	
3.15.3	69	60-61	289	
3.22	100	65-71	118	
3.24.25	69	72	118, 120, 132	
4.1.2-7	70, 100	73	65	
4.7–18	67	73-83	118	
4.12.8	67	84	119	
5.11.3	506	85	119, 120	
5.19.4	67	108	119	
5.26.9	100	110	120	
6.11.4	100	Acts of Paul (and	Thecla)	
6.12.2	67	- and canonical A		
7.3.6	67	- and Acts of Titi	us 454	
7.12.2-4	70, 100	– agapê 126		
7.15.1	71	- author 464-65		
7.16.2	71	- date/place 71-2	72, 125, 288, 304, 453, 465	
8.6.14	68	- Eucharist 126-		
8.13	506	- and 'first of the city' 465-66		
8.15.2			- onomastics 453-66	
Acta Munati Felio	cis 292	- Syriarch 459		
Acts of Andrew		- Thecla 309, 315, 462		
- date/place 68, 121		- and 2 Timothy 457, 459, 464		
- Eucharist 121–22		- Tryphaena 459		
- literary names 305		- unity of 453-55		
- 13	118	– via Šebaste 204		
21–22	289	- 1	304	

	2	305		4.78, 79, 84, 91	331-32
	3	304-05		4.95	341
	3.5	126, 295		4.98-99	342
	3.7	300		4.100-02	325
	4.27, 38-39	318		5	125
	5	134		5.105-07, 112	333
	5.4	307		5.119, 121, 139	325
	8.7	305		6.158-62	326
	9.1-2	295		6.168	333
	9.4	126		6.169-70	341
	9.5-7	126		6.191	328
	9.21	127		7.206-08	341
	12.4, 5	127		7.214	333
	14	126, 289		7.224-26	326, 341
	26	71		8.234-40	327-28
	28	72		9.270	328
	29	378		9.278-79	341
A	cts of Peter			9.281	328
	and Acts of Phili	p 323		10.290, 295, 391-	-92 328
_	Agrippa 334			11.240-42	329
	in Amphilochius	s 319		11.337, 340	323
_	burial 330			11.348-49	329
_	Christ/God as L	Dominus 326		12.367-69	342
_	Christ, importar	nce of 339-40		13	333
	conversion 323,			14	329
_	crucifixion 338			14.382-83	342
_	crying 321			15.400	333
	date/place 123, 3	318		17.424-90	344
	dunamis/virtus			19.508	329
_	speaking dog 32	8		20	295
	Eucharist 123–2			20.22	334
	flying 332			22.605	330
	God's power 34	3		23.615-16	341
	and Life of Aber			23.627-28	342
	Marcellus 327-3			27.690-91	342
	miracles 341	•		28.703-05	342
	Nero 339			28.713	342
	patrons 343-44			28.719	333
	Quo vadis 336-	37, 349		30-41	319, 539
	and resurrection			31.815-16	332
	Simon Magus, se		_	Martyrdom, ed.	
_	slavery of Christ	t/God 326, 344–45		1	344
	text 319-21			4-5	336
	voice 332			6.1-2	336
	1.1	341		7.1–2	338
	1.6, 8, 15	326		12	339
	1.18–20	322		12.4	336
	2	124	A	cts of Philip 590-	
	2.27	333		and Acts of Peter	
	2.60, 62	325		magic 591–92	
	,				

. 501		. D. 1. (2	
- mantis 591		- at Paphos 63	
- snakes 592–94	502	- priest 62, 67	
- and tour of hell	592	- priestess 62	400
Acts of Thomas	120	- sacrifice to 99-	-103
- Gnostic hymns		- statue 70	
- 2	318	Apion 33, 254	
4, 16	289	Apocalypse of Pet	
45	318		ake/Elysium Field 379
51–54	135	 and Apocalypse 	of Moses 379
139, 160	318	- cats 382	
Adams, E. 282–9.	3	 date/place 150 	
Aeschylus		- and Epistula A	
– Agamemnon		- and Lucian 14	5, 384
- 1150	471	– martyrdom 37	4-81
– Septem		- Nero 364, 380	
- 710	82	 Orphic tradition 	on 382
- Fragments, ed.	Radt	– Second Sibyllin	e Oracle 383–84
- 225	471	- 2.7-9E	383
310	82	2.10, 11, 13E	375, 383
agalma/eikôn 30		6.2E	383
Agrippa I 28		9.2-3E/27G	375-76
Aland, K. 547-48	1	9.4E	376
Albinus 28		10E	382-83
Alexander Polyhi	stor 13	14.4-6E	364, 380, 382
Alexandria		28G	368
- Christian teach	ers 295	33G	382-83
- church 290		Apollonius of Ty	ana 89–90
- gerousia, Jewish 31		- and magic 92	
- Greeks 34		- resurrections b	v 92, 152
- gymnasium 29		- on sacrifice 10	
- intellectual cen	tre XIII, 387	- sources for 91	
	4, 437–38, 447, 512–14	Apostles, heal for	free 91, 243
 and Mysteries 		Apuleius	,
- 'pogrom' 23–35		- date/place 88	
- theatre 29		 and Eucharist 	128
Alföldi, A. 552		- and Mysteries	
Alikin, V. 115		- no sacrifice 10	
Ameling, W. 26,	167	- Apol.	0,000
Ammianus Marce		- 12	180
- 17.11.1	76	55	180
22.14.3	76	- Flor.	100
25.4.17	76	- 9.10, 11	403
Amsler, F. 590, 59		9.12	401
Ando, C. 106, 52		- Met.	. • .
Anrich, G. 213–1		- 2.5	142
Antonius Diogen		2.28	74 , 91
- date/place 63, 8		2.28–30	89
- empty tomb 87		3.15.1	180
Aphrodite		9.14	128
- Mysteries 248		9.15	129
111,0001100 210		7.13	/

0.20		
9.29 91	- translations 581	
11.22 215	- and wilderness	
11.29 216	- 1.1-2	572, 574
11.24.3 540	2.5, 3.1–4	572
Archilochus, and Paul 306–07, 314	4.1	575
Arens, W. 253	7–8	572
aretology 143, 149–50, 244	12, 14	572
- aretalogos/us 148-49, 154	14.1–2, 15.1	570
- and Asclepius 154	20	569, 574
- authentication 150, 153	34	569
- 'good tiding' 143	46	571, 580
- and Isis 154	47	573
Aricia, and Diana 331	49, 52.3	571
Aristides	55.11–12	575
- Apol.	66.2	576
- 2.2, 15–17 367	68	569
17.2 257	72.3	572
Arnold, J. 196, 204	73.2–3	576
Artemis	74.2	572
- acclamation 317, 537	76–77	576
- Ephesus 65, 74, 100, 118, 318, 593	77.1	572
– and deer 590	81	575
- festivals 165, 596	82.3	567
- in Late Antiquity 595, 598, 601	89	569
- Mysteries 205	90.4	579
- Phosphoros 70, 100-01	91.8	579
- priest 65-66, 70, 118	91.9	567
- priestess 68, 74–75	93.1	573
- sacrifice 99-100	Athanassiadi, P. 4	33-34
- statue 272	atheism 234, 255	
Ascension of Isaiah	Athenagoras	
- and Nero 361-62	- on Mysteries 24	7
- 4.1-4 362	– on statues 270–	71
5.13 381	- Leg.	
Asinius Pollio 15	- 1.1	247
Assmann, A. 436	1.3	367
Assmann, J. 35, 432, 435-36	4.1	247
astrologers, Chaldaean 238	17	271
Athanasius	22.9, 28.8-9	247
- Life of Antony 153, 566-82	27	270
- Antony and Arians 570	31.1	255
- Antony not illiterate 572, 574–76	32.1	247
- Antony's old age 570-71	35.3	256
- Antony and Pythagoras 567-70, 572,	Athenodorus 272-	-73
577	Atran, S. 344-45	
- and askêsis 571	Aubert, JJ. 405	
- composition/content 566-72	Augustine	
- diegesis 577	- conversion 559	
- and martyrs 580	- Harnack on 608	3–10
- readership 577–79	 and Scillitan ma 	
r		,

15 11				
- and Possidius 60	09		26	84
- Confessiones			48.20	318
- 8.12.20	566		49.3, 5	318
8.6.14–15, 12.29			Daniel	
– De cura pro mor			12.1–3	84
- 12.15	147–48		Matthew	
– De gratia Christ	i	-	9.1-8	142
- 1.1	577		12.46-50	425
automatos 127, 188	8		14.22–3	93
			14.35	504
Bacchanalia scanda	al 438		19.26	329
Bagnall, R. 575, 57	78		22.14	377
Balzat, JS. 462			22.21	397
Bardaisan 324, 506	ó		23.7	508
Barnes, T.D. 368,	409, 443–44, 552–55,		23.35	508
563, 594			26.39, 42, 44	364, 381
Baronius, C. 611			27.7	505
Bartelink, G.J.M.	153, 292, 594–95	_	Mark	
Barth, K. 223	,,		1.28	504
3 Baruch 379			2.1–12	142
Bastiaensen, A.A.I	R. 396–97		3.6	46
Baucis and Phileme			5.35-43	153
Bauckham, R. 378			6.45–51	93
Bauer, W. 469	, 302		6.49	82
Baumbach, M. 61,	76_77		7.17	281
Bausi, A. 290, 375.			9.33	281
beard 76	, 500, 407		10.10–12	281
Beatty, A.C. 408			12.13	46
Becker, M. 188			12.17	397
	162 63		14.36, 39	
Belayche, N. 110,	102-03		•	364, 381
belief(s) 238, 340	22		15.16	505
Bergmann, W. 24,	32		Luke	504
Beskow, P. 396		_	4.14	504
Betz, M. 309, 315			4.16–30	533
Bible	0.4.05		4.33	83
- date of Gospels			5.17–26	142
- Gospels and Gre	eek novel 94–96		7	80-81
- Paul 219-20			8.41–56	81
- reading of 299-	300		8.52	84
- Genesis			11.21–22	325
- 1-4	16		20.25	397
- Exodus			22.42	364, 381
- 22.20	430		23.55	82
- Esther, LXX			24	82
- 8.17	41		24.1–12	86
– Psalms			24.11	84
- 13.4	84		24.30, 35	120
– Isaiah 15–16			24.39	152
- 7.14	15	_	John	
11.6–7	15	_	6.15-21	82

	11.43, 44	81		9–11	353
	18.10	13		12.11	539
	18.28, 33	505		13.1-13	353
	19.9	505		14-15	353
	20.1–10	86		14.18	539
	20.20, 27	152		15.5	353
	21	363		16.5	283-84
	21.18-19	381		16.18	539
_	Acts		-	1 Corinthians	
_	1.3	83	-	1.10-17	216
	1.13, 15	280		1.16	283
	2.20	504		3.2	219
	2.42, 46	120, 280		7.22	317, 539
	5.42	280		7.35	318
	6.8	314		10.14	266
	6.15	314		11.24	218
	7.59	378, 504		11.27-29	135
	8.3	280		14.23	283
	8.9-13	331		15.46	216
	9.11, 17	281		15.51	207
	9.32-35	156		16.15	283
	9.36-42	83		16.19	283-84
	9.43	281	_	2 Corinthians	
	10.27	281	_	10.3-4	325
	11.26	46, 368		10.10	312
	12	280	_	Galatians	
	13.50	466	_	1.10	317, 539
	14.11-12	86		1.13-14	41, 43
	16.46	281		5.20	266
	17.5	281	_	Ephesians	
	18.3	283		6.7	325, 539
	19.19	220	_	Philippians	
	19.28	318, 537		1.1	317, 396, 539
	20.7-12	83, 123, 281–82		2.2	539
	20.11	120, 299	_	Colossians	
	20.19	539	_	1.7	539
	20.20	281		4.2	539
	21.8, 16	281		4.15	280
	22.6	144		4.16	283
	26.13	144		1 Thessalonians	
	26.08	368	_	3.8	376
	26.28	51		5.27	299
	27.35	120		9.10	317
_	Romans		_	1 Timothy	
_	1.1	317, 396, 539	_	6.16	400
	1.6	539	_	2 Timothy	
	1.22-25	275		2.24	
	2.7	353		Philemon	
	6.4	219		2, 22	280
	6.22	317		Hebrews	

date/place 360		Bouvier, B. 590
- 10.36-12.13	360	Bovon, F. 590
– James		Bowersock, G. 84, 87, 94–96, 127, 152, 193
- 1.1	317, 539	Bowes, K. 287, 290, 297
318	505	Bowie, E.L. 66, 98
– 1 Peter		Boyarin, D. 45
 date/place 51, 3 	363	Brakke, D. 576
- 1.19	505	Brendel, R. XV
4.16	51, 367	Brown, M.P. 468
5.6	505	Brown, P. XIV, 339, 584, 607, 609
5.13	363	Burckhardt, J. 562-63
21.19	363	- on Constantine 626
- 2 Peter		Burkert, W. 97, 102, 145, 161, 224, 231, 236,
- date/place 386	-87	245, 258, 589
- 1.1	539	Bury, J.B. 338
2.5	380	
2.12	505	Callon, C. 310
3.15	505	Cameron, Al. 443
- 2 John		Cameron, Av. 568, 624
- 10	283	Campenhausen, H. von 474, 508
– Jude		Carleton Paget, J. 512
- 10, 11	505	Celsus
12	136	- and Christianity 202-03
- Revelation		- Corybantic Mysteries 201
- 1.1	317	– date/place 197
13	361	– Dionysiac Mysteries 198–99, 201
14.3	165	– Egyptian Mysteries 199–200
17.14	377	- Eleusinian Mysteries 198, 243
Bickerman, E. 24		- Hecate of Aegina 243
bishops	,,	- Jewish source 54, 512–13
chorepiscopus	587	- Mithraic Mysteries 197–98, 201–02, 243
 and Constanting 		- and Mysteries 195–208
Bloch, R. 55	01,020	- and Orphic Mysteries 198
Blondel, D. 443		- Sabazios Mysteries 201–02
Bodmer, M. 408		- and Samothrace 198
Bömer, F. 16		- on statues 270
Boll, F. 217		Certeau, M. de 345
Bollók, J. 307, 312	2	Chaldaean Oracles 189
books	-	Chaniotis, A. 537
- burning of 443		Chariton
- capsa 399		- and Acts of John 116
and Christianit	x 532_33 619_24	- date/place 62, 85, 98
- codex, miniatu		- empty tomb motif 94
- discovery of 58		- and 'first of the city' 62, 466
- expensive 578	57, 574	- and Gospels 95
- in Mysteries 22	26	- and sacrifice 98–99
- on Mysteries 2		- 1.1 98
Boukoloi, revolt		1.6.4
Boulnois, MO.		1.7.2
Bousset, W. 225,		1.7.2 83
Doubbet, W. 443,	337	1.7.7, 7

- conversion 345, 624-25

- disruption families 363, 425

2.1.2	98	- diversity VII, 136, 546
2.2, 4	98	- and Domitian 38, 361
2.5.4	466	- in Egypt 419, 428, 528
3.1	98	- and emotions 542
3.2.15	98	eschatology 199, 201–02
3.3.1	86	 Eucharist, see s.v.
3.7.7	99	- faith, see s.v.
3.8.3	99	 God as creator 274, 421, 538
3.9.1, 4	62	- heresy 533
4.3.1	466	- human sacrifice 253-64
4.3.7	99	– idolatry 266–67
4.3.10	98	 accused of incest 256–57
4.4.3	466	 intellectual centres XII–XIII
4.7.4	99	- against Jews 446-48
5.3.11	98	- lacking bona mens 394, 417
5.5.5	98	- literacy 297, 531, 619-24
5.7.10	99	– literature X
5.10.1	98	meeting places 202, 279–301, 545
6.2.2 - 4, 7	99	- Montanism XIII, 297
6.7.10	466	- as Mysteries 202, 208, 213
6.8.3	99	- name VIII, 45-51, 366-71
7.4.10	99	 Neronian persecution 349–71
8.5.2	99	- onomastics 612-13
Chamberlain, I	H.S. 618	- organisation 543
Christians/Chi	ristianity	 Parting of the Ways VIII, 37–57
– agapê 115–3	8	- patrons 297-98, 327-28
 Alexandria, s 	see s.v.	as philosophy 465
– apostasy 340), 376, 398	 persecutions (denied) X–XI, 413–14,
 and aristocra 	.cy 327, 625–26	525–26
– in army 626-		 prayer, importance of 292–93
 and associati 	ons 137–38, 207, 244, 301	– rural XIII, 528
– as atheists 25	55–56	- sacrifice 544
- baptism 293		 second century X
 and cannibal 	ism 253-64	secret doctrines 200–01, 206–07
 and cemeteri 		and slavery 345
– charity, Chri	stian and pagan 327	 slaves of God/Christ 317–46, 396, 424,
	Christiani 50, 358, 370	538–39
– Chrestus/Ch	ristus 49–50, 370	 social composition 202, 297, 300
– Christ/God		- spread of 245-46, 433, 624-27
 Christ, total 	devotion to 238, 321–26,	steadfastness 398, 402
339-40, 344-	-45	 freelance teachers 295
- Christ, as Sa	viour 423–24	- temple destruction 445-46
	s sum 398, 405, 426	- textual communities 619
	os/us 51–54, 468	- violence 442-49, 589
– Christianitas		- widows 327, 329, 334
– Christianos/i		- (wealthy) women 230, 280-81, 295, 298,
- churches, ter		336, 343, 363
	99–400, 532, 620–21	Claudius 29
20022200000000	45 (24 25	Claumbana

Clearchus

- Fragments, ed. Wehrli

- 86	471	Corke-Webster, J. XI, 413			
Clemens Alex.		Corpus Hermeticum XIII, 217			
 knows Galen 	507	Courcelle, P. 582			
 and Mysteries 	173–74, 244	Crescens 255			
 and Protevang 	elium of James 508	Cribiore, R 576			
- and statues 27	2, 277	crucifixion 32			
- Hypotyposes 5	513	Culcianus 408, 415-16			
- Paed.		Cynegius 443			
- 2.1.4.34	131	Cyprian			
3.8.45	505	- Ēp.			
- Protr.		- 55.2.1 440			
- 2.13.1-22.2	238	63.171–72 136			
2.15.1-3	244	Cumont, F. 161, 170, 195, 216-17, 221, 223,			
2.17.1	247	239, 242, 589–90			
4.46	272	Cureton, W. 470			
4.47	272	,			
4.48, 50	273	Daidala 175			
4.52–53, 57	273	Davis, N.Z. 24			
5.64.5	247	De Ste Croix, G.			
- Strom.	,	on early Christians 261, 402			
- 7.16.93.7	508	death, as sleep 84			
1 Clement		Dehandschutter, B. 474			
- date/place 362)	Deichmann, F. 445			
	persecution 362–63	Deissmann, A. 220, 539			
- 5-6	362	delatores 376–77			
60.2	539	Delatte, A. 597			
2 Clement 20.1	539	Demeter Demeter			
Cohen, S.J.D. 3-		- sacrifice 102			
Coleman, K. 35		- theologoi 165			
		demons			
Coles, R. 404, 49 Collins, J. 267	10	- in baths 122			
		- hlack 146, 330			
Constantine					
- and army 561		- exorcism 329			
- baptism 560	an Pridae 540	Deubner, L. 165 Devil			
- Battle of Milvi		- black 330			
- and bishops 5					
- and Christogr		- behind Simon Magus 333			
- conversion vis		Dialogue between Papiskos and Jason 512–			
conversion, paand churches	207	13 D: 1 - 1 -			
	28/	Didache			
– at Grand 550	552 550 50	- 14.1 123, 134			
– and <i>labarum</i>		Diels, H. 211–12, 614			
- and martyrs 2		Didius Julianus 313			
- reception of 5	02-03	Dieterich, A. 211, 216, 220–21, 592			
- religion 560	100 10 537 543	Dionysos, sacrifice 102			
- and sacrifice 1		Dionysios of Corinth 123, 379, 484–85,			
- and staurogram		494, 531–32			
- and tolerance		Dittenberger, W. 211			
Constitutio Anto	nınıana 526	Dodds, E.R. 338			
Cooper, K. 440		Döhler, M. 333			

Dubois, JD. 500		eusebeia/hosiotês	234
Duval, Y. 292		Eusebius	
		– Hist. Eccl.	
Eastman, D.L. 40	0	- 4.11.8	294
Eck, W. 461		4.22.5	461
Eckhardt, B. 55		4.23	123, 532
Edessene Chronicl	e 286	5.1.9	256
Egypt/ians		5.2.5	378
– in Alexandria 2		6.41.18	378
– bilingual 575–7	'6	8.1.5	292
- colour 4		8.2.1	287
- Coptic, rise of	576	8.9.7–10, 12	407
- and Greeks 34		8.9.7–8	409, 412–13, 425–26
 and Jews 26–27 		8.10.8	427
- martyr cult 579	•	8.11.1	612
- no Mysteries 17	77, 199–200, 240	8.13.7	412
 rise Christianity 	y 613	9.9.10-11	552
- wisdom 176, 20	0	– Laus Constanti	ni
Ehlen, O. 502–03		- 5.5	561
Elsner, J. 107		– Mart. Pal.	
emic/etic 38		- 9.2	109
Empedocles		– Praep. Ev.	
– B 111.9DK	95	- 3.13.24	148
1 Enoch		4.9.23	429
- and Aeneid 6 18	3–21	11.36	146
- author 20		– Vita Constantir	ii
- discovery 18		- 1.26-27	548
 Greek translation 	on 21	1.28.1–2	549
- 15	18–21	1.29	549
17–18	18	1.32.1	558
17.1–5	21	2.28.2, 32.3, 37.	2 557
19.3	18	4.24	561
Epicureanism 524		4.62.4	560
epiphany 86, 101		4.63.2-66	561
- earthquake 144			
- at noon 144, 55	7, 600–01	faith/pistis 235-3	6, 238, 250
– shudders 145		- and emotions 5	40
Essenes 11		- of Gnostics 345	5
ethnicity 34		- in the heart 323	3, 333
Eunapius, on Sosi	patra 187–90	 not outside hist 	ory 340-41, 345
Eucharist 115-38		- and military me	etaphor 324–25
– and agapê 136		- and inner perso	n 324–25
- ascetic 322		Fédou, M. 195	
- breaking bread 134		fellatio 71	
- holy 134-35, 32	22–23	Febvre, L. 234	
- origins 136		Feldt, L. XV	
Euripides		Festugière, AJ.	602
– Hecuba		Ficker, G. 612	
- 1-2, 54, 94, 390	82	Fishwick, D. 162	
703	83	Flaccus 27-28	

·	,	
Fowler, R.L. 169	- biography 605-	-10
Frankfurter, D. 261-62, 444-45	 and Christianis 	
Frazer, J.G. 211-12, 331	- and Constantin	ne 626
Frey, J. 38, 373	- faith of 607, 613	
Friesen, C. 128	- family 605	
,		on of Christianity
Gager, J. 446	416–18	,
Galen X	– and History of	Religion 211
- and Christians 95, 527	 and inscription 	
- and Clement 507	- and Jews/Judai	
- and Genesis 17	- and Islam XIV	
Galerius	- and Marcion 6	
- and churches 287	 and Marcion of and Mommsen 	
- edict of Serdica 417		
Gamble, H. 399	and Mystery reand Old Testan	
Gemeinhardt, P. 566	- on Porphyry 6	
genius 420	- and prosopogra	
ghosts 80–96		elium of James 500
Gibbon, E.	- and Reitzenstei	n 222
- and Constantine 562	Harrison, J. 211	
on early Christians 259–61, 435, 519	Hartog, P. 491	
Girard, R. 97	Hauben, H. 409	
gods	Havrda, M. 507	2 4
- acclamations 537	Hecataeus, On Eg	gypt 3–4
- as <i>Kyria/os</i> 317, 538	Heemstra, M. 38	
– megatheism 537–38	Hekate 44–45, 19	97, 331
- twelve 592	Heliodorus	
Goodman, M. 13, 38	- Calasiris 76-77	7
Gordon, R.L. 197, 239, 242–43, 246–47,	date/place 75	
544	- Pythagoras 76	
Gospel of the Egytians 504, 511	 and sacrifice 11 	
Graf, F. 104, 107, 245	- 1	75, 111
Granius Marcellus 327, 329	2	75–76, 111
Grant, R.M. 306-07, 314	3	75–76, 111
Grethlein, J. 211	4	76, 112
Gruen, E. 8, 10, 12	5	112–13
Grünstäudl, W. 374, 384, 387, 509	6.14-15	77
Gunkel, H. 212, 225	7.2.2	112
Gutschmid, A. von 593	9	76, 112
	10	112-13
Habicht, Ch. 5	10.41	75
Hades 145-46	Hengel, M. 5	
Haensch, R. 404	Henrichs, A. 69	
Hahn, J. 442	Henten, J.W. van	374
Halbwachs, M. 366	Hermas, Shephere	
Halkin, F. 408	- date/place 363	
Harnack, Ad. von XIV, 213, 325, 496	- Vision	
- and Althoff 606	- 1.1.1	363
- and Apocalypse of Peter 374	3.2.1	364
- and Augustine 608–10, 616	5.2.1	539
	·	,

6.2.4	539	9.1	44
Herrero de Jáureq	ui, M. 195, 248-49	10.1	52
Hilhorst, T. 447		15	472
Himmelfarb, M. 1	19	– Phila	d.
Hippolytus, on Da	aniel 292	- 4	128
Historia Apollonii	Regis Tyri	- Rom	
- date/place 73		- 6.1	52
- RA 27-21-23	73	7.3	135
- RA 48.10-12	73	– Smyr	n.
- RA 49.11-12	73	- 1.2	44
- RB 48.7-9	73	7.1	135
Historia Augusta		8	128, 299
- Sev. Alex.		13	473
- 49.6	296	indulge	ntia principis 394
Hock, R.F. 504-0		inscript	
Holl, K. 586, 623	-,,	7.	iterature 117, 327
Hommel, H. 49		– Agora	
Hopkins, K. 530		- XV 7	
Horsfall, N. 15–2	1	- CIL	2.13
Horst, P. van der		- IV.67	9 368
Hübner, R. 44	23, 130		47, 6667, 10.826 472
Huizinga, J. 431		– VI.10	
- '			ogenes of Oenoanda 524
Hume, D. 435	0		-
Hurtado, L.W. 23		- I. An	
Huttner, U. 455, 4		- 279-8	*
hymnodes/hymnag	gogoi 165	- I. An	•
Hypatia 35, 449		- 8	165
T 111 D 1 1	. 1	81–83	
Iamblichus, Babyl	oniaka	88	167
- date/place 66		96–98	
- resurrection 92		100-0	
Iamblichus, Vita F		- I. Ap	
idolatry, terminolo	ogy 266–67	- 40	462
Ignatians/us		– <i>I. Ері</i>	besus
 agapê/Eucharist 		– 20 A	II 472
- date 40, 43-44,	467	20B	473
 Christianismos 	52, 468	667A	164
– and Hermas 47	8	702	164
 Ioudaismos 43- 	44	987–8	39 164
- ioudaizein 44		909	472
- and Martyrdom	of Polycarp 474	1600	164
- name of Christi	ans 367	1687	472-73
- onomastics 467		2302	
- middle recension	n 472–75	– I. Ma	gnesia
- short recension	470-71	- 287, 3	_
- Ephes.		- I. Per	
- 2	472	- 274	164
- Magn.		- I Pess	sinous
- 2	472, 539	- 17	167
2.10	52	- I. Pri	

-	477	1 4			
- 5	167	- colour 4			
17	167	- and Egyptians 26-27			
46	167	- expulsion from Rome 238, 369–70			
47	168	438–39			
69	164, 167	– fiscus Iudaicus			
– I. Smyrna		 and/or <i>Ioudai</i> 	oi/Iudaei 25, 39, 55–57,		
- 133	472	233, 446			
195	474	 and literacy 5 	531		
219, 472, 701	473	 Parting of the 	Ways 37-57		
– IG		- Pentateuch 9			
- II ² 1156	475	– politeuma 26			
- XII 6, 2.595	471	- sacrifice 4, 41	9 (Diaspora)		
- SEG		 and Spartans 	3-14		
- 26.1214	473	- Torah 3-4			
45.1588 A	473	- and Virgil 15	-21		
55.723	171	Joly, R. 467, 474			
59.1489	612	Jones, Ch. 8, 16			
67.274	462	Josephus			
- TAM		• •	Flavianum 47–48, 368		
- II.3.1018	473	-AJ	,		
- III.1.489	473	- 1.240	13		
- IV 1.262	164	3.270-73	506		
(in)tolerance 439		10.226	7		
Irenaeus		12.157–67	7		
- Adv. Haer.		12.227	6		
- 1.23.4	331	13.166–70	8		
Isidorus 29		16.300-10	11		
Isis, see also Mysteries 239		18.63-64	47, 368		
 expulsion wors 		18.66-80	215		
- and women 23		18.238	28		
unaomen 20	_	20.267	48		
James, M.R. 454,	462· W 214	– <i>BJ</i>	10		
Jerome	102, W. 211	- 1.513-31	11		
 and Athanasius 	583	2.491–98	29		
- Adv. Iovin.	303	6.6	503		
- 1.48	316	Jourdan, F. 195	303		
– 1.46 – <i>Ep</i> .	310	Judaism, see also	Lewis		
- <i>Lp</i> . - 64.22	577	- aniconic, 269			
– 04.22 – Vita Hilarionis		- and associatio			
- <i>vita Hitarionis</i> - 12	77	- destruction To			
14.1–5	153	 destruction re female follower 	_		
39		Greek influen			
- Vita Pauli 582	140–41				
	502	- Ioudaismos 3			
- 17.1-3	583		- and Nock 232		
Jews, see also Jud			- origin modern term 45, 233		
- abortion/infant			- Parting of the Ways VIII, 37–57		
	25–34, 437–38, 447,	- weakened XI			
512–14	•	Julian the Apostate – and sacrifice 107, 110–11, 113			
- in Antioch 447		- and sacrifice	107, 110–11, 113		
- cannibalism 25	94				

Justin Martyr – freelancer 294–95		Leppin, H. 37, 295, 542–43, 608, 625–26 Letter to Diognetus		
- and Marcionites 254-55		- name of Christians 367		
- and Mithraic M	ysteries 242–43	- on statues 268-		
- Apol.		Letter of Jeremiah, on statues 269		
- 1.6	255	Letter of Lyons and Vienne 256, 261, 505		
1.9	277	library, temple 70		
1.25.1	247	Licinius, dream 5	55	
1.26.2	331	Lieu, J.M. 42–43,		
1.26.7	254	Life of Hypatios 5	94–60	
1.27	262	- and 'angels' 595		
1.27.4	247	- and Artemis 59	95	
1.61, 64	284	- and magic 596-	-99	
1.65	299	- and mantis 595		
1.66.1	130	- and trees 594		
1.66.2-3	135	Life of St. Nichola	s 113–14, 602	
1.66.4	242, 247	Life of Theodore of		
1.67	123, 284, 299	- and ex-voto 60	= =	
2.12	262	- and icons 602		
2.12.5	247	- and sorcerer 60	1	
- Dialogus 54		Lighfoot, J. 17, 376, 378-79, 383-84, 386		
- 19	262	Lightfoot, J.B. 469, 470, 472–73		
35.1	367	Lindemann, A. 11		
41.1	135	,	idualisation 530–31	
70.1	247	Lloyd-Jones, H. 1		
70.3-4	135	logistes 424–25		
78.6	247	Loisy, A. 219		
80.3	367	Lollianus, date 88	3–89	
Juvenal		Longinus, and Ge		
- 6.542 - 47	230	Longus		
15	148, 151	- no priests 73		
10	110, 101	- sacrifice 101		
Kany, R. 86		- 1.8.2	73, 101	
Karmann, Th. 50.	3-05	2.4	144	
Kerygma Petri 26		2.22.2	101	
Kinzig, W. 446	, 30,301	2.23	70	
Klauck, HJ. 279	_82	2.24.1, 2	101	
Kloppenborg, J. 2		2.30.5	101	
Koester, H. 224	.07	2.31	69, 73, 101	
Kortekaas, G. 73,	408 411	3.9–11	102	
Kraus, Th. 386	400, 411	3.10	73	
Kiaus, 111. 300		3.27	70	
Lactantius		3.32.3	103	
		4.13.3	102	
- De morte persecutorum		4.25		
- 10.2 44.5-6	553 553	4.26.1	73, 102	
	553		102	
46.3	555	4.27.1	101, 102	
Lampe, P. 300		4.32.3	102	
Lampo 29		Lucan - 5.64–236	210	
Lane Fox, R. 557–58, 609		- 3.04-236	218	

Lucian V		4.26 42		
Lucian X		- 4.26 42		
- and Apocalypse of Peter 384		MacMullen, R. 442		
- and Christians 95, 142–43, 208, 384		Magi 177–78, 182, 242		
miracles 139–48religious entrepeneurs 525		magic/magician		
	elleurs 323	- Babylonian 140-41		
– Alexander	0.2	- Byzantium 603		
- 5 25, 20	92	- Egypt 63, 76, 143		
- 25, 38	142	- Ephesia grammata 65, 188, 598-99		
- Lovers of Lies	140	- flying 335		
- 11	140	- greed 91		
13	93	- grimoire 599, 601		
14	91	- kit 599		
22	144	– Memphis 77		
31	143	– voces magicae 64		
34	143–44	- whispering 91		
- Onos 88		– in Xenophon of Ephesus 99		
– Peregrinus		Mahé, JP. 588		
- 11	208, 300	Malalas		
12	421	- 8.23-24 447		
– Philopatris		12.15 313		
- 12	314	Malherbe, A. 307		
- On Sacrifice 10	4, 535	Mani(chaeans)		
 True Histories 		- codex 621		
- 1.4	146	house churches 290		
Luijendijk, A. 440)	- literacy 531		
Luomanen, P. 514		- Mani 524		
		Mansi, G.D. 611		
Ma 161, 205		Maraval, P. 586–87		
Maccabees		Marcion/ites		
- Christian appro	priation XI	- Antitheses 51		
- mother XI		- cannibalism 254		
- tombs of 447-4	8	– Christianismos 51–52		
 1 Maccabees 		- and Gospels 383		
- 3.48	9	- and Harnack 621-24		
8-9	13	- as heretic 123		
12	6	- and Ioudaismos 42		
12.6-18	8	- and Jews 55		
12.9, 15	9	- and Judaism 43		
12.19-23	6	- and Justin Martyr 254-55		
12.39-53	13	- letters 531		
13.23	13	- and resurrection 95		
14.16, 20-23	10	Marcus Aurelius		
14.16-24k	12, 13	- and Christians X, 95		
15.23	12	Markschies, Ch. 115, 479		
- 2 Maccabees		Marnas 442–44		
- 5.9	5	Marrou, HI. 268		
8.23	9	Martin, V. 408		
- 4 Maccabees		martyr(s)		
- date 42, 478		– Alexandrian 414		
- Ioudaismos 42,	44	- <i>bêma</i> , terminology 416		
10,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,		2 2.770, 22		

- and Christ 404	1 06	Masson, O. 458		
- cup of death 381		Maximinus Daia		
- Dioskoros 414		- and churches 287		
intercession by	378	- death 552		
 replaced by mo 		McGowan, A. 115, 263		
	rates 424, 440, 589	Mellink, A.O. 468		
- as 'saints' 378	1410, 121, 110, 307	Meuli, K. 102, 258, 589		
- origin term 37.	5	Migne, JP. 611		
- spread term 40		Millar, F. 420, 459		
- trial 415–16	2, 300	Minnen, P, van 382		
- writing in priso	on 407	Minucius Felix		
martyr Acts XI-		- and <i>coniuratio</i> 258		
- authenticity 41		- and Fronto 258–59		
 martyrological 		Mitchell, S. 167, 586		
 question of gen 		miracles IX, 139–57, 341		
 official records 		- authentication 342		
- Socrates 421, 4		- as entertainment 156		
- Acta Cypriani	30 37	- healing 342		
- 1	274	- and magic 334		
1.7	290	- and mission 156-57		
$2^{1}, 2^{2}$	379	- opening doors 600		
– Acta Justini 28		Mithras/ism, see also Mysteries		
- 1, 6A	378	- decline cult 246		
3.3A	294	– and imperial cult 529		
– Abitinian Mari		- Mithraea, in Orient 239		
- 2.6	296	- origin 198, 242		
17.9–13	425	- spread 528		
– Perpetua		- women 230		
- 4.1-3	541	Mithras Liturgy 216, 218, 220		
6.4	441	Möllendorff, P. van 142, 488, 490		
7–8	378	Moll, S. 51		
17.1	131	Momigliano, A.D. 3, 6		
- Phileas 407-30	1	Mommsen, Th. 155, 211, 606		
- date 428		monotheism/polytheism 35, 435-36		
- against Jews 42	22	moral panic 353		
- Phileas, bishop		Morgan, T. 323		
- Pierius 414-15		Moses 4		
- text 407-09		Moss, C. 374, 400, 402, 413, 424, 448		
– Polycarp		mountains, view from 20		
- 9.3	539	Müller, F.M. 529		
14.2	381	Murray, G. 338		
17.2	474	Mysteries		
18.3	293	- Aeschines' mother 189, 226, 530		
- Scillitan Martyrs 389–406		- Agdistis 161, 248		
- and Augustine 397		- Alexander of Abonuteichos 161, 245		
text and translation 390–91		– Andania 243		
- 3-5	526	- Antinoos 161, 204-05		
4	539	- Aphrodite 247-48		
Mason, S. 25, 39-	-41, 45, 233	- Attis 161, 241, 246-47		
Massa, F. 247, 249	9	- Ceres 175, 205		

- Corybantic 199, 221, 226, 240, 248

Cybele 161, 244, 247and Damascius 193dances 203-04

- Demeter Karpophoros, Thesmopho-

ros 163-64, 168

Dio Chrysostom 178–79
Dionysiac 180, 182, 189, 248
Eleusinian 163, 165, 166, 175, 178, 181–85, 226, 240, 246, 248

eschatology 240, 245and Eunapius 185–91

- 'of the god' 161

- and Gnosticism 213, 217-18

handbook of 248–49
Hecate 190, 205, 246
historia hant 166, 68, 183, 1

- hierophant 166-68, 183, 185

and Himerius 190and Iamblichus 184–85

Imbros 184Imperial 161–69

- Isis 178, 180, 224, 240-41

- and Julian the Apostate 187, 190

- Lemnos 184 - Lerna 190

and Libanius 190–91light 165–66

Lykomids 165
Ma 161, 248
Magna Mater 246
Marmarini 243

Men 161Mithraic 178, 185, 189, 197–98, 239, 242

and money 243-44Mysterienreligion 210, 224

- Orphic-Bacchic 177, 180, 182-84, 189,

206, 226, 240

- Peloponnesus 161

- of Persephone 247

- and Philo 173–74, 217

- and philosophers 173–94

and philosophers 1/3and Plato 173and Proclus 191–93

and Psellus 249Sabazios 161, 205, 248

- Samothracian 163, 174-75, 184, 224

- Sarapis 200

sebastophant 166-68in second century 523Syrian goddess 243

and Syrianus 191
teletê 202-03
term, inflated 200
terror in 199, 201, 203
and Themistius 190

- theologos 165, 168-69

and Varro 174

necromancy 74, 112 Nelis, J.T. 12–13

Nero

as persecutor 349-71and plebs urbana 356-59

rediturus 361Nesselrath, H.-G. 384Newman, J.H. 90

Nicklas, T. XV, 332-33, 343, 373-74, 376,

381-83

belief 343

Niehoff, M. 54, 512–13 Nietzsche, F. 211, 435

Nilsson, M.P. 162, 169, 223, 236, 596

Nissen, Th. 324 Nock, A.D. 229–50

- and social anthropology 249-50

and gods 539
and Judaism 232
and Mysteries 239–49
myth and ritual 237–38
Orientalism 230–31
on women 230
Noetus of Smyrna 468
Norden, E. 19–21, 146, 374

Norelli, E. 381–82 novel, Greek

and empty tombs 79–96
and ghosts 79–96
and Gospels 95–96
place of origin 67
and priesthood 61–78
and resurrections 79–96, 152

and sacrifice 97–114Scheintod 84–89

Novenson, M. 41

Nuffelen, P. Van 174-80, 195, 245

Numenius
- and Genesis 17

and Mysteries 178
Fragments, ed. des Places
53 200

Nymphs 70, 73, 1	101–02	1.14	181, 198, 201
		2.1	513
Ocellus 16		3.13.9	53
O'Donnell, J.J. 6	09	3.16, 17	199, 201, 248
oikeiotês 7		3.36	205
Omerzu, H. 309-	–10	3.37	207
Onomastics		3.38	205
– Alke 474		3.50	201
- Agathopous 47	73	3.51	206
– Aphphia 462		3.52	207
- Artemon/ylla		3.55	202, 284–85
– Barsabas Justus	s 456–57	3.59-60	203, 208
- Bassos 473		3.75, 80	41
- Bourros 472		4.10	199, 201, 206, 248
 Christodoulos 	322	4.18	53
- Cittinus 394		4.52-53	512
– Daphnos 460		5.19	207
- Dion 460		5.33	203
- Epitropos 475		5.38	178
- Falconilla 460		5.41	203-04
- Firmilla 462		5.63	205
- Gavia/us 473-	74	6.22	197, 243, 248
– Hermaios et sir	n. 463	6.24	202
- Ignatius 470-7	1	6.27	254
- Myrtinus/lus 2	294	6.40	254
- Nartzalus 394		6.41	91
- Nympha/s 280	, 283, 458	6.42	198, 248
- Onesiphorus 3	05	6.59	246
- Panchares 305,		7.62	270
- Phrontine 461		8.17	200
- Procla 460		8.20	200
- Thekla 462		8.48	199
- Theodoulos 32	22	8.67	205
- Theophoros 47	71–72	Orpheus/Orph	nism 176-77, 191, 231, 239
- Thresptos 460		Otto, R. 223	
- Zotion 455, 46	9, 473	Ovid	
oracles 523-24		– Ars Amatori	а
Origen		- 1.75-76	55
- and Antinoos	204-05	1.415-16	56
- and Christianis	smos 53	3.201	313
- Dionysiac Mysteries 206		- Met.	
- Egyptian Mysteries 205, 213, 248		- 1.10-312	16
- and Ioudaismos		7.285ff.	597
- Jesus and Antir			
- Mithraic Mysteries 205		pagan/paganisi	m
- and Mysteries 195–208		– in Asia Mino	
– Contra Celsum			tellectuals 529, 622
- 1.1.25	53	- as religion 6	
1.7	200, 206	- term 61, 231	
1.9	181, 197, 201	Palme, B. 415-	
	, ,	,	

Pan, sacrifice 102		– Nero 349–71		
Panegyrici Latini		 and sacrifice 4 	14–15, 418, 429–30, 441	
- 4.14	554	Septimius Severus 509		
6.21.3-7	550	 Valerian 379, 4 	41, 527, 583	
12.2.5	550	Pervo, R. 126, 45	4	
papyri		Peter, see also Aca	ts of Peter	
– libelli 108		- burial 339	•	
- <i>BGU</i> IV.1197.9	573	- crucifixion 339)	
– P. Dura 54	108	- martyrdom 33	5-39, 380-81	
- <i>PDM</i> XIV.439	218	- walking on wa		
- PGM		Petersen, A.K. 15		
- I.277293	598	Peterson, E. 368-		
- IV.78-82	598	Petropoulou, M		
- VII.193-96	598–99	Pfeiffer, S. 33	2. //	
- VII.175-76 - VII.206-08	598	phantasma 82		
- XII.2	597	Philo 23–34		
- XII.2 - XII.145	598	- Flaccus 28-34		
- P. Gurob 1	248–49	- Leg.	21	
- P. Lond. 6.1912	29, 33–34	- 121-22	31	
- P. Oxy.	240	124–38	30–31	
- 6.849	319	134	29	
6.850	135	- Spec.		
50.3529	414	- 3.52-63	506	
- P. Thmouis 1	67	Philostratus		
parthenôn 74		– and Gospels 89–90		
Parker, R. 97, 237,	, 538–40	– Vita Apollonii		
Passion of Athenog	genes 586–90	- 1.3.1-2	91	
Paul		4.45	152	
- and Archilochu	s 306–07, 314	6.43.1-2	153	
- bald 311		7.38, 40	144	
- bow-legged 311		7.41	152	
- conversion 559		8.12.1	152	
- gracious 314		- VS		
- healthy 312		- 552-53	309	
- Ioudaismos 41		Phrygian (tales) 176		
- long-nosed 314				
- portrait of 303-	14	physiognomy 307–13		
-		- Adamantius 312		
- Roman citizen		- Dio Chrysostom 313		
- Roman judge or		- Polemon 308		
- single-browed 312		- Pseudo-Aristotle 312		
- small 311		Pietersma, A. 408		
- and Socrates 315		plague, Antonine	/Cyprianic 385–86, 544	
Perkins, J. 95		Plato 145		
persecutions		 Leg. 947a1 	70	
	376, 378, 418, 439–41,	– Phaedo		
526–27, 583		– 69c	377	
- Diocletian 413,	418, 429–30, 440, 527	113bc	145	
- Domitian 38, 3	61	113e-114b	378	
- Galerius 440		- Timaeus		
	413–14, 448–49, 525–26	– 22C	380	
•	-			

Pleket, H.W. 163, 165, 169, 539 Plinius		Egyptian 63-64, 69, 74emperor 72		
Fire of Rome 35	1		•	7.4
	1		maiden 68, 73–7	
Pliny, villa 327			not professional	
- <i>Ep</i> .	54		rotevangelium of	
- 10.96.1	51		and Achilles Tat	
10.96.3	104		from Alexandria	
10.96.4	417		author 500–507	
10.96.5	104, 376		in Clement Alex	
10.96.7	132, 263	- composition 500-01		
Plutarch		– date 507–09		
- and Orphism 17	76	_	and Jews 512–14	•
- Mor.		_	New Testament	503-05
- 351E-52A	177	_	in Origen 507	
415A	176	_	paradeisos 503	
795E	74	_	1 and 2 Peter 50)5, 506
– Numa		_	Salome 504	
- 8.7-8	275	_	and Susanna 502	2–3
- On the Soul	146	_	vocabulary 501,	511
- Fragments, ed. S	andbach		1.4	504
- 157	175		1.8	501
pneuma 82–83			1.10	508
pogrom			2.2	504, 506, 511
- call to action 31			2.9	501
- culturalist appro	oach 33		3.1	506
- definition 23–34			4,5	505
- looting 31, 33	1, 32 33		6.1, 2	501
- meaning 23–24			6.3	501, 505–06
- trigger 28			7	503
polis religion 212			7.3	511
Porphyry			7.7	505
- Harnack on 621	_22		8.2	501
			8.6	507
on Mysteries 18on sacrifice 109	1-82			
	: 42		9.8	506, 511
- on statues 277, 5			9.9	502, 505
- On Abstinence	107, 185		13.1-6	502
– Vita Plotini	102		13.2	505
- 15 E	182		15.17	505
- Fragments, ed. S			17	509
- 351-60 277			21.3	505
Porphyry, bishop of Gaza 442–43			23.9	507
Posidonius, on Golden Age 275			25	500
Price, S. 162, 169, 528, 534		25.3 505		
– on Nock 229–30, 232		Prümm, K. 216		
priests/priestesses 61-78		Pseudo-Clementines		
- Aphrodite 62-63, 70, 77		_	date/place 74	
- Apollo 75-76		-	Hom/Rec	
- Artemis 65-66, 68, 70, 72, 74			1.5	74
- crown 72			Homilies	
– Diana 73–74		-	2.26, 30	77

4.10	289	Roig Lanzillotta, L. 256, 258, 261–62, 269		
6.26	289	Roldanus, J. 568, 572		
 Recognitions 		Rome, Fire of 349–71		
- 4.1.72, 74	289	Rordorf, W. 72, 126, 454–55, 461		
4.6–7	289	Rouwhorst, G. 129, 136		
9.38	289	Rubenson, S. 568–69		
Puhvel, J. 596		Rüpke, J. 233, 236, 438, 519–21, 528–29,		
		531, 537, 540, 546		
Radermacher, L.	18, 140–41, 146	Ruggiero, F. 392, 396		
Radt, S. 596		Ruinart, Th. 407		
Ramsay, W.M. 62	27			
Rapp, C. 577		Sabazios 197		
Rebenich, S. 610		sacrifice		
Rebillard, E. 394	, 400, 410–11	– animal 97–114		
Reitzenstein, R.		and army 107–08, 110		
- and Egypt 222		- books on 106		
	ony 567, 572, 576–77	- critique 97-98, 535-36		
- miracles 139-5		- decline 535-36		
- Mysteries 209-	-27	 and emperor 104, 534 		
religio 235		- end of 113		
religion		- human, 100, 104, 253-64		
- and books 529	-30	– in novel 97–114		
- cities, role of 5	28–29	– pig 102		
- conversion 559		- ram 102		
 developments 	441, 520–21, 591	– Unschuldskomödie 258, 589		
- education 341		Said, E. 155, 230		
- entrepeneurs 5	524	Scaliger, J.J. 18		
- gods 537-41, 5		Schaeder, HH. 154		
- imperial cult 5		Scheid, J. 104, 438, 541		
	rung XIII, 237, 521,	Schmidt, C. 385-86, 455-56, 465		
529-33	0 1 1	Schmitt, T. 362		
- literacy XIII		Schnelle, U. 37-38, 55		
	n/mystèrisation 250, 527	Schöllgen, G. 468		
– Ökonomisierur	=	Schwartz, E. 614		
- philosophisation		Schwartz, J. 483-84, 496		
– and Roman En		Schwartz, S. 40		
- superstition, te		secretarium 393, 423		
- term 39, 235, 4		Seeck, O. 615		
- violence 431-4		Seeliger, H.R. 374		
 world religion 	524	Seneca, Ep. 108.22 439		
Religionsgeschich		Shanzer, D. 509		
resurrections 80-		Sibylline Books/Oracles		
Riedweg, Ch. 17	3-74, 195, 248-49	- Roman consultation 356, 530		
ritus 401		- 2.261-62 376		
Rives, J. 104, 109	, 439–41, 519–21, 527,	2.335–38 379		
533-34, 536, 54		3.17 267		
Robert, L. 167-6		4.4–7 273–74		
Robinson, J.A. 3		Shaw, B. 349-71, 432		
Römer, C. 427		Sienkiewicz, H. 337		
Rohde, E. 87		Simmel, G. 214, 223		
*				

Simon Magus 326–35		Sulpicius Severus		
- and Devil 333		 Life of Martin of Tours 444 		
- magician 333-34		symbolon 206		
- and statue 331		Syncellus 18		
Smid, H.R. 501-0)2	syngeneia 7–8		
Smith, J.Z. 221, 33	38–39, 527			
Snyder, G. 453-54	1	Tacitus		
	315–16, 405, 421, 436–37,	- on Christians 3	54-59	
458		- on Nero 355-5	6	
Spiegelberg, W. 15	55, 222	- odium generis humani 353, 355		
statues	,	– Annales	,	
- Artemis 272		- 15.40	263	
- Athena Polias 2	772	15.44.2–3	49–50, 350–71	
- and Christians		Tatian, on canniba	•	
- Hera 272	200 70	taurobolium 216,		
- Heraclitus on 2	70 273	Tertullian	217, 211	
- imperial 329	7 0, 27 3	- and <i>Christianis</i>	mus 53	
- Neryllinus 270	_ 7 1	- and <i>Iudaismus</i>		
- Paris 271	-/ I	and Tudutshiusas philosopher		
			273	
- Polydamas 271		on statues 275Adv. Marc.		
- Sarapis 272-73	3-4:- 277		42	
- in Second Sophi		- IV.33.8	43	
- terminology 26	5-68	- V.2.1	43	
- Theagenes 271	N-74	- Apolog.	257.50	
- in Theophilus 2	2/1	- 7 - 8	257–58	
- Zeus 272		12	275	
-	van 501–02, 512, 514	39.15	285	
Stowers, S. X		39.16–18	130	
Strabo		– De baptismo		
- 13.4.5	596	– 7	304	
16.2.35	276	- Corona		
17.1.10	29	- 3.3	132	
17.1.17	149	– De idololatria		
Straten, F.T. van	70	- 1	266	
Stroumsa, G. 107,	531, 621	3	274	
Strubbe, J. 167		4.1	275	
Strycker, É. De 50	02, 507–11	6.2-7	275	
Suetonius		11.6	274	
 Augustus 		- Scap.		
- 79.2	308	- 3-5	441	
– Caligula		3.4	394	
- 57.4	149	- Spect.		
 Claudius 		- 13	291	
- 25.4	49	Testuz, M. 508		
– Domitian		theios anêr 214		
- 12.2	56	theology, Greek 2	236-37	
- Nero		Thessalos 64		
- 9-19	351	theurgy 183		
16.2	50, 349, 351, 369	Thompson, J.B. 4	10	
38.1–3	349, 351	Thompson, J.B. 4 Thonemann, P. 32		
30.1 3	5 17, 551	1 11011c111a1111, 1 . Ja	-1, 1/2 /3	

thrêskeia 235		Wellhausen, J. 608			
Tilg, S. 86		Weltenbrand 380			
Tigchelaar, E. 375-76, 381-82		Wendland, P. 211			
Toepel, A. 510		West, M.L. 231			
Traditio Apostoli	ca, house church 285–86	Wilamowitz-Mo	ellendorff, U. von 209,		
Trombley, F. 586	5, 597–98	211–12, 223, 23	34, 610, 614		
		Wischmeyer, W. 374			
Unnik, W.C. van	385	Wisdom of Solon	ion		
Usener, H. 211-1	12, 221, 390	- 14.15	205		
Uytfanghe, M. V	an 190	17.14	83		
		Wobbermin, G.	213-14		
Vahlen, J. 155		women			
Varro		– old 129			
– on Golden Age	e 275	- as patrons 343	;		
- on statues 275		- and slaves 344			
- Ant. Rer. Div.		Woolf, G. 528			
16	275–76				
- Fragments, ed.	Cardauns	Xenophon of Ep	Xenophon of Ephesus		
16-17	276	- date/place 88, 99			
18	275	- sacrifice 99			
19	276	- 1.2.4	99		
254	272	1.5.7-8	99		
Vernant, JP. 10	2	1.8.1	100		
Versnel, H.S. 342	2	1.10.5 - 6	100		
Vigellius Saturni	nus 394	1.11.12	100		
Vinzent, M. 42,	383, 467, 469–71, 475, 478,	1.12.2	100		
481, 484		2.13.2	100		
Virgil		3.12.2	64		
 and apocalypse 	es 20	5.7	64		
 and Jews 15–2 	1, 267	5.11.4	100		
 Orphic influen 	nce 20-21	5.13.5	100		
– Aeneid		5.15.2	100		
- 6	19–21				
6.250,52	597	Zahn, Th. 46, 47	70, 478, 481, 488–89, 491,		
Visio beati Esdra	e	496–97			
- 76	313	Zeus			
Vogt, J. 552		- rare epithets 271			
Vuong, L. 510		– Sabazios 162			
		- Soter 73, 102			
Wagenvoort, H. 175		Zoroaster 176, 178			
Wassmuth, O. 383-84		- and ants 588			
Weber, M. 214, 223		Zwierlein, O. 335, 362, 456, 464, 474,			
Weinreich, O. 600		482–83			