J. THOMAS HEWITT

Messiah and Scripture

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 2. Reihe 522

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament · 2. Reihe

Herausgeber / Editor Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber/Associate Editors Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala) Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) · Janet Spittler (Charlottesville, VA) J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)

522



J. Thomas Hewitt

Messiah and Scripture

Paul's "In Christ" Idiom in Its Ancient Jewish Context

Mohr Siebeck

J. THOMAS HEWITT, 2013 MLitt, University of St Andrews; 2018 PhD, University of Edinburgh; currently Kirby Laing Research Fellow in New Testament, School of Divinity, History, and Philosophy, University of Aberdeen. orcid.org/0000-0002-7339-0279

ISBN 978-3-16-159228-7/eISBN 978-3-16-159229-4 DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-159229-4

ISSN 0340-9570/eISSN 2568-7484 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 2. Reihe)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available at *http://dnb.dnb.de*.

© 2020 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany. www.mohrsiebeck.com

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was printed on non-aging paper by Laupp & Göbel in Gomaringen, and bound by Buchbinderei Nädele in Nehren.

Printed in Germany.

For A. L. C. H.

Acknowledgements

This book is a revision of my doctoral thesis completed at the University of Edinburgh. I am grateful to my supervisor, Matthew Novenson, whose own research on ancient messiah speculation was an impetus for the project. I have received superlative support from him, both as a mentor and as an interlocutor. My wife and I are also fortunate to call Matt and his wife Michelle our dear friends. The Novensons have made our several sojourns in Scotland very rich.

Many others have offered valuable input at various stages of the project. I am thankful to Scott Hafemann, who is a hidden conversation partner on many pages of this study, and to N. T. Wright for his enthusiastic interaction with several aspects of the argument. John Barclay, too, deserves my appreciation for taking an interest in my scholarly development along the way. In the later stages of the book's completion, Hindy Najman, Ross Wagner, and the late Larry Hurtado each offered profitable feedback and eager support for which I am indebted to them. The input of all of these individuals has made the book stronger than it otherwise would have been, and of course responsibility for any enduring deficiencies is my own.

I am grateful to Cambridge University Press and Mohr Siebeck for their permission to reprint revised versions of some material that I have published previously. Portions of chapter 3 appeared in a different form in "Ancient Messiah Discourse and Paul's Expression ἄχρις οὗ ἔλθη τὸ σπέρμα in Galatians 3.19," NTS (2019): 398-411. Portions of chapters 1 and 3 appeared in different forms in "Participationism and Messiah Christology in Paul" (with Matthew V. Novenson) in God and the Faithfulness of Paul: A Critical Examination of the Pauline Theology of N. T. Wright, ed. Christoph Heilig, J. Thomas Hewitt, and Michael F. Bird, WUNT II 413 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2016), 393–415. I also want to express appreciation to the Kirby Laing Foundation and the School of Divinity, History, and Philosophy at the University of Aberdeen. These generous institutions have allowed me to undertake a research fellowship, which has afforded me the time and resources to bring this project to print. And I want to thank my Aberdeen colleagues Grant Macaskill, Tom Greggs, and Paul Nimmo, whose avid support I have enjoyed since joining the department.

The period during which this book was written saw more than one trans-Atlantic relocation, and I am grateful for friendships that have endured over those years and despite the distances. Bernardo, Michael, Stephen, Brad, and Alex have provided bolstering and laughter, and they have brought the gift of camaraderie, even from across the sea. Very special appreciation also goes to my parents and parents-in-law, whose support and loving sacrifice have been utterly constant and without which it would not have been possible to pursue, much less achieve, this goal. I am also thankful beyond measure for my children. Every day my sons and daughters are unquenchable sparks of joy. They are too young to appreciate how vital they have been in the authoring of this book, but they have my abiding gratitude.

Above all, my most profound appreciation belongs to my beloved wife, Andrea. She has been a cheerful and skillful conversation partner in my research and writing. And beyond such comparably mundane support, Andrea has cheered me on, she has believed in the goal, and she has loved me along every stretch of the path. I am grateful to her for these grand gifts and also for a thousand thousand small moments, many unseen, when she has set aside her own interests to see us through. It is not enough, but I dedicate this project to Andrea.

> J. Thomas Hewitt Aberdeen, Scotland 20 March 2020

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
Abbreviations	XIII
Introduction	1
A. The Problem Stated	2
B. Methodology	3
C. Definitions	4
D. Conceptual Models	5
E. Outline	6
Chapter 1: The Modern Problem of "In Christ" in Paul	7
Chapter 1: The Modern Problem of "In Christ" in Paul	
-	8
A. Into the Age of Mysticism	8 18
A. Into the Age of Mysticism B. Post-War Reactions	8 18 27
A. Into the Age of Mysticism B. Post-War Reactions C. Retrievals and Revisions	8 18 27
 A. Into the Age of Mysticism B. Post-War Reactions C. Retrievals and Revisions D. Conclusion 	8 18 27 40
 A. Into the Age of Mysticism B. Post-War Reactions C. Retrievals and Revisions D. Conclusion Chapter 2: Messiah Discourse in Ancient Judaism, 	8 27 40 42

	Tabl	e of	Contents
--	------	------	----------

2. Messiah and Indeterminacy54
<i>B. Messiah and Scripture</i>
2. Characteristics of Messiah Discourse
C. Conclusion
Chapter 3: In Messiah, Seed of Abraham77
A. On Words and Ideas77
B. In Your Seed, Who Is Messiah
 "In Abraham" and "In Christ"
C. Abraham's Seed in Jewish Interpretation, Including Paul
1. Collectivity and Individuality (Galatians 3:16)
D. Implications
1. Syntactical Features 116 2. Conceptual Features 117
E. Conclusion117
Chapter 4: In Messiah, Man of Heaven119
A. The Resurrection of the Dead119
1. 1 Corinthians 15 122 2. Daniel 7 124
B. Daniel 7 and Solidarity with the "Son of God" in 4Q246128
C. Daniel 7 and Solidarity with the Messiah in 1 Corinthians 15

Х

D. Implications
E. Conclusion155
E. Conclusion
Chapter 5: "In Christ" in Paul: Syntax156
A. Orientation156
B. Syntactical Analysis
1. Adverbial, Modifying a Divine Passive Verb161
2. Adverbial, Modifying a Divine Active Verb164
3. Adverbial, Modifying an Active Verb166
4. Adverbial, Modifying a Stative Verb173
5. Adverbial, Modifying a Verbal Adjective
that Modifies a Personal Noun179
6. Adverbial, Modifying an Adjective
that Modifies an Impersonal Noun180
7. Adjectival, Modifying an Impersonal Noun181
8. Adjectival, Modifying a Personal Noun or Pronoun
9. Substantival, Denoting Persons
C. Summary and Observations
Chapter 6: "In Christ" in Paul: Concepts192
A. Orientation
B. Conceptual Analysis
1. Simple Instrumentality
2. Simple Inclusion
3. Explicit Solidarity
4. Implicit Solidarity
C. Summary and Observations
D. Conclusion
Conclusion

XII	Table of Contents
A. Summary of the Argument	
B. Retrospect	
C. Prospect	
Bibliography	
Index for Chapters 5 and 6	
Index of Ancient Sources	
Index of Modern Authors	
Index of Subjects	

Abbreviations

All abbreviations of ancient sources and secondary literature conform to Billie Jean Collins et al., eds., *The SBL Handbook of Style: For Biblical Studies and Related Disciplines*, 2nd ed. (Atlanta: SBL Press, 2014).

Introduction

According to Codex Alexandrinus, Paul, in Rom 3:22, did not write διὰ πίστεως Ἰησοῦ χριστοῦ but διὰ πίστεως ἐν χριστῷ Ἰησοῦ.¹ For the purposes of this study, this variant is interesting not because of what it suggests about a fifth-century scribe's interpretation of the genitive relationship in the received text, but rather because of the care he takes with word order. Whatever the scribe's reasons for this amendment, he appears to have realized that merely inserting ἐν after πίστεως would result in the characteristically *un*-Pauline expression ἐν Ἰησοῦ – a phrase which never appears in the undisputed Pauline epistles.² Thus, in an apparent homage to Paul's idiolect the scribe also inverts the words Ἰησοῦ χριστοῦ so that the prepositional phrase reads ἐν χριστῷ Ἰησοῦ.

The significance of these textual details would perhaps be lost on many modern readers of Paul, who, upon hearing the English transliteration "Christ," hear only a second name of the man Jesus of Nazareth. If "Christ" is just a name, what difference would it make that Paul routinely wrote "in

¹ The variant is not recorded in the apparatus of NA²⁸. High-resolution images of Codex Alexandrinus are available online at The British Library, "Codex Alexandrinus (Gregory-Aland 02), Bible in Four Volumes: Volume 4 (New Testament)," Digitised Manuscripts, http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/FullDisplay.aspx?ref=Royal_MS_1_d_viii. For this particular variant, see fol. 86r, line 23. On the significance of this variant for interpreting the genitive relationship of πίστεως Ἰησοῦ χριστοῦ, see Richard N. Longenecker, *The Epistle to the Romans: A Commentary on the Greek Text*, NIGTC (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2016), 388.

² "In Jesus" appears once in the disputed epistles, in Eph 4:21 (ἐν τῷ Ἰησοῦ). Ernest Best, *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on Ephesians*, ICC (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1998), 428–430 suggests this unusual use of "in Jesus" is meant to imply that the tradition taught to the Ephesians can be traced to the historical figure of Jesus of Nazareth. Somewhat differently, N. T. Wright, "The Messiah and the People of God: A Study in Pauline Theology with Particular Reference to the Argument of the Epistle to the Romans," (D.Phil. thesis, Oxford University, 1980), 21 asserts that "in Jesus" is used to indicate that the Ephesians "have been taught the true facts about the man Jesus of Nazareth." Note also the inversion of χριστῷ Ἰησοῦ after ἐν in Gal 3:14 according to the fourth-century codices Vaticanus and Sinaiticus. The majority of witnesses read ἐν χριστῷ Ἰησοῦ, including Ψ^{46} A C D F G K L P Ψ 0278. 33. 81. 104. 365. 630. 1175. 1241. 1505. 1739. 1881. 2464 𝔅, the entire Latin tradition, and Harklensis.

Introduction

Christ" or "in Christ Jesus" but not "in Jesus"?³ But of course the Greek noun χριστός also translates as "messiah," which is something other than a name and is itself a transliteration of the Jewish scriptural word παύπ, "anointed one."⁴ And Paul, when using an expression built with the preposition $\dot{\epsilon}v$ and a personal object referring to Jesus, habitually chose the scriptural word "messiah" as that object. My aim in this study is to elucidate the import of this linguistic custom.

A. The Problem Stated

The problem can be stated simply: Modern interpreters of Paul have almost universally ignored the category "messiah" when describing Paul's use of the phrase ἐν χριστῷ even though χριστός means "messiah." A survey of these interpreters suggests there are at least two reasons for this.⁵ The first is a fixation on the word ev. What could Paul have meant by writing that something was done "in" Christ or even that someone was "in" Christ? Discussions of Paul's "mysticism," or doctrine of "union," or concept of "participation" have continued apace sheerly by force of Paul's seemingly odd use of the preposition ev with a personal object. The second and more significant reason for neglecting messiahship in accounts of Paul's "in Christ" language is a longstanding assumption that Paul had evolved beyond any interest in messiahship. Given this assumption, χριστός in Paul could not really have meant "messiah" because Paul's ideas looked nothing like "messianism." This, however, depends on the problematic premise that "messianism" in antiquity is an identifiable ideology that can be weighed in the balances with Paul's christology and found wanting. Given the choice, then, between attending to Paul's language or speculating about Paul's ideological commitments, modern interpreters have typically chosen the latter.

This has created a methodological paradox in treatments of Paul's "in Christ" language. Scholars have remained simultaneously interested in what Paul was saying yet predisposed against paying attention to what he was saying. And thus the cottage industry of research on Paul's "in Christ" lan-

³ Paul also wrote "in the lord" roughly about half as often as he wrote "in Christ" and related expressions (on which see below). Cf. Rom 14:14; 16:2, 8, 11, 12 [2x], 13, 22; 1 Cor 1:31 [paraphrase of LXX Jer 9:23]; 4:17; 7:22, 39; 9:1, 2; 11:11; 15:58; 16:19; 2 Cor 2:12; 10:17 [paraphrase of LXX Jer 9:23]; Gal 5:10; Phil 1:14; 2:19, 24, 29; 3:1; 4:1, 2, 4, 10; 1 Thess 1:1; 3:8; 4:1; 5:12; Phlm 16; 20 (thirty-five instances versus sixty-three, though in some cases it is perhaps debatable whether the referent of $\chi \omega \rho \omega \rho$ is Jesus).

⁴ Χριστός is a common noun, not a proper noun, and it is used by Paul as an honorific. On this see Matthew V. Novenson, *Christ among the Messiahs: Christ Language in Paul and Messiah Language in Ancient Judaism* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

⁵ See chapter 1.

B. Methodology

guage has become self-sustaining. This is why, even after a century and a half of modern biblical research, Stanley Stowers explains that we still "need a discourse or discourses that provide the conditions of intelligibility for the language of participation" (by which he means primarily the expression "in Christ").⁶ This need is bound to remain unfulfilled as long as we overlook the foremost clue indicating the discourse in which Paul was participating – the word $\chi\rho\iota\sigma\tau\delta\varsigma$, "messiah." Alternatively, my thesis is that Paul's use of "in Christ" language is part of a broader phenomenon of ancient Jewish messiah discourse, and that Paul's development and uses of the expression "in Christ" are accounted for by features of this discourse. In other words, I propose that $\hat{\epsilon}\nu \chi\rho\iota\sigma\tau\tilde{\phi}$ means "in messiah."

This claim is simple but susceptible to misunderstanding. I am not proposing that Paul was, after all, heir to a pre-formed messianic ideology to which his various uses of the word χριστός refer. That is to say, I do not think there was an extant messianic theology in Paul's period that explains his use of "in Christ" language. Recent research on messianism in antiquity has demonstrated that there was no such thing. Instead, what we have is a variety of ancient messiah texts whose commonality consists not in a uniform conception of messiahship, but rather in the markedly innovative interpretation of scripture in accordance with the varying historical realities of each author in order to describe their respective messiahs. This description is the model of ancient messiah discourse I will use here.⁷ And on this model, Paul may be understood as a participant in a recognizable Jewish interpretative enterprise, but a participant whose manner of speaking and whose ideas - like those of all the other participants - were nevertheless distinctive in light of the particularities surrounding the life of his messiah. Thus, Paul's "in Christ" language may be said to be both conventional and innovative.

B. Methodology

The aim of this study is historical description, not theological synthesis. It is therefore to be distinguished from treatments of the Christian doctrine of "union with Christ." Accordingly, I use the conventional linguistic, literary, and historical-inferential tools commonly deployed in the discipline of biblical studies. Additionally, within the general category of historical description I am specifically interested in Paul's language rather than themes or motifs

⁶ Stanley K. Stowers, "What Is 'Pauline Participation in Christ'?," in *Redefining First-Century Jewish and Christian Identities: Essays in Honor of Ed Parish Sanders*, ed. M. Chancey, S. Heschel, and F. Udoh, Christianity and Judaism in Antiquity Series 16 (Notre Dame: Notre Dame University Press, 2008), 353.

⁷ See chapter 2.

thought to be evinced in his writings. This study, then, is also different from research on participatory motifs in the Pauline epistles. Furthermore, my object of inquiry is neither έν-phrases generally nor χριστός-phrases generally.8 It is specifically the phrase έν χριστῷ and its variants. My defense for this delimitation is threefold: First, the study would grow too large if I attempted to conduct a thorough analysis of Paul's "in Christ" language as a specimen of ancient Jewish messiah discourse in addition to conducting a comparison with lexically similar phrases within the corpus Paulinum. Second, such comparisons of Pauline expressions have already been undertaken by others, but the framework of messiah discourse as an interpretative-linguistic phenomenon has been utterly neglected.⁹ And third, as concerns Paul's overall use of "messiah" language, ἐν χριστῷ is the most frequently occurring syntagm built with the word χριστός after the appellative combinations χριστός "Ιησους and "Ιησους χριστός.10 In other words, aside from Paul's axiomatic messianic designation of Jesus, "in Christ" is the thing Paul most frequently said about his messiah. It is therefore worthy of its own analysis.

C. Definitions

As a contribution to an ongoing scholarly conversation, this study uses as evidence for Paul the seven epistles which are widely considered to be of undisputed Pauline authorship: Romans, 1 Corinthians, 2 Corinthians, Galatians, Philippians, 1 Thessalonians, and Philemon.¹¹ Within these writings the

⁸ Therefore, while analyses of phrases such as ἐν χυρίφ or σὺν χριστ $\ddot{φ}$ would no doubt be fruitful, they are outside the purview of this study. However, see the brief comparative surveys concerning ἐν χυρίφ in the conclusions of chapters 5 and 6.

⁹ See chapter 1.

¹⁰ The noun χριστός is Paul's preferred designation for Jesus. The word occurs some 269 times in the undisputed epistles compared to 142 uses of "Ιησους and 188 uses of κύριος (not all of which refer to Jesus). The combinations χριστός "Ιησους and "Ιησους χριστός occur 106 times altogether. There are 56 instances of ἐν (τῷ) χριστῷ.

¹¹ For the NT I follow the Greek text of Kurt Aland et al., eds., *Novum Testamentum Graece*, 28th ed. (Stuttgart: Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2013). The one exception to this is that unlike NA²⁸ I do not capitalize the Greek noun $\chi\rho_i\sigma\tau\delta\varsigma$. On this, note Giorgio Agamben, *The Time that Remains: A Commentary on the Letter to the Romans*, trans. Patricia Dailey (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2005), 16–17: "The distinction between *Christos* (capitalized) and *christos* as an appellation was introduced by modern editors. Not only do the most ancient manuscripts fail to distinguish between capitalized and non-capitalized words, they also write *christos* – as with other *nomina sacra* such as *theos*, *kyrios, pneuma, Iēsous*, and so on – in an abbreviated form ….. But, in the preface to the Nestle-Aland edition, we read '*christos* will be written in lower case when it signals "the official designation" (*Amstbezeichnung*) of the Messiah …, and in upper case when it has clearly become a proper name …..' The real difficulty with this more or less conscious

evidence of primary interest is Paul's sixty-three uses of "in Christ" language, by which I mean the expressions ἐν χριστῷ, ἐν τῷ χριστῷ, ἐν χριστῷ Ἰησοῦ, and ἐν αὐτῷ where the pronoun's antecedent is χριστός.¹²

Additionally, in describing the pertinent ancient literature I use several phrases containing the word "messiah." Given the extensive secondary literature devoted to the study of "messianism" in antiquity, my terminology bears explaining. When speaking of "messiah texts" I mean texts that use the words משיח, אסוסדטק, unctus, or other translation equivalencies; I do not mean texts about eschatological figures sometimes considered to be "messianic" but never called "messiah." The authors of messiah texts engaged in "messiah speculation" - that is, the activity of characterizing a figure or figures called "messiah" and describing events, activities, and implications pertaining to that figure. In so doing, these authors participated in "messiah discourse," understood as the literary and linguistic conventions common to communication about messiahs. As we will see, the most prominent of these conventions is "messianic interpretation" by which I mean the reading of an antecedent scriptural text as pertaining to a "messiah" (regardless of whether that antecedent text is itself actually a "messiah text").¹³ Finally, it is possible to describe an ancient author's "messianology." This does not refer to widespread beliefs about a messiah, but rather the sum total of what one given author writes about a messiah. As concerns Paul, "messianology" is not synonymous with "christology," which typically refers to all of Paul's beliefs about Jesus. Rather, messianology is what Paul believes about the messiah, whom he identifies as Jesus.14

D. Conceptual Models

The overarching conceptual model of this study is to regard Paul's letters as ancient Jewish literature. Ancient "Judaism" – the historical, cultural, religious, and literary factors pertaining to ancient Jews – is therefore a context

transgression of the most basic philological principles, lies in determining this self-evident 'when.'" I do capitalize the English noun "Christ" since to my mind neglecting to do so would result in a distraction outweighing any philological benefit.

¹² Rom 3:24; 6:11, 23; 8:1, 2, 39; 9:1; 12:5; 15:17; 16:3, 7, 9, 10; 1 Cor 1:2, 4, 5, 30; 3:1; 4:10, 15a, 15b, 17; 15:18, 19, 22, 31; 16:24; 2 Cor 1:19, 20; 2:14, 17; 3:14; 5:17, 19, 21; 12:2, 19; 13:4; Gal 1:22; 2:4, 17; 3:14, 26, 28; 5:6; Phil 1:1, 13, 26; 2:1, 5; 3:3, 9, 14; 4:7, 19, 21; 1 Thess 1:1; 2:14; 4:16; 5:18; Phlm 8, 20, and 23.

¹³ See chapter 3.

¹⁴ "Messianology" is therefore synonymous here with the tautological expression "messiah christology."

for Paul, not a "background."¹⁵ Thus, for this study the analysis of other Jewish literature roughly contemporary to Paul's letters is valuable, but not primarily for pinpointing linguistic "parallels" or ostensible conceptual "parallels,"¹⁶ nor primarily for tracing the purported history of a tradition which Paul appears to espouse. Rather, contextualizing Paul within Judaism is valuable for describing shared discourses in which Paul participates and by which aspects of his writings are elucidated – messiah discourse in this case. Nevertheless, two caveats are in order: First, this study will propose that certain antecedent scriptural texts shaped Paul's messianology. That, however, can be said of any messiah text in and around the first century CE. Second, this study is primarily interested in re-describing Paul specifically, not ancient Jewish messiah discourse generally. In itself, however, that stated purpose does not devalue other Jewish literature; it merely focuses the object of inquiry.

E. Outline

Chapter 1, recounting modern treatments of "participationism" and associated language in Paul, illustrates a virtually uniform neglect of messiahship in describing Paul's "in Christ" language. Chapter 2 traces the rise of revisionist accounts of ancient messiah texts, accounts which eschew "the messianic idea" as an explanatory category and which instead emphasize the interpretative-linguistic conventions common to ancient messiah discourse. Chapters 3 and 4 explore Paul's participation in that discourse with special reference to his use of "in Christ" language. Chapter 3 traces Paul's messianic interpretation of scriptural traditions concerning Abraham's seed, and chapter 4 assesses his messianic interpretation of the Danielic "one like a son of man." Finally, chapters 5 and 6 comprise a two-part examination of every instance of "in Christ" language in Paul in light of the findings of chapters 3 and 4. Chapter 5 consists of a syntactical analysis and chapter 6 a conceptual analysis. The conclusion of the book very briefly summarizes the findings of the study, considers their import for evaluating existing scholarship, and suggests trajectories for further investigation.

¹⁵ This distinction is in partial response to the essays, Geza Vermes, "Jewish Studies and New Testament Interpretation," *JJS* 31 (1980): 1–17; Geza Vermes, "Jewish Literature and New Testament Exegesis: Reflections on Methodology," *JJS* 33 (1982): 361–376; and Geza Vermes, "Methodology in the Study of Jewish Literature in the Graeco-Roman Period," *JJS* 36 (1985): 145–158. I use the term "Judaism" in its conventional sense, but it has been instructively problematized by Steve Mason, "Jews, Judaeans, Judaizing, Judaism: Problems of Categorization in Ancient History," *JSJ* 38 (2007): 457–512.

¹⁶ See Samuel Sandmel, "Parallelomania," JBL 81 (1962): 1–13.

Chapter 1

The Modern Problem of "In Christ" in Paul

I have claimed in the introduction that in some important respects Paul's "in Christ" language has been misconstrued in modern scholarship. Whatever the causes of this, a lack of attention to the phrase has not been one of them. On the contrary, it rarely goes unmentioned in treatments of Paul and early Christianity. The idiom, however, is very rarely dealt with in its own right. Rather, discussions of it are logged in broader accounts of Paul's thought, or it is uncritically treated as a cipher for some theological or religio-historical concept.¹ This latter scholarly habit is especially problematic because it confuses Paul's idiom with various modern constructs thereby distorting the results of historical inquiry. Despite the relatively copious attention given to the phrase, one of the effects of this faulty approach is a neglect of one of the phrase's constituent lexemes, the noun χριστός. Because in modern parlance, scholarly and popular, "Christ" usually simply and uncontroversially denotes Jesus of Nazareth without evoking the meaning "anointed one" or "messiah," there results a fixation on the preposition $\dot{\epsilon}\nu$ and what it might mean for concepts of "union," "participation," or "mysticism." These ideas are certainly worthy of study, but they are conceptual constructs rather than accounts of an ancient author's manner of speaking. And in the case of the idiom $\dot{\epsilon}\nu \chi\rho\iota\sigma\tau\tilde{\omega}$, however else that manner of speaking might be described, it is consistently messianic. Nevertheless, modern treatments of Paul's "in Christ" language, almost without exception, ignore messiahship. I intend the present study as a corrective to this oversight.

This study is not, then, a treatment of participation, union, or the like, but rather an exploration of one very common example of Paul's messiah language. Nevertheless, discussions of these more comprehensive topics necessarily entail analyses of relevant language, among which the Pauline idiom "in Christ" is frequently (and perhaps correctly) considered preeminent. It is therefore neither possible nor desirable to pass over such treatments while recounting the modern problem of Paul's "in Christ" language. This study

¹ Note, for instance, the title of a recent collection of essays, "*In Christ" in Paul*, the subtitle of which is *Explorations in Paul's Theology of Union and Participation* (ed. Michael J. Thate, Kevin J. Vanhoozer, and Constantine Campbell, WUNT II 384 [Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2014]). This is a fine anthology, but it contains no substantive discussion of "in Christ" language as such in the undisputed Pauline epistles.

does do something different, though. And while its findings may be pertinent for an understanding of "participation" in Paul, I do not assume that a particular conception of participation is operative in Paul's thought, nor am I interested in the phrase mainly as it pertains to participation. Instead, I am interested in the phrase as it pertains to messiahship. Moreover, as will become evident in what follows, the modern problem of Paul's "in Christ" language is largely a problem of *disinterest* in messiahship. This trait has been endemic in the modern, critical study of Paul from its inception, and therefore it is appropriate to begin our survey with the self-designated *Herr* of the Tübingen School of biblical criticism, Ferdinand Christian Baur.²

A. Into the Age of Mysticism

Baur is (in)famous for his view that Paul's letters represent one side of a twosided dispute between Peter and Paul, that is, between Jewish Christianity and gentile Christianity. This theory is based largely on Baur's construal of the factions in the Corinthian church, a perspective first set out in his 1831 article "Die Christuspartei in der korinthischen Gemeinde" and developed in his 1845 *Paulus, der Apostel Jesu Christi.*³ Baur finds evidence in the Corinthian correspondence not of four factions, but of two – those claiming "έγὼ $\Pi αύλου$, έγὼ Ἀπολλῶ" and those declaring "έγὼ Κηφᾶ, έγὼ χριστοῦ" (1 Cor 1:12).⁴ Left with the awkward question of why Paul would oppose a group professing to be Christ's, Baur leverages the construct of messianism to explain the problem: The members of the Petrine party were Jewish Christians, who, given their Jewishness, were claiming closer association with the messiah than gentile believers enjoyed and thereby superiority over the gentiles loyal to Paul (and Apollos). Thus, on the problematic nature of the expression έγὼ χριστοῦ Baur speculates,

Among such proud men as these Jewish Christians, would not the presumption arise that Christ, the Messiah, belonged to them alone? Exactly in this manner the presumption did

² F. C. Baur, *Die Tübinger Schule und ihre Stellung zur Gegenwart* (Tübingen: Fues, 1860), 58n1.

³ F. C. Baur, "Die Christuspartei in der korinthischen Gemeinde, der Gegensatz des petrinischen und paulinischen Christentums in der ältesten Kirche, der Apostel Petrus in Rom," *Tübinger Zeitschrift für Theologie* 4 (1831): 61–206; F. C. Baur, *Paulus, der Apostel Jesu Christi, sein Leben und Wirken, seine Briefe und seine Lehre* (Stuttgart: Becher und Müller, 1845); ET F. C. Baur, *Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ: His Life and Works, His Epistles and Teachings*, trans. A. Menzies (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2003), esp. 1:268–320.

⁴ Baur, Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ, 1:274.

arise They called themselves τοὺς τοῦ Χριστοῦ – disciples of Christ – disciples of the Messiah, – or, changing slightly the name, χ ριστιανούς.⁵

According to Baur, such messianic fervor was an issue of contention for Paul because he, confronted with the previously unthinkable notion of a crucified messiah, saw in Jesus's death "the purification of the Messianic idea." Baur explains,

With this death everything that the Messiah might have been as a Jewish Messiah disappeared; through his death, Jesus, as the Messiah, had died to Judaism, had been removed beyond his national connexion with it, and placed in a freer, more universal, and purely spiritual sphere.⁶

Paul had thus "passed far beyond" interest in a messiah $\varkappa \alpha \tau \dot{\alpha} \sigma \dot{\alpha} \rho \varkappa \alpha$ (2 Cor 5:16).⁷ And therefore the Petrine party's claim of allegiance to the messiah – or, as Baur puts it, "the idea of the Xριστοῦ εἶναι" – is at the root of the "dispute between the Apostle and his opponents."⁸

In drawing up his historical reconstruction, Baur gives a brief but telling analysis of the genesis of Paul's "in Christ" language. Having contended that "the Χριστοῦ εἶναι" is the rub for Paul, Baur infers that

[t]he peculiar circumstance from which the εἶναι ἐν Χριστῷ must have been derived ... was not so much the earthly and national appearance of Jesus ... but rather the death of Jesus That which essentially distinguishes the national Jewish Messiah from the Christ of the true Christian consciousness, is the sufferings and death of Christ.⁹

In other words, Paul's notion of being "in Christ" is a one-upping of his opponents notion of being "of Christ"; to be "in Christ" is "the *true* $X\rho\iota\sigma\tau\sigma\tilde{\upsilon}$ elval."¹⁰ In this, Baur severs Paul's "in Christ" language from discourse about a "Jewish messiah," and indeed the phrase "in Christ" – despite its plain meaning – is taken as a *rejection* of messiahship. Grammatically speaking, Baur fixates on the preposition ev (on the assumption that "in" is better than

⁵ Baur, *Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ*, 1:276. See Philippa Townsend, "Who Were the First Christians? Jews, Gentiles and the *Christianoi*," in *Heresy and Identity in Late Antiquity*, ed. Eduard Iricinschi and Michael Holger Zellentin, TSAJ 119 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008), 212–230, who argues the opposite, that χριστιανοί emerged as a designation of the early Pauline gentile communities.

⁶ Baur, Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ, 2:125.

⁷ Baur, *Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ*, 2:126. On this problematic reading of 2 Cor 5:16, see chapter 3.

⁸ Baur, *Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ*, 1:297. Here, Baur is attuned to the meaning of χριστός. Note also 1:277–278: "On this account also [Peter's party's] designation, evidently intentionally chosen, was τοῦ Χριστοῦ not τοῦ Ἰησοῦ or τοῦ χυρίου."

⁹ Baur, Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ, 1:283-284.

¹⁰ Baur, *Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ*, 1:284 (italics added). Note also 2:176: "[t]he name χριστιανοί ... expresses nothing but the external side of this relation ... but the ὄντες ἐν Χριστῷ ... expresses its most intimate principle."

the genitive relation) and ignores the preposition's object, $\chi \rho \iota \sigma \tau \delta \varsigma$. This state of affairs would obtain in treatments of the idiom for more than a generation to come.

The work of Adolf Deissmann exemplifies this trend. Deissmann has been dubbed a "discoverer" of the Pauline concept of participation in Christ,¹¹ an epithet earned by his theory of "Christ-mysticism" set forth in his 1909 Upp-sala lectures and published the following year as *Paulus: En kultur- och religionshistorisk skiss.*¹² Deissmann builds his account of Paul's thought around "the primitive Pauline watchword 'in Christ," a "formula" which "is meant vividly and mystically" and is the "characteristic expression of his Christiani-ty."¹³ Deissmann arrives at his perspective in two steps. First, leaning on the inverse expression "God revealed his son *in me*" (Gal 1:16), Deissmann finds in Paul's Damascus road experience the catalyzing inception of his mystical thought.¹⁴ And second, perceiving in Paul a "Hellenistic-mystical tendency of the experience of Christ," Deissmann finds in the identification of $\varkappa 0$ gives with $\pi \nu \varepsilon \widetilde{\mu} \alpha$ in 2 Cor 3:17 the key to understanding Paul's idea of mystical communion:¹⁵

Christ is Spirit; therefore He can live in Paul and Paul in Him. ... Just as the air of life, which we breathe, is "in" us and fills us, and yet we at the same time live in this air and breathe it, so it is also with the Christ-intimacy of the Apostle Paul: Christ in him, he in Christ.¹⁶

Deissmann's explanation of Paul's "in Christ" language entails functionally redefining $\chi\rho\iota\sigma\tau\delta\varsigma$ as something other than "messiah" – in this case, Deissmann's conception of the $\pi\nu\epsilon\tilde{\nu}\mu\alpha$ of Hellenistic mysticism. Whereas for Baur Paul left behind "the national Jewish messiah" in favor of "the Christ of the true Christian consciousness,"¹⁷ for Deissmann "[t]he spiritual Christ was able to do what a dogmatic Messiah could not have done."¹⁸ Accordingly, Deissmann throughout sees Paul as a religious and linguistic innovator. His Damascus road apocalypse was "the basal mystical experience of a religious genius."¹⁹ And having thus been "thrown open to creative energy,"²⁰ "Paul

¹¹ E. P. Sanders, *Paul and Palestinian Judaism: A Comparison of Patterns of Religion* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1977), 453.

¹² G. Adolf Deissmann, *Paulus: En kultur- och religionshistorisk skiss* (Stockholm: Geber, 1910); ET G. Adolf Deissmann, *Paul: A Study in Social and Religious History*, trans. William E. Wilson (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1926), 147.

¹³ Deissmann, Paul, 140.

¹⁴ Deissmann, *Paul*, 130 (italics original).

 $^{^{15}}$ Deissmann, Paul, 138; 2 Cor 3:17: "the lord is the spirit (ό ... κύριος τὸ πνεῦμά ἐστιν)."

¹⁶ Deissmann, Paul, 140.

¹⁷ Baur, Paul the Apostle of Jesus Christ, 1:284.

¹⁸ Deissmann, Paul, 156, cf. 191.

¹⁹ Deissmann, Paul, 130.

Index for Chapters 5 and 6

This index lists the loci in chapters 5 and 6 of the analyses of each instance of "in Christ" language. The first page number corresponds to chapter 5 and the second to chapter 6.

Romans		5:19	165, 203
3:24	181, 198	5:21	175, 228
6:11	173, 209	12:2	184, 208
6:23	181, 215	12:19	170, 230
8:1	188, 217	13:4	175, 212
8:2	166, 219		
8:39	181, 198	Galatians	
9:1	167, 220	1:22	184, 208
12:5	173, 220	2:4	171, 203
15:17	168, 210	2:17	163, 204
16:3	182, 207	3:14	171, 204
16:7	174, 207	3:26	176, 230
16:9	183, 207	3:28	176, 230
16:10	179, 199	5:6	171, 204
			ŕ
1 Corinthians		Philippians	
1:2	161, 200	1:1	185, 208
1:4	161, 200	1:13	180, 231
1:5	161, 200	1:26	171, 232
1:30	174, 200	2:1	182, 204
3:1	183, 208	2:5	177, 213
4:10	174, 201	3:3	172, 205
4:15a	168, 201	3:9	164, 214
4:15b	168, 201	3:14	182, 233
4:17	181, 202	4:7	172, 206
15:18	168, 211	4:19	166, 236
15:19	169, 202	4:21	185, 208
15:22	162, 212		
15:31	170, 221	1 Thessalonians	
16:24	183, 208	1:1	186, 208
		2:14	179, 209
2 Corinthians		4:16	186, 209
1:19	174, 222	5:18	182, 206
1:20	174, 223		
2:14	164, 224	Philemon	
2:17	170, 226	8	173, 237
3:14	163, 203	20	173, 206
5:17	175, 227	23	187, 209
	<i>,</i>		· ·

Index of Ancient Sources

Hebrew Bible (and Septuagint)

Genesis			104, 104n88, 116,
1:27	93, 93n48		123n13
2:21-22	93n48	28:13	80n9
2:22	93	28:14	79, 80n8, 81n10,
2:7	148n100		85, 86, 116, 123n13
5:1-2	93	35:12	80n9
7:4	120n3	42:15, 16	170n54
12:3	79, 80n8, 84,	48:4	80n9
	84n24, 91, 104n88	49	74, 74n161
12:7	81n10	49:9	74, 149n105
13:5	81	49:9–10	70
13:15	80n9	49:10	69, 71, 72, 74, 75,
13:16	102n80		95-100
15:5	102n81		
15:6	79, 88n32	Exodus	
15:13	94, 94n49	4:16	210n22
15:18	81n10	4:22	84
17:4	88n32	12:40	94n49
17:7	103n83	13:8	20n88
17:8	80n9	18:19	210n22
18:18	79, 80, 80n8,		
	104n88	Leviticus	
21:12	94, 94n50, 117	26:11-12	223
22:1	88n32	26:16	90n38
22:16-18	102n81		
22:17	102, 102n81	Numbers	
		Num 24:17	67, 68, 69, 71, 72
22:18	79, 80, 80n8,		
	81n10, 85, 86,	Deuteronomy	
	86n27, 91, 100n74,	29:3	97, 98, 98n63
	103, 104, 104n88,	30:12-14	219n44
	115, 116, 123n13	30:15	219n44
24:7	80n9	31:27	210n22
25:23	33	33	71, 72
26:3	80n9, 86		
26:4	79, 80, 80n8, 80n9,	Judges	
	81, 81n10, 85, 86,	5:2	146n94

Ruth			148n100, 150n107,
	100		· · · · ·
4:12, 18–22	100	8:5	151n108
1 Samuel (1 Vined		8:5	145, 145n93,
1 Samuel (1 Kingd		0.7	150n107
2:10	170n53	8:7	123, 137, 145,
8:15	90n38		145n91, 145n92,
9:1-2	100n72		235
24:11	100n72	16:3 (15:3)	186
		18:50 (17:50)	82
2 Samuel (2 Kingd		33:21 (32:21)	169n49
7	38n196, 100n74,	34:10 (33:10)	186
	105	36:8 (35:8)	169n49
7:8, 14	121–122, 223	38:7 (37:7)	146n96
7:12	68, 69, 69n135,	69:10 (68:10)	82
	103n83, 114n123,	72:1 (71:1)	103
	115, 114n123	72:1–2 (71:1–2)	130n31
7:12–13	72	72:17 (71:17)	103, 104, 104n88
7:12, 14	113, 114	89 (88)	100, 100n74, 103
7:13	71, 103n87	89:4 (88:4)	101, 103, 103n86
7:14	122, 149n104	89:5 (88:5)	103, 103n87
19:43	30, 85n26	89:39 (88:39)	101
20:1	30, 85n26	89:40 (88:40)	101
23:1	67, 68	89:52 (88:52)	65
		105 (104)	100, 101, 103
1 Kings (3 Kingdor	ns)	105-106 (104-105)	101
12:16	85n26	105:6 (104:6)	101
		105:15 (104:15)	101, 101n78
2 Kings (4 Kingdor	ns)	105:42 (104:42)	101
18:5	169n49	105:43 (104:43)	101
		110 (109)	138, 138n64, 143,
1 Chronicles			146n93, 147, 148,
16:8–22	101		148n100, 151n108,
16:22	101n78		153, 226n69, 234
		110:1 (109:1)	71, 97, 98, 123,
2 Chronicles			137, 145n91, 147
6:42	101n78	110:3 (109:3)	146, 146n94
0.12	10111/0	126:6 (125:6)	90n38
Job		120.0 (125.0)	JOH50
32:11	99	Isaiah	
52.11	<i>))</i>	11	73, 74, 75
Psalms		11:1	112n115
2	38n196	11:1-2	72
2:2	70, 95	11:1-10	72
2:2	114n122	11:1–10	73
2:2, 7 2:2, 9	71		73
,		11:2, 3	
2:7	149n104	11:2, 4	73
8	135, 138, 146,	11:3	73
	146n93, 147, 148,	11:4	130n31

$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$
$ \begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$
$\begin{array}{cccccccc} Ezekiel & 9:25 & 66, 69 \\ 21:32 & 96n57 & 11 & 132 \\ 39:1, 6, 9-10 & 71 & 12 & 142n81 \\ & & 12:1-4 & 142 \\ \hline Daniel & 12:2 & 142, 212n25 \\ \text{whole} & 45n20 & 12:3 & 140, 234n93 \\ 3:33 (4:3) & 131n14 \\ \end{array}$
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$
39:1, 6, 9–10 71 12 142n81 12:1–4 142 Daniel 12:2 142, 212n25 whole 45n20 12:3 140, 234n93 3:33 (4:3) 131n14 140
12:1-4 142 Daniel 12:2 142, 212n25 whole 45n20 12:3 140, 234n93 3:33 (4:3) 131n14 140, 234n93
Daniel 12:2 142, 212n25 whole 45n20 12:3 140, 234n93 3:33 (4:3) 131n14 140, 234n93
whole 45n20 12:3 140, 234n93 3:33 (4:3) 131n14 140, 234n93
3:33 (4:3) 131n14
4.31(4.34) 131n14 Hosed
1.51 (1.51) 1511117 110504
6:27 146n96 10:1 169n49
7 75, 124–128,
148n100, 149n105, Amos
153, 154 9:11 68n131, 70, 71, 72,
7:3 75 72n151
7:7, 19–23 75
7:9 75, 144 <i>Micah</i>
7:9–14 70 5:3 67n126
7:9, 13 71, 128n26 7:6 71
7:10 75, 132
7:11–12, 26 137 <i>Habakkuk</i>
7:13 71, 71n146, 75, 2:4 215n33
131, 135n55, 136,

New Testament

Matthew			114, 115, 119–120,
1:1-6	100n75		121, 122, 223
1:2-6	100	1:4	112n116, 114n123,
1:17	65		119–120, 120n3,
13:32	91n39		121, 121n7, 122,
24:5, 36	75		235
24:30	141	1:5	112, 116, 211n24
24:31	142n78	1:7	185n104
24:43	142n78	1:8	206n17
26:64	144	1:9	226n68
27:52-53	120n4	1:13	99n65
		1:17	215n33
Mark		1:24	215n32
4:31	91n39	1:32	218, 219
13:26	141	2:7	216n35, 218
14:62	144	2:10	218
		2:13	218
Luke		2:26	217, 218
1:32	129n29	3:22	1
1:35	129n29	3:24	181, 187, 196, 198,
2:4	91n40	•	200
20:35	120n3	3:24-25	198
21:27	141	3:25	196
22:69	144	3:30	221n48
24:46	67, 68	4:1	108, 108n101
	,	4:13	90n35, 223n52
John		4:14	223n52
4:25	66	4:16	90n35, 223n52
		4:20	223n52
Acts		4:24	120n3
3:25	91, 91n40	4:24-25	120
4:2	120n3	4:25	120n3
7:46	144	5:8	228n75
15:16	70, 72	5:12-19	93
15:16-29	72	5:13	99n65
15:26	72	5:17	140
26:23	121n6	5:18	219, 229
		5:21	216n35
Romans		6	154
1:1	105	6:3	210
1:2	105	6:3–4	236
1:3	105, 109, 110, 111,	6:3-4, 11	121n7
	112, 113	6:4	120n3
1:3-4	68, 81, 82, 82n15,	6:4–11	120
	105–108, 111, 113,	6:4, 6–7, 12	210
		6:5	120n3

6:5, 8	210	8:31	199
6:9	120n3, 209, 216,	8:31–39	234n97
0.9	219	8:32	199
6:10–11	152, 209, 227n72	8:34	120, 120n3, 199,
6:11	121, 173, 181, 209–	0.51	234
0.11	210, 216, 239n107	8:37	199
6:11-14	78n6	8:39	181, 184n102, 187,
6:12	210, 216	0.57	198–199
6:12–23	216	9:1	154n121, 167, 220,
6:14	209	,	240n113, 239n108
6:16	216n34	9:1–5	110
6:21	216	9:3	108, 110, 112
6:21–23	216	9:4	84, 223n52
6:22	216, 216n35	9:5	108–109, 109n102,
6:23	32, 153n113,		110, 112, 163n28
	167n44, 181, 194,	9:6	109n103, 110
	215–216, 216n35,	9:6-13	111n110
	239n107	9:7	90n35, 94n50, 117,
7:3	215n32		195
7:4	120, 120n3	9:8	90n35, 110, 223n52
7:25	206n17	9:9	223n52
8:1	188, 188n118, 217–	9:9–13	111n110
	219, 219n46,	10:6	219n44
	239n107	10:9	120, 120n3
8:1-4	217, 219, 219n46	11:1	80n8, 111n110
8:2	166–167, 167n43,	11:8	97
	167n44, 217, 218,	11:8-10	98n63
	219-220, 239n107	11:25	97n60, 99n65
8:2–4	217	12:4	221
8:3	217, 218, 219	12:5	154n122, 173, 220-
8:3-4	217		221, 231, 231n83,
8:4	217, 218, 218n39,		239n107
	219	13:7	169n52
8:4–5	106–107	13:14	235
8:9	220, 245	14:14	190n126, 240n114
8:10-11	122	15:3	82
8:11	98n63, 120, 120n3,	15:3, 8	82n17
	220	15:3, 9, 12	82n17
8:12	215n32	15:8	223n52
8:13	219	15:8–9	112
8:16-17	83, 231	15:8–9, 12	73
8:17	225, 226n66,	15:9	82
	239n111	15:12	112, 112n116,
8:19, 23	228n74		169n49, 169n52,
8:22	99n65	15 10 12	211n24
8:24	169n52, 226n69	15:12–13	111n113
8:24, 37–39	144n89	15:13	112
8:25	169n52	15:15	210, 233n89
8:29	122	15:16	210

15.16 17	211-24	1.10	206-15
15:16-17	211n24	1:10	206n15
15:16-18	211n24	1:10-12	183
15:17	154n121, 168,	1:11-13	202
	170n53, 172n58,	1:12	8
	173n62, 206n15,	1:18	225
	210, 237, 237n104,	1:23–24	32, 213n26
	239n108	1:28	201
15:17–18	210, 221, 222, 232	1:28-30	200
15:18	211, 211n23,	1:29	201
	211n24	1:30	174, 198, 200–201,
15:33	172		201n12, 205,
16	182		215n33, 228, 229,
16:2	190n126, 240n114		229n78, 229n79
16:3	182–183, 183n96,	1:30-31	205
	186n108, 187,	1:31	170n53, 172,
	187n117, 207,		190n126, 205,
	207n19		205n15, 240n114
16:3, 9	179	2:8	206n15
16:7	117, 174, 179, 207,	3:1	183, 187, 208
	207n19	4:1	202
16:8	183n96, 190n126,	4:5	97n60, 98, 98n64
	240n114	4:9	225, 225n63
16:9	183, 183n96,	4:9–10	201
	183n98, 187, 207,	4:10	174, 201, 201n12
	207n19	4:11	99n65
16:10	179, 183n96, 199	4:14	202
16:11	190n126, 240n114	4:15	168, 173n62, 201-
16:12	183n96, 190n126,		202, 202, 237n104
	240n114	4:16	239n109
16:13	183n96, 190n126,	4:17	181, 190n126, 202,
10.15	240n114	1.17	240n114
16:20	172	5:31	237n104
16:22	183, 183n96,	6:2	140–141
10.22	183n97, 190n126,	6:5	176n77
	240n114	6:11	163n28
16:26	211n24	6:14	120n3, 142n80
10.20	2111124	7:10	238
1 Corinthians		7:12	238
1:2	161, 183, 184n104,	7:22	190n126, 240n114
1.2	185n104, 200,	7:22	238
	206n15	7:39	190n126, 240n114
1.2		9:1	190n126, 240n114 190n126, 240n114
1:3	206n15		<i>'</i>
1:4	187	9:2	190n126, 240n114
1:4-5	161–162, 200	10:17	221
1:5	161n21	10:18	108
1:7	206n15, 231n86	11:1	239n109
1:8	99n65, 146n96,	11:11	190n126, 240n114
1.0	206n15	11:23-24	221
1:9	206n15	11:26	97n60, 99

12:2	221	15:24, 28	149n104
12:12	36	15:25	71, 97, 97n60, 98,
15	122–124		98n63, 99n65, 143,
15:3	228n75		145n91, 234
15:3–5	24	15:25-26	151n108
15:4	120n3	15:26	123, 135
15:5, 7	151n108	15:27	145, 145n91,
15:10	222		150n107, 235
15:12	120n3, 121n6, 211	15:27-28	145, 145n92
15:12-13, 20-21	114n123	15:28	136
15:12–19	151n107	15:29	120n3
15:13	120n3, 211	15:31	154n121, 168, 170,
15:14	120n3, 211		170n53, 172n58,
15:15	120n3, 211		173n62, 206n15,
15:15, 17	203		221–222, 225, 232,
15:16	120n3, 150n106,		239n108
	211	15:32	221
15:16, 18	152, 211	15:38	91n39
15:17	120n3, 168, 211	15:40-42	142
15:17-19	150	15:40-43	234n95
15:18	168, 168n46, 169,	15:40-57	140n71
	186, 186n111, 211–	15:42	120n3, 142
	212, 212n25,	15:45	136, 148n100
	239n107	15:47	137, 150
15:19	169, 202–203	15:47-48	235
15:20	115, 120n3, 123,	15:47-49	142
	150, 150n107	15:48	236
15:20-22	148n99	15:48-29	234n93
15:20-27	122–123	15:49	234
15:20-28	131, 142, 143, 145,	15:50	236n101
	149, 150n107, 152,	15:51	142
	193	15:52	142
15:21	120n3, 126n21,	15:53	236n101
	150, 162	15:56	219n45
15:21–22, 45–49	93	15:58	190n126, 240n114
15:21, 22	150n107	16:8	99n65
15:21, 45, 47–49	148	16:19	190n126, 240n114
15:22	150, 151, 152, 162,	16:24	183–184, 187, 208
	165, 186, 212,		
	239n107	2 Corinthians	
15:23	151n108, 188n118	1:1	165
15:23–24	136	1:2	185n104
15:23–26	151	1:10	169n49, 169n52
15:23–28	137	1:17	222
15:24	137, 146, 146n94,	1:18	222
	146n96, 147n96,	1:19	220n47, 222, 223,
15.24 27	147n97, 151n108	1.10.20	239n108, 240n113
15:24-27	137, 147, 234n97	1:19–20	174, 174n68,
15:24–28	144, 144n89, 210		224n55

1:20	222, 223, 223n55,	6:14-7:1	121n8, 223n53
	239n107	6:16-18	223
1:21	223n54	6:18	121, 122
1:21-22	144	6:18-7:1	223, 224n55
1:23	226n68	7:1	121, 223, 223n55
2	226n69	8:5	169n52
2:12	190n126, 240n114	10:13, 14	99n65
2:14	154n121, 164–165,	10:17	170n53, 172,
	224–226, 231, 232,		190n126, 240n114
	239n108, 239n110	11:17, 21	84n22
2:14-16	226	11:22	84n22, 90n35
2:15–16	225	12:1–7	143n84
2:15, 17	165	12:2	184, 187, 208
2:16	226	12:7	184n103
2:17	154n121, 170, 220,	12:19	84n22, 154n121,
2.17	226–227, 227n70,	12.17	170, 220, 226,
	230, 238, 239n108,		227n70, 230,
	240n113		239n108, 240n113
3:1	98n63	13:3	154n121, 222, 226,
3:14	98, 99n65, 163, 203	15.5	227n70, 238
3:15	99n65	13:4	154n121, 175, 212–
3:17	10, 32n157	13.4	213, 239n108
4:6	166	13:13	213, 2391108 227n70
4:10	225	15.15	22/11/0
4:10-11	225n63	Galatians	
4:10–11	222	1:1	120n3
4:14	120n3	1:12, 16	143
5:1	235, 236	1:12, 10	145
5:1-2	236	1:16	10, 230
5:1-2 5:1-3	235	1:17	10, 250
5:1–5 5:1–5	235, 236	1:22	
5:1-5 5:2	222, 236	1.22	179n85, 184,
5:2 5:7	222, 230		184n104, 186n109, 187, 208
5:14	227	1:3	187, 208 185n104
5:14-15	228n73	2:4	171, 173n62, 203,
5:14–17 5:15	227 120n3 227	2.7	237n104
	120n3, 227	2:7 2:15	116
5:15-17	227		163
5:16	9, 108n100, 227	2:15-17	163n29
5:17	153n114, 175, 227–	2:16-17	204
5.10	228, 239n107	2:17	163–164, 204
5:19	165, 203, 207n18	2:20	230
5:19-20	226n69	3	26, 104, 149
5:20	228, 229	3:6	79
5:21	163n28, 175, 194,	3:8	25, 79, 79n8, 80,
	228–229, 229n78,	2.0.0	80n8, 81, 84, 85
	229n79, 229n80,	3:8-9	11n31
6.1	239n107	3:8, 14	32
6:1	228	3:9	85

3:11	164, 215n33	5:1	203
3:14	25, 80-81, 83-87,	5:4	204
	87n31, 88, 115,	5:4-6	204
	116–117, 171, 204,	5:5	204
	223n52	5:6	171, 204
3:14-16	69n134, 102n81,	5:10	190n126, 240n114
	195	5:17	106, 107
3:16	26, 36n184, 80,	6:8	216n35
	82n18, 85, 87–92,		
	92n43, 94–97, 100,	Ephesians	
	102, 103, 115,	1:12, 20	37n191
	125n20, 221,	1:20	40, 138n64
	221n49, 223n52,	1:20-21	137, 147
	231	1:20-22	144n88
3:16, 19	74, 223	2:6	40
3:16, 29	230	2:7	187n116
3:17	94n49	3:6	176n76
3:17–19	92	3:11	37n191
3:18	223n52	3:14–15	91
3:19	75, 92, 95–100, 230	3:14-15	91, 91n40, 92n42
3:20	221n48	4:6	91, 91140, 92142 92
3:20	223n52	4:21	92 1n2
		4.21	1112
3:22	223n52	DL:L:	
3:26	32, 83, 117, 122n9,	Philippians	195 195-107 197
	154n123, 176, 223,	1:1	185, 185n107, 187,
2.26.20	230, 239n107	1.0	195, 208
3:26-29	224n55	1:2	185n104
3:26-4:7	123n14	1:5	233n89
3:27	177n77, 230n82,	1:5-6	99n65
	231n83, 235, 236	1:6	233n89
3:28	36, 93n48, 117,	1:7	233n89
	154n122, 176–177,	1:8	226n68
	230–231, 239n107	1:12	231
3:28–29	221n49	1:13	154n121, 180,
3:29	90, 117, 121, 195,		180n89, 231–232,
	223, 223n52, 230,		239n108, 239n110
	231	1:14	190n126, 240n114
4:2	99n65	1:24–25	232
4:4	107n95, 230,	1:26	170n53, 171–172,
	230n81, 230n82		206n15, 232–233,
4:5–7	83		239n107, 239n112
4:6	83, 230	1:28	205
4:14	164	1:29	205
4:23	108–109, 223n52,	2:1	182, 199, 199n10,
	235, 235n99		204-205
4:28	223n52	2:3	214
4:28, 31	107	2:3-4	213, 214
4:29	106–107, 107n96, 108–109	2:3–5	237

276

2:5	177–178, 178n84,	3:20-21	234, 235
	213, 214, 239n107	3:21	182, 235, 236, 237
2:6	213n28	4:1	190n126, 240n114
2:6-11	213n28, 214,	4:2	190n126, 240n114
	235n98	4:4	190n126, 240n114
2:6-8	213, 215n33	4:7	172, 206
2:8	205n14, 214	4:9	172
2:9	235	4:10	190n126, 240n114
2:9-10	235n98	4:19	166, 236–237,
2:9-11	237		239n107
2:10	235	4:21	179n86, 183n98,
2:15	140, 140n72,		185–186, 187, 195,
	234n93		208
2:19	169, 169n52,		
	190n126, 240n114	Colossians	
2:24	190n126, 240n114	1:2	187n116
2:29	190n126, 240n114	3:1	121n7
3	154	3:1-2	235n99
3:1	190n126, 240n114	3:11	177n77
3:3	171n57, 172, 205-		
	206, 170n53	1 Thessalonians	
3:4-14	234	1:1	179n85, 184n104,
3:5	80n8		186, 190n126, 208,
3:8	153n115, 214		240n114
3:8-10	78n6	1:10	120n3, 141n76, 234
3:8-11	214	2:4	179n87
3:8-9	154, 164, 164n31	2:5	226n68
3:9	122n10, 153n115,	2:6-8, 11-13	202n13
	163, 164, 214–215,	2:10	226n68
	215n33, 231,	2:14	179, 179n85,
	239n108		180n90, 184n104,
3:9–10	153		209
3:10	120n3, 122,	3:8	190n126, 240n114
	164n31, 205n14,	4:1	190n126, 240n114
	215, 225, 231	4:16	142, 142n78,
3:10-11	182		160n19, 168n47,
3:11	214, 215, 120n3,		186-187, 209,
	122, 233		212n25, 234
3:12	233	4:17	140-141, 186
3:12-14	233	5:2	142n78
3:14	154n119, 182, 233-	5:10	206
	236, 239n108	5:12	190n126, 240n114
3:15	154n120	5:16-17	206n16
3:17	234, 239n109	5:18	182, 206
3:17-21	234	5:23	172
3:18	234		
3:20	182, 234, 234n93,	2 Thessalonians	
	234n96, 239n111,	2:7	99n65
	236		

1 Timothy		Hebrews	
4:13	99n65	2:8	145n91
		2:17	210n22
2 Timothy		3:13	97n60
2:8	69n134	5:1	210n22
2:18	120n3	7:9–10	33n164
Philemon		James	
3	185n104	1:17	177n77
5,7	237		
6	29, 207	1 Peter	
7	173	1:3	120
8	154n121, 173, 237-	3:22	137, 138n64,
	238, 239n108,		144n88, 147
	240n113	5:14	188n118
8–9	237		
9	237	Revelation	
16	190n126, 207,	1:13-14	71
	240n114	5:5	75n163, 149n105
20	173, 190n126, 206-	22:16	112n115
	207, 240n114		
23	183n98, 187,		
	207n19, 209		

Apocrypha

Judith		44:21	88n32
9:7	169n49	44:21-22	88n32
		45:25	100
Wisdom of Solomor	1		
5:5	32	2 Maccabees	
5:15	32	14:10, 15	99
8:17	32		
		1 Esdras	
Sirach/Ecclesiastic	us	5:5	100
37:2	177n77		
44:11-12	88n32	4 Maccabees	
44:19-23	88n32	4:22	177n77
44:20	88n32	18:1	90, 90n38, 91

Pseudepigrapha

2 Baruch whole	45n20	13:3 13:37–40	75, 149n105 75
39–40	139n69		
40:1-3	75	Joseph and Asenet	h
72:2	65	12:2	146n96
3 Baruch		Jubilees	
4:15	233n92	whole	48
		15:11–16, 25–34	88n32
1 Enoch		15:14	88n32
whole	16, 45n20	15:25-29	88n32
37-71	62, 126, 128n26	5:33-34	88n32
45:1, 3	144		
46-48	139n69	Psalms of Solomon	!
46:1	70	whole	62
46:3-6	144	18	113n120
48	37	17:21, 23-24, 32	73
48:10	70, 73	17:21, 32	66
49:2-4	73	17:29	130n31
51:3	144	18	113n120
55:4	144	18:5	66
61:8	144	18:7	71
62:1–3	144		, -
69:27, 29	144	Sibylline Oracles	
0,121,25		3:652	50
4 Ezra		3:652-795	50
whole	16, 45n20, 55,	5.052 775	50
whole	56n72, 59n86, 62,	Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs	
	63, 126	whole	45n20
11–12	149n105	whole	451120
11-12	149n105	Tostamont of Luda	h.
		Testament of Judah 12:2–3	
12–13 12:11	139n69	12:2-3	113n120 113n120
	149n105	24	1131120
12:31-32	70, 74, 149n105		
12:32	66, 67, 68, 75n165,	Testament of Mose	
	149n105	whole	48

Versions

Epistle to the LaodiceansNumb6180n8924:172 San23:1	ta
2 San	ers
	67
23:1	
	67

Dead Sea Scrolls

CD		II, 4	130, 133
XII, 23–XIII, 1	65, 69n137	II, 5	130, 131–132
XIV, 19	65, 69n137	II, 9	131–132
1028b		40252	
v, 27–29	75n163	whole	113n120
		V, 3	65
4Q174 (Florilegiu	m)	V, 3–4	71, 100
whole	113n120		
I, 10–13	72	4Q265	
		whole	65n117
4Q246			
whole	128–134, 148	4Q266 (Damascus	Document ^a)
I, 8	132	VII, 14–21	72
II, 1	129n29, 132		
II, 1–9	128	4Q267 (Damascus	Document ^b)
II, 3	132, 133	XIX, 10	72n151

Philo

De Abrahamo		Legatio ad Gaium	
5	88n32	55	33
60	88n32		

Josephus

Antiquitates judaicae 10.266–268 139

Rabbinic Texts

Mishnah		Genesis Rabbah	
m. Pesaḥ 10:5	19, 20n88	44:18	94n50
m. Soțah 9:15	64, 66, 71	8:1	93n45
Talmud Bavli		Leviticus Rabbah	
b. Ber. 61a	93n45	14	93n45
b. 'Erub. 18a	93n45		
b. Qidd. 70b	90n37	Pesiqta Rabbati	
b. Sanh. 38b	144	42:3	94n49
b. Sanh. 93b	73		
b. Sanh. 98b	75	Midrash Tanḥuma	
		Toledot §20	71n146
Seder 'Olam Rab	bah		
3	94n50	Midrash I Psalms	
		139:5	93n45

Targumim

Fragmentary Targum		2 Sam 23:3	67n126, 68n133
Gen 49:10	100	Mic 5:1, 3	67, 68
Gen 49:11	66n125		
Num 11:26	71	Targum Neofiti	
Num 24:7	67n126	Gen 49:10	99
Targum of the Writ	ings	Targum Onqelos	
1 Chron 3:24	71	Gen 49:10	99, 99n69
Ps 89:4	103		
Ps 89:5	103n87	Targum Pseudo-Jonathan	
		Gen 49:10	99
Targum of the Prop	ohets	Gen 49:11	66, 68
whole	69n135	Num 24:17, 19	67n126
2 Sam 23:1	68n133		

Apostolic Fathers

Shepherd of Hermas, Similitudes 9.27.3 (104.3) 146n96

Christian Authors

Augustine	Justin	
Expositio quarumdam quaestionum	Dialogus cum 1	<i>Tryphone</i>
in epistula ad Romanos	120:3–4	96
1 121	123.9	20n90

Inchoata Expositio 5.11 119–120

Classical Authors

Aristotle

Seneca

 De generatione anamalium

 716a19, 20
 33

 716a22
 33

Naturales quaestiones 3.29.2 33

282

Index of Modern Authors

Aejmelaeus, Anneli 169 Agamben, Giorgio 4 Albl, Martin C. 148 Allo, Ernest-Bernard 97 Baden, Joel S. 142 Barclay, John M. G. 34 Barr, James 110, 192, 193 Barrett, C. K. 162, 184, 224 Bartsch, Hans-Werner. 120 Baur, F. C. 8-11, 35, 40, 43, 52-53, 83, 108, 185, 244 Beker, J. Christiaan 151 Best, Ernest 1, 186, 195 Betz, Hans Dieter 171, 184 Betz, Otto 68-69, 102-103, 114, 126, 136-137, 145 Black, Matthew 49, 70, 137-138, 144, 145, 146, 147 Bockmuehl, Markus N. A. 42, 67, 96, 166, 172, 177–178, 185 Boer, Martinus C. de 123, 130, 151, 163, 171, 176, 184-185 Bonnard, Pierre 98 Bousset, Wilhelm 12, 13-15, 16, 17, 35, 40, 42, 43, 108, 134–136, 244 Bouttier, Michel 20, 22-23, 31, 108, 157-158, 167, 191 Boyarin, Daniel 87, 90, 126, 144, 231 Bruce, F. F. 186 Büchsel, Friedrich 18-19, 26, 31, 36, 159-160, 165, 166, 167, 169, 171, 172, 175, 181, 183 Bultmann, Rudolf 15, 17, 27, 43, 105, 108, 110 Burton, Ernest de Witt 184-185 Byrne, Brendan 140 Campbell, Constantine R. 7, 37, 41, 43, 158-159, 165, 166, 167, 168, 169, 171, 175, 176, 178, 180, 181, 183-184, 186, 191, 192, 240

Campbell, Douglas A. 77, 215, 229 Caragounis, Chrys C. 71, 147 Casey, Maurice 126, 127, 135, 138, 140 Chan, Alan Kam-Yau 146 Charlesworth, James H. 42, 51, 55-56, 65.66 Chester, Andrew 42, 51, 52, 53, 92, 142 Choi, Hung-Sik 158 Clinton, Arnold E. 138 Cohen, Shaye J. D. 60-61 Collins, Adela Yarbro 43, 66, 71, 127, 130 Collins, John J. 42, 48, 50, 53, 54-55, 65, 66, 68, 69, 71, 72, 102, 125, 127-128, 129, 130-134, 139, 141, 142-143, 147, 148 Collins, Raymond F. 142, 183, 201 Colpe, Carsten 13 Cook, Edward M. 64, 129, 130, 132 Cranfield, C. E. B. 121, 167, 217, 218 Crockett, William V. 162 Cross, Frank Moore 129, 130 Dahl, Nils A. 21, 42, 63, 74, 77, 85–87, 95, 97, 115, 121 Dan, Joseph 44 Daube, David 93–94 Davies, W. D. 19-20, 27, 28, 32, 40, 65, 108, 110, 147, 151, 195 Deissmann, G. Adolf 10-12, 13, 15, 16, 18, 20, 22, 23, 33, 40, 43, 84-85, 153-154, 156-157, 159, 177, 188, 244 Di Lella, Alexander A. 125, 140 Dodd, C. H. 138, 144 Duling, Dennis C. 68, 96, 99, 108, 112, 113-114, 115, 121 Dunn, James D. G. 105, 107, 109-111, 120, 127, 129, 130, 131, 158, 163, 167, 171, 173, 176, 184, 217

Eisenbaum, Pamela 33, 83

Ellis, E. Earle 89, 90 Engberg-Pedersen, Troels 15, 33-34, 140, 142, 234 Evans, Craig A. 127, 129, 137-138, 139, 140 Fee, Gordon D. 140, 162, 164, 166, 172, 176, 178, 180, 182, 183, 185, 186, 222, 232, 233, 234 Ferda, Tucker S. 130 Fishbane, Michael 59-60, 62, 102 Fitzmyer, Joseph A. 15, 66, 69, 71, 72, 107, 112, 120, 129, 132, 167, 169, 170 Flusser, David 35, 129, 132 Fredriksen, Paula 43, 99, 120, 121 Furnish, Victor Paul 98, 121, 175 Gager, John G. 53 García Martínez, Florentino 129 Garlington, Don 163 Garroway, Joshua D. 33 Gaston, Lloyd 53 Gaventa, Beverly Roberts 186 Georgi, Dieter 225 Gnilka, Joachim 171, 172, 178, 180, 185, 205, 214, 215, 233, 237 Gordon, Robert P. 67, 99 Gosse, Bernard 101 Gräßer, Erich 98 Green, William S. 42, 51, 54, 56–57 Greer, Rowan A. 61 Gregory, Bradley C. 88 Grypeou, Emmanouela 74, 95 Hafemann, Scott J. 165, 190, 224, 226, 227 Hartman, Lars 142 Hartman, Louis F. 125 Hay, David M. 144 Hayes, John H. 69, 114 Hays, Richard B. 82, 89, 108, 164, 201, 215 Heil, John Paul 237 Heilig, Christoph 165 Hengel, Martin 15, 42, 137, 140, 144, 146, 148 Hewitt, J. Thomas 29, 74, 85 Hill, C. E. 147, 151–152 Holleman, Joost 123, 135, 136, 142, 195 Holloway, Paul A. 164, 178, 180 Hooker, Morna D. 164, 175, 194, 215

Hurtado, Larry W. 12, 14, 107, 126, 141, 177, 178, 235 Idel, Moshe 45, 48, 49 Jewett, Robert 106, 107, 120, 140, 166-167, 217 Jipp, Joshua W. 38-40, 105, 106, 112, 124, 155, 235, 244 Johnson Hodge, Caroline E. 32-36, 81-84, 111, 245 Jonge, Marinus de 43, 51-52, 56-57 Juel, Donald 61, 86, 95, 97, 100, 115, 127, 139 Justnes, Årstein 129 Käsemann, Ernst 17-18, 25, 43, 120, 166, 177, 178, 218, 229 Kavka, Martin 44 Keck, Leander E. 218 Kennedy, H. A. A. 151 Kim, Seyoon 129, 137 Kirk, J. R. Daniel 112, 120 Klausner, Joseph 13, 46-51, 56, 57 Klijn, A. F. J. 142 Koch, Dietrich-Alex 97, 145 Konstan, David 159-160, 162, 166, 167, 168, 169, 172, 176, 178, 180, 181, 182-183, 185, 186-187 Kramer, Werner 23-24, 191, 241 Kugel, James L. 58-59, 61 Lambrecht, Jan 137, 138, 145, 148, 150, 151 Lang, Friedrich 98 Levenson, Jon D. 86, 87, 88, 89, 95 Levey, Samson H. 67, 68, 69, 71 Lietzmann, Hans 147 Lightfoot, J. B. 89, 166, 171, 176-177, 184, 186, 231, 234 Lim, Timothy H. 80 Lindemann, Andreas 97, 145, 147 Litwa, M. David 234 Lohmeyer, Ernst 166, 178, 180, 213 Longenecker, Richard N. 1, 176, 177 Losie, Lynn Allan 177 Macaskill, Grant 37-38, 41, 127-128, 176, 195, 228, 230 Macdonald, Dennis Ronald 170 MacRae, George 53-54 Marchand, Suzanne L. 12

Horbury, William 71, 72, 129, 144

Marshall, I. Howard 65 Martin, Dale B. 33 Martin, Ralph P. 177, 184 Martyn, J. Louis 163, 176, 184–185 Mason, Steve 6 Matlock, R. Barry 78, 164, 176, 177, 187 Meeks, Wayne A. 93, 96, 195, 210, 213, 225, 229, 235, 236 Metzger, Bruce M. 109, 175 Milik, J. T. 129 Mommsen, Tycho 11 Moo, Douglas J. 218 Moran, W. L. 96 Morgan, Michael L. 44, 46 Moss, Candida R. 142 Moule, C. F. D. 34, 109, 126, 177, 178 Mowinckel, Sigmund 135-136 Mroczek, Eva 58 Murphy-O'Connor, Jerome 170 Mußner, Franz 95 Najman, Hindy 58-59, 60-61 Neugebauer, Fritz 20-23, 31, 40, 108, 157, 159, 167, 180, 181, 183, 186, 189, 191 Neusner, Jacob 42, 54, 57-58, 64, 67 Neutel, Karin B. 210, 231 Nickelsburg, George W. E. 70, 127-128 Novenson, Matthew V. 2, 21, 29, 35, 37, 42, 43, 46, 52, 57, 62, 63, 64-66, 68, 69–73, 74, 75, 76, 82, 85, 105, 106, 112, 113, 144, 146, 148, 149, 189-190, 220, 223, 226 Oegema, Gerbern S. 43, 51, 52, 62-63, 65, 67, 68, 69, 71-72, 99, 135, 136, 139, 143 Orchard, J. B. 142 Paget, James Carleton 16 Peacocke, A. R. 34 Plevnik, Joseph 142 Porter, Joshua Roy 26 Porter, Stanley E. 25 Puech, Émile 128, 129 Rabens, Volker 34 Räisänen, Heikki 89, 167 Rajak, Tessa 12, 60 Ramelli, Ilaria 159-160, 162, 166, 167, 168, 169, 172, 176, 178, 180, 181, 182-183, 185, 186-187

Reed, Annette Yoshiko 89 Reitzenstein, Richard 12-13, 16, 17, 35, 40, 43, 78, 108, 123, 244 Reumann, John Henry Paul 180 Robinson, H. Wheeler 25-26 Rogerson, John W. 26 Salvesen, Alison 95, 99 Sanders, E. P. 10, 15, 27-28 Sandmel, Samuel 6, 88-89 Schaberg, Jane 138 Schäfer, Peter 43, 149 Schiffmann, Lawrence H. 65 Schlier, Heinrich 97 Schmauch, Werner 20, 166, 191 Schnelle, Udo 25-26, 31-32, 41 Schoeps, Hans Joachim 89 Scholem, Gershom 44–45, 47, 48–49, 56, 63 Schrage, Wolfgang 184 Schürer, Emil 46, 48-50, 56 Schütz, John Howard 210, 211, 225, 226, 227 Schweitzer, Albert 13, 15-18, 19, 28, 34-35, 40, 78, 114-115, 124, 141, 164, 195, 244 Schweizer, Eduard 69, 114, 120 Scroggs, Robin 162 Silva, Moisés 157, 177, 192, 232 Smith, Jonathan Z. 193 Smith, Morton 43, 56 Spurling, Helen 74, 95 Stanley, Christopher D. 80, 81, 98, 145 Stökl Ben Ezra, Daniel 129 Stone, Michael E. 66, 74, 75, 149 Stowers, Stanley K. 3, 28, 33, 34-36, 43, 44, 81–84, 108, 111, 122, 211, 218, 234 Strauss, Mark L. 67 Stuckenbruck, Loren T. 43, 62, 65, 66, 129, 130, 131, 153 Stuhlmacher, Peter 120, 140 Taubes, Jacob 44, 47 Thackeray, Henry St. John 89 Thate, Michael J. 7, 41 Thiessen, Matthew 33, 43, 81, 102, 123, 234.245 Thiselton, Anthony C. 184 Thrall, Margaret E. 165, 174, 22, 224, 229 Townsend, Philippa 9 Turner, Nigel 157

Vanhoozer, Kevin J. 7, 41 Vermes, Geza 6, 49, 86, 126, 131 Vincent, Marvin R. 172, 185, 215, 231 Waddell, James A. 43 Wagner, J. Ross 82, 112 Wasserman, Emma 147 Wedderburn, A. J. M. 24-26, 31, 32, 81, 84, 87, 150, 15, 157, 159-160, 189, 190, 193, 195 Weitzman, Steven 44, 46 Wenham, David 140, 143 White, Joel 138 Wilckens, Ulrich 98, 179, 199, 211, 218 Wilcox, Max 68, 102, 103, 115 Wilk, Florian 139 Williams, Guy 147

Wittgenstein, Ludwig 63, 74
Wolff, Christian 164, 224
Wolter, Michael 35–37, 142, 159, 167, 179, 182, 199, 211, 215, 217, 218
Wrede, William 53
Wright, N. T. 1, 20, 28–31, 35, 36, 43, 66, 74, 85, 89, 90–92, 114–115, 123, 124, 125, 138, 139, 146, 147, 149, 150, 155, 178, 207, 213, 218–219, 229, 244
Zakovitch, Yair 102
Zeller, Dieter 137, 145, 162, 168, 169
Zetterholm, Magnus 53
Zimmerman, Johannes 129, 133, 134, 149

Zuntz, Günter 170

Index of Subjects

Abraham, seed of Abraham 13n38, 25-26, 32-35, 74, 77-105, 115-118, 121, 146n96, 149, 171, 189, 193, 195-196, 204, 221, 223, 230, 244 accusative case 107n97, 145n91, 178n84, 217n36 Adam 47, 93-94, 123, 136, 145n93, 150, 162, 212 adjective, adjectival 26, 108n100, 117, 160, 162, 165, 167, 169, 174n65, 179-187, 188-189, 190n126, 198, 199, 201n12, 207, 232 adoption 230n82 adverb, adverbial 26, 108n100, 116, 145n91, 151n108, 159n16, 160, 161-180, 182, 186-187, 188-190, 212, 214, 235 Akiba 144 ambiguity 94, 95n53, 96n57, 103, 115, 125n20, 130, 132-133 analogy 16, 20, 25, 32, 34, 81, 83-84, 85n26, 87, 93-94, 107, 110, 133, 153, 174n67, 218 ancestry 20, 33-34, 81-84, 112, 115, 116 androgynous 93-94 angels 102n81, 125n20 anointing, anointed one 2, 7, 29, 30, 43n3, 50, 52, 53n58, 56-57, 58, 65-66, 67, 70, 71, 73, 74, 95, 100–101, 104, 114n122, 153, 195, 223n54, 244-245 antecedents 37, 124, 155 antichrist 132 anti-Judaism, anti-Semitism 53n56 apocalypse, apocalyptic, apocalypticism 10, 18n72, 56n72, 63, 75, 78n7, 79, 119, 124, 126-127, 130-132, 138, 139-143, 148-149, 151-152, 243

apocatastasis 160 apocrypha 46 appellative 4, 101, 130 apposition 91, 109n102, 186, 217n36 Aramaic 125, 128, 141n77, 146n96 Aristotle 33 article, see definite article Augustine 119-121 authorities, dominions, powers 123, 125, 137, 143, 144n88, 146n96, 151n108 authority 88n32, 136n56, 138, 155, 158, 237-238, 240, 243 ⊐, see prepositions backgrounds 6, 19, 26, 37, 86n27, 110, 136-137, 142n78, 143, 189 baptism 31, 36, 93n48, 210n20, 230n82, 231n83, 235n98, 236 Bar Kokhba, Simon ben Kosiba 63, 73 Bavli, see Talmud Bavli beasts 127, 130, 139, 147n97, 148 being-in-Christ 9, 13-14, 19-20, 29-30, 33-34, 40, 77, 158 binyanim 104n88 blessing 13n38, 25, 79, 83-84, 86, 87n31, 88n32, 91, 102n81, 104, 111n110, 115, 116-117, 171, 196, 204, 233n92 boasting 168, 170, 171-172, 200-201, 205-206, 210-211, 221-222, 232, 237, 239, 245 body of Christ 17n72, 24-25, 28, 36, 40, 122, 176n76, 140n72, 154, 173, 214n29, 220-221, 231n83, 234, 236 bread 221

canon 58n84 Cephas, *see* Peter

- chosen one 73, 100, 103, 127n26
- Christ (term), χριστός 2–5, 7, 9n8, 10,
 - 11, 12, 14, 16, 18, 19, 21, 23–24, 29, 32, 35, 36, 38, 41, 42, 50, 53, 57n79,
 - 76, 78–79, 85, 88, 101, 115, 153,
 - 242, 244–245
- Christ-being, see being-in-Christ
- Christians, χριστιανοί 9
- Christ in me 10, 13, 154
- Christ Jesus / Jesus Christ 1, 4, 245
- christology 2, 5, 15, 23, 32, 63, see also messianology
- Christ phrases 4, 5, 21–26, 78
- church (term), ἐκκλησία 184n104
- circumcision 88n32, 204
- citation formulas 97, 148n100
- citizenship 182, 234–235
- clouds 71n146, 130, 137, 139-141
- Codex Alexandrinus 1
- collectivity 36n184, 89–95, 101, 115– 116, 117, 125n20, 131
- concepts 41, 60, 157n5, 158n9, 192-198
- Corinthian church, Corinthians factions 8, 183–184, 201–202, 212, 220, 225, 232
- corporate personality 25-26, 30, 214n29
- covenantal nomism 27-28
- creativity, see innovation
- cross, crucifixion 9, 18, 21–22, 29, 38, 121, 175, 212–213, 225–226, 234, 239, *see also* death
- dative case 11, 197, 227n71
- David, seed of David 30, 55, 66, 67, 68n131, 70, 71, 73, 74, 82, 93, 94n48, 95, 100–105, 106, 108, 109, 111, 112, 113–115, 116, 118, 119, 134, 144, 146n96, 149, 150n107, 223, 242, 243, 245
- Dead Sea Scrolls, Qumran, 49n33, 55, 62, 63, 65n117, 69n137, 100, see also 4Q246 in Index of Ancient Sources
- death 123, 124, 142, 150, 151n108, 151n109, 152, 153, 154, 169, 194, 201, 203, 209–210, 211–212, 214, 215, 216, 218–219, 221, 224–226, 227

definite article 36, 109n102, 120n3, 162, 165, 176, 184n104, 187, 188n118, 227-228, 229, 243 demons 147n97 diachrony 31, 48, 49n36, 51 direct object 224 disputed Pauline epistles 1n2, 99n65, 106n94, 120n3, 187n116 divine passive 116, 123, 161-164, 171n55, 179, 184n103, 188-190, 205 dominions, see authorities, dominions, powers early scriptural interpretation 44, 55, 58-64, 74n161, 76 Eden 47 Egypt 20n88, 94 elect one 144 empire, see Roman empire έν, see prepositions eschatology, eschatological redeemers 5, 14, 16, 22, 24, 38, 41, 45, 51-52, 62, 72, 78, 121, 126, 136n56, 140, 141n76, 142n81, 143, 150n107, 151n108 eternal life 181, 194, 215-216 ethnicity 20, 163n29, see also genealogy euphemism 82, 212n25 exegesis 58n84, 62n107, 89, 93, 127 exile 46, 47, 59 Exodus (event) 94, see also Egypt faith, faithfulness 22, 35, 36, 61, 79, 83, 85, 88n32, 99n69, 112, 158, 168, 171n56, 176, 204, 211, 215n33, 228, 229, 230n82, 232 faith of Christ 1, 164n32, 214, 215n33 family 90-92 figurative language 25, 36, 108, 116, 171n55, 178, 225 flesh, σάρξ 105–113 footsteps of the messiah 64, 66

formulas 10, 11, 14, 18, 19, 20n91, 23, 24, 25, 39, 40, 93n48, 97, 107, 108, 148, 157, 167, 176n77, 192, 235n98, 238–239

Galatian opponents 107-108 genealogy, see also ethnicity 81-84, 109–110, 112 general resurrection 49, 114n123, 119-121, 150-151, 153, 211-212, see also resurrection generic singular 93-94 genitive case 1, 10, 11, 22, 32, 106, 153n115, 157, 164n31, 164n32, 173, 188n118, 214–215, 218, 233 gentile Christianity 8, 24, see also Hellenistic community gentile mission 33n161, 84, 112-113, 196, 210, 244 gentiles 8, 13n38, 32-35, 43, 68n131, 73-74, 82-84, 88n32, 90-92, 104, 111n120, 111n113, 112-113, 115, 116, 117, 123n14, 163, 171, 176n76, 210, 211n24, 229n80, 244 geography, geographic names 49n36, 73, 179n85 glory 109, 144, 166, 234, 236-237, 240n114 gnostic redeemer myth 12-13, 43 gonadic object 33, 82n18 grace 27, 204, 228, 233n89 grammar 38, 89, 105, 106, 157, 159, 177n78, 190, 215n31, 233n90, 234n94 heaven 14, 102, 137, 141n76, 142, 143n84, 150, 182, 233–236 Hellenism 12, 15n43, 17, 78 Hellenistic community (of believers) 12 - 15Hellenistic mystery religions, see mystery religions history-of-religion school, see religionsgeschichtliche Schule honorific 2n4, 39, 92 hope 28, 47-50, 53, 62, 73-74, 100, 102, 111n113, 112, 150, 169, 200-203, 204, 245 humanity of Jesus 145, 148, 150, 217, 228 ideology 2, 3, 38–39, 41, 42, 45–46, 48-50, 51n45, 52-54, 56, 73, 134-137, 154, 155, 193, 242

idioms, idiomatic 11, 33, 61-70, 76, 77, 82, 86-87, 95n54, 97n59, 99, 104, 109, 110, 111, 117–118, 145, 146n96, 159, 163, 168, 170n53, 172, 189, 190n126, 195, 205, 210, 241, 242-243 imagery 60, 70-76, 102n81, 112n115, 114, 115, 119, 126-127, 128n26, 130, 135, 138-142, 146n94, 149n105, 153, 233, 236n100, 241, 242-243 inclusion 83, 116-117, 193, 195-196, 197, 199, 207-209, 212n25, 217, 238, 240n114, 243 incorporation, incorporative 29-30, 34, 79, 92, 118, 124, 151, 152n112, 194 indeterminacy 54-58 individuality 88-95, 120n3, 125n20, 147, 154 infancy narrative 129 in Jesus 1n2, 2 inner-biblical interpretation 62n107, 102n80 innovation 3, 10, 12, 58n84, 62, 64, 76, 87, 88, 96n57, 106, 114, 135n54, 155, 156, 189, 193, 196, 241, 242-243 "in" phrases 4, 14n51, 21, 22, 81-87, 178, 180n90, 183n97, 190n126, see also in the law; in the Lord; in the Spirit; Christ in me instrumentality 22-23, 25-26, 31n152, 40, 116-117, 150n107, 158-159, 175n71, 190, 192-193, 196-207, 223, 236, 237n103, 238, 240n114, 243 intermediary figures, see mediatorial figures interpolation 88n32, 121n8, 170n53, 223n53 in the law 17, 78, 204 in the Lord 2n3, 32, 158, 170n53, 172n58, 190n126, 205, 240n114, see also Lord, κύριος in the Spirit 38, see also Spirit, πνεῦμα irony 112n115 Isaac 85-86, 87n31, 88n32, 94, 104, 107, 111n110, 117, 195

Israel, Israelites 19-20, 30, 39, 47, 65, 68, 80n8, 88n32, 91-92, 94, 95, 109-111, 124, 125n20, 135n55, 150n107, 206n15 Jerusalem 49, 66, 71, 235 Jesse 30, 68n131, 69n137, 72, 73, 111n113, 112 Jewish Christianity 8, 24 Josephus 139 Judea 179, 184, 185n104 justification 15n56, 28, 158, 163, 205, 215n31, 219, 229 Justin 20n90, 96 κατὰ πνεῦμα, see Spirit, πνεῦμα κατὰ σάρκα, see flesh, σάρξ king, kingship 29-30, 39, 41, 50, 66, 103-104, 124, 150n107, 155 kingdom 17, 47, 49, 123-125, 130, 131, 133, 138, 143, 151n108 language game 63, 74 Latin 66n123, 180n89 law. see torah locative connotation 31, 38, 39, 40, 159, 178, 230n82 Lord, κύριος 2n3, 4n10, 10, 14-15, 21, 24, 32, 170n53, 190n126, 205n15, 240n114, see also in the Lord Masoretic Text 68, 88n32, 96n57, 101n78, 103, 146n94 material pneuma 32, 33n165, 34, 36, 102n81 mediatorial figures 143 messiah discourse 3-6, 42-43, 55, 58-76, 77, 86-87, 113, 114, 117-118, 119, 152, 155, 156, 189, 192, 239, 241-243 messiah language 17, 37, 42, 50, 54, 57, 64n112, 76, 242, see also messiah discourse messiah myth 16, 124 messiah of Aaron 65 messiah of Israel 65 messiah speculation 5, 13, 55, 58, 61-64, 73, 76, 87, 95, 106, 115, 116,

124, 155, 189, 241-243, see also messiah discourse messiah text 5, 6, 62, 72, 86, 128n26, 155 messianic idea 6, 9, 13n39, 41-58, 73, 124, 134n54, 242 messianic interpretation 5, 6, 38n196, 58-76, 77, 79, 85-88, 94, 95n53, 99-100, 102n79, 114, 118, 124, 125n20, 127, 135, 138, 140, 141n97, 149, 151–152, 155, 156, 193, 239, 242 - 243messianism 2-3, 5, 8, 12, 38, 41, 44, 45-58, 63n109, 69n137, 73, 79, 106 messianology 5, 6, 28, 55, 63-64, 79, 124, 149, 150n107, 154, 155, 156, 160, 190, 193, 195, 240n114, 241, 242, 244–245 metaphor 25, 34, 114, 115, 177n77, 230n82, 235 midrash 59, 94, 115, 145 Mishnah 20n88, 46, 64n114, 65 Moses 53, 210n22 mystery religions 12-13, 15 mysticism 2, 7, 10-13, 14n51, 15-19, 34, 44, 78, 79, 124, 153-154, 156, 197, 238 names 1-2, 4n11, 20n90, 21, 24, 42, 53n58, 57n79, 71n146, 75, 92, 112, 113n120, 245 nationalism 12, 42, 89n32, 106, 113n118, 244 nations, see gentiles New Perspective on Paul 28 nominative case 107n97 oaths, vows 85-86, 88n32, 103, 170n54, 220-223, 226, 230 obedience of faith 112, 211n24 obedience of the gentiles 210, 211n24 offering of the gentiles 211n24 OG Daniel 66n122, 140n71 oneness 154, 211, 231 pagans, see gentiles parallels 6, 26, 30, 31, 93n44, 129, 135n54, 167n43, 220

parousia 25n176, 136, 151n108

participation, participatory 2, 3, 4, 6, 7-8, 10, 18, 27–29, 34–36, 38–40, 79, 92, 118, 119, 124, 152, 155, 159, 164n31, 195, 231-232, 239, 243-244 Pauline theology 41n218, 159, 177, 195 Persian 100n72 personal object 2, 82, 117, 195, 205 pesher 137, 146n96, 147 Peshitta 67 Peter 8–9, 185n104 Pharisees 48 Philippian church 235n98 Philo 33, 88n32 πίστις χριστοῦ, see faith of Christ pneuma, see Spirit, πνεῦμα powers, see authorities, dominions, powers predicate 59, 124, 167, 174n65, 209, 210, 229 Pre-pauline traditions 31, 107, see also interpolation prepositions 11, 82, 99n65, 141n77, 162n26, 214 presence 14-15, 18n72, 39, 226, 232 priests, priestly service 51, 57, 210-211 promise 13, 25, 44, 73-74, 79-81, 84-86, 97n31, 88n32, 91-92, 95-97, 99-105, 108-109, 111n110, 112-117, 121, 146n96, 156, 196, 221, 222-223, 230 pronouns 5, 96, 161, 162, 171, 174n68, 182-187, 188, 213, 233n92 prophets, prophecy 45n20, 46-49, 57, 60, 139, 141n76 Psalter 101n77, 146, 169n49 pseudepigrapha 46, 55 psychology 56, 115 Qumran, see Dead Sea Scrolls rabbis, rabbinic Judaism 45n20, 59n84, 63, 64n112, 73, 74, 75, 93-95, 113 reception, reception history 125n20, 130, 136, 139n69, 233n92 religionsgeschichtliche Schule 13, 14n46, 15, 17–18, 22, 26–27 representation 19-20, 25, 39, 87, 118, 133.189

resurrection 16-17, 29, 35, 68-69, 108n100, 112n116, 113-114, 119-128, 134–155, 162n24, 169, 182, 193-194, 196, 203, 209-210, 211-212, 214-215, 219, 221, 227-228, 233-236, 240n114, 243, 245 righteousness 31, 65, 73, 100, 163, 175, 194, 200, 204, 205, 214-215, 219, 228-229 right hand of God 135n55, 138, 144, 199, 226n69, 234 Roman empire 139n69 sand of the sea 102 Second Temple period 29, 37-38, 42, 47, 59n84, 134n54 seed of Abraham, see Abraham, seed of Abraham seed of David, see David, seed of David Semitic Greek 11-12, 84 Seneca 33 servant 38, 100, 102-103, 127n26 Shiloh, שילה 69, 72, 75, 95n53 signified, signifier 57 slavery 94, 207 sleep 142, 212 Society of Biblical Literature 41n218 solidarity 25, 30, 34n172, 118, 119, 121-155, 193-198, 200, 209-240, 243, 244 Solomon 103 son of David, see David, seed of David son of God 15n54, 54, 83-84, 113n118, 114, 119, 121-122, 128-134, 148-149, 154, 223, 224n55, 230, 235, 243 son of man, "one like a son of man" 6, 14, 71, 73, 75, 113n118, 124-128, 130-131, 133-137, 139, 141-142, 144-145, 148-149, 150n107, 152, 153n117, 154–155, 156, 193, 243 Spirit, πνεῦμα 10, 12–13, 14n52, 21–23, 31-33, 35, 38, 39, 72-74, 83-84, 102n81, 105-108, 119, 122, 166-167, 193n3, 204, 217-220, 235, 244 - 245stars of heaven 88n32, 102, 140, 234n93

stative verbs 107, 116, 160, 163n28, 171n55, 173-179, 181, 183, 184n104, 188-189, 190n126, 213, 214, 229 subjective genitive 164n32, 233 substantive, substantival 107, 108, 159, 160, 161, 188, 207 suffering 153, 154, 164n31, 204-205, 214-215, 224-226, 231-232, 239, 240n114, 243 synagogue (term), συναγωγή 184n104 syntax 11-12, 68, 85, 96, 118, 156-191 Syriac 65–67 Talmud Bavli 73-75 Targumim 64n112, 67n125, 67n126, 69n135, 99–100, 103 text-criticism, see textual variants textual variants 1, 96, 97n59, 153, 170n53, 174n66, 175n72, 234n96 Theodotion Daniel 126, 140n71, 142n80, 153n117, 186, 186n108 titles 14, 15, 24, 42, 56, 57, 92, 113, 115, 126-127, 130, 135, 141n25, 145, 148, 224 topography 154

torah 17, 78, 79, 88n32, 92, 95, 99n64, 163, 166-167, 204, 214, 217-220 tradition 1n2, 6, 24, 25, 31, 55, 59-60, 62-63, 68, 93, 102, 106, 113, 115-116, 120n4, 124, 134-136, 141, 142, 231n83 translation, translation equivalencies 5, 11, 37n191, 84, 89, 92n42, 112n115, 146n96, 213n28, 234n96 tribes 80n8, 91 Tübingen School 8 undisputed Pauline letters 1, 4, 7n1, 14n51, 99n65, 151n108, 160, 162, 163, 187, 197, 235n99, 250n114, 241 union with Christ 3, 17, 28n136, 37-38, 41n218, 175n71, 192, 193n3, 194 unity 91-92, 155, 183, 221, 243 variant readings, see textual variants weakness 212-213 wisdom 31-32, 73, 200-201, 205

wordplay 75n164, 112n116, 223n54 works of torah 27, *see also* torah World War II 18, 27