

J. D. ATKINS

The Doubt of the Apostles and the Resurrection Faith of the Early Church

*Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen
zum Neuen Testament 2. Reihe*

495

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen
zum Neuen Testament · 2. Reihe

Herausgeber / Editor

Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber/Associate Editors

Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala)

Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) · Janet Spittler (Charlottesville, VA)

J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)

495



J. D. Atkins

The Doubt of the Apostles and the Resurrection Faith of the Early Church

The Post-Resurrection Appearance Stories of the
Gospels in Ancient Reception and Modern Debate

Mohr Siebeck

J. D. Atkins, born 1976; 1999 BS in Economics, University of Pennsylvania; 1999 BSE in Systems Engineering, University of Pennsylvania; 2006 MDiv, Westminster Theological Seminary; 2009 ThM in New Testament; 2017 PhD in New Testament and Early Christianity, Marquette University; part-time instructor in New Testament and Greek at Trinity Evangelical Divinity School and Nashotah House Theological Seminary.
orcid.org/0000-0001-6390-5825

ISBN 978-3-16-158165-6/eISBN 978-3-16-158166-3
DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-158166-3

ISSN 0340-9570/eISSN 2568-7484 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 2. Reihe)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available on the Internet at <http://dnb.dnb.de>.

© 2019 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany. www.mohrsiebeck.com

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was printed by Laupp & Göbel in Gomaringen on non-aging paper and bound by Buchbinderei Nädele in Nehren.

Printed in Germany.

To Alice, Isaiah, and Elijah
for your unwavering love and support

and

πᾶσιν τοῖς διστάζουσι·
εἰρήνη ὑμῖν

Acknowledgments

This monograph is a slightly revised and expanded version of the doctoral dissertation that I submitted in August 2017 to the faculty of Marquette University. Whatever benefit accrues either to the academy or to the church as a result of this study, a great deal of the credit must be reserved for the many who contributed either directly or indirectly to the finished product. Pride of place belongs to my director, Julian V. Hills, and his tireless dedication to helping me improve both my writing and my arguments. I can only hope to repay him by following his example as a teacher who serves his students. I thank Grant R. Osborne and William S. Kurz, S.J., both of whom kindly agreed to serve on my dissertation board even as they were beginning their much-deserved retirements. Professor Osborne, who served as an external reader from Trinity Evangelical Divinity School, provided me cheerful guidance for over a decade. I am also grateful to Michel R. Barnes, who, in addition to serving on my board, offered sage advice on several occasions during the early stages of my research. My thanks to Joshua Ezra Burns, who willingly stepped in at the last minute to fill a gap in my board. At one point or another, each of these scholars has been a source of encouragement to me.

I want to thank Osvaldo Padilla and Dieter T. Roth for graciously reading and commenting on individual chapters. The work is no doubt stronger because of their feedback. I am especially grateful to Dr. Padilla for encouraging me at a time when I needed it most. Similarly, I would like to express appreciation to Deirdre Dempsey and Joseph G. Mueller, S.J. Both generously made themselves available for consultation on a number of occasions when my limited knowledge of Syriac and Latin proved insufficient. I am also indebted to Basil Lourié for lending his expertise in Armenian, and to Andrei Orlov for putting me in contact with him. I must thank Dr. Orlov for cheering me on every time we crossed paths.

This study would not have been possible without the financial support of fellowships awarded by the Arthur J. Schmitt Foundation and Marquette University. I gladly express gratitude to both institutions. My gratitude also extends to my parents-in-law, Johann and Esther Lai, for their unstinting generosity and their frequent prayers, and to my father, who was always ready to lend a helping hand to make life go by a bit more smoothly.

Many thanks to Tom Boyce and Donald and Michelle Kim, dear friends of mine who gave of their time to help with proofreading and did so on very short

notice. These friends and many others have prayed for me and encouraged me while I was working on this project and during the delays when I was recovering from health issues.

I also want to mention Shannon and David Lamb. During my first year as an undergraduate at the University of Pennsylvania, Shannon instilled in me the value of carefully observing the details of the biblical text. In doing so, she opened my eyes and my heart to the beauty of the Scriptures – a sweet gift that gives new life again and again. Dave later reinforced the same lesson, making it a habit. Chapter 10 is in a sense a tribute to their early tutelage.

Finally, no one deserves more thanks than my wife, Alice. By following me around the U.S. as I pursued degrees at various institutions, she gave up the comfort of living in proximity to close friends and family and sacrificed the pace of her own career advancement. She selflessly gave me the time and space that I needed to finish the project. And she continued to support me during difficulties and delays. She did all this and so much more. I would be remiss if I did not also thank my sons, Isaiah and Elijah, for their joyful encouragements, their prayers for my health and my writing progress, and their great patience as they waited for the completion of this project.

Easter 2019

J. D. Atkins

Table of Contents

| | |
|-----------------------|-----|
| Acknowledgments | VII |
| Abbreviations | XVI |

Part I: Introduction and Context

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Chapter 1: Introduction..... | 1 |
| <i>1.1 The Antidocetic Hypothesis in Previous Scholarship.....</i> | <i>4</i> |
| 1.1.1 The Materializing-Trajectory Theory and the Antidocetic Hypothesis | 6 |
| 1.1.2 The Resilience of the Antidocetic Hypothesis | 8 |
| 1.1.3 Objections to the Antidocetic Hypothesis..... | 9 |
| 1.1.4 Unexamined Presuppositions about Antidocetic Polemic..... | 11 |
| <i>1.2 Doubt as a Motif in the Resurrection Narratives</i> | <i>12</i> |
| <i>1.3 The Doubt Motif in Previous Scholarship.....</i> | <i>13</i> |
| 1.3.1 The Traditional View: Historical but Preserved for Apologetic Purposes | 13 |
| 1.3.2 The Transformational View: Historically Derived but Modified for Apologetic Purposes | 14 |
| 1.3.3 The Skeptical View: A Late, Apologetic Invention. | 15 |
| 1.3.4 The Form-Critical View: Genre-derived but Modified for Apologetic Purposes | 15 |
| 1.3.5 A Consensus: Doubt as an Apologetic Device..... | 16 |
| 1.3.6 A Political View: Doubt as Slander | 17 |
| 1.3.7 Unexamined Presuppositions about the Doubt Motif | 18 |

| | |
|---|----|
| <i>1.4 Methodology</i> | 18 |
| 1.4.1 Reception History as a Historical-Critical Tool..... | 18 |
| 1.4.2 Reception History and Unrecognized Modern Bias..... | 20 |
| 1.4.3 Reception History and Ancient Bias..... | 22 |
| 1.4.4 Methodology for Identifying Instances of Reception..... | 25 |
| 1.4.5 The Structure of This Study..... | 30 |
| | |
| Chapter 2: Gnosticism, Docetism, and Doubt in Context..... | 33 |
| | |
| 2.1 <i>Gnosticism and Docetism</i> | 33 |
| 2.1.1 Gnosticism: Terms and Concepts | 33 |
| 2.1.2 Docetism: Terms and Concepts | 38 |
| 2.1.3 Gnostic Interpretive Methods | 48 |
| 2.1.4 Docetization as an Interpretive Method..... | 53 |
| 2.1.5 Orthodoxy and Heresy..... | 58 |
| | |
| 2.2 <i>Doubt and Unbelief in Early Christianity</i> | 60 |
| 2.2.1 The Doubt Motif in the Resurrection Narratives | 60 |
| 2.2.2 Key Terms for Doubt and Unbelief | 62 |
| 2.2.3 Faith, Doubt, and Early Christian Identity..... | 64 |
| 2.2.4 Abraham's Faith and the Apostles' Doubt..... | 66 |
| 2.2.5 The Condemnation of Doubt and Unbelief in Early Christianity..... | 69 |
| 2.2.6 The Shame of Unbelief..... | 75 |
| 2.2.7 "Unbeliever" as a Term of Abuse..... | 76 |
| 2.2.8 Doubt as an Apologetic Device?..... | 78 |
| 2.2.9 EXCURSUS: Philo's Suppression and Softening of Abraham's Doubt | 79 |

Part II:
The Reception of the Resurrection Narratives

| | |
|--|----|
| Chapter 3: Two Early Readings of Luke 24: Docetic and Antidocetic | 83 |
| | |
| 3.1 <i>Ignatius, Smyrn. 3–5</i> | 83 |
| 3.1.1 Introduction | 83 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3.1.2 Ignatius’s Sources and Antidocetic Redaction..... | 87 |
| 3.1.3 Conclusion..... | 108 |
| 3.2 The “Ophites” of Irenaeus, <i>Haer. 1.30</i> | 109 |
| 3.2.1 Introduction | 109 |
| 3.2.2 A Cumulative Case for the Ophite use of Luke | 112 |
| 3.2.3 The Ophite Response to Luke 24 and Its Implications | 124 |
| 3.2.4 Marcion and the Ophites: Luke’s Text and the Biblical Canon | 128 |
| 3.3 Conclusion | 132 |
| | |
| Chapter 4: The Great Omissions in Proto-Orthodox Apologetics: Doubts, Proofs, and the Resurrection of Jesus..... | 133 |
| 4.1 1 Clement..... | 134 |
| 4.2 The Preaching of Peter | 140 |
| 4.3 Justin Martyr | 151 |
| 4.3.1 Justin, <i>1 Apol.</i> 50.12 | 152 |
| 4.3.2 Justin, <i>Dial.</i> 106.1..... | 154 |
| 4.3.3 Justin, <i>Dial.</i> 53.5–6..... | 156 |
| 4.3.4 Justin, <i>1 Apol.</i> 19–21 | 158 |
| 4.4 Theophilus of Antioch, <i>Autol. 1.13–14</i> | 160 |
| 4.5 [Ps.-]Athenagoras of Athens, <i>On the Resurrection</i> | 164 |
| 4.6 Irenaeus | 166 |
| 4.6.1 Irenaeus, <i>Haer.</i> 5.7.1 and 5.31.2..... | 166 |
| 4.6.2 Irenaeus, <i>Epid.</i> 76..... | 169 |
| 4.7 3 Corinthians | 171 |
| 4.8 Tertullian | 176 |
| 4.8.1 Tertullian, <i>Apol.</i> 21 and 48–50 | 176 |
| 4.8.2 Tertullian, <i>Res.</i> 34..... | 178 |
| 4.9 Conclusion | 182 |

| | |
|--|---------|
| Chapter 5: Doubt and Gnosis..... | 186 |
| 5.1 <i>Doubt as Opportunity in Gnostic Dialogues</i> | 187 |
| 5.1.1 <i>The Apocryphon of John</i> | 187 |
| 5.1.2 <i>The Gospel of Mary</i> | 194 |
| 5.1.3 <i>The Letter of Peter to Philip</i> | 204 |
| 5.2 <i>Doubt as Paradigm: Valentinian Readings</i> | 210 |
| 5.2.1 <i>Treatise on the Resurrection</i> (a.k.a., <i>Epistle to Rheginos</i>)..... | 211 |
| 5.2.2 Heracleon's Commentary on John..... | 216 |
| 5.2.3 EXCURSUS: Origin, <i>Fr. Jo.</i> 106..... | 218 |
| 5.2.4 <i>The Tripartite Tractate</i> | 220 |
| 5.3 <i>Doubt and Gnostic/Proto-Orthodox Debates</i> | 226 |
| Chapter 6: Further Readings of Luke 24: Responding to Resurrection as <i>phantasia</i> | 234 |
| 6.1 <i>Marcion and Tertullian on Luke 24</i> | 235 |
| 6.1.1 Introduction | 235 |
| 6.1.2 Luke's Text before Marcion and Marcion as Editor | 235 |
| 6.1.3 Marcion's Docetism and Criticism of Jesus's Disciples | 240 |
| 6.1.4 Marcion and Tertullian on the Resurrection Narratives | 245 |
| 6.1.5 Conclusion..... | 255 |
| 6.2 [Ps.-]Justin, <i>Res.</i> 9.6–8..... | 257 |
| 6.2.1 Introduction | 257 |
| 6.2.2 The Opponents and Their Docetic Interpretation of Jesus's Resurrection | 260 |
| 6.2.3 [Ps.-]Justin's Antidocetic Redaction..... | 269 |
| 6.2.4 Conclusion..... | 283 |
| Chapter 7: The Different Glory (<i>hetera doxa</i>) of Docetism: The "Gospel" of the <i>Acts of John (AJ)</i> | 286 |
| 7.1 <i>Introduction</i> | 286 |
| 7.2 <i>Source Analysis: Dependence on the Gospels</i> | 290 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 7.2.1 Dependence on Luke | 291 |
| 7.2.2 The Author's View of the Fourth Gospel | 296 |
| 7.3 <i>Re-use of the Resurrection Narratives</i> | 300 |
| 7.3.1 <i>AJ</i> 88.9–20: Polymorphy and the Non-recognition Motif in John 21 | 301 |
| 7.3.2 <i>AJ</i> 90: The Transfiguration of Thomas's Doubt | 303 |
| 7.3.3 <i>AJ</i> 92–93: A Docetic Replacement for Luke 24:36–43(53)? | 310 |
| 7.3.4 EXCURSUS: Did 1 John 1:1 Help Inspire the Docetic Christology in <i>AJ</i> 93.1–4? | 320 |
| Chapter 8: Casting out Doubt: The Longer Ending of Mark and the <i>Epistula Apostolorum</i> | 325 |
| 8.1 <i>The Longer Ending of Mark and Its Early Reception</i> | 325 |
| 8.1.1 The Exorcism of Doubt | 325 |
| 8.1.2 Trends in the Reception of the LE among Proto-orthodox Writers | 336 |
| 8.1.3 The LE, Polymorphism and Docetic Christology | 345 |
| 8.1.4 Conclusion..... | 350 |
| 8.2 <i>The Epistula Apostolorum</i> | 351 |
| 8.2.1 Introduction | 351 |
| 8.2.2 Dialogue, Dialectic, and Doubt (<i>Ep. Apos.</i> 12–50)..... | 356 |
| 8.2.3 Rewriting the LE of Mark (<i>Ep. Apos.</i> 10.1–11.4)..... | 359 |
| 8.2.4 Rewriting the Group Appearance Narrative (<i>Ep. Apos.</i> 11.2–12.2)..... | 367 |

Part III: Rereading the Resurrection Narratives

| | |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 9: The Case Against the Antidocetic Hypothesis | 379 |
| 9.1 <i>The Abrupt Appearance</i> | 380 |
| 9.1.1 The Abrupt Appearance in the Tradition and in Antidocetic Redaction..... | 380 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 9.1.2 The Abrupt Appearance in Luke 24:36..... | 381 |
| 9.1.3 The Abrupt Appearance in John 20:19, 26 | 382 |
| 9.2 The “Flesh” | 383 |
| 9.2.1 The Emphasis on the Flesh in Antidocetic Redaction..... | 383 |
| 9.2.2 The Absence of <i>Sarx</i> in John 20 | 385 |
| 9.2.3 The Single Occurrence of <i>Sarx</i> in Luke 24:36–49 | 386 |
| 9.3 The Touch Test..... | 388 |
| 9.3.1 The Touch Test in Antidocetic Redaction | 388 |
| 9.3.2 The Touch Motif as Traditional: Preliminary Evidence..... | 389 |
| 9.3.3 The Portrayal of the Touch Test in John’s Narrative | 391 |
| 9.3.4 The Portrayal of the Touch Test in Luke’s Narrative | 394 |
| 9.4 The Doubt Motif in Luke 24:41 | 395 |
| 9.4.1 The Reception of the Doubt of the Apostles and Luke 24:41 | 395 |
| 9.4.2 The Doubt Motif in Lukan Redaction..... | 396 |
| 9.5 The Eating “Proof” | 400 |
| 9.5.1 The Eating “Proof” as Traditional Even among Docetists | 400 |
| 9.5.2 Luke vs. Antidocetic Writers on the Eating Proof | 401 |
| 9.6 Conclusion | 407 |
| | |
| Chapter 10: Towards a New Reading of Luke 24 and John 20 | 409 |
| 10.1 Rereading Luke 24:36–49..... | 409 |
| 10.1.1 The Physical Proofs in Modern Bias | 409 |
| 10.1.2 Rereading Luke 24 with the Help of Justin Martyr..... | 412 |
| 10.1.3 Physical vs. Scriptural Proofs in Acts..... | 413 |
| 10.1.4 Physical vs. Scriptural Proofs in Luke: The Doubt Motif, Again | 417 |
| 10.1.5 What about the Eating “Proof”? | 420 |
| 10.1.6 Conclusion..... | 423 |
| 10.2 Rereading John 20:24–29..... | 424 |
| 10.2.1 The Presupposition of Humanity and the Argument | |

| | |
|--|---------|
| for Divinity | 425 |
| 10.2.2 The Thomas Pericope and John's Conception of Theophany | 427 |
| 10.2.3 Theophany of the Pierced God | 429 |
| 10.2.4 Conclusion..... | 435 |
| Chapter 11: Some Final Reflections | 436 |
| 11.1 <i>The Resurrection Faith of the Early Church</i> | 436 |
| 11.2 <i>The Stigma of Doubt and the Origins of Easter Faith</i> | 438 |
| Appendix: Other Alleged Antidocetic Passages in Luke and John | 445 |
| A.1 <i>Luke</i> | 445 |
| A.1.1 Luke 1–2..... | 445 |
| A.1.2 Textual Variants in Luke 24:36–53 | 447 |
| A.2 <i>John</i> | 460 |
| A.2.1 John 1:14 | 461 |
| A.2.2 John 6:51–58 | 465 |
| A.2.3 John 20:31 | 466 |
| Bibliography | 469 |
| Index of Ancient Sources..... | 505 |
| Index of Subjects | 551 |

Abbreviations

The following abbreviations are used in addition to those found in P. H. Alexander, ed., *The SBL Handbook of Style: For Ancient Near Eastern, Biblical, and Early Christian Studies* (Peabody: Hendrickson, 1999) and in Simon Hornblower, Antony Spawforth, and Esther Eidinow, *The Oxford Classical Dictionary* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

| | |
|-------------------------------|---|
| Ach | Achmimic Coptic |
| AJ | <i>Acts of John</i> |
| Adamant. Dial. | <i>Adamantius Dialogue (De Recta in Deum Fide)</i> |
| BBC | Blackwell Bible Commentaries |
| BCNHE | Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi, Section “Études” |
| BCNHT | Bibliothèque copte de Nag Hammadi, Section “Textes” |
| BECNT | Baker Exegetical Commentary on the New Testament |
| BLC | Bardaïsan of Edessa, <i>The Book of Laws of Countries</i> |
| Boh | Bohairic Coptic |
| EBC | The Expositor’s Bible Commentary |
| Ephrem, <i>Comm. Diat.</i> | Ephrem of Syria, <i>Commentary on the Diatessaron</i> |
| Ephrem, <i>Hymn. c. haer.</i> | Ephrem of Syria, <i>Hymns against Heresies</i> |
| Ephrem, <i>PR II</i> | Ephrem of Syria, <i>Prose Refutations</i> |
| <i>Keph.</i> | <i>The Kephalaia of the Teacher</i> |
| <i>Manich. Ps. Bk. II</i> | <i>A Manichaean Psalm-Book, Part II.</i> Edited by C. R. C. Allberry. Manichäische Handschriften der Sammlung A. Chester Beatty 2. Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 1938. |
| MKAW | <i>Mededeelingen der Koninklijke Akademie van Wetenschappen, Afdeling Letterkunde</i> |
| Nemesius, <i>Nat. Hom.</i> | Nemesius of Edessa, <i>De natura hominis</i> |
| NCenBC | The New Century Bible Commentary |
| NTApoc | <i>New Testament Apocrypha.</i> 2 vols. Revised edition. Edited by Wilhelm Schneemelcher. English translation edited by Robert McL. Wilson. Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2003 |
| PFES | Publications of the Finnish Exegetical Society |
| Philastrius, <i>Div. her.</i> | Philastrius of Brescia, <i>Diversarum hereseon liber</i> |
| PNTC | The Pillar New Testament Commentary |
| SAAA | Studies on the Apocryphal Acts of the Apostles |
| Sah | Sahidic Coptic |
| SECA | Studies on Early Christian Apocrypha |
| Smyth | Smyth, Herbert Weir. <i>Greek Grammar.</i> Revised by Gordon M. Messing. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1956. |
| ZECNT | Zondervan Exegetical Commentary on the New Testament |

Part I

Introduction and Context

Chapter 1

Introduction

Modern critical study of the resurrection narratives in the canonical gospels has often been driven by the question of heresy and orthodoxy in the second century, i.e., was the “proto-orthodox” church justified in its claim that Jesus rose in the flesh, or did the various “lost Christianities” that argued for a docetic/spiritual-only notion of resurrection reflect the more original form of Easter faith?¹ This is no doubt an important question both historically and theologically, but it can be misleading. The reason is that it may be a question that the evangelists themselves were not attempting to answer.

For better or worse, the questions that we bring to the biblical text shape our interpretation of it. The interpreter who approaches the resurrection narratives with this question of orthodoxy and heresy in mind is predisposed, at least on some level, to seeing the evangelists taking one side or the other in an early church debate. And when the stories are read in light of the categories posed by the question, it is easy to notice details that appear to be directly relevant to the controversy over docetic Christology in the second century. So when Jesus invites the apostles to touch his body and eats fish (Luke 24:36–53; John

¹ I here borrow terminology from Bart D. Ehrman, *Lost Christianities: The Battle for Scripture and the Faiths We Never Knew* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2003); idem, *The Orthodox Corruption of Scripture: The Effect of Early Christological Controversies on the Text of the New Testament* (2nd ed.; New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 13–14. On the wider modern debate over orthodoxy and heresy in the early church, see Walter Bauer, *Rechtgläubigkeit und Ketzerei im ältesten Christentum* (BHT 10; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1934) (ET: *Orthodoxy and Heresy in Earliest Christianity* [trans. Paul J. Achtemeier; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1971]); Walther Völker, review of *Rechtgläubigkeit und Ketzerei im ältesten Christentum*, by Walter Bauer, *ZKG* 54 (1935): 628–31 (ET by Thomas P. Scheck in Walther Völker, “Walter Bauer’s *Rechtgläubigkeit und Ketzerei im ältesten Christentum*,” *JECS* 14 [2006]: 399–405); H. E. W. Turner, *The Pattern of Christian Truth: A Study in the Relations between Orthodoxy and Heresy in the Early Church* (London: Mowbray, 1954); Hans Dieter Betz, “Orthodoxy and Heresy in Primitive Christianity,” *Int* 19 (1965): 299–311; Thomas A. Robinson, *The Bauer Thesis Examined: The Geography of Heresy in the Early Christian Church* (Studies in the Bible and Early Christianity 11; Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen, 1988); Andreas J. Koestenberger and Michael J. Kruger, *The Heresy of Orthodoxy: How Contemporary Culture’s Fascination with Diversity Has Reshaped Our Understanding of Early Christianity* (Wheaton, Ill.: Crossway, 2010); Paul Hartog, ed., *Orthodoxy and Heresy in Early Christian Contexts: Reconsidering the Bauer Thesis* (Eugene, Ore.: Pickwick, 2015).

20:24–29), it is not surprising that a diverse set of commentators – conservative, liberal, and skeptical alike – can all come to the same conclusion: Luke and John are attempting to refute docetists who advocated a non-physical view of Jesus’s resurrection.

Indeed, interpreters can support this conclusion by appealing to second-century texts that emphasize these same details as part of their polemic against docetic Christology. The most frequently cited of these is Ignatius of Antioch’s *Letter to the Smyrnaeans*. In his refutation of some early docetists, Ignatius recounts a resurrection appearance story that closely parallels that of Luke 24. Both depict Jesus as touchable (“handle me and see [ψηλαφήσατέ με και ἴδετε],” Luke 24:39 = *Smyrn.* 3.2) and able to eat (“he ate before them [ἐνώπιον αὐτῶν ἔφαγεν],” Luke 24:43; “he ate with them [συνέφαγεν αὐτοῖς],” *Smyrn.* 3.3). Because the verbal correspondence is close and because Ignatius is relatively early (ca. 115 CE), it has seemed reasonable to many to infer that Luke is also confronting docetism.² And although the verbal agreement is not as close (“Bring your finger here and see [φέρε τὸν δάκτυλόν σου ὧδε και ἴδε]”), the same inference is often made regarding to Jesus’s invitation to Thomas in John 20:24–29.³

² E.g., Hans Grass, *Ostergeschehen und Osterberichte* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1956), 71, 89; Hans von Campenhausen, *Tradition and Life in the Church: Essays and Lectures in Church History* (trans. A. V. Littledale; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1968), 52 n. 42; C. F. Evans, *Resurrection and the New Testament* (SBT 2/12; London: SCM, 1970), 109; Gerd Lüdemann, *The Resurrection of Jesus: History, Experience, Theology* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1994), 147; Michael D. Goulder, “The Baseless Fabric of a Vision,” in *Resurrection Reconsidered* (ed. Gavin D’Costa; Oxford: Oneworld, 1996), 56–67; Stuart G. Hall, “Docetism,” in *The Oxford Companion to Christian Thought* (eds. Adrian Hastings et al.; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), 173; François Bovon, *Luke* (3 vols.; Hermeneia; trans. Christine M. Thomas; Philadelphia: Fortress, 2002–2012), 3:389; Allen Brent, *Ignatius of Antioch: A Martyr Bishop and the Origin of Episcopacy* (London: T&T Clark, 2007), 140; Richard B. Vinson, *Luke* (SHBC 21; Macon, Ga: Smyth & Helwys, 2008), 753; Lidija Novakovic, “Jesus’ Resurrection and Historiography,” in *Jesus Research: New Methodologies and Perceptions* (eds. James H. Charlesworth and Brian Rhea; Princeton-Prague Symposium on Jesus Research 2; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2014), 926–27.

³ E.g., Grass, *Ostergeschehen und Osterberichte*, 71, 89; Georg Richter, *Studien zum Johannesevangelium* (BU 13; Regensburg: Pustet, 1977), 180–84; Walter Schmithals, *Johannesevangelium und Johannesbriefe: Forschungsgeschichte und Analyse* (BZNW 64; Berlin: de Gruyter, 1992), 412–13; Gregory J. Riley, *Resurrection Reconsidered: Thomas and John in Controversy* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1995), 92–99; Hall, “Docetism,” 173; Wolfram Uebele, “Viele Verführer sind in die Welt ausgegangen”: *Die Gegner in den Briefen des Ignatius von Antiochien und in den Johannesbriefen* (BWANT 151; Stuttgart: Kohlhammer, 2001), 113–16; Mark A. Matson, *John* (Interpretation Bible Studies; Louisville: Westminster John Knox, 2002), 120; Dale C. Allison, Jr., *Resurrecting Jesus: The Earliest Christian Tradition and Its Interpreters* (New York: T&T Clark, 2005), 246–47; Brent, *Martyr Bishop*, 140–42; Novakovic, “Resurrection,” 926–27.

But what if these modern readings of Luke's and John's resurrection narratives have mistaken correlation for causation? As Samuel Sandmel observed in his famous 1961 presidential address to the Society of Biblical Literature on the (mis)use of parallels in the study of the NT, "Two passages may sound the same in splendid isolation from their context, but when seen in context reflect difference rather than similarity."⁴ What if Luke's and John's Gospels are not responding to the docetic/antidocetic debate but are themselves the subject matter of the debate? What if it is not that Luke and John are reacting to the rise of docetism, but that docetism is in part a reaction to Luke's and John's depictions of the risen Jesus?

Luke and John, like Matthew and Mark, reveal very little about the circumstances in which their gospels were written, and the information that can be gleaned from other first-century sources is limited as well. It is therefore quite understandable that scholars turn to the more abundant second-century materials for clues about what kind of issues the evangelists might be addressing. In fact, one could argue that by including a commissioning of the apostles in their accounts of Jesus's post-resurrection appearances the evangelists point us forward to a future generation of believers and so in some sense encourage us to consider the after-story.⁵ On the other hand, because the evangelists reveal so little about their own historical situations, it is difficult to determine how much of the after-story as it is known to us from second-century sources was also known to the evangelists and to what extent, if any, they reshaped their sources in light of this after-story. In other words, how are we to evaluate the theory that the evangelists were aware of and responding to an early form of docetism?

This study attempts to shed light on the relationship between Luke's and John's resurrection narratives and early church debates over docetic Christology by examining the *reception* of the canonical appearance stories in the second and early third centuries. I have sought to determine whether or not these earlier readings are in fact compatible with the modern antidocetic hypothesis. As will emerge, it is my contention that a close comparison of the canonical accounts with those of second and early-third century writers will reveal (i) that Luke's and John's treatments of the group appearance tradition differ fundamentally from antidocetic polemic; (ii) that Luke 24 and John 20 were written independently of controversies over docetic Christology; (iii) that the docetic/antidocetic debate in the early church, at least as it pertains to Jesus's resurrection, was primarily an exegetical battle over how the canonical

⁴ Samuel Sandmel, "Parallelomania," *JBL* 81 (1962): 2. While Sandmel was addressing the misuse of parallels from the Dead Sea Scrolls and from rabbinic literature in the interpretation of the Gospels, his warning applies equally to second-century parallels to the resurrection narratives.

⁵ In John, Jesus even pronounces a blessing on "those who have not seen, and yet have believed" (20:29).

appearance stories are to be interpreted; and (iv) that the weight of the apologetic argument in both Luke 24:36–53 and John 20:24–29 rests not on physical proofs of the resurrection but on the fulfillment of OT prophecy.

In addition to the themes of touching, eating, and prophecy, I examine two other features in the canonical stories from a reception-critical perspective: the narration of Jesus's appearance, e.g., "he stood in their midst" (Luke 24:36; John 20:25), and the motif of the doubt of the apostles (Luke 24:38, 41; John 20:25, 27). Because the latter also appears in Matt 28:17, I have included Matthew's group appearance narrative in my reception-critical analysis. Modern interpreters of Luke and John often understand the doubt as serving to enhance the apologetic value of the physical demonstrations by showing that the eyewitnesses were not easily convinced. I argue that this apologetic reading is incompatible with both the early reception of the narratives and the way ancient Christians understood doubt.

1.1 The Antidocetic Hypothesis in Previous Scholarship

Some have attempted full-scale defenses of the antidocetic hypothesis, e.g., C. H. Talbert, *Luke and the Gnostics*, and Udo Schnelle, *Antidocetic Christology in the Gospel of John*.⁶ But more often interpreters seem to judge the parallel in Ignatius, *Smyrn.* 3 sufficient to demonstrate that the evangelists are refuting docetists.⁷ Gerd Lüdemann, for instance, offers the following assessment of Luke 24:39: "Given such realism, one can hardly avoid seeing here an opposition to Docetism. Evidently in this verse Luke is combating challenges to the bodily reality of the resurrection of Jesus as Ignatius, *To the Smyrnaeans* 3.2,

⁶ Charles H. Talbert, *Luke and the Gnostics* (Nashville: Abingdon, 1966); idem, "Antignostic Tendency in Lucan Christology," *NTS* 14 (1968): 259–71; Udo Schnelle, *Antidocetic Christology in the Gospel of John: An Investigation of the Place of the Fourth Gospel in the Johannine School* (trans. Linda M. Maloney; Minneapolis: Fortress, 1992). While most have not been convinced of Talbert's claim that all of Luke-Acts is antignostic, his argument for an antidocetic interpretation of Luke 24:36–43 has been well received (see, e.g., W. Ward Gasque, *A History of the Interpretation of the Acts of the Apostles* [Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1989], 302; Barbara Shellard, *New Light on Luke: Its Purpose, Sources, and Literary Context* [JSNTSup 215; London: Sheffield Academic, 2002], 283–85).

⁷ E.g., Campenhausen, *Tradition*, 52 n. 42; Evans, *Resurrection*, 109; C. K. Barrett, *The Gospel according to St. John* (2nd ed.; Philadelphia: Westminster, 1978), 63–64, 569, 572; Schmithals, *Johannesevangelium*, 412–13; Goulder, "Baseless Fabric," 56–67; Hall, "Docetism," 173; Matson, *John*, 120; Josep Rius-Camps and Jenny Read-Heimerdinger, *The Message of Acts in Codex Bezae: A Comparison with the Alexandrian Tradition* (4 vols.; LNTS 415; London: T&T Clark International, 2004–2009), 2:274 n. 211; Brent, *Martyr Bishop*, 140; Vinson, *Luke*, 753; Novakovic, "Resurrection," 926–27.

does at the beginning of the second century.”⁸ Georg Richter makes a similar argument as part of his contention that John 20:24–29 was inserted by an antidocetic redactor.⁹

Today the antidocetic hypothesis has established itself as a mainstream view in reference works and textbooks.¹⁰ It has proven so attractive that it is most often treated not as a hypothesis but as a historical given: the mere fact that the evangelists refer to the risen Jesus in physical terms is considered sufficient evidence of antidocetic intent.¹¹

⁸ Lüdemann, *Resurrection of Jesus*, 147; similarly idem, *The Resurrection of Christ: A Historical Inquiry* (2nd ed.; Amherst, NY: Prometheus, 2004), 109.

⁹ Richter, *Studien*, 180–84.

¹⁰ E.g., E. Earle Ellis, “Luke, Gospel according to,” *ISBE* 4: 183; Hall, “Docetism,” 173; Robert H. Gundry, *A Survey of the New Testament* (4th ed.; Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2003), 291; Craig L. Blomberg, *Jesus and the Gospels: An Introduction and Survey* (2nd ed.; Nashville: B&H Academic, 2009), 416; Charles B. Puskas and C. Michael Robbins, *An Introduction to the New Testament* (2nd ed.; Eugene, Oreg.: Cascade, 2011), 241–42; Donald A. Hagner, *The New Testament: A Historical and Theological Introduction* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2012), 244.

¹¹ E.g., Paul Schubert, “The Structure and Significance of Luke 24,” in *Neutestamentliche Studien für Rudolf Bultmann zu seinem siebenzigsten Geburtstag am 20. August 1954* (ed. Walther Eltester; BZNW 21; Berlin: Töpelmann, 1957), 172; J. G. Davies, “The Origins of Docetism,” *StPatr* 6 (1962): 18 n. 1; Walter Grundmann, *Das Evangelium nach Lukas* (THKNT 3; Berlin: Evangelische Verlagsanstalt, 1964), 449; Evans, *Resurrection*, 117; Marvin W. Meyer, *The Letter of Peter to Philip: Text, Translation, and Commentary* (SBLDS 53; Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1981), 110–11; R. Joseph Hoffmann, *Marcion, On the Restitution of Christianity: An Essay on the Development of Radical Paulinist Theology in the Second Century* (AARAS 46; Chico, Calif.: Scholars Press, 1982), 119; Jerome Kodell, *The Gospel according to Luke* (Collegeville Bible Commentary 3; Collegeville, Minn.: Liturgical Press, 1982), 117; Robert L. Maddox, *The Purpose of Luke-Acts* (SNTW; Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1982), 21–22; Grant R. Osborne, *The Resurrection Narratives: A Redactional Study* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1984), 172; Frederick W. Danker, *Jesus and the New Age: A Commentary on St. Luke’s Gospel* (2nd ed.; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1988), 396; Francis Watson, *Text, Church, and World: Biblical Interpretation in Theological Perspective* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1994), 292; Gerd Theissen and Annette Merz, *The Historical Jesus: A Comprehensive Guide* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1998), 494; A. J. M. Wedderburn, *Beyond Resurrection* (London: SCM, 1999), 125, 277 n. 289; Mark A. Matson, *In Dialogue with Another Gospel? The Influence of the Fourth Gospel on the Passion Narrative of the Gospel of Luke* (SBLDS 178; Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2001), 212–13; Robert J. Karris, “Invitation to Luke,” in *Invitation to the Gospels* (New York: Paulist, 2002), 321; Shellard, *New Light*, 285; Richard B. Hays, “Reading Scripture in Light of the Resurrection,” in *The Art of Reading Scripture* (eds. Ellen F. Davis and Richard B. Hays; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003), 231 n. 37; Paul Foster, “Polymorphic Christology: Its Origins and Development in Early Christianity,” *JTS* NS 58 (2007): 72; Heikki Räisänen, *The Rise of Christian Beliefs: The Thought World of Early Christians* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2010), 125–26; Paul R. Hinlicky, *Divine Complexity: The Rise of Creedal Christianity* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2011), 41; Yoseop Ra, *The Origin and Formation of the Gospel* (Eugene, Oreg.: Wipf & Stock, 2015), 92–93; Mark T. Finney, *Resurrection, Hell, and the Afterlife: Body and Soul*

1.1.1 The Materializing-Trajectory Theory and the Antidocetic Hypothesis

One reason that a physical conception of resurrection is so readily equated with antidocetic polemic is that the antidocetic hypothesis is often bound up with a larger theory about the development of resurrection appearance traditions in the early church. According to this theory, the original appearance traditions consisted of visions of a luminous, non-physical Jesus, and over time the stories were modified to be more concrete and physical. The historical-critical reconstruction runs as follows: (i) the earliest evidence comes from Paul, who speaks in 1 Cor 15 of a “spiritual body,” and from Acts, in which Paul is said to have had a vision of a luminous Jesus from heaven; (ii) since Paul in 1 Cor 15:5–8 seems to put his experience of the risen Jesus on a par with those of Peter and the Twelve, the latter appearances must have also been heavenly visions of a luminous Christ; (iii) the resurrection accounts in the Gospels, which include an empty tomb and a palpable Jesus who does not appear from heaven, must therefore be later apologetic fabrications; and (iv) these changes were motivated by an antidocetic *Tendenz* similar to that which drove Ignatius’s retelling of the post-resurrection appearance story in *Smyrn.* 3.

First popularized by Hans Grass and introduced to the English-speaking world by Reginald H. Fuller, with various modifications this materializing-trajectory theory has gained numerous adherents.¹² One of the most influential

in Antiquity, Judaism, and Early Christianity (BibleWorld; New York: Routledge, 2016), 129, 132.

¹² Grass, *Ostergeschehen und Osterberichte*. Reginald H. Fuller, “Ostergeschehen und Osterberichte,” *ATHR* 45 (1963): 95–98; idem, *The Formation of the Resurrection Narratives* (New York: Macmillan, 1971). Within a few years of the publication of Fuller’s version of Grass’s reconstruction, John E. Alsup could write of Grass’s study: “No other work has been so widely used or of such singular importance for the interpretation of the gospel accounts – and that includes the pastor’s study” (*Post-Resurrection Appearance Stories of the Gospel Tradition: A History-of-Tradition Analysis* [Calwer theologische Monographien 5; Stuttgart: Calwer, 1975], 32). Grass’s version of the theory, though it proved to be the most influential, was by no means the first. Similar proposals appear at least a century before Grass, e.g., Christian Herman Weisse, *Die Evangelienfrage in ihrem gegenwärtigen Stadium* (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1856), 272–92; Daniel Schenkel, *A Sketch of the Character of Jesus: A Biblical Essay* (trans. Hendrikus Martinus Klaassen; London: Longmans, Greek, and Co., 1869), 319; Kirsopp Lake, *The Historical Evidence for the Resurrection of Jesus Christ* (Crown Theological Library 21; London: Williams & Norgate, 1907), 219–26.

While the full impact cannot be assessed here, it is telling that the materializing-trajectory theory quickly made significant inroads into systematic theology. On the basis of the materializing-trajectory theory, theologians from a variety of traditions found it necessary to exclude Luke’s and John’s accounts of the risen Jesus as unreliable sources for Christology, e.g., Wolfhart Pannenberg, *Jesus: God and Man* (2nd ed.; Philadelphia: Westminster, 1977), 89–93; Karl Rahner, *Foundations of Christian Faith: An Introduction to the Idea of Christianity* (trans. William V. Dych; New York: Seabury, 1978), 276; idem, *Man in the Church* (vol. 2 of *Theological Investigations*; trans. Karl-H. Kruger; Baltimore: Helicon, 1963), 214;

among them is James M. Robinson. In his 1981 presidential address to the Society of Biblical Literature, Robinson updated Grass's reconstruction by incorporating texts from Nag Hammadi and by introducing a new modification.¹³ Like Grass, he argues that the original resurrection appearances were of a luminous figure from heaven, but Robinson proposes that Paul's term "spiritual body" sparked two competing streams of tradition. A "materializing" trajectory, which is reflected in the Gospels, developed in reaction against an early gnostic stream that preserved the original luminous appearances from heaven, but made them even less "bodily." According to Robinson, the evangelists retain "vestiges" of an earlier luminous appearance tradition, e.g., Jesus's "sudden appearances and disappearances," but have for apologetic reasons emphasized a physical resurrection.

Since Robinson's address, variations of the materializing-trajectory theory have appeared frequently in the secondary literature.¹⁴ One or another form of the theory has been endorsed by, e.g., Lüdemann, Michael Goulder, A. J. M. Wedderburn, G. W. E. Nickelsburg, Heikki Räisänen, Markus Vinzent, and Lidija Novakovic.¹⁵ And recently Bart D. Ehrman has produced an accessible version of the theory written for popular audiences.¹⁶

Specialized studies applying the materializing-trajectory model to individual gospels have also appeared. Taking up a similar but more narrow line of argumentation than that of Robinson, Gregory J. Riley proposed that the Thomas pericope in John 20:24–29 was written to refute the view of an early Thomasine community that denied a bodily resurrection and composed the *Gospel of Thomas*, the *Acts of Thomas*, etc.¹⁷ Similarly, Crispin H. T. Fletcher-

Peter Carnley, *The Structure of Resurrection Belief* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1987), 67–68, 234–249.

¹³ James M. Robinson, "Jesus from Easter to Valentinus (or to the Apostles' Creed)," *JBL* 101 (1982): 5–37.

¹⁴ Robinson's essay has proven so significant that the Jesus Seminar judged it worthwhile to vote on aspects of it in the same way they voted on the biblical texts themselves (The Jesus Seminar, "Voting Records: The Resurrection Appearances," *Forum* 10 [1994]: 256–57).

¹⁵ Lüdemann, *Resurrection of Jesus*; idem, *Resurrection of Christ*; Goulder, "Baseless Fabric," 55–58; Wedderburn, *Beyond Resurrection*, 125, 277 n. 289; George W. E. Nickelsburg, *Resurrection, Immortality, and Eternal Life in Intertestamental Judaism and Early Christianity* (HTS 56; exp. ed.; Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2006), 246–47; Räisänen, *Christian Beliefs*, 125–33; Markus Vinzent, *Christ's Resurrection in Early Christianity and the Making of the New Testament* (Burlington, Vt.: Ashgate, 2011), 77–191; Novakovic, "Resurrection," 926–27.

¹⁶ Bart D. Ehrman, *How Jesus Became God: The Exaltation of a Jewish Preacher from Galilee* (New York: HarperOne, 2014), 181–83, 207.

¹⁷ Riley, *Resurrection Reconsidered*, 69–175; similarly Kevin Madigan and Jon Douglas Levenson, *Resurrection: The Power of God for Christians and Jews* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2008), 221–22. See also the critique of Riley's reconstruction in Ismo

Louis and David Catchpole have argued that Luke, in an attempt to correct early resurrection appearance traditions that envisioned the risen Jesus as an incorporeal angel, depicts Jesus as inviting touch and eating fish.¹⁸

1.1.2 *The Resilience of the Antidocetic Hypothesis*

The antidocetic hypothesis has proven so attractive that it is retained even by those who strongly criticize the materializing-trajectory models of Grass, Robinson, and others. An early voice of dissent was registered in the tradition- and redaction-critical study of John E. Alsup.¹⁹ Alsup challenges Grass's notion of a development from luminous appearances to the "anthropomorphic" appearances found in the Gospels by demonstrating that the latter are independent of luminous appearance stories found elsewhere. Yet despite this potentially devastating critique, Alsup never questions the theory that Luke's "chief redactional goal" in the group appearance narrative is to counter docetism. Alsup's study – because it is so critical of Grass's model – is an early and striking illustration of the fact that the antidocetic label, once attached on Luke (and/or John), has exhibited extraordinary sticking power in the history of interpretation.²⁰

Much the same could be said of Gerald O'Collins's response to Robinson. O'Collins offers a scathing critique of Robinson's proposal of competing trajectories by arguing that Robinson forces the various texts to fit his theory. But when it comes to Robinson's antidocetic reading of Luke 24 and John 20, O'Collins concedes,

Dunderberg, "John and Thomas in Conflict," in *The Nag Hammadi Library after Fifty Years: Proceedings of the 1995 Society of Biblical Literature Commemoration* (eds. John D. Turner and Anne McGuire; NHMS 44; Leiden: Brill, 1997).

¹⁸ Crispin H. T. Fletcher-Louis, *Luke-Acts: Angels, Christology and Soteriology* (WUNT 2/294; Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1997), 62–71; David R. Catchpole, *Resurrection People: Studies in the Resurrection Narratives of the Gospels* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 2000), 88–98; similarly Nickelsburg, *Resurrection*, 246–47.

¹⁹ Alsup, *Appearance Stories*, 33–54, 266–74.

²⁰ Alsup, *Appearance Stories*, 172. It is unclear exactly why Alsup does not call for the abandonment of this part of Grass's reconstruction as well, especially since Alsup's analysis leaves little if any new "antidocetic" material to assign to Lukan redaction. Indeed, on the basis of his own results the only way that Alsup can attribute "antidocetic" editorial activity to Luke is by positing the "tentative" (Alsup's term) theory that in 24:36–43 Luke has combined two distinct sources, each of which already depicts Jesus in physical terms (*Appearance Stories*, 171–72). Lukan redaction in this case is minimal; it consists in little more than combining and reiterating what Luke found in his sources. Possibly, like many before and after him, Alsup has accepted second-century parallels, e.g., Ignatius, *Smyrn.* 3.2 and *Ep. Apos.* 11–12, as sufficient proof of Luke's antidocetic motivations. Alsup, in a footnote, cites these texts as parallels to Luke and John (*Appearance Stories*, 174 n. 504).

In their realistic and bodily presentation of the risen Christ's appearance, Luke and John clearly want to guard against errors. Robinson rightly observes their "apologetic" against "spiritualizing the resurrection away" (*Jesus*, 12). At the same time, these two evangelists also qualify their presentation by including details which indicate the transformed existence of the risen Lord. Closed doors do not prevent his coming (John 20:19, 26); he suddenly appears and disappears (Luke 24:31–36).²¹

O'Collins makes this concession even while admitting that an antidocetic interpretation stands in tension with the observation that Jesus "suddenly appears and disappears" in the gospel accounts.²²

Further proof of the resilience of the antidocetic hypothesis can be found in conservative evangelical readings of Luke 24 and John 20. Evangelical scholars, as might be expected, reject the theory of a materializing-trajectory because it implies that the physical demonstrations in Luke 24 and John 20 are unhistorical embellishments. Some are nevertheless willing to accept a chastened version of the antidocetic hypothesis. In reference to the Lukan Jesus inviting the apostles to touch him, I. Howard Marshall argues that this detail "may have been *remembered* in the fight against docetism, *but that does not mean that it was invented for this purpose.*"²³ Similarly, Andreas Koestenberger, commenting on John 20, suggests: "From the evangelist's perspective, Thomas's objection *becomes a welcome foil* for forestalling the incipient gnostic notion that Jesus only appeared to be human (the heresy later termed 'Docetism')." ²⁴

1.1.3 Objections to the Antidocetic Hypothesis

Despite the popularity of the antidocetic hypothesis, it has not been without detractors. Brief but significant objections to an antidocetic reading of Luke 24:36–43 and/or John 20:24–29 have been voiced by a variety of scholars.

²¹ Gerald O'Collins, *Jesus Risen: A Historical, Fundamental and Systematic Examination of Christ's Resurrection* (New York: Paulist, 1987), 228 n. 9, citing Robinson, "Easter to Valentinus," 12.

²² Oddly, O'Collins agrees that Luke is "'antidocetic' in a broad sense" but then argues for a docetic interpretation of Jesus's meal: the risen Jesus didn't really eat ("Did Jesus Eat the Fish [Luke 24:42–43]?" *Greg* 69 [1988]: 69–70).

²³ I. Howard Marshall, "The Resurrection of Jesus in Luke," *TynBul* 24 (1973): 92, emphasis added; similarly Osborne, *Resurrection Narratives*, 247–48. Craig Blomberg suggests that Luke 24 emphasizes the reality of the bodily resurrection, "perhaps against incipient docetic trends in Luke's day" (*Jesus and the Gospels*, 416).

²⁴ Andreas J. Koestenberger, *John* (BECNT 4; Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2004), 579, emphasis added. Robert H. Gundry, though he argues against the "fabrication" of the group appearance narrative in Luke 24:36–53, affirms in essence Riley's proposal about the Thomas pericope: "John even uses Thomas, a Gnostic hero (compare the Gnostically tinged so-called *Gospel of Thomas*), against the Gnostics. Though at first skeptical of Jesus as the physically risen Lord and God, Thomas comes around to this orthodox belief" (*Survey*, 250, 291).

Some have noted the presence of features that seem to be in conflict with anti-docetic interests. As Ernst Käsemann, alluding to John 20, famously asked, “In what sense is he flesh, who walks ... through closed doors?”²⁵ Along similar lines, Michael R. Licona has recently raised the following objection: “If Luke and John were inventing stories to combat the Docetic idea of a Jesus who existed in a ‘spiritual,’ that is, an immaterial sense, why portray Jesus as appearing, disappearing and materializing through walls at will (Lk 24:31, 36; Jn 20:19, 26)?”²⁶

Others have drawn attention to the absence of features that they would expect from an antidocetic argument. Rudolf Schnackenburg observes that the Thomas pericope does not state “whether Thomas really placed his finger in Jesus’s wounds.” This suggests to Schnackenburg that the Thomas pericope is not an antidocetic insertion, as Richter has suggested.²⁷ Richard Dillon likewise argues that the absence in Luke’s account of a confirmation that the physical demonstrations actually convinced the disciples implies a lack of antidocetic interest on Luke’s part.²⁸

Probably the most comprehensive counter-response to the materializing-trend theory, and with it the antidocetic hypothesis, is N. T. Wright’s monograph, *The Resurrection of the Son of God*.²⁹ In explicit polemic against Robinson and Riley, Wright contends that the resurrection narratives in the Gospels preserve early traditions “with only light editing.”³⁰ Wright argues that the term “resurrection” in first-century Palestine was never understood to involve the raising of disembodied spirits or souls, and that – with the exception of cases when it was metaphorically applied to the restoration of Israel – it always denoted a literal restoration of human bodies. He concludes that the notion that Jesus rose bodily could not have been a later development. Wright calls for the abandonment of the materializing-trajectory theory:

The idea that traditions developed in the church from a more hellenistic early period (in this case, a more “non-bodily” view of post-mortem existence) to a more Jewish later period (in

²⁵ Ernst Käsemann, *The Testament of Jesus: A Study of the Gospel of John in the Light of Chapter 17* (trans. Gerhard Krodel; Philadelphia: Fortress, 1968), 9.

²⁶ Michael R. Licona, *The Resurrection of Jesus: A New Historiographical Approach* (Downers Grove: IVP Academic, 2010), 513.

²⁷ Rudolf Schnackenburg, *The Gospel according to St. John* (3 vols.; trans. Cecily Hastings; New York: Seabury, 1980), 3:329.

²⁸ Richard J. Dillon, *From Eye-Witnesses to Ministers of the Word: Tradition and Composition in Luke 24* (AnBib 82; Rome: Pontifical Biblical Institute, 1978), 163–67.

²⁹ N. T. Wright, *The Resurrection of the Son of God* (Christian Origins and the Question of God 3; Minneapolis: Fortress, 2003). A number of Wright’s arguments are anticipated in brief in the earlier but lesser-known study of William Lane Craig (*Assessing the New Testament Evidence for the Historicity of the Resurrection of Jesus* [Studies in the Bible and Early Christianity 16; Lewiston, N.Y.: Edwin Mellen, 1989], 337).

³⁰ Wright, *Resurrection*, 611.

Index of Ancient Sources

Old Testament

Genesis

| | |
|--------------|--|
| 1:2 LXX | 194 |
| 3:21 | 262n109, 306n94 |
| 6:1–4 | 97n40 |
| 6:4 | 265n118 |
| 15:16 | 79 |
| 17:17–18 LXX | 79 |
| 18 | 105n69, 240, 265– 268, 400, 402n88, 405n93 |
| 18:2 LXX | 276, 381n7 |
| 18:5 | 276n150 |
| 18:8 | 55 |
| 19 | 140 |
| 19:3 | 405n93 |
| 19:26 | 140n19 |
| 27:12 LXX | 311n115 |
| 27:21 LXX | 311n115 |
| 27:22 LXX | 311n115 |
| 28 | 265n118 |
| 32 | 265n118 |

Exodus

| | |
|-----------|---------------------------|
| 2:15 | 56n96 |
| 3–4 | 79n183 |
| 3 | 265n118 |
| 4:9 | 430n84 |
| 10:21 LXX | 311n115 |
| 12:46 | 433n98, 434n100 |
| 16:13–14 | 269n134 |
| 18:4 | 56n96 |
| 33:2 | 306n93 |
| 33:13 LXX | 345n72 |
| 33:17 | 305n93 |
| 33:18 | 299n67, 427, 428 |
| 33:18 LXX | 305n93, 345n72, 428n73 |

| | |
|-----------|--------|
| 33:20 | 427 |
| 33:21 LXX | 305n93 |
| 33:23 LXX | 305 |
| 34:1 LXX | 305n93 |
| 40:32 | 427 |
| 40:34 | 427 |

Numbers

| | |
|-----------|-----------------|
| 9:12 | 433n98, 434n100 |
| 11:9 | 269n134 |
| 12:7 LXX | 138 |
| 20:11 | 430 |
| 22:23 LXX | 276n148 |
| 22:31–34 | 422n52 |
| 22:31 LXX | 276n148 |
| 23:3–4 | 345n72 |

Deuteronomy

| | |
|-----------|---------|
| 6:13 | 457n43 |
| 6:16 | 306n96 |
| 10:16 LXX | 328n9 |
| 16:26 LXX | 311n115 |
| 22:17 LXX | 144n32 |
| 28:29 LXX | 311n115 |

Judges

| | |
|----------|---------|
| 6 | 265n118 |
| 6:23 | 449n11 |
| 8:25 LXX | 144n32 |
| 13 | 265n118 |
| 13:15 | 276n150 |

1 Kings

| | |
|----------|--------|
| 20:9 LXX | 145n34 |
|----------|--------|

2 Kings

| | |
|------|--------|
| 6:17 | 422n52 |
|------|--------|

| | | | |
|---------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------|
| 13:21 | 174–175 | 28:16 LXX | 75 |
| 19:14 LXX | 144n32 | 35:5–6 | 342n65 |
| <i>1 Chronicles</i> | | 52:5 LXX | 263n111 |
| 21:15–16 LXX | 276n148, 381n7 | 53:6 | 153n62 |
| | | 53:8 | 319n140 |
| <i>Job</i> | | 59:10 LXX | 311n115 |
| 5:14 LXX | 311n115 | 60:17 LXX | 138 |
| 12:25 LXX | 311n115 | <i>Jeremiah</i> | |
| | | 4:4 LXX | 328n9 |
| <i>Psalms</i> | | <i>Ezekiel</i> | |
| 2:1–2 | 121n122 | 41:16 LXX | 144n32 |
| 8:5–7 LXX | 269 | 41:21 LXX | 144n32 |
| 21:23–24 LXX | 155n67 | 43:6 LXX | 276n148 |
| 21:23 LXX | 155 | <i>Daniel</i> | |
| 34:19 | 90n18 | 8:15 LXX | 276n148, 381n7 |
| 34:20 | 433n98, 434n100 | 10:19 | 449n11 |
| 35:19 | 434n100 | 12:2 | 76 |
| 54:17 | 360n131 | 12:15 LXX | 276n148, 381n7 |
| 69:4 | 434n100 | <i>Joel</i> | |
| 78:25 | 269n134 | 3:1 | 98n47 |
| 110:1 | 364n149 | <i>Amos</i> | |
| 113:15 LXX | 311n115 | 4:11 | 74n162 |
| 118:2 | 415 | <i>Habakkuk</i> | |
| 134:17 LXX | 311n115 | 1:5 | 74n164 |
| <i>Proverbs</i> | | <i>Zechariah</i> | |
| 12:17 | 360n131 | 1:8–11 LXX | 276n148 |
| 17:6 | 63n124 | 2:3 | 74n162 |
| <i>Isaiah</i> | | 12:10 | 182n152, 433–434 |
| 6:9–11 LXX | 335n41 | 12:10 LXX | 433–434 |
| 6:9–10 | 74 | 13:7 | 156, 170 |
| 6:10 | 434n100 | | |
| 17:10 | 63n124 | | |
| 22:13 | 164n97 | | |
| 24:21 LXX | 150n48 | | |
| 26:19 | 342n65 | | |

Old Testament Apocrypha and Pseudepigrapha

| | | | |
|--------------------------------------|---------|-----------------------------------|--------|
| <i>Apocalypse of Adam</i> | 352n104 | <i>Apocalypse of Ezra</i> (Greek) | |
| 1.4 | 265n118 | 7.12 | 71n155 |
| <i>Apocalypse of Elijah</i> (Coptic) | | <i>Apocalypse of Moses</i> | |
| 5.32 | 46n50 | 32.4 | 453n31 |

| | | | |
|--|---------|---------------------------------|---------------|
| <i>Ascension of Isaiah</i> | | 3:33 | 345n72 |
| | 40n24 | 5:2 | 345n72 |
| 7.4–5 | 456n40 | 8:13 | 70n145 |
| 9.30 | 456n40 | 10:29 | 345n72 |
| | | 15:9 | 90n18 |
| <i>2 Baruch</i> | | <i>4 Maccabees</i> | |
| 50.1–51.13 | 456n40 | 7:19 | 406n99 |
| <i>1 Enoch</i> | | 18:9–19 | 406n99 |
| 19.1 | 315n122 | 18:10 | 90n18, 406n99 |
| 39.14 | 456n40 | 18:11–19 | 90n18 |
| 71.11 | 456n40 | | |
| 99.7 | 265n118 | <i>Sibylline Oracles</i> | |
| <i>2 Enoch</i> | | 2.260–262 | 70n145 |
| 22.8–10 | 456n40 | 3.746 | 269n135 |
| 37.1–2 | 456n40 | 4.39–43 | 70n145 |
| 56.2 | 456n40 | 5.281–283 | 269n135 |
| <i>3 Enoch</i> | | 8.1 | 150n48 |
| 15.1 | 456n40 | 8.182–187 | 70n145 |
| 53.2–7 | 456n40 | 8.287 | 70n145 |
| <i>4 Ezra</i> | | <i>Sirach</i> | |
| 14.22 | 90n18 | 3:23 | 306n95 |
| 15.4 | 71 | 5 | 90n18 |
| <i>The Heartless Rich Man and the Precious Stone</i> | 139n17 | 8.5 | 333n31 |
| <i>Jannes and Jambres</i> [A] | | 16:10 | 328n9 |
| 5.46–47 | 453n31 | 20 | 90n18 |
| <i>Joseph and Aseneth</i> | | <i>Testament of Abraham</i> [A] | |
| 14–16 | 269 | 4.9 | 265n120, 404 |
| 15.14 | 276n150 | 14.7–8 | 453n31 |
| 16.8 | 269n134 | 15.4 | 390n34 |
| <i>Letter of Aristeas</i> | | <i>Testament of Abraham</i> [B] | |
| 53 | 139n17 | 10.11 | 143n32 |
| <i>Lives of the Prophets</i> | | 13.6 | 276n150 |
| 23.2 | 265n118 | <i>Testament of Benjamin</i> | |
| <i>1 Maccabees</i> | | 10.8–9 | 75–76 |
| 15:15 | 145n34 | <i>Testament of Isaac</i> | |
| <i>2 Maccabees</i> | | 1.6–7 | 72n157 |
| 3:26 | 345n72 | 2.2 | 449n11 |
| | | <i>Testament of Reuben</i> | |
| | | 3.7 | 265n118 |
| | | 5.6–7 | 265n118 |

| | | | |
|---------------------------------|---|--------------------------|----------------|
| <i>Testament of Solomon</i> [A] | | 13:14 [G ¹] | 345n74 |
| 3.7 | 265n118 | | |
| 6.5 | 453n31 | | |
| 16.4 | 97n39, 315n122 | | |
| <i>Tobit</i> | | | |
| 5:4 [G ¹] | 276n148, 381n7 | | |
| 6:5 [G ¹] | 268, 404, 421n45 | | |
| 12:17 | 449n11 | | |
| 12:19 [G ¹] | 55, 265n120, 268, 403, 404–405, 421n45 | | |
| | | <i>Wisdom of Solomon</i> | |
| | | 1:2 | 307n99, 345n72 |
| | | 3:9 | 75n167 |
| | | 7:27 | 116n104 |
| | | 10:6–8 | 140 |
| | | 10:7 | 140 |
| | | 14:25 | 70n145 |
| | | 15:15 | 311n115 |

Qumran Literature

| | |
|-------------|-------|
| 1QS | |
| VIII, 15–16 | 90n18 |

Philo and Josephus

| | | | |
|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|------------|
| Josephus | | <i>Jewish War</i> | |
| | | 2.182 | 139n17 |
| <i>Jewish Antiquities</i> | | 6.47 | 95 |
| 1.17 | 79n183 | | |
| 1.21 | 463n62 | | |
| 1.192–193 | 79n183 | | |
| 1.192 | 265n121 | | |
| 1.197 | 54, 105n69, 265, 404 | | |
| 1.223 | 345n72 | | |
| 1.325 | 265n118 | | |
| 1.331–334 | 265n118 | | |
| 2.270–276 | 79n183 | | |
| 2.270 | 75n169 | | |
| 3.15.3 [3.318] | 414n17 | | |
| 3.62 | 265n118 | | |
| 3.298 | 79n183 | | |
| 4.57 | 463n62 | | |
| 4.85 | 79n183 | | |
| 4.142 | 463n62 | | |
| 5.213 | 265n118 | | |
| 5.218 | 463n62 | | |
| 5.277 | 265n118 | | |
| 7.122 | 150n48 | | |
| 7.327 | 345n74 | | |
| 10.138–139 | 330n21 | | |
| 18.64 | 350n93 | | |
| | | <i>The Life</i> | |
| | | 208 | 345n74 |
| | | 223 | 143–144n32 |
| | | Philo | |
| | | <i>On Agriculture</i> | |
| | | 136 | 144n32 |
| | | <i>Allegorical Interpretation</i> | |
| | | 1.4 | 463n62 |
| | | 1.35 | 463n62 |
| | | 1.45 | 345n74 |
| | | 1.63 | 463n62 |
| | | 1.99 | 144n32 |
| | | 3.85 | 79n183 |
| | | 3.101 | 345n72 |
| | | 3.217–218 | 79n183 |
| | | <i>Hypothetica</i> | |
| | | 6.9 | 95 |
| | | <i>On the Change of Names</i> | |
| | | 126 | 311n115 |
| | | 175–218 | 79n183 |
| | | 177 | 79 |

| | | | |
|-------------------------------------|---------------------|--|-------------|
| 178 | 80, 281n161 | <i>On the Migration of Abraham</i> | |
| 181–182 | 80, 316n128 | 116 | 331 |
| 188 | 80n188 | <i>On Planting</i> | |
| 218 | 79–80 | 90 | 138n14 |
| <i>On the Cherubim</i> | | <i>On the Posterity of Cain</i> | |
| 60 | 463n62 | 21–31 | 194n36 |
| <i>On the Creation of the World</i> | | <i>On the Preliminary Studies</i> | |
| 138 | 463n62 | 20 | 144n32 |
| <i>On Dreams</i> | | <i>On the Special Laws</i> | |
| 1.36 | 456n40 | 1.105 | 278n154 |
| 1.91 | 144n32 | 2.23 | 331, 333n31 |
| 1.133 | 265n118 | <i>Questions and Answers on Genesis</i> | |
| 1.141 | 95 | 2.40 | 456n40 |
| 2.6 | 345n74 | 2.47 | 345n74 |
| 2.206 | 345n74 | 3.55–58 | 79n183 |
| <i>On Giants</i> | | 3.56 | 80 |
| 36 | 144n32 | 3.57 | 80n184 |
| 60 | 463n62 | 3.58 | 80n185 |
| <i>On the Life of Abraham</i> | | 4.9 | 265n120 |
| 111–118 | 265n120 | 4.17 | 80n187 |
| 111–113 | 79n183 | <i>That God is Unchangeable</i> | |
| 111–112 | 79 | 74 | 138n14 |
| 111 | 79 | <i>That the Worse Attacks the Better</i> | |
| 113 | 39 | 145 | 331, 333n31 |
| 118 | 39n21, 54, 265, 403 | 146 | 331n23 |
| 268 | 79 | | |
| 270 | 79 | | |

Rabbinic Literature and Targumim

| | | | |
|-----------------------|---------|-------------------------|----------------------|
| <i>b. Baba Meši'a</i> | | <i>b. Yoma</i> | |
| 86b | 265n120 | 75b | 269n135 |
| <i>b. Mo'ed Qatan</i> | | <i>Exodus Rabbah</i> | |
| 28b | 434n99 | 3.13 | 430n84 |
| <i>b. Soṭah</i> | | 47.5 | 265n120 |
| 48b | 64n127 | <i>Genesis Rabbah</i> | |
| <i>b. Sukkah</i> | | 48.11 | 265n120 |
| 5.2 | 434n99 | 48.14 | 55, 265n120, 266n122 |
| 52a | 434n99 | <i>Leviticus Rabbah</i> | |
| | | 15.2 | 430 |
| | | 34.8 | 265n120 |

| | | | |
|-------------------------------|------------|-------------------------------|---------|
| <i>m. Sanhedrin</i> | | <i>Targum Onqelos</i> | |
| 10:1 | 76n174 | Num 2:11 | 430n84 |
| <i>Targum Neofiti</i> | 54–55, 140 | <i>Targum Pseudo-Jonathan</i> | |
| Gen 18:8 | 265, 404 | Gen 18:8 | 265n120 |
| | | Gen 19:3 | 265n120 |
| <i>Targum of the Prophets</i> | | <i>y. Berakot</i> | |
| Zech 12:10 | 434n99 | 9.1 | 56n96 |

New Testament

| | | | |
|----------------|----------------------|----------|----------------------|
| <i>Matthew</i> | 310n111 | 15:33 | 189 |
| 1:20 | 345n72 | 16:8 | 176n133, 358 |
| 2:13 | 345n72 | 16:9 | 283n166 |
| 2:19 | 345n72 | 17:1 | 294–295 |
| 4:18–22 | 301 | 17:3 | 214n108 |
| 5:17 | 90n18 | 17:17–20 | 78n181 |
| 5:28 | 161n86 | 17:17 | 70n145 |
| 5:32 | 161n86 | 17:18 | 333 |
| 5:39–43 | 165n98 | 17:20 | 64, 176n133, 244n41, |
| 5:44–45 | 165n98 | | 397n68 |
| 5:44 | 161n86, 270n137 | 18:6 | 65n132 |
| 5:46 | 270n137 | 19:8 | 328n9 |
| 6:3 | 161n86 | 21:15–16 | 293n40 |
| 6:30 | 176n133, 358 | 21:26 | 92n23 |
| 7:12 | 90n18 | 21:31–32 | 78n181 |
| 7:13–14 | 213n108 | 21:32 | 70n147 |
| 8:26 | 176n133, 358, 397 | 22:14 | 214n108 |
| 9:9 | 323n154 | 22:29 | 233n162 |
| 9:13 | 270n137 | 22:30 | 263, 270n137 |
| 9:18–26 | 161 | 22:40 | 90n18 |
| 10:1 | 148 | 23:8–11 | 358n125 |
| 10:37–38 | 148n44 | 23:34 | 116n104 |
| 11:4 | 360n131 | 24:6 | 283n166 |
| 11:13 | 90n18 | 24:14 | 197n46 |
| 11:25 | 99n48 | 24:23–24 | 78n181 |
| 12:2 | 293 | 24:30 | 348n85, 349n90 |
| 12:29 | 92n23 | 25:1–12 | 217 |
| 13:12 | 53n78 | 25:29 | 53n78 |
| 13:19 | 335n41 | 26:6 | 293n40 |
| 13:58 | 78n181 | 26:24–25 | 293n40 |
| 14:27 | 367 | 26:26 | 93n26 |
| 14:30–31 | 303n83 | 26:28 | 432n91 |
| 14:31 | 63, 77, 78, 176n133, | 26:30 | 155n67 |
| | 190n17, 341, 358, | 26:56 | 170 |
| | 367, 368–369 | 27:6 | 432n91 |
| 15:29 | 189 | 27:31 | 121 |

| | | | |
|-------------|---|----------|-----------------------------------|
| 27:32 | 348n86 | 3:18 | 293n41 |
| 27:41 | 121n122 | 3:27 | 92n23 |
| 27:49 | 459 | 3:30 | 99n48 |
| 27:58 | 459n51 | 3:35 | 294n42 |
| 28:1–15 | 176–177, 343 | 4:7 | 382n8 |
| 28:2–15 | 342 | 4:9 | 294n42 |
| 28:6 | 459 | 4:10–12 | 52 |
| 28:8–11 | 342–343 | 4:13 | 397 |
| 28:8 | 418n33 | 4:15 | 335n41, 410n4 |
| 28:9 | 312n118, 390 | 4:38 | 397n67 |
| 28:10 | 367, 418n33 | 4:39 | 333 |
| 28:16–20 | 16, 176, 177, 189, 191, 342 | 4:40 | 78n181, 271, 282, 283n166, 397 |
| 28:16–18 | 344 | 5:1–20 | 331, 332, 333n30 |
| 28:16–17 | 339 | 5:2 | 98n42, 332n26 |
| 28:16 | 61n116, 189, 344n70 | 5:3–4 | 332 |
| 28:17–19 | 224 | 5:13 | 98n42 |
| 28:17–18 | 357 | 5:14 | 332n26 |
| 28:17 | 4, 13, 14, 18n58, 61, 63, 134, 139, 165, 169–171, 177, 190– 194, 198–199, 203, 208n89, 213–214, 224–226, 228, 231, 232, 233n162, 248, 271, 285, 340, 344, 357, 367–369, 384, 385, 443, 459 | 5:15 | 332n26 |
| | | 5:16 | 332n26 |
| | | 5:18 | 332 |
| | | 5:19 | 332 |
| | | 5:20 | 332 |
| | | 5:42 | 98n47 |
| | | 6:5–6 | 78n181 |
| | | 6:7 | 98n42 |
| | | 6:35 | 310n111 |
| | | 6:41–42 | 292n34, 317n134 |
| 28:18 | 339, 357 | 6:52 | 397 |
| 28:19–20 | 196–197, 334n34 | 8:17–21 | 397 |
| 28:19 | 197, 225, 338, 364 | 8:17 | 283n166 |
| 28:20 | 191, 198–199, 206, 208n89 | 8:21 | 283n166 |
| | | 8:31 | 144n33 |
| | | 8:33 | 397 |
| <i>Mark</i> | | 9:2 | 294–295 |
| 1:4 | 142n29 | 9:9–10 | 397 |
| 1:10 | 98 | 9:19 | 78n181 |
| 1:16–20 | 301 | 9:20 | 98n42 |
| 1:16 | 165n101 | 9:23 | 65n132 |
| 1:21–28 | 331 | 9:42 | 65n132 |
| 1:23 | 98n42 | 10:5 | 328n9 |
| 1:26 | 98n42 | 10:8 | 386n16 |
| 1:40–45 | 331 | 10:17 | 293n40 |
| 2:2 | 293n40 | 10:35–41 | 397n65 |
| 2:6 | 293n40 | 10:42 | 293n41 |
| 2:17 | 270n137 | 10:43–45 | 382n8 |
| 2:24 | 293 | 11:1 | 293n41 |
| 3:13 | 148 | 11:2 | 283n166 |
| 3:14 | 332, 333 | 11:23–24 | 73n160 |

| | | | |
|----------|--|----------|---|
| 11:30 | 78n181 | 16:9–11 | 327–328, 363, 366 |
| 11:32 | 92n23 | 16:9–10 | 332 |
| 12:18–27 | 277n152, 385n15 | 16:9 | 329, 332, 337, 345, 346n77, 347n81, 348– |
| 12:18 | 294n42 | | 350, 360, 363n146, 365 |
| 12:25 | 263, 270n137, 404n92 | | |
| 12:37 | 293n41 | | |
| 13:3 | 344n70 | 16:10–14 | 337–339 |
| 13:7 | 283n166 | 16:10–13 | 333 |
| 13:20 | 386n16 | 16:10–11 | 361, 364 |
| 13:21–22 | 78n181 | 16:10 | 327n7, 332n26, 360, 361n134, 361n135, 366n158 |
| 13:24–25 | 399n76 | | |
| 14:3–9 | 293 | | |
| 14:3 | 293n40 | 16:11–14 | 343–344 |
| 14:10 | 293n41 | 16:11 | 62, 332n26, 345, 350n93, 360, 362, 363 |
| 14:22 | 93n26 | | |
| 14:24 | 432n91 | 16:12–13 | 327–328, 346n77, 361n135, 363, 364, 365, 367 |
| 14:26 | 155n67 | | |
| 14:27 | 398n71 | | |
| 14:29 | 398n70, 398n71 | 16:12 | 345, 346, 348, 360, 365 |
| 14:31 | 398n70 | | |
| 14:37–38 | 399n76 | 16:13 | 62, 149, 327n7, 332n26, 360n131, 360, 361, 362n139, 363 |
| 14:38 | 386n16 | | |
| 14:40 | 399n76 | | |
| 14:50–52 | 398n70 | | |
| 14:50 | 170 | 16:14–18 | 400n78 |
| 14:54 | 382n8 | 16:14–16 | 149 |
| 15:20 | 121 | 16:14–15 | 344 |
| 15:21 | 348–349 | 16:14 | 62, 63, 71, 74, 150, 153n60, 208n89, 327– |
| 15:22 | 293n41 | | 328, 330–336, 337, 338n50, 339–341, 344, 345, 358, 360, 365, 366, 367, 371 |
| 15:34 | 43n34, 53n77 | | |
| 15:40 | 398n71 | | |
| 15:41 | 294n42 | | |
| 15:43 | 459n51 | | |
| 16:1–20 | 332n26 | 16:15–20 | 329, 364 |
| 16:1–8 | 363n146 | 16:15–19 | 342 |
| 16:2 | 332n26 | 16:15–18 | 337, 341–342, 344 |
| 16:3 | 332n26 | 16:15–16 | 337 |
| 16:4 | 208n89 | 16:15 | 150, 151n51, 328, 330, 331–334, 336, 337, 338, 344, 364 |
| 16:5 | 332n26 | | |
| 16:6–7 | 405n98 | | |
| 16:6 | 418, 459 | 16:16–17 | 337, 338 |
| 16:7 | 345n76 | 16:16 | 70, 71, 150, 328, 329, 364 |
| 16:8 | 325, 329, 332n26, 418 | | |
| 16:9–20 | 32, 325–336 | 16:17–20 | 337 |
| 16:9–18 | 363 | 16:17–18 | 337, 364 |
| 16:9–15 | 359 | 16:17 | 332n26, 336n44, 337n46 |
| 16:9–14 | 137n13, 326, 329, 336n44, 338n50, 360 | 16:18 | 332n26, 337 |
| 16:9–13 | 332n27 | | |

| | | | |
|-------------|--|-------------------------------|---|
| 16:19 | 123, 130n152, 146n36, 274, 337, 337n46, 341, 342n67, 364n149, 455 | 4:1 4:8 4:12 4:17–19 | 99n48 457n43 306n96 424n60 |
| 16:20 | 328, 330, 331, 332, 336n44, 337, 364 | 4:17 4:18 4:22 4:30 | 143 99n48 394n58 168n110 |
| <i>Luke</i> | | | |
| 1–2 | 124, 126, 129n150, 131, 236–238, 445– 447 | 4:33 4:35 5:1–11 | 98n42 98n42 29n77, 291, 301, 302 310n111 |
| 1:1–4 | 118, 236n8, 423 | 5:1 | 310n111 |
| 1:1–2 | 236n8 | 5:11 | 291–292 |
| 1:2–3 | 161n86 | 5:13 | 57n104, 252n76, 253n82, 391n44 |
| 1:2 | 420n39 | | |
| 1:3 | 173 | 5:17 | 293n40 |
| 1:5–45 | 29n77 | 5:21 | 293n40 |
| 1:7 | 114 | 5:32 | 143n29, 270n137 |
| 1:11 | 276n148, 381 | 5:35 | 423n54 |
| 1:19 | 381 | 6:2 | 293 |
| 1:20 | 78, 396 | 6:6–11 | 414 |
| 1:26–38 | 384, 385n15 | 6:13 | 147–148 |
| 1:27 | 114 | 6:14 | 293n41 |
| 1:28 | 174n128 | 6:18 | 154n66 |
| 1:35 | 114n99, 161n86, 446 | 6:24–26 | 29n77 |
| 1:45 | 65n132 | 6:27–28 | 165n98 |
| 1:56–66 | 29n77 | 6:27 | 270n137 |
| 1:64 | 422n52 | 6:29–30 | 165n98 |
| 2:8–20 | 29n77 | 6:32 | 270n137 |
| 2:8 | 118 | 7:1–10 | 66n136 |
| 2:9 | 276n148 | 7:11–16 | 161 |
| 2:11–14 | 118 | 7:22 | 320n144 |
| 2:14 | 446n3, 449n11 | 7:30 | 293 |
| 2:15 | 456 | 7:36–50 | 29n77, 292 |
| 2:25–38 | 29n77 | 7:36–39 | 293n40 |
| 2:41–51 | 29n77 | 7:36 | 292–293 |
| 2:46 | 382n8 | 7:39 | 292, 293–294 |
| 2:47 | 115n100 | 7:40 | 293n40, 449n13 |
| 2:52 | 114–115 | 8:2 | 337n48 |
| 3:1 | 29n77 | 8:7 | 382n8 |
| 3:2–4 | 115 | 8:8 | 294n42 |
| 3:2 | 115 | 8:12 | 78, 398, 410n4 |
| 3:3 | 142n29 | 8:13 | 165n98 |
| 3:6 | 386n17 | 8:18 | 248n56 |
| 3:21–22 | 116 | 8:21 | 294n42 |
| 3:22 | 98, 99n48, 116n105, 431n88 | 8:23 8:24 | 98n42 397n67 |
| 3:23 | 29n77, 117, 118 | 8:26–39 | 414 |
| 3:38 | 413n13 | 8:27 | 98n42 |

| | | | |
|----------|-----------------------------------|----------|-------------------------------------|
| 8:43 | 154n66 | 13:26 | 403n89, 423n54 |
| 8:44–46 | 57n104, 252n76, 253n82, 391n44 | 13:33–34 | 406n98 |
| 8:45 | 168n110 | 14:1–24 | 292 |
| 8:55 | 98n47 | 14:1–6 | 29n77 |
| 9:21 | 243 | 14:7–11 | 29n77 |
| 9:22 | 12, 144n33, 417, 422 | 14:9 | 423n54 |
| 9:28 | 294–295 | 14:10 | 423n54 |
| 9:29 | 296n53 | 14:12–14 | 29n77 |
| 9:33 | 243 | 14:12 | 294n43 |
| 9:41 | 70n145, 244 | 14:16–24 | 29n77 |
| 9:42 | 98n42 | 14:21 | 423n54 |
| 9:43 | 394n58 | 16:7 | 449n13 |
| 9:45 | 397, 410n4 | 16:13 | 310n112 |
| 9:48 | 143n29 | 16:16 | 423n54 |
| 9:49 | 143n29 | 16:18 | 386n16 |
| 9:51 | 146n36 | 16:19–31 | 29n77 |
| 10:3 | 382n8 | 16:23–28 | 163n94 |
| 10:17 | 143n29 | 16:29 | 90n18, 449n13 |
| 10:21–22 | 410n4 | 16:30 | 92n23, 417 |
| 10:21 | 99n48 | 16:31 | 90n18, 92n23, 163- 164, 417, 420 |
| 10:22–24 | 119, 120 | 17:3 | 142n29 |
| 10:22 | 119n117 | 17:5–6 | 29n77 |
| 10:23 | 119n117 | 17:5 | 397 |
| 10:36 | 248n56 | 17:6 | 397n68 |
| 11 | 98 | 17:11–19 | 29n77 |
| 11:4 | 143n29 | 17:22–37 | 386n16 |
| 11:5–8 | 29n77 | 17:25 | 144n33, 154n66 |
| 11:14–15 | 414 | 18:1–8 | 29n77 |
| 11:20 | 336n44 | 18:9–14 | 29n77 |
| 11:22 | 92n23 | 18:12 | 335n41, 396 |
| 11:26 | 423n54 | 18:18 | 293n40 |
| 11:37–52 | 292 | 18:23 | 12 |
| 11:37 | 394n58 | 18:27 | 161n86, 165n98 |
| 11:45 | 449n13 | 18:33 | 417, 422 |
| 11:49 | 116 | 18:34 | 200, 397, 410n4 |
| 12:10 | 99n48 | 19:1–10 | 29n77 |
| 12:16–20 | 29n77 | 19:1 | 248n56 |
| 12:24 | 278n154 | 19:2–10 | 323n154 |
| 12:28 | 176n133 | 19:3 | 399n76 |
| 12:40 | 248n56 | 19:22 | 449n13 |
| 12:46 | 65n131, 65n132, 78, 396 | 19:29 | 293n41 |
| 12:51 | 248n56 | 19:39 | 293n40 |
| 13:2 | 248n56 | 19:47 | 121n122 |
| 13:4 | 248n56 | 20:6 | 91–92n23 |
| 13:6–9 | 29n77 | 20:26 | 394n58 |
| 13:8 | 449n13 | 20:27 | 294n42 |
| 13:10–17 | 29n77 | 20:34–40 | 417 |
| | | 20:34–36 | 263, 270n137 |

| | | | |
|-------------|--------------------------------|----------|--|
| 20:34 | 270n137, 272n139 | 24:6–7 | 201, 405n98, 418 |
| 20:35–36 | 240n21 | 24:7 | 12, 145n34 |
| 20:36 | 240, 270n137, 404n92, 456 | 24:8–11 | 200–201, 418 |
| 20:37–38 | 406n98 | 24:9–11 | 12 |
| 20:44 | 293n41 | 24:10–11 | 366 |
| 21:8 | 143n29 | 24:11 | 61, 62, 69, 134, 153, 165, 201n62, 203, 247, 300, 398n73, 406 |
| 21:12 | 143n29 | | |
| 21:17 | 143n29 | 24:12–24 | 419 |
| 21:20–21 | 423n54 | 24:12 | 459 |
| 21:26 | 399n76 | 24:13–35 | 267, 400n78 |
| 21:27 | 423n54 | 24:13–32 | 29n77 |
| 22:3 | 293n41 | 24:13–15 | 208n90 |
| 22:15 | 400 | 24:14 | 394n58 |
| 22:17–19 | 93n26 | 24:15–16 | 122, 124n138, 126, 419 |
| 22:19–20 | 459 | | |
| 22:20–24 | 386n16 | 24:15 | 122, 267 |
| 22:20 | 237n9, 432n91 | 24:16 | 62, 122–123, 124, 335, 410n4 |
| 22:24 | 90n18 | | |
| 22:27 | 382n8 | 24:19–23 | 145–146 |
| 22:31–32 | 78, 396, 398, 410n4 | 24:19–20 | 419 |
| 22:32 | 398 | 24:20–21 | 69 |
| 22:33 | 398n70 | 24:20 | 120 |
| 22:35 | 293n41 | 24:21 | 245 |
| 22:39–46 | 386n16 | 24:22–24 | 245 |
| 22:39–41 | 295 | 24:23 | 240, 363 |
| 22:39 | 206n81 | 24:24 | 419 |
| 22:45 | 394n58, 399n76 | 24:25–27 | 91, 153, 154n64 |
| 22:55 | 382n8 | 24:25 | 61, 69, 74, 75, 78, 139, 146, 147, 153, 166n103, 203, 233n162, 240, 245– 247, 256, 336, 396, 406, 419 |
| 23:6–8 | 404n92 | | |
| 23:8 | 99n48 | | |
| 23:13 | 120 | | |
| 23:16 | 120 | | |
| 23:20 | 423n54 | | |
| 23:26 | 120, 121 | 24:26–35 | 174n128 |
| 23:33 | 120, 293n41 | 24:26–27 | 419 |
| 23:35 | 120, 121n122 | 24:26 | 144–145, 144n33, 146, 151n51, 154 |
| 23:36 | 348n86 | | |
| 23:40 | 294n42 | 24:27–29 | 247 |
| 23:46 | 121n124 | 24:27 | 90n18, 143n29, 146, 147n38, 154, 156, 233n162, 240, 245 |
| 23:49–24:53 | 152 | | |
| 23:49 | 152, 398n71 | | |
| 23:52 | 460n51 | 24:28 | 225 |
| 23:53 | 283n166 | 24:29 | 276n150 |
| 24:3 | 300, 459–460n51 | 24:31–43 | 384 |
| 24:4 | 240, 276n148, 300, 381, 419 | 24:31–36 | 9 |
| | | 24:31–32 | 421n44, 422 |
| 24:6 | 208n87, 405–406n99, 459 | | |

| | | | |
|----------|--|-------------------|---|
| 24:31 | 10, 147n38, 233n162, 267, 381n6, 382n8, 410n4, 454 | 24:39–40 24:39 | 410 2, 4, 12, 23, 57, 88, 92–95, 98–100, 102, 103, 105, 166n104, 168, 174–175, 179n141, 184, 237, 246, 249–253, 255, 256, 272, 274–275, 279n155, 281, 310– 312, 315, 317, 320, 322n149, 369–373, 386–388, 390, 391, 421, 422n49, 450–453 |
| 24:32–36 | 247 | | 175 |
| 24:32 | 240 | 24:40–41 | 88n12, 173, 247, 274, 385, 450–453, 459 |
| 24:33–44 | 88 | 24:40 | 154n64 |
| 24:33–41 | 311 | 24:41–47 | 154 |
| 24:33–36 | 104n68 | 24:41–44 | 89, 255, 268–269, 310, 319, 400–401, 403 |
| 24:33–35 | 362n139 | 24:41–43 | 317n132 |
| 24:33–34 | 88 | 24:41–42 | 4, 61, 62, 72, 88, 92, 103, 106, 108, 139, 147n39, 153, 155, 165, 177, 207, 208, 232, 246–247, 256, 271, 276n150, 277, 279–283, 285, 310– 312, 315, 320, 340, 341, 362n141, 367– 371, 373, 375, 394– 400, 406, 410, 412, 414n17, 417n26, 420, 422n48, 442, 453n25 |
| 24:33 | 419 | 24:41 | 103, 168, 255, 276, 317–318, 384, 404, 412 |
| 24:34 | 17, 454 | | 268, 272n139, 274 405 |
| 24:36–53 | 1, 9n24, 15, 147n39, 310–320, 447–448 | 24:42–43 | 2, 88, 89n13, 255n86, 317n134, 400, 403n89, 411n7, 421– 422 |
| 24:36–51 | 271–274 | 24:42 | 154, 273, 405n98, 406n100, 407, 422 |
| 24:36–50 | 293 | 24:43–44 | 91, 137, 157, 160n82, 412, 413, 414–415n17, 417, 420 |
| 24:36–49 | 267n126, 385, 386– 388, 400n78, 422–423 | 24:43 | |
| 24:36–43 | 8n20, 9, 14, 17, 55, 87, 108, 137, 175, 274, 312, 314, 406n100, 422–423 | 24:44–49 | |
| 24:36–41 | 137 | 24:44–47 | |
| 24:36–40 | 420 | | |
| 24:36–37 | 104, 275 | | |
| 24:36 | 4, 108, 154, 155, 196, 233n162, 267, 275– 276, 380, 381–382, 448–449, 454, 459 | | |
| 24:37–43 | 155 | | |
| 24:37–39 | 255 | | |
| 24:37–38 | 102, 103, 108, 153, 177, 248–249, 267, 281, 285, 341, 372, 384, 406 | | |
| 24:37 | 13, 98n45, 103, 214, 248–249, 274–275, 284, 367, 368, 381n2, 382n8, 398n73, 449 | | |
| 24:38–43 | 421 | | |
| 24:38–41 | 64, 385 | | |
| 24:38 | 4, 13, 61, 63, 69, 134, 165, 246, 249, 256, 282n165, 367–369 | | |
| 24:39–43 | 181, 209, 278, 411– 412, 424n59, 454 | | |
| 24:39–41 | 13, 69, 154, 178, 313, 318, 319, 384, 385, 394 | | |

| | | | |
|-------------|--|---|---|
| 24:44–46 | 153, 367 | 1:14 | 165n98, 299–300, |
| 24:44 | 89–91, 92, 145n34, 154–155, 156, 207– 209, 237, 239–240, 314n121, 385, 406n99, 406n100, 412, 417n26, 421– 423, 455 | 1:17–18 1:19–34 1:20–21 1:25 1:32 | 309n109, 425, 427, 461–465 427 118 467n72 467n72 462n54 |
| 24:45–49 | 423 | 1:35–51 | 301 |
| 24:45 | 123, 147n39, 154, 240, 314n121, 336, 410n4, 422–423 | 1:41 2:4 2:11 | 467n72 283n166, 365n156 345n73 |
| 24:46–47 | 142, 150, 412, 422 | 3:4 | 192n24 |
| 24:46 | 144–145n34, 154, 156, 240, 385, 417n26 | 3:13–14 3:13 | 433 425 |
| 24:47–53 | 153 | 3:14 | 130n152 |
| 24:47–48 | 146n36, 156, 364 | 3:15–16 | 65n132 |
| 24:47 | 91n20, 142, 143, 155 | 3:16–18 | 364n150 |
| 24:48–49 | 206n79 | 3:18 | 65n132, 70, 71, 78 |
| 24:48 | 106n73, 207, 209, 225 | 3:21 | 345n73 |
| 24:49 | 137, 143n31, 208n90, 229n158, 364n150 | 3:24 3:31 | 283n166 425 |
| 24:50–53 | 363n148, 317, 319– 320 | 3:32 3:36 | 320n144 65n132 |
| 24:50–51 | 318–319 | 4:14 | 430n84 |
| 24:50 | 319 | 4:25 | 467n72 |
| 24:51–52 | 209–210, 454, 455 | 4:29 | 425, 467n72 |
| 24:51 | 123, 154, 237n9, 267, 318n138, 453–459 | 4:35 4:39 | 462n54 217n119 |
| 24:52 | 154, 314n121, 453– 459 | 4:41 4:42 | 217n119 217n119 |
| 24:53 | 155n67, 189n10 | 4:48 4:50 | 217–218, 392, 393n52 217n119 |
| <i>John</i> | | 5:12 | 425 |
| 1:1–18 | 464 | 5:17–18 | 425 |
| 1:1–3 | 161n86 | 5:22 | 357n121 |
| 1:3 | 165n98 | 5:25 | 65n132 |
| 1:5 | 348n85, 349n90 | 6:17 | 283n166 |
| 1:9–14 | 463n59 | 6:32 | 425n65 |
| 1:10–11 | 462n56 | 6:33 | 425 |
| 1:10 | 461 | 6:35 | 65n132 |
| 1:11–12 | 66n134, 66n136 | 6:38 | 425 |
| 1:12–14 | 462n56 | 6:40 | 65n132, 180, 385n14, 425n65 |
| 1:12 | 65n132, 65n133 | | |
| 1:13–14 | 464n64 | 6:41–42 | 425 |
| 1:13 | 462–463 | 6:41 | 425 |
| 1:14–18 | 434n100 | 6:42 6:46 6:47 | 425 425, 427n70 65n132 |

| | | | |
|---------|-----------------|----------|-------------------|
| 6:51–58 | 465–466 | 10:29 | 425n65 |
| 6:51–56 | 465n69 | 10:30–36 | 425 |
| 6:51 | 425 | 10:30 | 165n98, 425 |
| 6:61–63 | 465–466 | 10:32–38 | 392 |
| 6:63 | 465n69, 466 | 10:33 | 425, 461 |
| 6:64–71 | 78 | 10:37 | 425n65 |
| 6:64 | 65n132 | 10:38 | 165n98 |
| 6:70 | 310n112 | 11 | 161 |
| 7:6 | 283n166 | 11:19–33 | 360n132 |
| 7:8 | 283n166 | 11:24 | 165n98 |
| 7:16–29 | 461 | 11:25–27 | 357 |
| 7:16 | 426 | 11:25 | 65n132 |
| 7:24 | 426 | 11:26 | 65n132 |
| 7:25–26 | 467n72 | 11:28 | 360n132 |
| 7:27–29 | 426 | 11:30 | 283n166 |
| 7:27–28 | 426n66 | 11:47 | 425 |
| 7:30 | 283n166 | 11:50 | 425 |
| 7:37–38 | 429n81 | 12:23–24 | 433 |
| 7:38–39 | 433n96 | 12:32–34 | 433 |
| 7:38 | 65n132 | 12:36–40 | 74n165 |
| 7:39 | 65n132, 283n166 | 12:37–41 | 78 |
| 7:40–42 | 467n72 | 12:37 | 343n69 |
| 7:46 | 425 | 12:39–40 | 410n4 |
| 7:51 | 425 | 12:40 | 434n100 |
| 7:52 | 425 | 12:41 | 433 |
| 8:14–19 | 461 | 12:44 | 65n132 |
| 8:14 | 426 | 12:45 | 427, 434n100, 435 |
| 8:15 | 426 | 12:46 | 65n132 |
| 8:16–19 | 426 | 13:3 | 425 |
| 8:19 | 425n65 | 13:18 | 310n112 |
| 8:20 | 283n166 | 13:19 | 78 |
| 8:23 | 425, 426 | 13:23–25 | 297 |
| 8:24 | 71 | 13:31 | 433 |
| 8:28 | 433 | 13:38 | 367 |
| 8:31 | 65n132 | 14:7 | 425n65, 427 |
| 8:38 | 425n65 | 14:8–10 | 345n72 |
| 8:40 | 425n63 | 14:8 | 428 |
| 8:42 | 425 | 14:9 | 434n100, 428, 435 |
| 8:43–47 | 78 | 14:10–11 | 392 |
| 8:49 | 425n65 | 14:10 | 165n98 |
| 8:54 | 425n65 | 14:11 | 165n98 |
| 8:57–58 | 425 | 14:12 | 65n132 |
| 8:57 | 425 | 14:19–20 | 428 |
| 8:58–59 | 425 | 14:20 | 345n72, 425n65 |
| 9:3 | 345n73 | 14:21–22 | 345n72 |
| 9:16 | 425 | 14:23 | 425n65 |
| 9:24 | 425 | 14:27 | 196 |
| 9:29–30 | 426n66 | 15:1 | 425n65 |
| 10:18 | 425n65 | 15:8 | 425n65 |

| | | | |
|----------|---------------------|----------|-------------------------|
| 15:15 | 425n65 | | 384, 385, 399n74, |
| 15:16 | 310n112 | | 399n77, 451n19, 459 |
| 15:23 | 425n65 | 20:21–23 | 364 |
| 15:24 | 427n72 | 20:21 | 137n12, 196 |
| 15:25 | 434n100 | 20:22 | 173 |
| 16:27 | 425 | 20:24–29 | 1–2, 4, 5, 7, 9, 13–14, |
| 17:6 | 345n73 | | 17, 18, 22, 24, 32, |
| 17:20 | 65n132 | | 162, 167n107, 305, |
| 17:21 | 165n98 | | 307–309, 310, 389, |
| 18:2 | 206n81, 295n50 | | 391, 407, 424–425, |
| 18:5 | 425n64 | | 426–428, 435, 461 |
| 18:7 | 425n64 | 20:24 | 166n104 |
| 18:14 | 425 | 20:25–29 | 385 |
| 18:17 | 425 | 20:25–27 | 57, 371 |
| 18:29 | 425 | 20:25 | 4, 61, 134, 165, 167– |
| 19:5–7 | 425 | | 168, 173n126, 178, |
| 19:5 | 425 | | 217–218, 219, 272, |
| 19:8 | 426n66 | | 283, 304–309, 367, |
| 19:19 | 425n64 | | 370, 384, 385, 392, |
| 19:24 | 459 | | 393–394, 424n60, |
| 19:25 | 365n154 | | 428, 435 |
| 19:34–37 | 394n57 | 20:26–27 | 168n110, 308 |
| 19:34 | 429–433 | 20:26 | 9, 10, 108, 304, 367, |
| 19:36 | 433n98, 434n100 | | 368, 380, 382–383, |
| 19:37 | 433–435 | | 459 |
| 19:38 | 13 | 20:27–28 | 313, 392n48 |
| 19:40 | 459n51 | 20:27 | 4, 12, 15n45, 23, 61, |
| 19:42 | 459n51 | | 62, 65n131, 134, 161– |
| 20:1–18 | 300, 308 | | 162, 168, 181, 296, |
| 20:2 | 297, 304 | | 297n55, 303–309, |
| 20:3 | 459 | | 310n110, 311, |
| 20:5–6 | 459 | | 336n42, 358, 367, |
| 20:10 | 459 | | 370, 373, 390, |
| 20:11–18 | 200, 202 | | 392n48, 393–394, |
| 20:11–15 | 202n67 | | 424, 428 |
| 20:17 | 202–203, 283n166, | 20:28–29 | 308 |
| | 312n118, 319n141, | 20:28 | 304, 307, 308, |
| | 425n65 | | 309n110, 312n117, |
| 20:18–19 | 12–13 | | 392n48, 393, 424, |
| 20:18 | 201, 202–203, 218 | | 428, 435 |
| 20:19–29 | 107, 267n126, 385 | 20:29 | 3n5, 65n132, 162, |
| 20:19–23 | 304, 382, 399n77 | | 180–181, 192n24, |
| 20:19 | 9, 10, 104, 108, | | 218, 253, 304, |
| | 155n67, 168n110, | | 305n89, 307, 308, |
| | 196, 199n55, 304, | | 364n150, 385n14, |
| | 367, 368, 380, 382– | | 391–392, 424, 428 |
| | 383, 449, 459 | 20:30–31 | 310n110 |
| 20:20 | 102, 167–168, 181, | 20:31 | 461, 466–467 |
| | 218, 272, 283, 371, | 21:1–14 | 292n33, 301–302 |

| | | | |
|-------------|---|---------|----------------|
| 21:1–4 | 301–302 | 2:4 | 229n158 |
| 21:1 | 345 | 2:17 | 98n47, 386n17 |
| 21:4 | 62, 123n133, 302, 303 | 2:22 | 415n18 |
| 21:5–15 | 317n132 | 2:26 | 386n17 |
| 21:7 | 302, 367 | 2:29–35 | 414–415 |
| 21:8–9 | 292n33 | 2:31 | 386n17 |
| 21:9–14 | 400n78 | 2:38 | 142, 143n29 |
| 21:9 | 291n32, 292n33 | 2:44 | 65n132 |
| 21:12 | 302, 303, 367 | 2:46 | 189n10 |
| 21:13 | 317n134 | 3:1 | 189n10 |
| 21:14 | 302, 345 | 3:6 | 143n29 |
| 21:15–23 | 351n96 | 3:12 | 394n58 |
| 21:15–17 | 367 | 3:15 | 415 |
| 21:18–23 | 297n58 | 3:16 | 143n29 |
| 21:18–19 | 106n73 | 3:17–26 | 415 |
| 21:20 | 297 | 3:17–19 | 142–143n29 |
| 21:24–25 | 198 | 4:1 | 382n9 |
| 21:25 | 297, 298, 300 | 4:7 | 382n8 |
| | | 4:8 | 423n54 |
| <i>Acts</i> | | 4:10–12 | 415 |
| 1:1–22 | 173 | 4:10 | 143n29 |
| 1:1–11 | 176–177 | 4:12 | 143n29 |
| 1:1 | 117n109, 174 | 4:13 | 394n58 |
| 1:2–8 | 206n79 | 4:15–17 | 414 |
| 1:2 | 137, 274, 277, 290n25, 310n112, 384, 454, 459, 459n51 | 4:17–18 | 143n29 |
| | | 4:20 | 320n144 |
| | | 4:25–26 | 121n122 |
| 1:3–8 | 137 | 4:26 | 121 |
| 1:3 | 13n34, 94, 115n103, 128n148, 163n93, 177, 209, 414n17, 416, 459n51 | 4:30 | 143n29 |
| | | 4:32 | 65n132 |
| | | 4:33 | 460n51 |
| | | 4:36 | 154n66 |
| 1:4 | 276n150, 400n78 | 5:14 | 65n132 |
| 1:6–8 | 351n96 | 5:26 | 423n54 |
| 1:8–9 | 153 | 5:28 | 143n29, 432n91 |
| 1:8 | 153n61, 207n83, 208n88, 225, 229n158, 364 | 5:31 | 142n29 |
| | | 5:40–41 | 143n29 |
| | | 5:41 | 178 |
| 1:9–11 | 364n149 | 6:1–6 | 137, 138n15 |
| 1:9–10 | 128n148 | 6:2 | 138n15 |
| 1:9 | 94, 274, 277, 290n25, 318–319, 384, 454 | 6:3 | 138n15 |
| | | 6:5 | 138n15 |
| 1:10 | 381 | 6:11 | 423n54 |
| 1:11 | 94, 146n36, 274, 277, 384, 454 | 7:51–52 | 406n98 |
| | | 7:59 | 460n51 |
| 1:12 | 319n139, 423n54 | 8:1–4 | 178 |
| 1:15 | 382n8 | 8:1 | 206 |
| 1:21–22 | 117 | 8:4–8 | 206 |
| 1:21 | 460n51 | 8:9–24 | 414 |

| | | | |
|----------|---|----------|----------------------------|
| 8:12 | 137, 143n29 | 13:32–37 | 416 |
| 8:14–17 | 206n80 | 13:39 | 65n132 |
| 8:16 | 460n51 | 13:41 | 74n164, 78, 394n58, 396 |
| 8:17 | 423n54 | | |
| 8:33 | 319n140 | 14:8–18 | 414 |
| 8:36 | 449n13 | 14:11 | 39n21 |
| 9:1–8 | 351n96 | 14:23 | 137 |
| 9:16 | 143n29, 144n33 | 14:27 | 422n52 |
| 9:17 | 460n51 | 15:1–9 | 66n134, 66n136 |
| 9:21 | 143n29 | 15:4 | 154n66 |
| 9:27 | 143n29 | 15:5 | 65n132 |
| 9:30 | 291n30 | 15:7–11 | 415n18 |
| 9:40 | 422n52 | 15:11 | 460n51 |
| 10:10 | 276n148 | 15:12 | 415n18 |
| 10:30 | 276n148, 381 | 15:15–21 | 415n18 |
| 10:31 | 449n13 | 15:16 | 143n29 |
| 10:33 | 154n66 | 15:22 | 415n18, 423n54 |
| 10:34 | 422n52 | 15:26 | 460n51 |
| 10:37–38 | 117 | 16:1 | 65n132 |
| 10:40–42 | 415 | 16:14–15 | 410n4, 422n52 |
| 10:40 | 348n85, 349n90 | 16:16–22 | 414 |
| 10:41 | 88–89, 92, 102, 276n150, 384, 400n78, 403n89, 415n20 | 16:18 | 143n29 |
| | | 16:31 | 460n51 |
| | | 17:1–3 | 415n17 |
| 10:42 | 415 | 17:2–3 | 416 |
| 10:43 | 142n29, 143, 416 | 17:3 | 144n33 |
| 10:44 | 416n21 | 17:11 | 416 |
| 10:45 | 65n132 | 17:12 | 416 |
| 10:46 | 423n54 | 17:14 | 415n18 |
| 11:13 | 276n148, 381 | 17:18 | 95 |
| 11:16–17 | 419n33 | 17:27 | 311n115, 322n149 |
| 11:17 | 460n51 | 18:13 | 143n29 |
| 11:19 | 178, 399n76 | 18:17 | 143n29 |
| 11:20 | 460n51 | 18:27 | 65n132 |
| 11:21 | 65n132 | 19:5 | 460n51 |
| 11:26 | 65n131 | 19:8 | 415n17 |
| 12:7 | 276n148, 381 | 19:9 | 78, 396 |
| 12:8 | 449n13 | 19:13 | 460n51 |
| 12:9–11 | 421 | 19:17 | 460n51 |
| 12:9 | 404n92 | 19:18 | 65n132 |
| 12:14 | 394n58, 399n76 | 19:19 | 74 |
| 12:16 | 422n52 | 19:35 | 449n13 |
| 13:3 | 423n54 | 20:13 | 460n51 |
| 13:6–12 | 414 | 20:21 | 460n51 |
| 13:12 | 423n54 | 20:24 | 460n51 |
| 13:24 | 115n103 | 20:28 | 432n91 |
| 13:27–28 | 121 | 20:35 | 460n51 |
| 13:30–31 | 416 | 21:1–14 | 118 |
| | | 21:13 | 143n29 |

| | | | |
|----------|---------------------------------|----------------------|--|
| 21:20 | 65n132, 66n134, 66n136 | 28:24 28:27 | 74, 78, 92, 396 74, 78, 335n41, 396 |
| 21:25 | 65n132, 66n134, 66n136 | 28:31 | 460n51 |
| 21:26 | 423n54 | <i>Romans</i> | |
| 21:33 | 423n54 | 1:16 | 65n132, 66n134 |
| 21:37 | 449n13 | 1:18–21 | 74 |
| 22:2 | 449n13 | 2:16 | 238n15 |
| 22:6 | 206 | 2:24 | 263n111 |
| 22:7 | 206 | 3:3 | 63 |
| 22:8 | 206 | 3:21–23 | 66n134 |
| 22:11 | 399n76 | 3:21 | 90n18 |
| 22:16 | 143n29 | 3:22 | 65n132 |
| 22:19 | 65n132 | 3:25 | 432n91 |
| 22:20 | 106n73 | 4:5 | 65n132 |
| 22:30 | 291n30 | 4:6 | 65n133 |
| 23:6–9 | 416n22 | 4:9–25 | 66n134, 66n137, 67n141 |
| 23:6–8 | 68n141 | | 65n132 |
| 23:8 | 99n48 | 4:11 | 66 |
| 23:9 | 99n48, 404n92 | 4:16–25 | 65n133, 67 |
| 23:15 | 291n30 | 4:16 | 67 |
| 23:18 | 449n13 | 4:17 | 67 |
| 23:20 | 291n30 | 4:18–22 | 65n132, 67 |
| 23:28 | 291n30 | 4:24 | 387, 463n59 |
| 24:14–15 | 416 | 8:3 | 182n153, 212 |
| 25:5 | 449n13 | 8:11 | 65n133 |
| 25:12 | 423n54 | 9:3 | 65n133 |
| 25:22 | 449n13 | 9:25–32 | 65n132, 75 |
| 25:24 | 449n13 | 9:33 | 65n133 |
| 26:1 | 423n54 | 10:1 | 65n132 |
| 26:6–8 | 416 | 10:4 | 67n141 |
| 26:9 | 143n29 | 10:9–13 | 76 |
| 26:18–20 | 142n29 | 10:9–11 | 67 |
| 26:18 | 78, 335n41, 396, 398, 422n52 | 10:9–10 | 65n132, 75 |
| 26:22–23 | 91, 416 | 10:11 | 67 |
| 26:22 | 90n18 | 10:12 | 74 |
| 26:24–28 | 416 | 11:17 | 70 |
| 26:24 | 449n13 | 11:20 | 68 |
| 26:25 | 449n13 | 14:1 | 68n142 |
| 26:28 | 65n131 | 14:18–21 | 68n142 |
| 27:3 | 291n30 | 14:20 | 64n128, 70, 73 |
| 27:21 | 382n8, 423n54 | 14:23 | 70 |
| 27:23 | 276n148, 381 | 16:8–9 | 238n15 |
| 27:35–36 | 403n89 | 16:25 | |
| 28 | 92n24 | | |
| 28:12 | 291 | <i>I Corinthians</i> | |
| 28:23 | 90n18, 91–92, 102, 415n17 | 1:21 | 65n132 |
| | | 2:8 | 121n122 |
| | | 3:2 | 283n166 |

| | | | |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------|------------------------|------------|
| 6:1–6 | 65n132, 76 | 6:14 | 70n145, 76 |
| 6:4–6 | 77 | 10–12 | 77n176 |
| 6:6 | 65n131, 65n133, 76 | 11:14 | 301n72 |
| 6:13–14 | 167 | 12:9 | 385n15 |
| 6:15–16 | 385n15 | | |
| 7:12–15 | 65n131, 65n132, 65n133, 77 | <i>Galatians</i> | |
| 7:14 | 76 | 2:9 | 12 |
| 8:2 | 283n166 | 2:11–16 | 242 |
| 10:4 | 430n85 | 3:6–26 | 66n137 |
| 10:27 | 65n131, 65n132, 77 | 3:9 | 65n132 |
| 11:10 | 240n21 | 3:10 | 458n48 |
| 11:24–25 | 459 | 3:13 | 458n48 |
| 11:25 | 432n91 | 3:22 | 65n132 |
| 14:22–24 | 65n131, 65n132, 77 | 5:6 | 65 |
| 15 | 6, 135, 161, 164, 178, 182 | 6:10 | 65n133 |
| 15:3–7 | 11 | <i>Ephesians</i> | |
| 15:3–5 | 204n75 | 1:1 | 65n132 |
| 15:3 | 384, 385n15 | 1:19–22 | 334n34 |
| 15:5–8 | 6, 136 | 1:19 | 65n132 |
| 15:12–19 | 67n141 | 2:3 | 71 |
| 15:12 | 385n15 | 2:5–6 | 212 |
| 15:20–28 | 68n141 | 2:14 | 387 |
| 15:20–23 | 182n153 | 5:30 | 385n15 |
| 15:20 | 136 | <i>Philippians</i> | |
| 15:23–28 | 46n53 | 2:6–7 | 242n26 |
| 15:23–24 | 135 | 3:21 | 346 |
| 15:32 | 164n97 | <i>Colossians</i> | |
| 15:33–35 | 197n48 | 1:2 | 65n132 |
| 15:34–46 | 76 | 1:15–17 | 334n34 |
| 15:36–37 | 136 | 1:20 | 432n91 |
| 15:37–39 | 346 | 1:22 | 252n73 |
| 15:37–38 | 385n15 | 2:12 | 212 |
| 15:42 | 183n155 | 3:1 | 212 |
| 15:44 | 6, 125n139 | <i>1 Thessalonians</i> | |
| 15:50 | 125, 126, 131 | 1:7 | 65n132 |
| 15:51–53 | 212 | 2:10 | 65n132 |
| 15:51–52 | 346 | 2:13 | 65n132 |
| 15:52–54 | 183n155 | 4:14–17 | 182n153 |
| 15:53 | 164n97 | <i>2 Thessalonians</i> | |
| <i>2 Corinthians</i> | | 1:10 | 65n132 |
| 4:4 | 65n131, 65n132, 76, 335, 410n4 | 2:4 | 282n163 |
| 4:6 | 335, 410n4 | 2:12 | 65n132 |
| 4:14 | 182n153, 212 | 16:1 | 65n132 |
| 5:3 | 306n94 | | |
| 6:14–15 | 65n131, 65n132 | | |

1 Timothy

1:2 65n132, 65n133
 1:12 148n44
 1:13 74n163
 2:1–4 197n48
 2:18 212
 4:3 65n132
 4:12 65n132
 5:8 65n131, 65n132, 77
 5:16 65n132
 5:18 129n151
 6:2 65n133
 6:3 65n132

2 Timothy

2:8 384, 385n15
 2:13 63
 2:16–18 67–68n141
 2:18 68n141

Titus

1:4 65n132, 65n133
 1:6 65n132
 1:15 65n131, 74
 3:8 65n132

Hebrews

2:6–9 269
 2:6 138n14
 2:8 283n166
 2:18 322n149
 3:8–19 74
 3:12 74
 4:2–3 65n132
 4:4 138n14
 5:6 138n14
 6:7 463n62
 9:14 432n91
 11:17–19 67
 12 138
 12:4 283n166

James

1:5–8 140, 194, 223n141
 1:6–8 72
 1:13 306n96
 4:8–9 72, 140

1 Peter

1:1 144n33
 1:11 91n21, 144n33,
 151n51
 1:19 432n91
 1:21 65n132, 67
 2:6–10 66n134
 2:6–8 75
 2:7 65n131, 65n132,
 75n171
 4:16 65n131

2 Peter

1:1 65n132

1 John

1:1 107n76, 311n113,
 320–324, 389n31,
 421n44
 3:2 283n166
 3:15 70n145
 4:1 78n181
 5:1 65n132, 66n134
 5:5 65n132
 5:6 341–342
 5:10 65n132, 78n181
 5:13 65n132
 12:12 142n29

2 John

7 40n24, 48, 86n5

Jude

5 70
 22–23 73

Revelation

2:13 65n132, 106n73
 5:9 432n91
 17:6 106n73
 17:10 283n166
 17:12 283n166
 17:14 65n132
 21 146n36
 21:8 65n131, 70n145

New Testament Apocrypha, Nag Hammadi, and Related Texts

| | | | |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------|--|
| <i>Acts of Andrew and Matthias</i> | | 88.4–5 | 320n144 |
| 5.5 | 347 | 88.4 | 297, 298n60, 298n61 |
| 17.3–4 | 347 | 88.5–7 | 299 |
| | | 88.5 | 298n61 |
| <i>Acts of John</i> | | 88.7 | 305n93 |
| | 32, 80, 97, 286–324, 374 | 88.9–20 | 291, 297, 301, 303 |
| | | 88.11–18 | 302, 303 |
| 20.12 | 298n60 | 88.12–20 | 301–302 |
| 26.2 | 298n60 | 88.12 | 302 |
| 27.8 | 295n47 | 88.18–19 | 291, 292n33 |
| 33 | 316n124, 316n129, 333, 335 | 89–92 | 191n20 |
| | | 89 | 295n48, 297n56, 302n80 |
| 33.6–8 | 70n145 | | |
| 39 | 316n124, 316n129 | 89.1–6 | 302, 303 |
| 39.12 | 295n47 | 89.2 | 302 |
| 39.14–15 | 71n150 | 89.4 | 303 |
| 40.8 | 295n47 | 89.5 | 303 |
| 41.1 | 295n47 | 89.9–10 | 347 |
| 45.5 | 295n47 | 89.10–15 | 317 |
| 46.5 | 298n60 | 89.10–14 | 319n139 |
| 63–86 | 300n71, 308 | 89.11 | 297 |
| 70.1 | 97n39 | 89.14 | 303 |
| 70.4 | 301n72, 315n122 | 90 | 295n48, 297n56, 302n80, 306n97, 308 |
| 73.7–8 | 319 | | |
| 76 | 316n124, 316n129 | 90.1–4 | 304 |
| 81 | 316n124, 316n129 | 90.1–2 | 294–295, 304 |
| 81.10–20 | 74n163 | 90.1 | 294n44, 298n60 |
| 82.1 | 97n39 | 90.2 | 295n47 |
| 82.6 | 301n72, 315n122 | 90.4–22 | 303, 305 |
| 84 | 316n124, 316n129 | 90.5–7 | 304 |
| 84.6–7 | 75n169 | 90.5 | 305n93 |
| 86.1 | 295n47 | 90.6–7 | 295n47, 296 |
| 87–93 | 32, 38, 40, 50, 97n39, 374n179 | 90.7–8 | 296 |
| | | 90.7 | 304, 305n93 |
| 87 | 299 | 90.8–9 | 305 |
| 87.1–3 | 300 | 90.8 | 305n93 |
| 87.3–88.8 | 287n7 | 90.9–14 | 304, 305 |
| 87.3–5 | 300 | 90.9–10 | 306 |
| 88–89 | 302 | 90.10–11 | 286n2, 296, 303, 318n135 |
| 88 | 295n48, 302n80 | | |
| 88.1–8 | 297 | 90.10 | 304n88 |
| 88.1 | 300 | 90.11–14 | 305 |
| 88.2–8 | 51 | 90.13 | 43n34 |
| 88.2–5 | 298 | 90.15–22 | 296n54 |
| 88.2–3 | 310n112, 316n127 | 90.15–16 | 304, 310n110, 393 |
| 88.3–5 | 298n60 | 90.16 | 296, 303, 304, 305n91, 373 |
| 88.3–4 | 298, 301n74 | | |

| | | | |
|-----------|---|--|-----------------------------|
| 90.21–22 | 304, 393 | <i>Acts of Paul</i> | 172n123 |
| 90.22 | 307 | | |
| 91 | 295n48, 302n80 | <i>Acts of Peter</i> | |
| 92.1–93.4 | 311, 318 | 7.9 | 77n179 |
| 92 | 310, 315 | 7.11–15 | 74n163 |
| 92.2 | 310, 373 | 7.15 | 75, 335n39, 410n4 |
| 92.3 | 97n39, 373 | 10.13–18 | 70n147, 74n163 |
| 92.6–7 | 310n112, 316n127 | 10.13 | 64n128, 77 |
| 92.8 | 316 | 10.15 | 77n179 |
| 93 | 57, 297n56, 312n118 | 20.10 | 346 |
| 93.1–4 | 255n88, 314, 315n122, 320–324, 374, 394 | 20.21 | 318n136 |
| | | 21.9–15 | 302n77 |
| | | 31 | 159n78 |
| 93.1 | 315 | | |
| 93.2 | 312n118 | <i>Acts of Peter and Andrew</i> | |
| 93.3 | 252, 310, 311, 372 | 2.1 | 347 |
| 93.4–10 | 292–294, 317–319, 401n86 | 16.1 | 347 |
| 93.4–5 | 292–293 | | |
| 93.4 | 306n97 | <i>Acts of Peter and the Twelve Apostles</i> (NHC VI,1) | |
| 93.6–7 | 294n43 | 2.19–25 | 451n19 |
| 93.12 | 319 | | |
| 93.14–17 | 287n7, 302n79, 310n110 | <i>Acts of Pilate</i> | |
| | | | 341–344 |
| 93.15–17 | 51 | 1.1 | 342n65 |
| 93.15 | 298n60 | 2.4–5 | 343n68 |
| 94–102 | 38n16, 40n24, 309n110 | 6–8 | 342n65 |
| | | 13 | 342–343 |
| 94.10–14 | 318–319 | 13.2 | 338n50, 342n65, 343– 344 |
| 94.16–17 | 320n144 | | |
| 95.22–28 | 288n7 | 14.1 | 342n65, 344 |
| 97 | 430 | | |
| 98.15–10 | 288n7 | <i>Acts of Thaddaeus</i> | |
| 99–100 | 58n109 | 6.8 | 89n14 |
| 101 | 430 | | |
| 101.7–9 | 432n90 | <i>Acts of Thomas</i> | |
| 102.2 | 290n25 | 28 | 150n49 |
| 102.3–7 | 49n66 | 40.3 | 58n109 |
| 103.1–3 | 309 | 44.1 | 301n72, 315n122 |
| 103.2–4 | 309n110 | 45.12 | 347 |
| 104.1–2 | 301, 304, 309 | 48.1 | 301n72, 315n122 |
| 104.2 | 304n86 | 81.1 | 358n124, 393n55 |
| 106–108 | 297n58 | 142.3 | 58n109 |
| 107.11 | 298n60 | 153 | 302n77 |
| 108.1 | 295n47 | 153.1 | 301n72, 315n122 |
| 110–115 | 297n58 | 160 | 54n83 |
| 111.6 | 298n60 | | |
| 111.13 | 295n47 | <i>Allogenes</i> (NHC XI,3) | |
| 114.9–12 | 297n58 | | 35n10 |

- Apocalypse of Adam* (NHC V,5)
35n10, 112
- 1 Apocalypse of James* (NHC V,3)
27.5–6 54n83
31.2–32.8 23n67, 57n102,
391n40
31.4 57n102
32.8 57n102
- 2 Apocalypse of James* (NHC V,4)
313–314, 322
48.6–9 313
56.15 313
57.10–19 57n102, 252
57.10–14 312, 314n121, 322,
391
57.14–19 314n121
58.20–23 306n94
63.6–11 313
- Apocalypse of Peter* (NHC VII,3)
36n10, 97n40
71.6–29 97n39
75.2–6 96n37
81–83 43n35
81.15–23 56
81.18 459n48
82.9–14 459n48
82.18–19 53n78
82.20–83.15 53n78
82.21–83.8 97
82.21–26 458n48
83.15–26 53n78
83.26–84.5 53n78
- Apocalypse of Saint John the Theologian*
263–264n115
- Apocryphon of James* (NHC I,2)
352n103
1–2 49n66, 127–128n148,
230n160
2.17–24 115n103, 128n148
2.33–39 115n103, 128n148
3.17–24 180n147
12.35–13.1 180n147
- Apocryphon of John* (NHC II,1; III,1;
IV,1; BG 8502,2)
34n5, 35n10, 38, 112,
127, 187–194, 195,
198n52, 199n55, 204,
205n75, 208, 223,
230, 231, 233, 289,
369n167
1.18–29 (NHC II) 189n13
1.30–2.9 (NHC II) 347
2.9–10 (NHC II) 190
2.9 (NHC II) 191n17
2.10 (NHC II) 190n17
21.10 (NHC II) 54n83, 192
26.31–32 (NHC II) 54n83, 192
27.20–21 (NHC II) 54n83
31.4 (NHC II) 54n83, 192
31.27–31 (NHC II) 188n8
20.21–21.21 (NHC III)
56n99
36.3–4 (NHC III) 192
39.15–18 (NHC III)
188n8
40.6–9 (NHC III) 193n34
3.2 (NHC IV) 198n50, 225n147
9.14–17 (BG) 190n17
19.6–20.3 (BG) 193
20.3–4 (BG) 347n80
20.4–21.16 (BG) 193
20.4–19 (BG) 189n13
20.5 (BG) 189n12
20.15 (BG) 190n17
21.13–16 (BG) 193n27
21.15 (BG) 198n50, 225n147
21.18–19 (BG) 191
21.20–22.16 (BG) 193
34.14 (BG) 193
36.16 (BG) 193
38.6–45.18 (BG) 193
44.19–46.16 (BG) 193
46.19–47.14 (BG) 193
68.1–12 (BG) 192
69.15–17 (BG) 192n24
75.14–77.5 (BG) 193
75.15–77.5 (BG) 193n28
75.15–20 (BG) 188n8
77.1 (BG) 194

| | | | |
|------------------------------------|----------------------|-----------|-----------------------|
| <i>Apostolic Constitutions</i> | | 1.5 | 355n113 |
| 6.15 | 337 | 2.2 | 355n113 |
| 8.1–2 | 337 | 3.2 | 355n113 |
| | | 3.10–13 | 365n153 |
| <i>Ascension of Isaiah</i> | | 3.10–11 | 464n64 |
| | 40n24 | 3.10 | 355n113 |
| | | 4.1–4 | 355n113 |
| <i>Book of Baruch</i> | 115n101, 121n124 | 4.1 | 355n113 |
| | | 5.10–12 | 333n30 |
| <i>Book of Thomas</i> (NHC II,7) | | 5.14 | 366n158 |
| 143.8–16 | 54n83 | 5.15 | 366n158 |
| | | 5.22 | 355n113 |
| 3 <i>Corinthians</i> | | 6.3 | 355n113 |
| | 60, 171–176, 184, | 7.1–2 | 355n113 |
| | 185, 385n13, 385n15, | 7.1 | 353n105, 354n110 |
| | 386–387 | 9–12 | 355n113 |
| 1 | 171 | 9–11 | 363 |
| 1.1 | 173 | 9.1 | 355n113 |
| 2 | 171 | 9.3 | 365n154 |
| 2.4–6 | 172, 385 | 9.14–15 | 354n109 |
| 2.4 | 176 | 10–11 | 359 |
| 2.5 | 174n128 | 10.1–2 | 360 |
| 2.6 | 173, 175 | 10.1 | 365, 366n158 |
| 2.13 | 174n128 | 10.2 | 360n132 |
| 2.24–32 | 172–173, 388n28 | 10.3–5 | 361 |
| 2.24–26 | 385n15 | 10.3 | 360, 361n134, |
| 2.24–25 | 175 | | 361n135 |
| 2.32 | 174–175 | 10.4–6 | 360 |
| | | 10.4 | 365, 366 |
| <i>Corpus Hermeticum</i> | | 10.5–6 | 363 |
| 16.13 | 95 | 10.5 | 351, 360n131, 362, |
| | | | 366 |
| <i>Didascalia Apostolorum</i> | | 10.6 | 351 |
| 5.14 | 366n158 | 10.7–9 | 367 |
| 5.15 | 366n158 | 10.7 | 360 |
| 21 | 337 | 10.8–9 | 360 |
| 23 | 337 | 10.8 | 351, 360, 361, 362, |
| | | | 363, 365n154, 366 |
| <i>Doctrina Petri</i> | 93, 94n28, 141n23 | 11–12 | 8n20, 395 |
| | | 11.1–3 | 360 |
| <i>Epistles of Paul and Seneca</i> | | 11.1 | 366n158 |
| 13 | 147n37 | 11.2–12.2 | 367 |
| | | 11.2–6 | 64n128 |
| <i>Epistula Apostolorum</i> | | 11.2 | 368, 381 |
| | 32, 60, 183n154, | | |
| | 289n12, 326n3, 350, | 11.3 | 351, 368, 372, 449n10 |
| | 351–375, 381, | 11.4–6 | 360 |
| | 386n18, 388 | 11.4–5 | 368 |
| 1.1 | 355n113 | 11.4 | 366 |

| | | | |
|-----------|---|-----------------|---|
| 11.5–6 | 191n17, 228n155, 369 | 41 | 364n149 |
| 11.5 | 271, 351, 357, 357n122 | 41.4–42.4 42 | 358n125 364n149 |
| 11.6 | 351, 366, 373, 385 | 43.5 | 366n158 |
| 11.7–12.2 | 371 | 50.6 | 353n105 |
| 11.7–8 | 370, 372 | 51 | 364n149 |
| 11.7 | 272, 357, 371, 372n174 | 51.1–2 51.4 | 365n153 363n148 |
| 11.8 | 372 | | |
| 12.1–2 | 255 | | <i>Eugnostos the Blessed</i> (NHC III,3; V,1) |
| 12.1 | 70n147, 253, 269, 273, 279n156, 385, 389, 393 | | 35n10 |
| 12.2 | 351, 356, 369, 373 | | <i>Excerpt from the Perfect Discourse</i> (NHC VI,8) |
| 12.46 | 71 | 65.32–66 | 70n146 |
| 13 | 355n111, 355n113 | 66.1–13 | 58n109 |
| 14.1–6 | 355n113 | 77.31–32 | 70n146 |
| 14.6 | 174n128 | | |
| 14.8 | 365n153 | | <i>Gospel of the Egyptians</i> (NHC III,2; IV,2) |
| 16.1–17.4 | 358n125 | | 35n10 |
| 19 | 364n149 | | |
| 19.14 | 370n170, 411n7 | | <i>Gospel of the Hebrews</i> |
| 19.17 | 264n117 | | 93, 102–103, 141n23, |
| 19.18 | 365n153 | | 324n156, 400n78 |
| 21 | 454n32 | | |
| 21.1–3 | 357, 365n153 | | <i>Gospel of Judas</i> (Tchacos 3) |
| 21.6–8 | 357 | | 35n10 |
| 21.6–7 | 357 | | |
| 21.8 | 357n121 | | <i>Gospel of Mary</i> (BG 8502,1; P.Oxy. 3525; P.Ryl. 463) |
| 23.2 | 273n140, 279n156 | | 38, 50n68, 194–203, 208, 209n91, 232–233 |
| 23.3 | 279n156 | | |
| 24.3 | 357, 373 | | |
| 24.4 | 356, 358 | 8.14–15 (BG) | 196 |
| 25.2 | 357, 358 | 8.15–21 (BG) | 197n48 |
| 25.2–3 | 358 | 8.21–9.4 (BG) | 197 |
| 26.1 | 355n113 | 9.7–12 (BG) | 197 |
| 29.5–6 | 358n125 | 9.14–17 (BG) | 190n17, 198, 225n147, 228n155 |
| 29.7–30.5 | 358n125 | | |
| 30.1–2 | 364 | 9.14 (BG) | 202n67 |
| 30.1 | 364 | 9.20–24 (BG) | 198 |
| 30.2–3 | 364 | 10.4–13 (BG) | 201 |
| 30.3–5 | 364 | 10.4–5 (BG) | 201n60 |
| 30.3 | 364 | 10.10–11 (BG) | 202 |
| 31.1–33.7 | 354n109 | 10.14–15 (BG) | 199 |
| 31.7 | 354n109 | 17.7–15 (BG) | 201 |
| 33.4 | 354n109 | 17.15 (BG) | 201n63 |
| 36.8–9 | 71, 356 | 18.1 (BG) | 202n67 |
| 36.9 | 356 | 18.6–10 (BG) | 203n71 |
| 39.12 | 365n153 | line 8 (P.Oxy.) | 197 |

- lines 10–11 (P.Oxy.)
 190n17, 198,
 225n147, 228n155
- line 18 (P.Oxy.) 200, 201n60
- line 19 (P.Oxy.) 200
- lines 9–11, recto (P.Ryl.)
 200–201
- Gospel of Peter* 42n34
- 4.10 43n34
- 5.19 43n34
- 6.21 43n34
- 6.24 43n34
- 9.34–10.42 43n34
- 9.35–10.4 43n34
- 10.39–40 305n92
- 13.56 43n34
- Gospel of Philip* (NHC II,3)
- 53.23–35 57n101
- 53.34–26 224n144
- 55.19–22 58n109, 214n108
- 55.23–36 114n99
- 56.15–19 57n101
- 57.29–58.2 302n77
- 67.27–28 49n66
- 68.26–29 43n34
- 68.26–28 53n77
- Gospel of the Savior*
- 67–68 348
- 68 302n77
- Gospel of Thomas* 9n24
- 2 324n156
- 35 92n23
- 75 214n108
- Gospel of Truth* (NHC I,3; XII,2) 50
- 18.22–24 121n122
- 29.1–5 223n141
- 30.27–31.8 57n100
- 31.1–12 463n59
- 56.24–58.17 306n94
- Heracleon
- Commentary on John*
 38, 50, 58n109,
 59n110, 140n21, 180,
 214n108, 216–219,
 220n131, 221–222,
 225n148, 229n156,
 281n160, 430n82
- Hypostasis of the Archons* (NHC II,4)
 35n10, 112
- Hypsiphron* (NHC XI,4)
 35n10
- Interpretation of Knowledge* (NHC XI,1)
- 1.24–2.20 70n146
- 6.28–29 54n83
- 10.34–37 430n82
- Letter of Peter to Philip* (NHC VIII,2)
- 35n10, 38, 204–210,
 232
- 132.16–21 206n79
- 132.22 208n90
- 133.1–5 206
- 133.7–8 205
- 133.14–17 206
- 133.17 205
- 134.8–9 206
- 134.10 206
- 134.13–17 206
- 134.13 206
- 134.17–18 206
- 134.23–26 208
- 135.5–8 207
- 135.5–6 207n83
- 135.7–8 208
- 137.4–13 208
- 137.13–17 455n37
- 137.19 205
- 137.25–29 208n90
- 138.2–10 56n99, 209–210, 455
- 138.3 205
- 138.6–7 210
- 138.11–13 208n90
- 138.15–20 205n76
- 139.4–6 209n93

- | | | | |
|---|--|---|---|
| 139.11 | 205 | <i>Pseudo-Clementine Recognitions</i> | |
| 139.18–23 | 204n75 | 3.30 | 261n107, 263n115, |
| 139.21–22 | 205 | | 451 |
| 8.2–7 (Tchacos 1) | 205n76 | | |
| <i>Manichaeen Psalm-Book, Part II</i> | | | |
| 187 | 199n57, 202n67, | | 36n10, 120n121 |
| | 335n37 | 51.20–52.3 | 41n29, 43 |
| 196 | 54n81 | 55–56 | 241n24 |
| | | 55.18–20 | 54n81 |
| <i>Marsanes</i> (NHC X) | | 55.18–19 | 43 |
| | 35n10 | 55.30–56.32 | 41n29 |
| <i>Martyrdom of Philip</i> | | 55.30–56.19 | 54n81 |
| 40 | 347 | 56.14–19 | 43 |
| <i>Melchizedek</i> (NHC IX,1) | | | |
| | 35n10 | | |
| 6.28–7.3 | 70n146 | <i>Sophia of Jesus Christ</i> (NHC III,4; BG 3; P.Oxy. 1881) | 35n10, 195 |
| | | 91.10–13 (NHC III) | |
| <i>On the Origin of the World</i> (NHC II,5; XIII,2) | | | 55n89, 56n99, 267n126, 347, 348, 457n41 |
| | 35n10, 112 | 98.14–99 (NHC III) | |
| 114.23 | 54n83 | | 347n81 |
| <i>Preaching of Peter</i> | | | |
| | 60, 94n28, 140–151, | 89.6–91.9 (BG) | 347n81 |
| | 184, 326n3, 337 | lines 29–44 (POxy) | 347n81 |
| frags. 1–5 | 141 | | |
| frag. 2 | 150n50 | <i>Teachings of Silvanus</i> (NHC VII,4) | |
| frag. 6 | 142, 143, 150 | 92.15–33 | 211n97 |
| frag. 7 | 71, 142n26, 143, 147– 149, 151n51 | <i>Testimony of Truth</i> (NHC IX,3) | |
| frag. 8 | 141, 142n29 | | 232–233n162 |
| frag. 9 | 90n18, 91n21, 141, 143–147, 150, 151, 155n68, 185, 413 | 29.6–24 | 410n4 |
| | | 33.10–14 | 45–46n48 |
| frag. 10 | 141 | 33.20–34.1 | 233n162 |
| | | 33.20 | 58n109 |
| <i>Protevangeliium of James</i> | | | |
| | | 34.25–26 | 466 |
| 19.3–20.1 | 70n145, 307, 356n116, 393 | 35.20–26 | 233n162 |
| | | 36.3–7 | 233n162 |
| | | 36.23–26 | 233n162 |
| | | 36.29–37 | 54 |
| <i>Pseudo-Clementine Epistle of James</i> | | 37.5–9 | 233n162 |
| 11.1–2 | 74n163 | 49.7–10 | 71 |
| | | 58 | 354n110 |
| <i>Pseudo-Clementine Homilies</i> | | | |
| 17.16 | 261n107, 263n115, 451 | <i>Thought of Norea</i> (NHC IX,2) | 35n10 |

| | | | | |
|---|------------------------------|--------|--|--|
| <i>Three Forms</i> (NHC XIII,1) | 50.12–18 | 455n35 | <i>Trimorphic Protennoia</i> (NHC XIII) | 35n10 |
| <i>Three Steles of Seth</i> (NHC VII,5) | 35n10 | | <i>Tripartite Tractate</i> (NHC I,5) | 38, 215, 220–226, 18.14–21 222 77.11–21 222 77.26–27 222 110.23 224n144 115.33–118.14 224n144 115.33–116.7 224n144 116.8–9 224n144 116.9–117.36 224n144 116.13–20 193n33, 224n144 117.36–118.14 224n144 118.14–122.12 224n144 118.24–119.2 214n108, 220 118.35 224n144 118.37–119.2 225 118.38–119.2 224 119.3 224n144 119.18–20 221 119.20–122.12 223 119.28–120.11 193n33, 224n144 120.9–11 224 122.5–9 224n144 127.25–128.15 225n145 128.1 225 128.5–9 225, 281n160 128.6–10 225 128.9 225, 228n155, 229n156 |
| <i>Thunder</i> (NHC VI,2) | 35n10 | | <i>A Valentinian Exposition</i> (NHC IX,2) | 30.20 118n112 |
| <i>Treatise on the Resurrection</i> (NHC I,4) | 38, 211–215 | | <i>Zostrianus</i> (NHC VIII,1) | 35n10 |
| 19.6 | 213 | | | |
| 44.6–10 | 64n128, 215, 221 | | | |
| 44.8–10 | 58n109, 213n108 | | | |
| 44.14–15 | 213 | | | |
| 44.25 | 213 | | | |
| 44.30–33 | 212n101 | | | |
| 45.14–46.2 | 261n107 | | | |
| 45.25–29 | 212 | | | |
| 45.29–40 | 212 | | | |
| 45.39–46.7 | 64n128, 215 | | | |
| 45.39–46.2 | 46n48 | | | |
| 46.3–7 | 221 | | | |
| 46.27–42 | 215 | | | |
| 46.35–47.1 | 212n101 | | | |
| 47.1–3 | 64n128, 213 | | | |
| 47.30–48.3 | 64n128, 168n108, 212, 213 | | | |
| 47.36–37 | 214 | | | |
| 47.38–48.3 | 214 | | | |
| 48.3–6 | 57n101 | | | |
| 48.4–11 | 214n108 | | | |
| 48.10–15 | 213, 261n107 | | | |
| 48.10–11 | 214 | | | |
| 49.4–5 | 212n101 | | | |
| 49.15–24 | 212 | | | |
| 55.1–10 | 213 | | | |

Other Early Christian Literature

| | | |
|----------------------------|--------|--|
| <i>Adamantius Dialogue</i> | 5.4–12 | 40n24, 55n89, 240n21, 254n84, 266n125, 451n19, 457n41 |
| 1.6–8 | 238n15 | |
| 2.19 | 349 | |
| 4.17–5.1 | 56n98 | |
| 5.1 | 266 | 5.4–5 300 |
| 5.3 | 251n73 | 5.6 42n34, 253, 255, 267, 389 |

| | | | |
|--|----------------------|------------------|--------------------------------------|
| 5.12 | 214n109, 248, 251n73 | 102.2 | 181n151, 412n12, 451n19 |
| Ambrose | | | |
| <i>De fide</i> | | | |
| 2.145 | 337 | <i>Homilies</i> | |
| 2.151 | 337 | 242.12 | 422n48 |
| <i>De Spiritu Sancto</i> | | | |
| 1.86 | 337 | <i>Sermons</i> | |
| <i>Expositio Evangelii secundum Lucam</i> | | | |
| 10.169–179 | 382n10 | 145A | 424n61 |
| 10.179 | 382n10, 423n58 | 242.6 | 454n32 |
| <i>Tractates on the Gospel of John</i> | | | |
| Aphraates | | | |
| <i>Homilies</i> | | | |
| 1.17 | 337, 338 | 21.13.2–24 | 454n32 |
| Arabic Harmony | | | |
| 54.6 | 338–340, 396 | 121.5 | 392n47 |
| 55.1–3 | 339 | <i>Barnabas</i> | |
| Aristides | | | |
| <i>Apology</i> | | | |
| 141n21 | | 10.12 | 410n4 |
| Arnobius | | | |
| <i>Adversus nationes</i> | | | |
| 1.43 | 159n81 | <i>I Clement</i> | |
| Athenagoras | | | |
| <i>A Plea for the Christians</i> | | | |
| 10.2–3 | 165n98 | 5.1–5 | 134–140, 178n139 |
| 11.2 | 165n98 | 5.1–2 | 138 |
| 11.4 | 165n98 | 10.7 | 12 |
| 12.3 | 164n97 | 10.7 | 138 |
| <i>On the Resurrection</i> see [Ps.-]Athenagoras | | | |
| Augustine | | | |
| <i>Against Faustus the Manichaeus</i> | | | |
| 16.8 | 336n42 | 11.2 | 72, 139, 140 |
| 16.33 | 336n42 | 12.1 | 138 |
| <i>Epistles</i> | | | |
| 102.2–7 | 56n99, 267n126 | 12.8 | 138 |
| Barnabas | | | |
| <i>I Clement</i> | | | |
| Athenagoras | | | |
| <i>A Plea for the Christians</i> | | | |
| 10.2–3 | 165n98 | 17.5 | 138 |
| 11.2 | 165n98 | 23–27 | 135 |
| 11.4 | 165n98 | 23.2–3 | 72 |
| 12.3 | 164n97 | 23.2 | 135 |
| <i>On the Resurrection</i> see [Ps.-]Athenagoras | | | |
| Augustine | | | |
| <i>Against Faustus the Manichaeus</i> | | | |
| 16.8 | 336n42 | 23.3–24.1 | 135n6 |
| 16.33 | 336n42 | 23.3–4 | 135, 139 |
| <i>Epistles</i> | | | |
| 102.2–7 | 56n99, 267n126 | 23.3 | 135, 140 |
| Athenagoras | | | |
| <i>A Plea for the Christians</i> | | | |
| 10.2–3 | 165n98 | 24–27 | 135, 136, 139, 161 |
| 11.2 | 165n98 | 24.1 | 136, 139, 161, 173n124 |
| 11.4 | 165n98 | 24.3–4 | 75 |
| 12.3 | 164n97 | 24.4–5 | 173n124 |
| <i>On the Resurrection</i> see [Ps.-]Athenagoras | | | |
| Augustine | | | |
| <i>Against Faustus the Manichaeus</i> | | | |
| 16.8 | 336n42 | 26.1 | 138, 139 |
| 16.33 | 336n42 | 26.2–3 | 173n124 |
| <i>Epistles</i> | | | |
| 102.2–7 | 56n99, 267n126 | 27.5 | 140 |
| Athenagoras | | | |
| <i>A Plea for the Christians</i> | | | |
| 10.2–3 | 165n98 | 28 | 135 |
| 11.2 | 165n98 | 42 | 135, 136, 137n12, 157n73, 229n157 |
| 11.4 | 165n98 | 42.1 | 137n12 |
| 12.3 | 164n97 | 42.2 | 138 |
| <i>On the Resurrection</i> see [Ps.-]Athenagoras | | | |
| Augustine | | | |
| <i>Against Faustus the Manichaeus</i> | | | |
| 16.8 | 336n42 | 42.3 | 135n6, 139, 413 |
| 16.33 | 336n42 | 42.4 | 138n15 |
| <i>Epistles</i> | | | |
| 102.2–7 | 56n99, 267n126 | 42.5 | 138 |
| Athenagoras | | | |
| <i>A Plea for the Christians</i> | | | |
| 10.2–3 | 165n98 | 43.1 | 138 |
| 11.2 | 165n98 | 46.9 | 135 |
| 11.4 | 165n98 | | |
| 12.3 | 164n97 | | |

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 50.2–4 | 135 | <i>Extracts from the Prophets</i> | |
| 55.6 | 138 | 28 | 34n7 |
| <i>2 Clement</i> | | <i>Miscellanies</i> | |
| 9.1–4 | 135n5 | 1.18 [88.7–8] | 75n170 |
| 11–12 | 135n4 | 1.21 [146.1–3] | 120n121 |
| 11.1–2 | 64n128, 72 | 2.3 [10.2] | 216n117, 220n131, 228n156 |
| 11.2 | 140n18 | 2.9 [45.4] | 324 |
| 11.2–3 | 75 | 2.11 [51.3] | 223n141 |
| 19.2 | 74 | 2.11 [52.2] | 354n110 |
| Clement of Alexandria | | 2.11 [54.4] | 34n7 |
| <i>Adumbrations</i> | | 2.20 [117.5–6] | 34n7 |
| 321, 323–324 | | 3.3 [12.1–24.3] | 252n78 |
| 3 | 70n145 | 3.4 [26.3] | 323, 324 |
| <i>Christ the Educator</i> | | 3.4 [30.1–5] | 49n62 |
| 2.1 | 255 | 3.4 [30.1] | 34n7, 36n10 |
| <i>Excerpts from Theodotus</i> | | 3.7 [59.3–4] | 323 |
| 1 | 462n58 | 3.7 [59.3] | 47n57, 401n85 |
| 1.1 | 46n49, 121n124 | 3.7 [59.4] | 318n136 |
| 7 | 230n159, 269n136 | 3.12 [87.1, 3] | 270n137 |
| 9 | 214n108, 216n117, 218n124, 220n131, 229n156 | 3.13 [91.1] | 42n34, 233n162 |
| 13 | 466n70 | 3.13 [92.1] | 42n34, 233n162 |
| 23 | 52n71 | 3.14 [95.3] | 270n137 |
| 25–28 | 59n110 | 3.17 [102.1–104.2] | 42n34 |
| 48.2–3 | 223n140 | 3.17 [102.3] | 42n34, 45, 47, 48n57, 401n85 |
| 54–55 | 211n96 | 3.17 [108.1] | 324n155 |
| 55.1 | 262n109 | 3.18 [109.2] | 34n7 |
| 56 | 211n97, 211n99 | 4.6 [35.2] | 323n154 |
| 56–58 | 58n109 | 4.9 [71.1–75.4] | 323 |
| 58 | 214n108 | 4.9 [71.1] | 216n114 |
| 59 | 23n67, 45n43, 45n44, 56n100, 390n39 | 4.12 [83.1] | 41n29 |
| 59.1–62.3 | 115 | 4.13 [89.4] | 121n122 |
| 60.1 | 114n99, 131n157, 446n4 | 4.22 [136.5] | 220n131 |
| 61 | 46n49 | 4.25 [157.1–3] | 64n128 |
| 61.3 | 429 | 4.25 [157.2–3] | 140n19 |
| 62 | 45 | 6.5 [43.3] | 142 |
| 62.2 | 430 | 6.6 [48.1–2] | 71n151, 147 |
| 66 | 49n66 | 6.6 [53.2–3] | 96 |
| 74 | 230n159, 446n3 | 6.15 [127.2] | 147n38 |
| <i>Exhortation to the Greeks</i> | | 6.15 [127.5] | 147n38 |
| 1 | 76n173 | 6.15 [128.1–2] | 90n18, 143 |
| 2.27.2.6 | 71 | 7.2 [11.2] | 71n152 |
| | | 7.13 [82.1] | 323–324 |
| | | 7.16 [94.1–105.5] | 49n62, 179n142, 438n3 |
| | | 7.17 [108.1–2] | 323 |
| | | 29.9 [145.4] | 323 |

| | | | |
|---|---|-------------------------------|----------------------|
| | | 23.1.10 | 40n23, 40n24, 241n24 |
| Codex Fuldensis | 338–340 | 24.3.1 | 304n86, 348n83 |
| Cyprian | | 24.3.2–3 | 348n86 |
| <i>Sententiae Episcoporum de haereticis baptizandis</i> | | 24.3.10 | 372n175 |
| 37 | 337 | 25 | 35n10 |
| | | 26 | 35n10 |
| | | 26.10.5 | 40n24 |
| | | 28 | 354n110 |
| Cyril of Alexandria | | 30.3.2 | 266n124, 305n92 |
| <i>Commentary on John</i> | | 30.3.3–6 | 266n124 |
| 12.1 | 346n78, 393n55 | 30.3.6 | 87n6 |
| <i>Commentary on Luke</i> | | 30.17.5–7 | 266n124 |
| | 278n154 | 30.27.14–16 | 462n58 |
| | | 30.28.2 | 40n24 |
| | | 30.34.6 | 42n33 |
| Didymus | | 31.7.4 | 44n40 |
| <i>De Trinitate</i> | | 31.7.6 | 212n104 |
| 2.12 | 337 | 31.7.10 | 47n54 |
| | | 37 | 109n81 |
| | | 37.7.1–6 | 130n152 |
| Ephrem of Syria | | 39 | 35n10 |
| <i>Commentary on the Diatessaron</i> | | 40 | 35n10 |
| 11.5 | 337 | 40.8.2 | 40n24 |
| 14.5–9 | 244n38 | 41.1.7 | 40n24 |
| 19.5 | 337, 338n54 | 42.9–12 | 235n4 |
| 21.3 | 55n89, 240n21, 254n84, 266n125, 400n82, 402n88, 457n41 | 42.11.17 Elenchus 4 | 241n25 |
| | | 42.11.17 Scholion 19 | 244 |
| | | 42.11.17 Scholion 32 | 244n38 |
| <i>Hymns against Heresies</i> | | 42.11.17 Scholion 76 | 240n21, 244n38 |
| 36.12–13 | 254, 400n82, 402, 412n12, 437 | 42.11.17 Elenchus 78 | 250n64 |
| <i>Prose Refutations</i> | | 51.20.3 | 355n113 |
| 16–24 | 455n35, 455n36 | 54.1.3–8 | 459n50 |
| 81 | 241n25, 455n35, 455n36 | 62.6.7 | 337 |
| | | 64.64.7 | 250n64 |
| Epiphanius | | | |
| <i>Refutation of All Heresies</i> | | Eusebius | |
| De Incarnatione 3.4–5 | | <i>Chronicle</i> | |
| | 56n99, 267n126 | 2.276 | 83n1 |
| 3.6.3 | 337 | <i>Commentary on Isaiah</i> | |
| 20.17.5–7 | 305n92 | 310.14 | 338n50 |
| 21.1.3 | 40n24, 355n112 | <i>Ecclesiastical History</i> | |
| 21.2.4 | 56n95 | 2.23.9 | 68n141 |
| 21.3.1 | 56n95 | | |
| 21.214 | 116n106 | | |

- 3.4.8–9 135n3
 3.15.1–3.16.1 135n3
 3.24.5–13 326n3
 3.27.2–3 459n50
 3.28.2 390n37
 3.31–32 84n1
 3.32 83n1
 3.36.2–15 83n1
 3.36.11 94n29
 3.39.14–16 326n3
 3.39.15–16 118n111
 4.3.2 159n78
 4.7.9 96
 4.7.10 96n37
 4.11.8–9 257n92
 4.18.6 259n97
 4.18.7 263n112
 4.20.1 160
 4.22.1–3 135n3
 4.23.11 135n3
 5.1–63 429n81
 5.18.14 143n31
 5.22 429n81
 5.28 459n50
 6.12.6 42n34
 6.14.5–7 326n3
 6.14.7 426n67
- Ecclesiastical Theology*
 2.27.14–16 428n76
- To Marinus*
 1.1–2 337
 Suppl. 9 421–422n48
- Eutherius of Tyana
Confutationes quarundam propositionum
 15 266n125
- Eznik of Kolb
On God
 358 455n35, 455n36
 404 241–242n26
 407–415 255n86
- Freer Logion 334–335, 338, 410n4
- Gregory
Homilies on the Gospels
 424n61
- Hegemonius
Acta Archelai
 67.4–5 120n121
- Hesychius
Collectio Difficultatum et Solutionum
 52 338n50
- Hippolytus
Against Noetus
 18 337, 382n10
- The Apostolic Tradition*
 32.1 337
- Refutation of All Heresies*
 5.1–5 50n68
 5.2 34n7, 36n10
 5.6.4 36n10
 5.7.32 464n62
 5.8.1 49n65
 5.8.11 466n70
 5.8.18–24 262n107, 458n47
 5.8.18 454n32
 5.8.29–30 53n78
 5.8.29 36n10, 49n66
 5.10.2 49n66, 111n90,
 458n47
 5.11.1 36n10
 5.23.3 36n10
 5.26.29 115n101
 5.26.32 121n124
 5.27.2–3 211n96
 5.28.1 36n10
 6.19.3 56n95
 6.19.6 40n24, 355n112
 6.35.2–7 114n99, 131n157,
 446n4
 6.35.5–7 46
 6.35.7 44n39
 6.37.7 110n87
 6.42.2–8 111n87
 7.14–27 41n29
 7.20.1 324n155

| | | | |
|--|---------------------|---------------------------------|------------------------|
| 7.26.8–7.27.13 | 120n121, 438n3, 446 | 5.2 | 89 |
| 7.26.8–9 | 114n99, 131n157 | 8.2 | 90n17, 91n20, 95, |
| 7.26.8 | 53n76, 126n144 | | 105n70 |
| 7.28.1–5 | 40n24 | 9.1 | 89 |
| 7.28.4–5 | 40n23 | 9.2 | 90 |
| 7.30.1 | 349n92 | | |
| 7.35 | 459n50 | | |
| 7.35.1–2 | 126n145 | | |
| 7.38.4–5 | 277n151, 455n35, | | |
| | 455n36 | | |
| 8.3 | 49n66 | | |
| 8.8.1–8 | 36n10 | | |
| 8.8.2 | 42 | | |
| 8.9.2 | 42n34 | | |
| 8.10.6–11 | 438n3, 446 | | |
| 8.10.6–7 | 131n157 | | |
| 8.10.7 | 53n76, 126n144 | | |
| 8.11.1 | 42 | | |
| 9.15.2 | 52n70 | | |
| 10.19.3–4 | 241n25 | | |
| 10.19.3 | 40n23 | | |
| <i>De resurrectione ad Mammaeam imperatricem</i> | | | |
| lines 2–7 | 464n62 | | |
| <i>On the Song of Songs</i> | | | |
| 25.6–10 | 367 | | |
| 25.8–9 | 367 | | |
| Ignatius of Antioch | | | |
| <i>Letter to the Ephesians</i> | | | |
| | 86n4, 86n6 | | |
| 7.2 | 100n51, 385n15 | | |
| 8.2 | 100n51 | | |
| 10.3 | 100n51 | | |
| <i>Letter to the Magnesians</i> | | | |
| 1.2 | 100n51, 385n15 | | |
| 6.1 | 107n74 | | |
| 8–11 | 40n24 | | |
| 8.1–9.2 | 413n14 | | |
| 8.2 | 89 | | |
| 9.2 | 89 | | |
| 11.1 | 86n6, 91n20, 106 | | |
| 13.1 | 100n51 | | |
| 13.2 | 100n51 | | |
| <i>Letter to the Philadelphians</i> | | | |
| 4.1 | 385n15 | | |
| | | 5.2 | 89 |
| | | 8.2 | 90n17, 91n20, 95, |
| | | | 105n70 |
| | | 9.1 | 89 |
| | | 9.2 | 90 |
| | | <i>Letter to Polycarp</i> | |
| | | 1.2 | 100n51 |
| | | 2.2 | 100n51 |
| | | 3.2 | 85n2 |
| | | 5.1 | 100n51 |
| | | <i>Letter to the Romans</i> | |
| | | 5.1 | 83 |
| | | 5.2 | 107n75 |
| | | 10.3 | 83 |
| | | inscr. | 100n51 |
| | | <i>Letter to the Smyrnaeans</i> | |
| | | | 83-108, 289, 452n23 |
| | | 1.1 | 100n51 |
| | | 1.1–2 | 86n6, 106, 385n15 |
| | | 2 | 56n98 |
| | | 2–7 | 86n6 |
| | | 2–6 | 40n24 |
| | | 2–4 | 135n5 |
| | | 2–3 | 96 |
| | | 2.1–3.2 | 314 |
| | | 2.1 | 76, 86, 91, 95, 96, |
| | | | 106, 241n24 |
| | | 3–5 | 83–108, 234 |
| | | 3 | 4, 6, 48, 105n70, 108, |
| | | | 252n73 |
| | | 3 (longer recension) | 94, 454 |
| | | 3.1–5.1 | 88 |
| | | 3.1–3 | 87 |
| | | 3.1 | 89, 104, 384 |
| | | 3.2–3 | 104n67, 275, 278, |
| | | | 449n10 |
| | | 3.2 | 2, 4–5, 8n20, 20, 87, |
| | | | 88, 89, 92, 93, 95, |
| | | | 100, 102, 103, |
| | | | 141n23, 199, 251, |
| | | | 255, 284, 311n113, |
| | | | 381, 384, 389, 390, |
| | | | 395 |
| | | 3.3–4.2 | 401 |

| | | | |
|--------------------------------|---|------------------------------|---|
| 3.3 | 2, 88–89, 100, 103, 105, 284, 318n136, 384, 402, 415n18 | 1.5.5 1.6.1 | 262n109 23n67, 44n40, 45n43, 56n100, 85n2, 211n98, 217n119, 229n156, 390n39 |
| 4.1–2 | 89 | | 211n98, 217n119, 229n156, 390n39 |
| 4.1 | 56n99, 92n23, 451n19 | | 229n156, 390n39 |
| 4.2 | 95, 105, 402, 412n12, 437 | 1.6.1–2 1.6.2 | 58n109, 220n131 224n144, 228n156, 229n156 |
| 5.1–3 | 91 | | 229n156 |
| 5.1 | 89–91, 105n70, 107, 413n14 | 1.7.2 | 44n40, 45n42, 46n49, 49n66 |
| 5.2 | 86, 87n6, 97n39, 452n23 | 1.7.5–1.8.1 1.8.1–1.9.4 | 223 49n62 |
| 5.3 | 70n147, 86, 92, 106 | 1.8.1–2 | 49n66 |
| 6.2 | 59n112, 93n26, 97n39, 315, 465n68 | 1.8.1 1.8.2 | 49n63, 49n65, 50 53n77 |
| 7.2 | 90, 413n14 | 1.8.3–4 | 217n118 |
| 8.1 | 107n74 | 1.8.5 | 230n159, 462n57, 462n58, 464 |
| 8.2 | 58n107 | | 462n58, 464 |
| 12.1 | 100 | 1.9.3 | 23n67, 45n43, 45n44, 56n100, 390n39, 462n58 |
| 12.2 | 100n52, 385n15 | | 56n100, 390n39, 462n58 |
| 13.2 | 100n51 | 1.9.4 | 48n59, 49n61 |
| <i>Letter to the Trallians</i> | | 1.10.1 | 454 |
| 3.1 | 107n74 | 1.10.3 | 58n107 |
| 6–11 | 40n24 | 1.11.1 | 36n12, 36n14, 37n15, 109n83, 110, 111n87, 111n88, 119 |
| 8.1 | 385n15 | | 109n83, 110, 111n87, 111n88, 119 |
| 9.1–11.1 | 77 | | 111n88, 119 |
| 9.1–2 | 86n6 | 1.11.3 | 36n14, 109n83 |
| 9.1 | 318n136 | 1.11.5 | 36n13, 36n14, 37n15, 38, 109n83, 110 |
| 10.1 | 76, 86, 95, 106, 241n24 | 1.13.6 1.15.3 | 166, 180n146 114n99, 131n157, 446n4 |
| 11 (longer recension) | 86n4 | | 114n99, 131n157, 446n4 |
| 12.1 | 100n51 | 1.18.1 | 34n5 |
| 12.2 | 107n74 | 1.18.3 1.20.3 | 166 119n116 |
| <i>Irenaeus</i> | | 1.21.1 | 34n5 |
| <i>Against Heresies</i> | | 1.21.5 | 34n6 |
| | 106, 194n38, 257 | 1.23.1 | 40n24, 241n24, 355n112 |
| 1.1 | 111n87 | | 40n24, 241n24, 355n112 |
| 1.1.3 | 51n70, 118n112, 460n51 | 1.23.2 1.23.3–4 1.23.3 | 56n95 125n141 40n24, 56n98, 304n86, 355n111, 355n112 |
| 1.2.2 | 223n139 | | 40n24, 56n98, 304n86, 355n111, 355n112 |
| 1.2.3 | 223n140 | | 355n112 |
| 1.3.1 | 49n66, 118n112 | 1.23.4 | 354n110 |
| 1.3.2 | 230n160 | 1.23.5–1.28.2 | 125n141 |
| 1.3.6 | 179n142, 438n3 | 1.24 | 35n10 |
| 1.4.1 | 116n106 | 1.24.1–2 | 54n80 |

| | | | |
|-------------|--|--|---|
| 1.24.2 | 40n23, 40n24, 56n97, 91n22 | 1.31 1.31.2 | 35n10 109n80 |
| 1.24.3 | 36n10 | 1.31.3 | 37n15, 109n83, 111 |
| 1.24.4 | 41, 241n24, 348n86, 455n35 | 2.10.2 2.12.1 | 118n112 118n112 |
| 1.24.5 | 54n80 | 2.12.8 | 118n112 |
| 1.24.6 | 58n106 | 2.13.8 | 36n14, 37n15, 109n83, 111 |
| 1.25.1–4 | 54n83 | | |
| 1.25.1 | 42n33 | 2.13.10 | 36n14, 37n15, 109n83, 111 |
| 1.25.2 | 37n15, 166 | | |
| 1.25.3 | 96n37 | 2.14.2 | 50n67 |
| 1.25.6 | 34n7, 36n10 | 2.22.1–6 | 118n112 |
| 1.26.1 | 41n31, 42n33, 54n82, 87n6, 390n37, 451n23 | 2.21.1 2.22.2 | 218n124 174n128 |
| 1.26.2 | 42n33 | 2.23.3–4 | 40n24, 355n112 |
| 1.27.2 | 40n25, 166, 240n22, 242n28, 242n30 | 2.24.4 2.27.2 | 56n97 52n72 |
| 1.27.3 | 40n23, 221, 245n43, 250n60 | 2.32.3–4 | 56n99, 159n78, 169, 277n151, 411n7, 412n12, 413 |
| 1.27.4 | 238n12, 251n72 | | |
| 1.29–31 | 35, 109, 125n141 | 2.32.3 | 166 |
| 1.29–30 | 127, 204 | 2.32.4 | 372n175 |
| 1.29 | 35n10, 119n114, 188 | 2.35.2 | 119 |
| 1.29.1–31.2 | 37n15 | 3.1.1–3.2.1 | 228n155, 229 |
| 1.29.1 | 34n5, 36n14, 109, 353n105 | 3.1.1–2 3.1.1 | 166, 241n26 37n15, 180n146, 227, 229n156, 230 |
| 1.29.4 | 116n106, 119n114 | | |
| 1.30 | 35n10, 38, 42, 44, 109–131, 172n121, 188, 237, 262n107, 355n113, 458n48 | 3.2.1–2 3.2.1 | 239n16, 242n29 49n66, 52, 179n142, 228n155, 231, 239n16, 438n3 |
| 1.30.1–15 | 42n33 | 3.2.2 | 166, 180n146, 197n48, 218n124, 227, 242n28, 242n30 |
| 1.30.1 | 119n114 | | |
| 1.30.10–11 | 119n113 | | |
| 1.30.11 | 114, 116, 129n149 | 3.3.3 | 84n1 |
| 1.30.12–13 | 116 | 3.3.4 | 251n69 |
| 1.30.12 | 115 | 3.4.3 | 111n89, 118 |
| 1.30.13–14 | 124, 167n108, 231 | 3.4.10 | 119n114 |
| 1.30.13 | 117, 119, 120, 122, 166, 168n108, 211n96, 277n151, 355n113, 436 | 3.5.1 3.6.3 3.10.4 3.10.5 | 52n71, 231n160 463n62 118, 119 337n47 |
| 1.30.14 | 49n66, 52n72, 56n99, 117, 123, 127, 128n148, 188, 230n159, 230n160, 458n46 | 3.11.1–3 3.11.1 3.11.2 3.11.3 3.11.7 | 463 464 118, 464 40n23, 44, 54n82 52, 53n77, 54n82 |
| 1.30.15 | 36n12, 36n14, 109n83, 353n105 | 3.11.9 3.12.6 | 50 231n160 |

| | | | |
|----------------|--|---|--|
| 3.12.7 | 37n15, 89n14, 180n146 | 5.26.2 | 36n12, 238n12 |
| 3.12.11 | 49n64 | 5.30.3 | 464 |
| 3.12.12 | 43n34, 52n74, 127, 180n146, 197n48, 231, 235n4, 239n15, 239n17, 239n18, 242n28, 242n30, 447n6 | 5.31.1 | 168n109, 261, 280n159 |
| 3.12.15–3.13.2 | 242n29 | 5.31.1–2 | 167–168 |
| 3.12.15 | 242n28, 242n30 | 5.31.2 | 166, 283n167, 385, 393 |
| 3.13.1–2 | 242n28, 242n30 | 5.32.1 | 261 |
| 3.14.3 | 29, 290n22, 291n28, 293n37 | <i>Demonstration of the Apostolic Preaching</i> | |
| 3.15.1 | 29n78, 29n79 | 1–3 | 170n115, 171 |
| 3.15.2 | 58n109, 59n110, 179n142, 438n3, 457n45 | 1–2 | 170 |
| 3.16.1 | 54n82, 56n98 | 1 | 158n76 |
| 3.16.4 | 166n103 | 3 | 157n74 |
| 3.16.5 | 91n21, 464, 466 | 5 | 116n106 |
| 3.18.6 | 241n25 | 27 | 170n115 |
| 3.18.7 | 45n46 | 35 | 170n115 |
| 3.21.1 | 42n33, 459n50 | 37–39 | 171 |
| 3.21.3 | 269 | 41 | 170n115 |
| 3.22.1 | 44n40, 45n46 | 42 | 159n78, 169n111, 412n9 |
| 3.24.1 | 429n81 | 56 | 170n115 |
| 4.6.1–4.7.4 | 119n116 | 61 | 157n74, 170n115 |
| 4.6.6 | 427n71 | 76 | 156, 157, 158n76, 169–171, 228n155, 369n168, 341 |
| 4.18.1 | 463n62 | 84 | 454n32 |
| 4.20.1 | 116n106 | 86 | 157n74, 170 |
| 4.26.5 | 138n14 | 99 | 170, 171 |
| 4.33.2 | 40n24, 40n26, 45n45, 240n22, 241n25, 241n26, 429n80 | <i>Fragments</i> | |
| 4.33.3 | 457n45, 460n51 | 34 | 174n129 |
| 4.33.4 | 42n33 | 52 | 382n10 |
| 4.33.5 | 241n25 | Jerome | |
| 4.35.1 | 36n12 | <i>Commentary on Isaiah</i> | |
| 4.35.3 | 429 | 18 | 102–103 |
| 5 | 258n83 | <i>Commentary on Matthew</i> | |
| 5.1.2 | 45n46, 56n97, 241n25, 385 | pref. | 465n65 |
| 5.1.3 | 42n33, 459n50, 465 | <i>Epistles</i> | |
| 5.2.3 | 93n26, 166, 385n15, 388 | 121.6.15 | 160n85 |
| 5.3.3 | 385n15 | <i>On Illustrious Men</i> | |
| 5.6.2 | 385n15 | 2 | 400n78 |
| 5.7.1 | 166–168, 385, 393 | 9 | 465n65 |
| | | 16 | 93, 94n29, 103 |
| | | 25 | 160 |

Against the Pelagians, Dialogue III

2.15 338

John Chrysostom

Homilies on John

87 382n10

87.1 393n54

Homilies on Matthew

38 119n116

90.2 443nn13–14

Justin Martyr

Dialogue with Trypho

2–8 259

5–6 259

6.1 259

17.1–2 263

27 74n165

32.3 337n46

35 111n89, 353n105

35.5–6 457–458

35.6 260n103

48.4 459n50, 465n66

49.1 459n50, 465n66

51.2 89n14, 159

53 160

53.5–6 91n21, 151–152, 156–158

55–57 266

57 265n120

67.2 459n50, 465n66

69.5 159

76.6 337n46

80.3 259n95

80.4 260n103

80.5 59n112

81.4 270n137

88 463n62

106 160

106.1 91n21, 152, 154–156, 157, 209, 275n147

106.2 155n67

107–109 155–156

119 156

138.1 337n46

First Apology

19–21 158–160, 283

19 161

19.3–6 412n11

19.3 158

21 161, 457n42

26 353n105

30–31 283

30 159, 411n6, 411n7,

412

31 159

31.7 145n35

33.2 159, 169, 412

45.5 337n46

48.2–3 342n65

50 160, 337n46

50.12 91n21, 151–154, 155,

157

51.6–7 153n62

53.4 263n113

56 354n110

58 353n105

63 91n21

67.8–68.1 153n63

67.8 337n46

On the Resurrection see [Ps.-]Justin

Lactantius

Divine Institutes

4.15.1 159n81

Martyrdom of Polycarp

58n107

16.1 431n88

Minucius Felix

Octavius

11.8–9 158n77

34 136n8

Nemesius of Emesa

On the Nature of Man

38 267n126

| | | | |
|-----------------------|--|---------------------------|--|
| Origen | | 6.24 | 109n81 |
| | | 6.28 | 458n48 |
| <i>Against Celsus</i> | | 6.30 | 458n48 |
| pref. 6 | 282n163 | 6.41 | 58n108 |
| 1.6 | 411n7 | 7.35 | 40n23, 56n99, |
| 1.27 | 151n53 | | 267n126 |
| 1.28 | 160 | 8.3–11 | 58n108 |
| 1.57 | 354n110 | 8.58 | 58n108 |
| 1.68 | 58n108, 411n7 | 24–38 | 35n10 |
| 2.32 | 413n13 | 61–62 | 219n126 |
| 2.33 | 459n50 | | |
| 2.36 | 430 | <i>Commentary on John</i> | |
| 2.49 | 160, 412n12, 459n50 | 2.14.100 | 216n114 |
| 2.54–55 | 413n13 | 5.7 | 238n15 |
| 2.54 | 160 | 6.36 | 135n3 |
| 2.55 | 158n77, 160, 184n155, 366, 411n7, 412n12 | 10.11.48 | 216n116 |
| | | 10.19 | 430n82 |
| 2.56 | 106n73 | 10.27 | 180 |
| 2.59–60 | 366 | 10.33.210–215 | 216n116 |
| 2.59 | 184n155 | 10.33.211 | 216n116 |
| 2.60–61 | 56n99 | 10.43.301–302 | 180n145, 218, 393 |
| 2.61–62 | 267n126 | 13.10.63 | 214n108, 216n117, 220n131, 221, |
| 2.61 | 393n55, 421n44, 451n19 | | 225n148, 229n156, 281n160 |
| 2.62 | 382n10, 413n13 | 13.16.95 | 216n116 |
| 2.63 | 177, 459n50 | 13.17 | 141n23 |
| 2.64 | 302n77 | 13.20.120 | 216n116 |
| 2.69 | 382n10 | 13.25.148 | 216n117 |
| 2.74 | 459n50 | 13.33.187–192 | 216n116 |
| 2.75 | 70n148 | 13.33.187 | 216n116, 216n117 |
| 2.77 | 189n11 | 13.51.341 | 58n109, 59n110, 214n108, 216n116, 216n117, 217n118 |
| 3.1 | 170n116 | | |
| 3.17 | 58n108 | | |
| 3.19 | 58n108 | 13.60.419 | 214n108, 217n119, 221, 229n156 |
| 3.22 | 56n99, 267n126, 451n19 | 13.61.431 | 217n119 |
| 3.26 | 459n50 | 13.74 | 218n123 |
| 3.31–32 | 459n50 | 13.122 | 218n123 |
| 3.37 | 95 | 13.200–201 | 217 |
| 3.41–43 | 459n50 | 13.226 | 217 |
| 3.43 | 413n13 | 13.424 | 217n118 |
| 4.15–16 | 302n77 | 19.27 | 119n116 |
| 4.24 | 95 | 19.89–90 | 217n119 |
| 4.52 | 58n108 | 20.170 | 218n123 |
| 5.53 | 71n153 | 32.170–196 | 78 |
| 5.59–62 | 58n108 | 32.171 | 78 |
| 5.61 | 34n7 | 32.174 | 78, 397n68 |
| 5.62 | 354n110 | | |

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------|--|--|
| <i>Commentary on Matthew</i> | | 18.5 | 164n97, 183n155 |
| 11.6 | 64n126, 78n180, 341n61 | 19.3 | 164n97 |
| 12.37 | 302n77 | Ps.-Justin | |
| <i>First Principles</i> | | <i>Questions and Answers to the Orthodox</i> | |
| pref. 8 | 93 | 128 | 382n10 |
| <i>Fragments on John</i> | | [Ps.-]Justin | |
| 106 | 214n109, 219n126, 393n55 | <i>On the Resurrection</i> | |
| 119.1–8 | 302n77 | | 183n154, 215n110, 234, 257–260, 262n109, 274, 282n162, 283–284, 386 |
| <i>Homilies on Luke</i> | | | |
| 1, frag. 9 | 326n3 | | |
| 6 | 84n1 | | |
| <i>Prayer</i> | | 1.12 | 216n113 |
| 23.2 | 202n68 | 2.1 | 260 |
| | | 2.2 | 260 |
| Persian Gospel Harmony | | 2.3–13 | 260 |
| | 340–341, 396 | 2.9–14 | 264, 387n24, 451n22 |
| | | 2.9–12 | 264 |
| Philastrius of Brescia | | 2.11 | 265, 268 |
| | | 2.13 | 264n116 |
| <i>Diversarum hereseon liber</i> | | 2.14 | 48n58, 56n99, 205n77, 254n84, 260, 261–262n107, 263– 268, 372n175, 402, 412n12, 437, 451n19, 457n41 |
| 1 | 109n81 | | |
| Pionius | | | |
| <i>fragment in ActaSS</i> | | 3.16–4.6 | 267n126 |
| (February 1) 45B | 159n81, 411n7, 412n12 | 3.17 | 270n137 |
| | | 3.18 | 77n177, 280, 281, 394n58 |
| Polycarp | | | |
| <i>Letter to the Philippians</i> | | 4.3 | 267n126 |
| 2.1 | 59n110 | 5.1 | 260, 262 |
| 7.1–2 | 374n180 | 5.2–6.18 | 260 |
| 7.1 | 135n5, 251n69 | 5.2 | 77, 222n134, 260, 280 |
| 7.2 | 59n110 | 5.3 | 280 |
| 13.2 | 314 | 5.4 | 77n177, 280 |
| | | 5.8 | 280 |
| [Ps.-]Athenagoras | | 5.9–10 | 280 |
| <i>On the Resurrection</i> | | 5.11–15 | 216n113 |
| | 164–166 | 5.12 | 77n177, 280 |
| 1 | 75, 165 | 5.15 | 77n177, 280 |
| 1.3 | 165n98 | 5.16 | 76n175, 280 |
| 3.2 | 164n97, 183n155 | 7 | 262n109 |
| 8.3 | 165n98 | 7.1–12 | 260 |
| 9.1 | 165n98 | 7.12 | 270n137 |
| | | 8 | 262n109 |

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|---|------------------------|--|
| 8.1–25 | 260 | Shepherd of Hermas | |
| 8.1 | 262 | <i>Mandate(s)</i> | |
| 8.6 | 77n177, 280 | 9.4–7 [39.4–7] | 70n147 |
| 8.16–20 | 259 | 9.4–10 [39.4–11] | 73 |
| 8.24 | 270n137 | 9.4–12 [39.4–12] | 335n39, 410n4 |
| 9 | 318n136, 395 | 9.9 [39.9] | 75 |
| 9.1–9 | 387n24 | <i>Similitude(s)</i> | |
| 9.1–8 | 269 | 9.15.3 [92.3] | 70 |
| 9.1–4 | 260 | <i>Vision(s)</i> | |
| 9.6–8 | 271–285 | 1.4.3 [4.3] | 345n72 |
| 9.6–7 | 278n154, 316n125, 384, 393n56 | Tatian | |
| 9.6 | 167n106, 228n155, 280–283, 369n168, 384, 449n10, 463n62 | <i>Diatessaron</i> | 228n155, 338–341 |
| 9.7 | 253, 255, 268, 276, 278–281, 284, 384, 389, 402 | Tertullian | |
| 9.8 | 277, 384, 454 | <i>Against Marcion</i> | |
| 9.9 | 264n116, 277n152, 280, 385n15 | 1.14 | 255n86 |
| 10–11 | 263 | 1.19–20 | 120n118 |
| 10.1–10 | 259 | 1.19 | 130n154 |
| 10.1–4 | 261n107 | 1.19.2 | 240n22, 251 |
| 10.4 | 225n148, 260, 280, 281 | 1.20.1–4 | 239n15, 239n18, 447n6 |
| 10.5–6 | 280 | 1.20.1–2 | 242n29 |
| 10.5 | 269 | 1.20.1 | 239n16, 239n18 |
| 10.6–7 | 261n106 | 1.20.2 | 242n28, 242n30 |
| 10.6 | 77n177, 280 | 1.24 | 241n25 |
| 10.7 | 259 | 2.27.1–2 | 242n26 |
| 10.11–12 | 263 | 3.3 | 159n79, 411n6 |
| Ps.-Tertullian | | 3.7–8 | 45n45 |
| <i>Against All Heresies</i> | | 3.8 | 40n26, 54n86, 241n25, 241n26, 253n80 |
| 1.4 | 40n24 | 3.8.1 | 241n23, 249n58 |
| 1.5 | 54n80 | 3.8.4 | 254, 400n82 |
| 2.1–4 | 109n81 | 3.9 | 240n20 |
| 2.2 | 130n152 | 3.9.1–7 | 400n82, 402n88 |
| 2.4 | 44n37 | 3.10–11 | 241n26 |
| 4.5 | 44n40, 47n54 | 3.10 | 48n57, 54n80 |
| 6.5 | 41n27 | 3.11 | 40n26, 45n45, 241n25 |
| Rufinus | | 3.11.7–8 | 241n25 |
| Origen's <i>Principia</i> | | 3.84 | 318n136 |
| pref. 8 | 141n23 | 4.1.1–2 | 253 |
| | | 4.2–6 | 235n4 |
| | | 4.2–4 | 239n15, 239n18, 447n6 |
| | | 4.2.4–5 | 239n15 |

| | | | |
|----------|----------------------|--|----------------------|
| 4.3–5 | 239n16 | 5.3.1–2 | 239n15, 239n18, |
| 4.3–4 | 238n15 | | 447n6 |
| 4.3 | 239n15 | 5.3.7 | 242n30, 246n48 |
| 4.3.2–4 | 238n15 | 5.8 | 240n21 |
| 4.3.2 | 242n28, 242n29, | 5.14.1 | 387 |
| | 242n30 | 5.17.14–15 | 387 |
| 4.3.4 | 238 | 5.19 | 126n143 |
| 4.4–5 | 238 | 5.19.6 | 252n73 |
| 4.4 | 120n118 | 5.20.3–4 | 40n25, 240n22, |
| 4.4.2 | 238n15 | | 242n26 |
| 4.4.4 | 130, 238n15, 245n44 | <i>Against Praxeas</i> | |
| 4.4.5 | 238n15, 239n18 | 2.1 | 337n48 |
| 4.5.6 | 238n15 | 25 | 181n149, 306n97, 393 |
| 4.5.7 | 239n17 | <i>Against the Valentinians</i> | |
| 4.6 | 253 | 1 | 179n142, 438n3, |
| 4.7.2 | 349 | | 457n45 |
| 4.9.4 | 23n67, 57n104, | 4.2 | 110n87, 111 |
| | 252n76, 391n44 | 4.3 | 44n39 |
| 4.16.1 | 349n92 | 26 | 23n67, 45n43, 45n44, |
| 4.20.8–9 | 23n67, 57n104, | | 56n100, 390n39 |
| | 252n76, 391n44 | 39 | 36n12, 36n13, 110 |
| 4.20.13 | 23n67, 57n104, | <i>Antidote for the Scorpion's Sting</i> | |
| | 252n76, 391n44 | 1 | 36n12 |
| 4.21.6–7 | 242 | <i>Apology</i> | |
| 4.21.7 | 243n33 | | 176–178 |
| 4.21.8 | 243 | 21 | 344 |
| 4.22.4–6 | 243 | 21.20–23 | 177, 254 |
| 4.22.4 | 243n37 | 21.23 | 457n42 |
| 4.23.2 | 244 | 21.25 | 178, 199, 337n48 |
| 4.25 | 119n116, 120n118 | 48–50 | 176 |
| 4.32.2 | 55n89 | <i>The Crown</i> | |
| 4.38 | 266, 395n60 | 14.4 | 269 |
| 4.38.5–6 | 55n89, 240n21, | <i>The Flesh of Christ</i> | |
| | 457n41 | 1 | 46 |
| 4.38.7 | 240n21 | 1.1 | 306n97 |
| 4.40.1 | 400n79 | 1.4 | 40n24, 40n25, 40n26, |
| 4.43 | 108n79, 179, | | 45n45, 241n23, |
| | 214n109, 254, | | 241n25, 241n26, 248 |
| | 312n118 | 1.14 | 241n25 |
| 4.43.2 | 240n21, 457n41 | 3 | 266 |
| 4.43.3 | 122, 246, 247, 248 | 3.1 | 238n15 |
| 4.43.4 | 246, 248 | 3.2 | 40n25, 240n22, |
| 4.43.6–7 | 249 | | 241n25 |
| 4.43.6 | 246 | 3.4 | 40n25, 240n22 |
| 4.43.8–9 | 246–247 | 3.6–9 | 240n20, 254, 402n88 |
| 4.43.8 | 246, 248, 249n58, | | |
| | 400n79, 402, 450–451 | | |
| 4.43.9 | 247n50 | | |

| | | | |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|---|
| 5 | 40n26, 45n45, 241n25, 241n26 | 34 37 | 179–180, 254, 383 466 |
| 6 | 41n27, 55n89, 240n21, 266, 457n41 | 38 44 | 179 179 |
| 8 | 41n28, 54n81 | 46–47 | 179 |
| 9 | 431n88 | 48 | 178 |
| 10–14 | 47n55 | 51 | 182n152 |
| 14 | 459n50 | 51.2 | 454 |
| 15 | 46, 54n80, 213n107 | 53 | 178 |
| 15.1–3 | 462 | 55 | 178 |
| 16 | 45n48 | 55.1–10 | 192n23 |
| 18–19 | 462 | 57–62 | 181, 411n7 |
| 20.1 | 44n40 | 57–60 | 183n155 |
| 24 | 212n105, 465 | 57 63 | 179 179, 181 |
| <i>Prescription against Heretics</i> | | | |
| 14.14 | 53n76, 53n78, 438n3 | <i>To Scapula</i> | |
| 17 | 179n142, 438n3 | 3.2 | 71n155 |
| 18.3–19.3 | 53n78 | <i>The Soul</i> | |
| 22 | 242n29 | 17 | 402n88 |
| 22.2 | 227n153, 231n161 | 17.14 | 249n58, 252, 253– 254, 256, 312n118, 389, 393 |
| 23–24 | 242n28, 242n30 | | |
| 24–28 | 52n72 | | |
| 25–28 | 58n109, 59n110 | 18 | 36n12, 217 |
| 25–26 | 49n66 | 25.8 | 337n48 |
| 26.9 | 53n78 | 35.1 | 54n83 |
| 29.2–3 | 239n18 | | |
| 30.9 | 130n154 | | |
| 30.11 | 459n50 | | |
| 30.16 | 337n48 | | |
| 33.7 | 212n103 | | |
| 33.8 | 118n112 | | |
| 33.11 | 253n80 | | |
| 35 | 126n143 | | |
| 38–39 | 49n62, 179n142, 438n3 | | |
| 38 | 251n72 | | |
| 38.7–10 | 52n75 | | |
| 39 | 48n59, 50n67 | | |
| <i>The Resurrection of the Flesh</i> | | | |
| | 178–182, 258n93 | | |
| 2 | 46n53, 178, 179 | | |
| 4 | 54n83, 181, 183n155, 411n7 | | |
| 7 | 262n109 | | |
| 9 | 182n152 | | |
| 12–13 | 136n8 | | |
| 19 | 54n83, 57n101 | | |
| 24 | 178 | | |
| | | <i>Theodore of Mopsuestia</i> | |
| | | <i>Catechetical Homilies</i> | |
| | | 5.8 | 55n89, 240n21, 254n84, 266n125, 400n82, 401n83, 402n88, 457n41 |
| | | <i>Commentary on John</i> | |
| | | 7.20.27–29 | 424n61 |
| | | <i>Theodoret</i> | |
| | | <i>Compendium of Heretical Falsehoods</i> | |
| | | 1.14 | 109n81 |
| | | <i>Theophilus</i> | |
| | | <i>To Autolytus</i> | |
| | | | 160–164, 185, 258n93 |
| | | 1.7 | 116n106 |
| | | 1.8 | 161 |
| | | 1.13–14 | 160–164, 413 |

| | | | |
|---------|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------|
| 1.13 | 136n8, 161, 162–163, 177n138 | Titus of Bostra | |
| 1.14 | 150n49, 161, 162, 393 | <i>Contra Manichaeos</i> | |
| 2.10 | 161n86 | 4.34 | 401n83 |
| 2.13 | 161n86 | Valentinus | |
| 2.15 | 116n106 | <i>Summer Harvest</i> | 110n87 |
| 2.22 | 161n86, 184n156 | | |
| 3.3 | 161n86 | Victorinus | |
| 3.12 | 160, 184n156 | <i>Commentary on the Apocalypse</i> | |
| 3.13–14 | 161n86 | 11.1 | 465n65 |
| 3.28 | 160 | | |

Greco-Roman Literature

| | | | |
|-----------------------------|--------|--------------------------------------|---------|
| Aeschylus | | Aristotle | |
| <i>Eumenides</i> | | <i>De anima</i> | |
| 103 | 450n17 | 423b27–29 | 421n44 |
| | | 434b9 | 421n44 |
| <i>Septem contra Thebas</i> | | <i>De generatione et corruptione</i> | |
| 876 | 63n123 | 2.2.329b7–11 | 421n44 |
| Antonius Liberalis | | <i>Ethica Eudemia</i> | |
| <i>Metamorphoses</i> | | 239b.11–12 | 315n122 |
| 25 | 456n40 | | |
| Apollodorus | | <i>Poetica</i> | |
| <i>Epitome</i> | | 1454b | 450n17 |
| 1.20 | 55n90 | <i>Rhetorica</i> | |
| 3.5 | 55n90 | 1.2.16–18 [1357b] | 414n17 |
| 3.22 | 56n96 | | |
| | | Cicero | |
| Appian | | <i>De natura deorum</i> | |
| <i>Bella civilia</i> | | 1.23.63 | 73n160 |
| 4.3.14 | 63n123 | | |
| Apuleius | | Dio Cassius | |
| <i>Metamorphoses</i> | | <i>Historiae Romanae</i> | |
| 8.8 | 450n17 | 46.3.4 | 63n123 |
| | | 48.54.7 | 63n123 |
| Aristophanes | | 67.1.3 | 63n123 |
| <i>Lysistrata</i> | | 71.25 | 63n123 |
| 610 | 250n66 | Dio Chrysostom | |
| | | <i>Tarsica altera (Or. 34)</i> | |
| | | 47–48 | 288n10 |

| | | | |
|--------------------------------|---------|---------------------------------|----------------|
| Diodorus Siculus | | Isaeus | |
| <i>Bibliotheca historica</i> | | <i>Aristarchus</i> | |
| 3.66.4 | 414n17 | 6 | 414n17 |
| Dionysius of Halicarnassus | | Lucian | |
| <i>Antiquitates romanae</i> | | <i>Alexander (Pseudomantis)</i> | |
| 1.90.2 | 414n17 | 5 | 411n7 |
| 5.18.1 | 414n17 | <i>Hermodotimus (De sectis)</i> | |
| Euripides | | 7 | 456n40 |
| <i>Bacchae</i> | | <i>Philopseudes</i> | |
| 54 | 39 | 11–15 | 411n7 |
| <i>Helena</i> | | <i>Vera Historia</i> | |
| 31–48 | 55n91 | 2.12 | 421n44 |
| 31–35 | 55n90 | Lucretius | |
| 116–121 | 55n91 | <i>De rerum natura</i> | |
| 1219 | 55n91 | 1.304 | 390n34, 421n44 |
| <i>Iphigenia taurica</i> | | Lysias | |
| 1298 | 63n123 | <i>Orationes</i> | |
| 1476 | 63n123 | 12.51 | 414n17 |
| Herodotus | | Macarius | |
| <i>Historiae</i> | | <i>Apocriticus</i> | |
| 1.114 | 250n66 | 3.1 | 459n50 |
| Homer | | 4.2 | 456n40 |
| <i>Ilias</i> | | Ovid | |
| 5.334–342 | 432n95 | <i>Fasti</i> | |
| 5.339–342 | 430n86 | 701–704 | 55n92 |
| 23.99–100 | 322n150 | <i>Metamorphoses</i> | |
| 23.99–104 | 420n43 | 8.626 | 39n21 |
| <i>Odyssea</i> | | 10.48–49 | 450n17 |
| 5.92 | 269n135 | 14.824–828 | 456n40 |
| 11.151–154 | 420n43 | 14.845–851 | 456n40 |
| 11.204–208 | 420n43 | Philostratus | |
| 19.357–475 | 450n17 | <i>Vita Apollonii</i> | |
| 23.70–172 | 74n166 | 1.18 | 411n7 |
| <i>Homeric Hymn to Demeter</i> | | 8.7 | 411n7 |
| 2 | 317n130 | 8.12 | 93n26, 420n43 |
| 7 | 302n78 | | |

| | | | |
|-------------------|----------------|--------------------------------------|---------|
| Plato | | Porphyry | |
| <i>Apologia</i> | | <i>Vita Pythagorae</i> | |
| 24b | 95 | 16 | 35n10 |
| 40a | 95 | | |
| <i>Cratylus</i> | | Ps.-Lucian | |
| 400b-c | 54n83 | <i>Asinus (Lucius)</i> | |
| 400c | 192n23 | 54.14–16 | 315n122 |
| <i>Gorgias</i> | | Sophocles | |
| 524–525 | 450n17 | <i>Ajax</i> | |
| <i>Phaedo</i> | | 981 | 250n66 |
| 81d | 54n83 | <i>Oedipus tyrannus</i> | |
| <i>Phaedrus</i> | | 345 | 250n66 |
| 243 | 55n90 | 440–442 | 331n22 |
| 250c | 54n83 | <i>Trachiniae</i> | |
| <i>Respublica</i> | | 1228–1229 | 63n123 |
| 9.586 | 55n90 | Thucydides | |
| <i>Symposium</i> | | <i>Historia belli peloponnesiaci</i> | |
| 203b | 269n135 | 8.45.1 | 63n123 |
| Plotinus | | Virgil | |
| <i>Enneades</i> | | <i>Aeneid</i> | |
| 2.9.9 | 37n15 | 1.355 | 450n17 |
| Plutarch | | 2.272–279 | 450n17 |
| <i>Moralia</i> | | 2.792–793 | 420n43 |
| 180e | 430n86, 432n95 | 6.450–458 | 450n17 |
| <i>Romulus</i> | | 6.697–702 | 420n43 |
| 27–28 | 456n40 | Xenophon | |
| Polybius | | <i>Cyropaedia</i> | |
| <i>Historiae</i> | | 7.2.17 | 71n153 |
| 8.29.8 | 311n115 | | |

Subject Index

Abraham

- doubt of 79–80
- faith of 66–69

Acts (canonical)

- and *Acts of John* 290, 319
- and *1 Clement* 137, 138n15
- and *3 Corinthians* 173
- and Ignatius of Antioch 88–89, 91–92, 94
- and Irenaeus 229–230n158
- and Justin Martyr 153n61
- and *Letter of Peter to Philip* 205–206
- and *Preaching of Peter* 143
- and [Ps.-]Justin 274, 276n150, 277
- role of physical and scriptural proofs in 413–417, 420–421
- and Tertullian 177
- and Theophilus of Antioch 163n93
see also Luke (Gospel)

Acts of Andrew and Matthias 347

Acts of John (AJ)

- and Acts 290, 319
- apophaticism of 309, 316–317
- Christomonism of 296, 299n66, 309n97, 319
- as composite document 38, 287–288
- dating and provenance 288–289
- dependence on canonical Gospels 290–300
- docetic Christology in, overview 40, 57
- docetistic reuse of John's resurrection account 301–310
- docetistic reuse of Luke's resurrection account 252, 300, 310–320, 335, 391, 394, 401n86
- and *Epistula Apostolorum* 355n113, 372–375
- and Ignatius of Antioch 97n39, 311n113, 314–315

- interpretive method 50–51, 300
- and 1 John 320–324, 432n90
- and the LE of Mark 347
- piercing of Christ in 430
- and Tertullian 306–307n97, 312n118
see also doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; touch motif/test

Acts of Peter 77, 335n39, 346, 348

Acts of Peter and Andrew 347, 348

Acts of Pilate 341–344

Acts of Thomas 347

Adamantius Dialogue 250n64, 266–267, 389, 400

Adumbrations (Clement of Alexandria) 321–324

Against Heresies (Irenaeus) 166–169 *see also* Irenaeus

Against Heresies (Ps.-Tertullian) 47

AJ *see* *Acts of John*

allegorical interpretive method 49–50, 52, 54, 147, 151, 262n109, 429, 462–464

Allison, Dale C. 16

Alsup, John E. 6n12, 8, 16, 334, 405n98

Ambrose of Milan 423n58

angelophanies

- and antidocetic redaction 275–277, 403–404, 408, 449, 456
 - in docetic interpretation 55, 105n69, 118, 254, 263–269, 275–276, 402–404, 408, 456–457
 - in Hellenistic-Jewish interpretation 39, 54–55, 263–269, 403–404
 - characteristics (terminology and motifs) of 267, 345, 349n91, 381, 404, 408
- ### anthropomorphosist (proto-monophysite) Christology 41 *see also* docetism
- ### antidocetic hypothesis, the
- and the abrupt appearance of Jesus 380–383

- and alleged emphasis on Jesus’s flesh in Gospels 383–388
- and the doubt motif 13–18, 21, 60, 78–79, 185, 219, 226, 395–399
- and the eating proof 400–407, 409–410
- logic of 2, 23–24
- and the materializing-trajectory theory 6–9, 10–11, 437–438
- in previous scholarship 4–12
- and systematic theology 6n12
- and the touch proof 2, 12, 108, 388–395, 409–410
- unexamined presuppositions of 11–12, 18, 20–21, 23, 69–75
see also reception, reception history
- antidocetic redaction, characteristics of 12, 24, 108, 284–285, 379–381, 383–385, 388–389, 395–396, 401–403, 405, 407–408, 450 *see also specific writers and texts*
- Antitheses* (Marcion) 130, 349
- Apelles and Apelleasts 40–41, 46, 48n57, 57, 178, 240n21, 266, 277n151, 431n88
- Aphraates 338
- Apocalypse of Adam* 112, 352n104
- 1 Apocalypse of James* 57
- 2 Apocalypse of James* 57n102, 252, 306n94, 313–314, 322–323, 391
- Apocalypse of Peter* 36n10, 53n78, 56, 96–97
- Apocalypse of Saint John the Theologian* 263–264n115
- Apocryphon of James* 127–128n148, 230n160, 347, 352n103
- Apocryphon of John*
 - dating and genre 187–188
 - docetic reuse of Matthew’s resurrection account 188–194, 233
 - docetism and polymorphic Christology in 191, 233, 347
 - as gnostic 35n10, 38, 112, 231
 - and *Gospel of Mary* 195, 198n52, 199n55, 208
 - and the LE of Mark 347
 - and *Letter of Peter to Philip* 204, 208
 - and the Ophite account 127, 188–189, 231
 - persecution motif in 199n55
 - as rewritten Bible 112, 127
 - as supplement to John’s Gospel 189–190
see also doubt and doubt motif
- Apology* (Aristides of Athens) 140–141n21
- 1 Apology* (Justin Martyr) 145n35, 152–154, 158–160 *see also* Justin Martyr
- Apology* (Tertullian) 176–178 *see also* Tertullian
- apophaticism 309, 316–317
- apostles, criticism of
 - in Crossan’s doubt as slander theory 17–18, 60
 - in *Gospel of Mary* 198–199, 203, 232, 233
 - by Heracleon 217–219
 - by heretics (general), 31, 58n106, 77–78, 132, 166, 167, 185, 226–230, 280, 281, 354n109, 395, 441
 - by Marcion 130–131, 175, 242–248, 254, 256, 280, 354n109
 - by Ophites 118, 124–127, 130–131, 132, 166, 167–168n108, 175, 231, 232
 - by Valentinians (general) 168n108, 180–181
see also embarrassment, criterion of; doubt and doubt motif
- apostles, defense of (implicit and explicit)
 - in *Acts of Pilate* 341–344,
 - by Chrysostom 443
 - in *1 Clement* 137–139
 - in Diatessaronic sources 339–341
 - in *Epistula Apostolorum* 279n156, 354n109, 356–359, 365–367, 369
 - in Freer Logion 334–335
 - by Ignatius of Antioch 106–107, 132, 199, 285, 368
 - by Irenaeus 170–171, 185, 228–230
 - by Justin Martyr 155–156
 - by Luke 397–399, 441–442
 - in Old Syriac 341
 - by Origen 77–78, 219
 - in *Preaching of Peter* 146–148, 185
 - by proto-orthodox authors (general) 184–185, 227, 395–396, 441
 - by [Ps.-]Justin 280–283, 285
 - by Tertullian 185, 199, 231n161, 242–248, 254, 256, 368
see also embarrassment, criterion of; doubt and doubt motif

- appearance tradition *see* angelophanies; antidocetic hypothesis, the; doubt and doubt motif; eating proof/meal scene; prophecy, prophetic (scriptural) fulfillment; touch proof/test
- Arabic Harmony 338–340, 341, 396
- Aristides of Athens 140–141n21
- Aristotle 96, 414n17
- ascension narratives, ascension of Jesus
- in Acts 153n61, 459n51
 - in *Acts of John* 318–320, 373
 - in *Acts of Pilate* 342n65
 - and alleged antidocetism in Luke 11, 453–458
 - and angelophanies 267–268, 276, 456
 - in Apelles' interpretation 277n151
 - in *Apocryphon of James* 128n148
 - in Carpocratian interpretation 42n33, 261n107, 277n151
 - in *Epistula Apostolorum* 363n148, 364n149, 365n153
 - in *Gospel of Mary* 201–203
 - in *Gospel of Peter* 43n34
 - Greco-Roman 177, 456–457
 - in Irenaeus 454
 - in Hippolytus 454n32
 - in Justin's writings 152–154
 - in LE of Mark 337n48, 342n67, 363n148, 364n149
 - in *Letter of Peter to Philip* 210, 455
 - in the Ophite account 112, 115n103, 117, 123, 128n148, 130n152, 237, 277n51, 455–456, 458
 - in *Preaching of Peter* 145–146
 - and prophecy 153n62
 - in [Ps.-]Justin's account 269, 273–274, 276–277, 384, 454
 - in Tertullian's writings 177, 454
 - in Valentinian interpretation 46n53
- Attridge, Harold W. 222n135, 223, 224n144
- Augustine of Hippo 336n42, 392n47, 422n48
- Autolykus* (Theophilus of Antioch) 160–164
- Axonionicus 44n39
- Bammel, C. P. Hammond 86n4
- Barbeloïtes 35n10, 188
- Bardaisan and Bardesanites 55, 215n12, 223n141, 400
- Barnard, Leslie W. 165
- Barnes, Timothy D. 85n2
- Barrett, C. K. 17
- Basilides and Basilideans 36n10, 41, 56, 86n4, 96, 120n121, 241n24, 348–349, 355n113
- Bates, Matthew W. 410n4
- Bauckham, Richard 73n161
- Bauer, Walter 58n108, 59n110
- BeDuhn, Jason D. 98n43, 244n39, 349n89
- Bellinzoni, Arthur J. 142n25
- Betz, Hans Dieter 411n8
- biblical canon 128–131
- Blackwell Bible Commentaries 19
- Blomberg, Craig 9n23
- Bock, Darrell L. 394n58, 410n4
- Bockmuehl, Markus 21, 22n65
- body *see* docetization; psychic body of Christ; spiritual body/flesh, touch motif/test
- Boer, Esther de 196n45
- Bonnet, Maximilien 287n5, 305n89
- Book of Baruch* 115n101
- Borgen, Peder 465n69
- Bovon, François 409n1
- Brown, Raymond E. 421n44, 434n100
- Bruner, Frederick Dale 410n3
- Bynum, Caroline Walker 258n93
- Cadwallader, Alan H. 334n34
- Caecilius 158n77
- Cambe, Michel 141n21, 142n27, 145n34, 146n36, 148n42
- Campenhausen, Hans von 16
- canon, biblical 128–131
- Carpocratians 36n10, 42n33, 96n37, 261n107, 277n151
- Carson, D. A. 13–14
- Carter, Timothy L. 237n9
- Cassian, Julius 42n34, 47, 233n162
- Cassiodorus 321–322
- Catchpole, David 8, 17, 268n132, 399n77
- Celsus 58, 151n53, 158n77, 159–160, 177, 184n155, 189n11, 354n110, 366, 413, 430, 433, 459n50
- centos (*centones*) 48–51

- Cerinthus and Cerinthians 42, 44, 86n4,
87n6, 353–355, 390–391, 451n23, 463–
464
- Charlesworth, James H. 17n53
- Christian identity, role of faith and doubt in
64–69
- Christology
- angel/angelomorphic 55, 99n48,
105n69, 174n28, 240, 254, 263–269,
275–277, 284, 305n92, 347, 365n153,
400–401, 402n88, 403–404, 408, 449,
456–457
 - Christomonism 296, 299n66, 309n97,
319
 - docetic varieties, overview 39–48
 - polymorphic 51, 97n39, 190–192, 233,
297n56, 299, 300–306, 308–310, 315,
317–318, 345–348, 350, 365
 - possessionist 41n32
 - proto-monophysite (anthropomorpho-
sist) 39–41, 42–45, 48, 56, 57, 59, 86,
96, 97n39, 125, 205, 286, 295–296,
297n56, 299–322, 355, 391, 431, 437n2,
448, 450, 452, 457, 460, 462
 - separationist 40n24, 41–48, 53nn77–78,
56, 59, 86n4, 87n6, 97n39, 116–118,
125, 126, 131, 355, 390–391, 431,
432n90, 437n2, 446, 448, 450–453,
455–456, 457–467
see also docetism; *specific writers and
texts*
- Ciasca, Agostino 340n58
- Cicero 73n160
- 1 Clement*
- and Acts 137, 138n15
 - and *3 Corinthians* 173n124
 - dating and authorship 134–135
 - on doubt and unbelief, general views 73,
75
 - and Irenaeus 229n157
 - and John 137n12
 - and LE of Mark, 137n13
 - and Luke 136–137, 130–140
 - and Matthew 136, 139–140
 - redaction of appearance tradition 136–
140, 178n139, 183–184, 413
see also apostles, defense of; doubt and
doubt motif
- 2 Clement* 73, 75
- Clement of Alexandria
- and *Acts of John* 320–324
 - on Basilides 41n29
 - on doubt and unbelief, general views 71,
75, 76
 - on gnostic interpretive methods 49n62
 - and 1 John 321–323
 - on John as spiritual gospel 426n67
 - on Julius Cassian 42n34, 47, 233n162
 - on Marcion 47, 252n78
 - and *Preaching of Peter* 71, 141, 147n38,
148n42
 - as proto-orthodox 60
 - on Valentinians and gnostics 34n7, 45,
47, 121n122, 216n117, 220n131,
354n110, 401
see also eating motif/meal scene
- Clement of Rome 60 *see also* *1 Clement*
- Codex Fuldensis* 338–340
- Commentary on Isaiah* (Jerome) 102–103
- Commentary on John* (Heracleon) 38,
140n21, 216–219, 220–221
- Commentary on Luke* (Cyril of Alexandria)
278–279n154
- commissioning/call narratives 16, 149–150,
196–198, 225, 332–333, 364
- 3 Corinthians*
- and Acts 173
 - antidocetic redaction of Jesus tradition
172–176, 184, 384–385, 386–387
 - and *1 Clement* 173n124
 - dating and genre 60, 171–172
 - and John 173
 - and Luke 173–175, 388n28
 - and the Ophite account 171–172, 175
see also doubt and doubt motif
- Craig, William Lane 10n29
- Crossan, John Dominic 17–18
- crucifixion and passion narratives 39–41,
42n34, 45, 48, 56, 96–97, 120–121,
144–145, 205, 241, 429–435
- Crüsemann, Frank 67n138
- Culpepper, R. Alan 409n1
- curiosity 306, 306–307n97, 310, 393
- Cyril of Alexandria 278–279n154, 346n78
- Czachesz, István 290n20, 297n57
- daimons 94–101, 266n123, 315n122

- D'Anna, Alberto 258n93, 260n104,
261n105, 267n126, 271n137, 278n154,
280nn157–158
- Davis, Stephen T. 62n117
- demons/demonic 70, 95, 97, 367, 371–372,
441n8
see also daimons; exorcism
- Demonstration of the Apostolic Preaching*
(Irenaeus) 169–171 *see also* Irenaeus
- Devil 334–335
- Dialogue with Trypho* (Justin Martyr) 154–
158, 209, 259, 263 *see also* Justin Mar-
tyr
- Diatessaron 228n155, 338–341, 396
- Dillon, Richard 10, 422n49
- disbelief *see* doubt and doubt motif
- Dobschütz, Ernst von 141n21, 144n33
- Docetae 36n10, 42, 43n36, 53n76,
126n144, 131n157, 446
- docetism
- defined 38–39
 - proto-monophysite (anthropomorpho-
sist) Christology 39–41, 42–45, 48, 56,
57, 59, 86, 96, 97n39, 125, 205, 286,
295–296, 297n56, 299–322, 355, 391,
431, 437n2, 448, 450, 452, 457, 460,
462
 - separationist Christology 40n24, 41–48,
53nn77–78, 56, 59, 86n4, 87n6, 97n39,
116–118, 125, 126, 131, 355, 390–391,
431, 432n90, 437n2, 446, 448, 450–453,
455–456, 457–467
 - types of docetic Christology, overview
39–48
see also Christology; docetization;
Gnosticism and gnostic thought; *specific*
writers and texts
- docetization
- of body/flesh of Jesus 6–7, 11, 40–41,
44–47, 57, 124–125, 178, 192n23, 212–
215, 232, 252, 260–261, 262n107, 264–
266, 269n136, 355n113, 387, 402,
431n88, 432n90, 437, 451–452, 455,
458, 462
 - of eating motif/meal scene 47–48n57,
55, 105, 254, 264–269, 276–277, 317–
318, 400–402, 403–405, 408, 421
 - as interpretive method (general) 53–58,
436–438
 - of suffering and death of Christ 39–41,
42n34, 45, 46n49, 48, 54, 86, 96–97, 99,
121n122, 172n123, 204n75, 205, 209,
241, 309, 402n87, 429–430, 432n90
 - of touch motif 45, 56–57, 168, 252–253,
311–312, 313–315, 320–324, 390–391,
394, 407, 462
 - and *phantasia* 32, 54n86, 105n69, 234,
235, 240–241, 248–254, 261–262n107,
264–269, 275–277, 284, 348, 411–
412n8, 437, 442, 451
 - and polymorphism 51, 97n39, 190–192,
233, 297n56, 299, 300–306, 308–310,
315, 317–318, 345–348, 350, 365
 - precedents for (Jewish) 39–40, 54–55,
263–269, 284, 402n88, 404
 - precedents for (Greco-Roman) 55–56
- Doctrina Petri* 93, 94n28, 100n55, 101,
141n23
- Dodd, C. H. 15
- Donaldson, Terrence L. 23n66
- doubt and doubt motif
- of Abraham 79–80
 - in *Acts of John* 303, 306–309, 310–312,
315–317, 333, 393, 394
 - in anthropological taxonomies 210–211,
216–217, 220–224, 225–226, 228
 - and the antidocetic hypothesis 13–18,
21, 60, 78–79, 185, 219, 226, 395–399
 - in *Apocryphon of John* 188–194, 223,
230, 231, 233, 369n167
 - as apologetic device in modern scholar-
ship 13–17, 78–79
 - *1 Clement* view and omission of 136–
140, 183–184
 - *3 Corinthians* omission of 175–176
 - and the criterion of embarrassment 439–
443
 - and divine condemnation 71–73
 - in early Christian conceptions 17–18,
64–78, 438–443
 - in *Epistula Apostolorum* 71, 356–359,
365–366, 368–369, 373
 - in *Gnostic Treatise on the Resurrection*
213–215
 - in *Gospel of Marcion* 245–249
 - in *Gospel of Mary* 196–203, 232–233
 - in Heracleon's commentary 216–218

- Ignatius of Antioch’s omission of 102–103, 106, 198–199, 285
- and instability vs. stability 193–194, 223
- Irenaeus’s omission of 166–167
- Irenaeus’s redaction of 169–171
- Justin Martyr’s omission of 152–160
- the LE of Mark’s portrayal of 61–62, 70–71, 325–336
- in *Letter of Peter to Philip* 207–210, 232, 233
- Luke’s portrayal of 395–399, 417–420, 423–424
- and non-recognition motif 15, 62, 122, 124–126, 132, 147, 302–303, 335–336, 347, 374, 419, 427–428, 461–462
- in the Ophite account 124–125, 230–231
- in Origen’s account 219
- *Preaching of Peter* omission of 146–151
- and proto-orthodox reception of the LE of Mark 336–344
- [Ps.-]Athenagoras’s omission of 164–166
- [Ps.-]Justin’s redaction of 277–283, 285
- in resurrection narratives, overview 12–13, 60–62
- terminology 62–64
- Tertullian’s inclusion of 254
- Tertullian’s omission of 177–178, 180–181, 198–199
- Theophilus of Antioch’s omission of 161–164
- in *Tripartite Tractate* 220–226
- in Valentinian cosmogony 222–223
see also apostles, criticism of; apostles, defense of; eating motif/meal scene; prophecy, prophetic (scriptural) fulfillment; touch motif/test
- Dunderberg, Ismo 194n38
- Dunn, James D. G. 14, 67n141
- eating motif/meal scene
 - in *Acts of John* 317–318, 401n86
 - and angelomorphic Christology 55, 105n69, 254, 264–269, 276–277, 400–401, 403–405, 408, 421
 - and the antidoctetic hypothesis 2, 8, 9n22, 400–407, 409–410
 - Clement of Alexandria’s interpretation of 255, 403n89
 - *3 Corinthians* omission of 175
 - *Epistula Apostolorum* omission of 370, 411n7
 - in Eusebius’s interpretation 421n48
 - Ignatius’s redaction of 87, 89n16, 92, 103, 104–105, 284, 402
 - Irenaeus’s omission of 168–169
 - Justin’s omission of 154–154, 158–160
 - in Marcionite interpretation 55, 254–255, 266, 400, 402n88, 403n89
 - Luke-Acts portrayal of 401–407, 415–416, 420–423
 - [Ps.-]Justin’s redaction of 276–277, 279, 384, 402
 - Tertullian’s interpretation of 254–255, 269, 284, 402–403
 - and Tobit 55, 268, 404–405, 421n45
 - and Valentinus 318n136, 401
- Ebionites 42n33, 86n4, 86–87n6, 261, 263n115, 305n92, 451, 464–465
- Edwards, James R. 88n10, 93n28
- Ehrman, Bart D. 1n1, 7, 13n35, 14, 85n2, 95n33, 95n35, 100n52, 237n9, 353n106, 447–459
- Elchasites 305n92
- Eldad and Modad* 73n160
- embarrassment, criterion of 439–443
- Emmaus pericope 62, 74, 122, 139, 145–147, 166n103, 208n90, 233n162, 245, 335–336, 361n138, 419, 422
- Ephrem the Syrian 244, 254, 338, 402n88
- Epiphanius 35n10, 130n152, 241nn24–25, 250n64, 355n113
- Epistle of Peter to Philip* *see* *Letter of Peter to Philip*
- Epistle to Rheginos (Treatise on the Resurrection)* 38, 168n108, 211–215, 221
- Epistula Apostolorum*
 - and *Acts of John* 289n12, 355n113, 372–375
 - antidoctetic redaction of resurrection narratives 71, 183n154, 356–375, 381, 385, 386n18, 388, 389
 - dating and genre 326n3, 351–355,
 - and Ignatius of Antioch 374–375
 - and the LE of Mark, 32, 326n3, 350, 359–364
 - opponents, identity of 353–355
 - prophecy in 367, 371–372

- as proto-orthodox 60
- and [Ps.-]Justin 264n11, 271–273, 279n156, 369n168, 381
see also apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; touch motif/test
- Ernst, Allie M. 366
- Essig, Klaus-Gunther 84n1
- Ethymius Zigabenus 431n88
- Eucharist 93n26, 465–466
- Euripides 55
- Eusebius 84n1, 94, 96, 257n92, 326n3, 338, 421n48
- Evangelisch-katholischer Kommentar* series (EKK) 18–19
- Excerpts of Theodotus* 226
- exorcism 332–336
- Ezra of Kolb 241n26
- 4 *Ezra* 71
- faith
 - of Abraham 66–69, 79–80
 - and early Christian identity 64–69
see also doubt and doubt motif
- female testimony 12, 145, 203, 247, 365–367, 418
- flesh
 - *Acts of John*, rejection of 299, 305–306, 309
 - and antidocetic hypothesis 10, 388, 392n48, 383–388, 407–408
 - 2 *Apocalypse of James*, denial of resurrection of 313
 - *Apocryphon of John*, denial of resurrection of 192
 - Apelles on 40–41, 57, 266, 431n88
 - Basilidean denial of 304n86, 348
 - in 1 *Clement* 134
 - Coptic *Apocalypse of Peter*, portrayal as demonic 96–97
 - 3 *Corinthians* redactional emphasis on 172–174, 384–385
 - Ebionite denial of resurrection of 261, 262n115, 451
 - *Epistula Apostolorum* redactional emphasis on 355n113, 365n153, 369, 375, 385
 - Gnostic *Treatise on the Resurrection* on 46n48, 212–214, 261n107
 - *Gospel of Truth* on 56–57n100
 - Marcion's denial of Jesus's 40, 45, 48, 240–241, 261
 - Ignatius's redactional emphasis on 100, 104n67, 105, 252n73, 384, 402
 - Irenaeus's redactional emphasis on 168, 385, 454
 - John, lack of redactional emphasis on 385–386, 407–408, 461–462
 - Luke, lack of redactional emphasis on 98n44, 386–387, 407–408, 452, 454, 457
 - Naassene denial of resurrection of 262n107, 454n32, 466n70
 - Ophite denial of resurrection of 31, 44, 124–126, 231, 232, 262n107, 267n127, 436, 452
 - [Ps.-]Justin's redactional emphasis on 276–277, 284, 384, 402, 454
 - Tertullian's redactional emphasis on 180n148, 385n14, 387, 388, 411n7, 450, 454
 - *Testimony of Truth* 45n48, 54, 233n162
 - in Valentinian interpretation 44–47, 48, 56–57, 178, 180–181, 192n23, 269n136, 452n23, 462, 463n59, 464, 466n70
see also docetization; eating motif/meal scene; spiritual body/flesh; touch motif/test
- Fletcher-Louis, Crispin H. T. 7–8
- form-criticism, doubt motif and 15–16
- Freer Logion (FL) 334–335, 338, 357n123, 364n152
- Fuller, Reginald H. 6, 14, 407
- Gadamer, Hans-Georg 19n61
- Genesis 54, 55, 71, 127, 265–266
- gnostic (post-resurrection) dialogues,
 - Ophite account as precursor 127 see also *Apocryphon of John*; *Gospel of Mary*; *Letter of Peter to Philip*
- Gnosticism and gnostic thought
 - gnosis as secret/special revelation 52, 58, 70n147, 111n90, 127, 194, 208, 216n117, 220n131, 227–232, 437, 446, 458n48
 - interpretive methods 48–53, 119, 126–127, 226–233, 436–438, 446

- understanding of apostles and Gospels 226–233, 234
- terms and classifications 33–38
see also Christology; docetism; doubt and doubt motif; Ophites and the Ophite account; Valentinus and Valentinians;
specific writers and texts
- Gospel of the Hebrews* 93–94, 100–101, 102–103
- Gospel of Judas* 35n10
- Gospel of Marcion*
 - criticism of apostles 242–244
 - docetic Christology 240–241, 391, 400
 - and Jesus’ resurrection, 245–255, 312n118, 400
 - and Luke, source analysis 235–240, 243n35
see also eating motif/meal scene; Marcion and Marcionites; touch motif/test
- Gospel of Mary*
 - ascent of the soul vs. resurrection 201–203
 - criticism of apostles 198–199, 209n91, 210, 232–233
 - dating and genre 194–195
 - heterodox or “gnostic” classification of 38, 195, 208
 - John, reuse of 196, 199n55, 200–203
 - Luke, reuse of 195–196, 200–201, 203
 - Matthew, reuse of 195–198
 - peace greeting 449
 - resemblance to centos 50n68
see also doubt and doubt motif; persecution of apostles
- Gospel of Peter* 42–43n34, 301n74, 305n92
- Gospel of the Savior* 312n117, 347–348
- Gospel of Truth* 50, 56–57n100, 306n94, 463n59
- Goulder, Michael 7, 87n6
- Grant, Robert M. 100, 162n90
- Grass, Hans 6–7, 8, 20, 393n51, 421n46, 437
- Great Commission *see* commissioning/call narratives
- Greco-Roman literature
 - precedents for docetism 55
 - ascension accounts 456–457
 - condemnation of doubt in 73n160
 - polymorphy in 315n122
 - Justin’s use of 158, 182, 283
 - Theophilus of Antioch’s use of 161, 182
- Gregory, Andrew 28n75, 99, 112–113, 163n92, 206n78, 353n105
- Grundmann, Walter 424n59
- Gundry, Robert H. 9n24
- Hällstrom, Gunar 259n94, 261n107, 267n126, 271n138, 275
- Harnack, Adolf von 84n1, 175n130, 235n2, 245, 248n57, 257n92, 259n94, 349
- Hartenstein, Judith 204n75, 207n83
- “The Heartless Rich Man and the Precious Stone” 139n17
- Heimgartner, Martin 271n137, 276n150, 278n154, 279n156, 282
- Hengel, Martin 337n48
- Heracleon 38, 50, 140n21, 180, 215–219, 220–221, 222, 223, 225n148, 229n156
- Hilgenfeld, Adolf 110n86
- Hills, Julian V. 28n76, 358n125, 374n179
- Hippolytus
 - on Apelles 277n151
 - on ascension 454n32
 - on Basilides 41n29, 114n99, 241n24, 446
 - classification of heresies 41n29, 42–43n34, 46–47
 - on *Docetae* 42n34, 43n36, 53n76, 126n144, 438, 446
 - on female testimony 367
 - on gnostic interpretive methods 49n65, 53n76, 126n144, 438,
 - on Marcion 241n25, 349n92
 - on Naasenes 111n90, 262n107, 454n32
 - on Ophites 121n124, 262n107
 - as proto-orthodox 60
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 258n93
 - on Theodotus of Byzantium 126n145
 - on Valentinus and Valentinians 44n39, 46–47, 111n87, 446n4
- historical-critical exegesis
 - and modern bias 20–22, 185, 409–412
 - and reception history 18–20
- Hitchcock, F. R. Montgomery 261n105, 280n159
- Hoffmann, R. Joseph 242n31, 245
- Hogg, Hope W. 340n58
- Holmes, Michael W. 93n26, 100n52

- Homer 48–49
Homeric Hymn to Demeter 302n78
honey and honeycomb 268–269, 272n139, 273–274, 276
Hornschuh, Manfred 359
Hubbard, B. J. 16
Hübner, Reinhard M. 85n2
Hug, Joseph L. 16–17, 102n63, 329, 351n94, 362n139
hylic (anthropological classification) 210–211, 216, 217n120, 221, 224n144, 226
Hypostasis of the Archons 112
Hypsiphron 35n10
- Ignatius of Antioch
– and Acts 88–89, 91–92, 94
– and *Acts of John* 97n39, 311n113, 314–315, 374–375
– and the antidocetic hypothesis 2, 4–5, 6, 8n20, 20, 31, 87, 108, 381, 386–387, 388, 395, 402–403
– antidocetic redaction of resurrection narrative 93–108, 125, 132, 151, 153, 178, 183n154, 185, 186, 198–199, 229n158, 234, 252n73, 253, 254, 275, 278, 281, 284, 285, 315, 368, 374, 381, 384, 386–387, 388, 389, 395n61, 402–403
– and *Apocalypse of Peter* 97
– docetism of opponents of 40, 452n24
– and *Doctrina Petri* 93, 94n28, 101
– on doubt and unbelief, general views 76–77, 222
– and *Epistula Apostolorum* 374–375
– and *Gospel of the Hebrews* 93–94, 101, 102–103
– *Letter to the Smyrnaeans*, dating and overview 83–87
– and Luke, source analysis 87–102, 107n77, 108
– and the Ophite account 125
– and orthodoxy/heresy terminology 59n112, 60
– on prophecy 89–91, 105n70, 413n14
– and [Ps.-]Justin 277–278, 284–285
see also apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; touch motif/test
illusion *see phantasia*
- infancy narratives 126, 131, 174, 236–238, 445–447
Intermediate Ending to Mark 104n68
Irenaeus-witness criterion 29–30, 113, 114, 122, 290, 291
Irenaeus
– and Acts, source analysis 229–230n158
– antidocetic redaction 168, 185, 385, 388
– and *Apocryphon of John* 188, 231
– on Carpocratians 42n33, 261n107, 277n151
– classification of heresies 34–37, 38, 41, 42n33, 43–44, 45, 109–112, 241n24
– and *1 Clement* 229n157
– and *Epistula Apostolorum* 369n168
– on faith and Christian identity 65n131
– on gnostic criticism of the apostles and the Gospels 227–232
– on interpretive methods 49n61, 50–52, 127, 174n128, 227–232
– on Jesus as theophany in John 427n71
– on Jesus eating honey 269
– and John, source analysis 167–168
– and Justin Martyr 110n86, 156–157, 169, 183
– and the LE of Mark 337
– on Luke's unique content 29–30
– and Luke, source analysis 166n104, 229–230n158
– on Marcion 220–221, 238n12, 239n16, 241, 250n60, 251n69
– and Matthew, source analysis 169–171, 228n155
– on Pentecost 229–230n158
– on prophecy 91n22, 159n78, 166n103, 169, 170, 183, 413
– as proto-orthodox 60
– and [Ps.-]Justin 260, 261n105
– resurrection apologetic 166–171, 174n129, 385, 388
– on Valentinians 36–37, 110–111, 118, 168n108, 180n146, 211n98, 216n114, 217n118, 217n119, 218n124, 227n152, 228–229n156, 429, 460n51, 462
see also Against Heresies; apostles, defense of; *Demonstration of the Apostolic Preaching*; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; touch motif/test; Ophites and the Ophite account

- James (Apostle) *see* 1 *Apocalypse of James*;
2 *Apocalypse of James*; *Apocryphon of James*
- James (canonical) 73n160
- James, M. R. 297
- Jauss, Hans Robert 19n61
- Jerome 94, 100, 102–103, 160, 338
- Jesus *see* Christology
- Jesus Seminar, the 7n14, 18n58
- Jewish Christians 73n160, 160, 262–263, 268, 459 *see also* Ebionites; *Gospel of the Hebrews*
- Jews
- ancient criticism of Jesus 156, 158n77, 159–160, 189n11, 413, 430
 - apostles' fear of 199n55, 203, 382, 383n11
 - as hylics in gnostic literature 217n120
- John (Apostle) *see* *Acts of John*; *Apocryphon of John*
- John (Gospel)
- and *Acts of John* 292n33, 296–300, 301–309, 430, 432n90
 - alleged antidocetic passages, outside resurrection narratives 460–467
 - *Apocryphon of John* as supplement to 189–190
 - and 3 *Corinthians* 173
 - doubt motif in 12–13, 61–62, 63n121 *see also* Thomas pericope
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 357–358, 367–371
 - and *Gospel of Mary* 196, 199n55, 200–203
 - Heracleon's commentary on 38, 50, 140n21, 180, 215–219, 220–221, 222, 223, 225n148, 229n156
 - and Irenaeus 167–168, 385, 462–465, 466
 - and the Ophite account 118, 122n127, 130n152
 - and Origen 78, 202n68, 216, 218–219, 393, 413n13, 430, 433
 - and [Ps.-]Athenagoras 165
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 272, 283
 - role of physical and scriptural proofs in 382–383, 385–386, 391–394, 407–408, 424–435
 - and Tertullian 179–181, 253–254, 385n14, 389, 431n88, 465
 - theophany concept in 427–435
 - and Theophilus of Antioch 161–162
 - touch motif, portrayal of 391–393
 - in Valentinian interpretation (outside of Heracleon) 179–181, 462, 463n59, 464, 466n70
- 1 John 86n4, 142n29, 253, 320–324, 431–432
- 2 John 86n4
- John Chrysostom 443
- John of Damascus 257nn91–92
- Josephus 79n183, 95, 143n32, 265, 350n93
- Jubilees* 127
- Jude 70, 73–74
- Junod, Éric 286n2, 287–288n8, 289n13, 291nn26–27, 301n74, 305n89, 310n112, 317, 318, 320–323
- Justin Martyr
- and Acts, source analysis 153n61
 - angel Christology 266
 - dependence on Gospels 152–153
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 356–357
 - and Irenaeus 156–157, 169
 - and the LE of Mark 337
 - and *Preaching of Peter* 140n21, 145n35, 155n68
 - on prophecy 91n21, 152–155, 156–160, 183, 209, 275n147, 412–413
 - as proto-orthodox 59n112, 60
 - redaction of resurrection narratives 151–160
 - *see also* apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; [Ps.-]Justin; touch motif/test
- Justin the Gnostic 36n10, 115n101, 121n124
- Kaestli, Jean-Daniel 286n2, 287–288n8, 289n13, 291nn26–27, 301n74, 305n89, 310n112, 317, 318, 320–323
- Käsemann, Ernst 10, 405, 426, 462n55
- Kasser, Rodolphe 207n85
- Kelhoffer, James A. 149nn45–46, 325n3, 329, 332n27, 337n46, 342, 346n77, 356n118, 360n132, 364
- Kelly, J. N. D. 383n12
- King, Karen L. 193, 195, 197n48, 204n75

- Kinlaw, Pamela E. 315n122
- Klinghardt, Matthias 130n154, 244n39
- Knox, John 131
- Koestenberger, Andreas 9
- Koester, Helmut 27, 101, 102n63, 113, 352n99
- Kubiś, Adam 434nn99–100
- Lalleman, Pieter J. 286n2, 287–289, 291, 294n44, 297, 298n61, 300, 301n74, 305n91, 314, 317n132, 346, 373, 374n179
- Larsen, Kasper Bro 15n45
- Law of Moses and the prophets 89–92, 105n70, 197, 239–240, 406n99, 413n14, 417n26, 422n48
- Layton, Bentley 34–35, 36n11, 213n108
- Lazarus 178–179
- LE *see* Mark, Longer Ending
- Lechner, Thomas 86n4
- Lehtipuu, Outi 67n141
- Letter of Peter to Philip*
- on ascension 210, 455
 - dating and genre 35n10, 38, 204
 - dependence on Luke and Acts 205–206
 - docetic Christology of 204–205, 206, 208, 209–210, 233, 455
 - as gnostic 35–36n10, 38
 - reuse of Luke-Acts and Matthew 206–210, 232, 233, 455
- see also* docetization; doubt and doubt motif
- Letter to the Philippians* (Polycarp) 59n110
- Letter to the Smyrnaeans* (Ignatius of Antioch), dating and overview 83–87 *see also* Ignatius of Antioch
- Levinsohn, Stephen H. 423n56
- Licona, Michael R. 10
- Linnemann, Eta 329
- Logan, Alastair H. B. 35n10, 125n141
- Logos 222–223
- Longer Ending of Mark *see* Mark, Longer Ending (LE) of
- Lot's wife 139–140
- Lüdemann, Gerd 4–5, 7, 407, 411n8
- Luke (Gospel)
- and *Acts of John* 192–196, 252, 290–296, 300, 302, 310–320, 335, 391, 394, 401n86
 - alleged antidocetic passages, outside resurrection narratives 445–447
 - and *Apocryphon of John* 189n10
 - and Basilides 114n99
 - and biblical canon 128–131
 - and *1 Clement* 136–137, 139
 - and Clement of Alexandria 72, 255
 - and *3 Corinthians* 173–176, 184, 386–387, 388n28
 - doubt motif in 12–13, 61–64, 103, 147n39, 154, 256, 394–399, 408, 417–420, 423–424
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 367–373, 375, 388, 395
 - and Gnostic *Treatise on the Resurrection* 214
 - and *Gospel of Marcion* 130–131, 159n80, 179, 235–240, 242–252, 254–255, 381n6, 387, 388, 391, 400, 402n88, 403n89, 447, 448n7, 450–451, 455n36, 460n51
 - and *Gospel of Mary* 195–196, 200–201, 203
 - and Ignatius of Antioch, antidocetic redaction of 93–108, 125, 132, 151, 153, 178, 183n154, 185, 186, 198–199, 229n158, 234, 252n73, 253, 254, 275, 278, 281, 284, 285, 315, 368, 374, 381, 384, 386–387, 388, 389, 395n61, 402–403
 - and Ignatius of Antioch, source analysis 87–102, 107n77, 108
 - and Irenaeus 29–30, 166n104, 168–169, 229–230n158, 388
 - and Justin Martyr 152–160, 163–164, 183–184, 209, 412–414, 415n18, 423–424
 - and *Letter of Peter to Philip* 205–210, 405, 455
 - and modern bias 21, 185, 409–412
 - and the Ophite account 113–129, 130–132, 231, 267n127, 285, 387–388, 446, 452, 455, 458 *see also* doubt motif
 - and Persian Gospel Harmony 340–341
 - and *Preaching of Peter* 94n28, 141–148, 150–151, 413
 - and [Ps.-]Athenagoras 165

- and [Ps.-]Justin 267–285, 350, 369n168, 381, 384, 386–387, 388, 389, 395, 400–401, 403
 - role of physical and scriptural proofs in 4, 386–387, 394–396, 405–406n99, 408, 411–413, 417–422n48, 423–424 *see also* eating motif/meal scene; prophecy, prophetic (scriptural) fulfillment; touch motif/test
 - and Tertullian 176n133, 177–178, 235, 243–251, 388, 395n60, 402–403, 411n7, 450–451
 - textual variants (Western non-interpolations) 447–460
 - touch motif, portrayal of 394–396, 412–413, 415, 419–420, 438, 442
 - and Theophilus of Antioch 163–164, 413
 - and *Tripartite Tractate* 225
 - in Valentinian interpretation 114n99, 446
see also Acts
- Lunn, Nicholas P. 137nn12–13, 337n46, 348n84, 359n130, 364n149
- MacRae, G. W. 198n51
magic, attributed to Jesus 159–160, 164, 283–284, 411–414
- Malalas, John 84n1
- Manichaeans 41n30, 401
- Marcion and Marcionites
- and angelophany 55, 240, 266
 - anthropological taxonomy 220–221
 - docetism of 40, 45, 47, 55, 57, 119–120, 159n80, 214n109, 240–241, 266, 387–388
 - and *3 Corinthians* 175
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 354, 372n175
 - and Ignatius’s *Letter to the Smyrnaeans* 86n4
 - and the LE of Mark 349–350
 - and Luke’s infancy narratives 131, 446–447
 - as non-gnostic 38
 - and the Ophite account 130–131, 446–447
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 261, 285
 - Tertullian on 45, 122, 130n154, 238–241, 243–244, 245–254, 266, 275n145, 312n118, 349, 381n6, 388, 395n60, 402n88, 450–451
see also apostles, criticism of; *Gospel of Marcion*
- Marcovich, Miroslav 154n66
- Marjanen, Antti 195n40, 199n57, 202n67, 205nn75–76
- Mark (Gospel)
- and *Acts of John* 292–295
 - doubt motif in 397
 - and *Gospel of Marcion* 243n35, 244n41
 - and the Ophite account 115, 116, 118, 121
 - and *Preaching of Peter* 148
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 269–271, 274, 276n149, 282
- Mark, Longer Ending (LE) of
- and *Acts of Pilate* 341–344
 - ascension in 123, 337n48, 342n67, 363n148, 364n149
 - and Basilides 348–349
 - and *1 Clement* 137nn12–13
 - dating and authorship 325
 - doubt motif in 61–62, 70–71, 158, 325–336
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 358, 359–367
 - and the Freer Logion 334–335
 - and Josephus 350n93
 - and Justin Martyr 153n60
 - and Marcion 349–350
 - and the Ophite account 123, 130n152, 326n3, 455
 - and polymorphic Christology/docetism 345–350
 - and *Preaching of Peter* 142, 149–151, 184, 326n3, 337
 - proto-orthodox reception of 336–344
 - structure of 326–329, 360–362
 - and Tatian’s *Diatessaron* 338–341
 - and Tertullian 337
- Marshall, I. Howard 9, 210
- Martin, Michael Wade 447–459
Martyrdom of Philip 347, 348
- martyrs, apostles as 106–107, 198–199
- Mary *see Gospel of Mary*
- Massaux, Édouard 88n10
- materializing-trajectory theory 6–9, 10–11, 125, 437–438

- Matthew (Gospel)
- and *Acts of John* 292, 294–295
 - and *Acts of Pilate* 342–344
 - and *Apocryphon of John* 188–192, 194, 231, 369n167
 - and Christian identity 66n134
 - and *I Clement* 139
 - and Clement of Alexandria 148n42
 - doubt motif in 13, 61, 63–64, 139–140, 177–178, 198
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 228n155, 357, 358, 367–369
 - and Gnostic *Treatise on the Resurrection* 213–214
 - and *Gospel of Marcion* 244n41
 - and *Gospel of Mary* 195–196, 198–199, 203, 232
 - and Irenaeus 169–170, 228
 - and John Chrysostom 443
 - and *Letter of Peter to Philip* 206, 208n89
 - in modern critical study 14
 - and the Ophite account 118, 119–120, 125n140, 130n152
 - and proto-orthodox reception of the LE of Mark 339–340, 342–344
 - and [Ps.-]Athenagoras 165
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 228n155, 269–271, 276n149
 - touch motif in 390
 - and Tatian's *Diatessaron* 339–340
 - and Tertullian 176–177, 344
 - and Testimony of Truth 233n162
 - and *Tripartite Tractate* 224–226
- meal scene *see* eating proof/meal scene
- Meier, John P. 440
- Menander 36n11, 86n4
- Meyer, Marvin W. 205n75
- Michaels, J. Ramsey 383n11
- Minns, Denis 159n80
- Mirecki, Paul A. 150n48, 329–330, 331–332
- monophysite Christology *see* docetism;
proto-monophysite Christology
- Moses, Law of 89–92, 105n70, 197, 239–240, 406n99, 413n14, 417n26, 422n48
- myth/mythology, gnostic 35, 36n10, 36n11, 37n15, 38, 49, 53, 56n95, 109–112, 115, 119, 120n124, 126n144, 127, 187–188, 193–194, 195, 204, 205n75, 209, 212n101, 222–223, 231, 280n159, 288n8, 352, 395
- Naassenes 36n10, 50n68, 111n90, 261–262n107, 454n32, 458, 466n70
- Nag Hammadi codices
- and the antidocetic hypothesis 7, 20
 - on doubt and unbelief, general views 70
 - and gnosticism 34n5, 35, 53
- see also specific texts*
- negative (apophatic) theology and Christology 309, 316–317
- Nicholls, Rachel 20
- Nickelsburg, G. W. E. 7, 129n151
- Nicolaitans 35n10, 86n4
- Nolland, John 13
- non-recognition motif 15, 62, 122, 124–126, 132, 147, 302–303, 335–336, 347, 374, 419, 427–428, 461–462
- Norelli, Enrico 242n32, 245
- Novakovik, Lidija 7
- objective vision theory 442–443
- O'Collins, Gerald 8–9
- Old Syriac 341, 396
- Old Testament, Ophites and 128–131
- On the Flesh of Christ* (Tertullian) 179n141
- On the Origin of the World* 112
- On the Resurrection* ([Ps.-]Athenagoras) 164–166
- On the Resurrection* ([Ps.-]Justin) *see* [Ps.]Justin
- Ophites and the Ophite account (Irenaeus, *Haer.* 1.30)
- and Apelles 277n151
 - and *Apocryphon of John* 127, 188–189, 231
 - on the apostles' reception of gnosis 126–127, 132, 228n155, 230n160, 231, 232, 452
 - on ascension 112, 115n103, 117, 123, 128n148, 130n152, 237, 277n51, 455–456, 458
 - and the biblical canon 128–131
 - and *3 Corinthians* 171–172, 175
 - dating and genre of account 109–112

- docetistic interpretation of Luke's resurrection account 124–127, 167–168n108, 387
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 355n113
 - as Gnostics 35, 37, 109–112
 - and Ignatius of Antioch 125
 - and John 118, 122n127, 130n152
 - and the LE of Mark 123, 130n152, 326n3, 455
 - and Luke, source analysis 114–124
 - and Luke's infancy narratives 114–115, 129n150, 131, 446
 - and Marcion 130–131, 446–447
 - and Matthew 118, 119–120, 125n140, 130n152
 - and Origen 458n48
 - and pre-gnostic character of Luke's Gospel 126–127, 132, 231, 446–447
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 261–262n107, 267n127, 285
 - and rewritten Bible 126–127
 - source critical methodology for 112–113
 - and Valentinus/Valentinians 36–37, 109–111, 112n91, 121n122
 - *see also* apostles, criticism of; doubt and doubt motif
- Origen
- on body of Christ 430
 - on daimons 95
 - and Celsus 22, 430–431, 433
 - on collection of the gospels 325n3
 - and *Doctrina Petri* 94n28, 100n55, 141n23
 - on doubt and unbelief, general views 63–64, 71
 - and Heracleon 180, 216, 218–219
 - on Ignatius of Antioch 84n1
 - and John, apologetic interpretation of 78, 180, 202n68, 218–219, 393, 413n13, 430
 - on Marcion 238–239n15, 441
 - and Matthew, apologetic interpretation of 63–64, 78, 341n61
 - on Ophites 458n48
 - on polymorphism 302n77
 - and *Preaching of Peter* 94n28, 141n23
 - on prophecy 413n13
 - on Simonians 354n110
- *see also* apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif
 - orthodoxy and heresy, as label 58–60, 125, 436
 - Osiek, Carolyn 73n160
 - Ovid 55
- Pagels, Elaine H. 197n48, 217, 222n135, 223, 224n144
- Painchaud, Louis 122
- Papias 326n3
- parallelomania in modern critical studies 3, 22–24
- Parsons, Mikeal C. 448n8
- Parvis, P. M. 159n80
- Pasquier, Anne 38n17, 195n41, 198n51
- Paul (apostle)
- on faith and doubt 64, 65–69, 70, 74, 76–77, 80
 - and materializing-trajectory theory 6, 7, 11, 125
 - as model for Ignatius of Antioch 92n24
 - Ophite use of 124–125, 131
 - on prophecy 92n24, 416
- Paulsen, Henning 141n21
- Pearson, Birger A. 34–36, 41n29, 353n105
- Perkins, PHEME 187n1
- persecution of apostles 106–107, 178, 198–199, 203n71
- Persian Gospel Harmony 340–341, 396
- Pervo, Richard I. 300n71, 307–308, 309n107, 319n141
- Peter (Apostle), speeches in Acts 398–399n73, 414–416 *see also* *Letter of Peter to Philip*; *Preaching of Peter*
- 1 Peter 144n33
- Petersen, William L. 338, 340
- Pétrément, Simone 37n14
- phantasia*
- in angelophany accounts 264–268, 404, 421
 - and demons/daimons 266n123
 - in docetic Christology 32, 54n86, 105n69, 234, 235, 240–241, 248–254, 261–262n107, 264–269, 275–277, 284, 348, 411–412n8, 437, 442, 451
 - in *Epistula Apostolorum* 372
 - in Gnostic *Treatise on the Resurrection* 213, 214

- in Marcion's Christology 214n109, 240–241, 248–254
- and objective vision theory 442–443
- Philip *see Letter of Peter to Philip*
- Philo 79–80, 95, 144n32, 194n36, 265, 299n67, 302n77, 331
- physical proofs *see* eating proof/meal scene; prophecy, prophetic (scriptural) fulfillment; touch proof/test
- piercing of Christ 45, 394n57, 429–435
- Plato 96, 192n23
- Polycarp 59n110, 84n1, 251n69, 374n180, 431n88
- polymorphism and polymorphic Christology 51, 97n39, 190–192, 233, 297n56, 299, 300–306, 308–310, 315, 317–318, 345–348, 350, 365
- Porphyry 35n10
- Porter, Stanley E. 441
- possessionist Christology 41n32
- post-Enlightenment thought 21, 70, 75, 79, 185, 396, 409–410, 438–439
- Pouderon, Bernard 258n93, 259n94, 261n107, 263n113
- Praxeas 307n97
- Preaching of Peter*
 - and Acts, source analysis 143
 - characterization of apostles 146–151, 185, 337
 - dating and provenance 140–141
 - redaction of resurrection narratives 142–151
 - and Justin Martyr 140n21, 145n35, 155n68
 - and the LE of Mark, source analysis 149–151, 326n3, 337
 - and Luke, source analysis 142–148, 150–151
 - and Mark, source analysis 149
 - prophecy in 141, 143–144, 146–147, 150–151, 184, 413
 - as proto-orthodox 60
 - unbelief, view of 71
see also apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif
- Prodicus 36n10
- prophecy, prophetic (scriptural) fulfillment
 - Celsus on 160, 413
 - *1 Clement* 135, 137–138, 184, 413
 - *3 Corinthians* 173, 175, 184
 - in *Epistula Apostolorum* 367, 371–372
 - Ignatius of Antioch on 89–91, 105n70, 413n14
 - Irenaeus on 91n22, 159n78, 166n103, 169, 170, 183, 413
 - John, role in 4, 427–435
 - Justin Martyr on 91n21, 152–155, 156–160, 183, 209, 275n147, 412–413
 - and Law of Moses 89–91, 239–240
 - Luke and Acts, role in 4, 405–406n99, 411–420, 421–422n48
 - Origen on 413n13
 - Paul on 92n24, 416
 - in *Preaching of Peter* 141, 143–144, 146–147, 150–151, 184, 413
 - and [Ps.-]Justin 283–284
 - Tertullian on 159n79
 - Theophilus of Antioch on 162–164, 183, 413
- Protagoras 73n160
- Protevangeliium of James* 307
- proto-monophysite Christology *see* docetism
- proto-orthodox, as term 59–60
- [Ps.-]Athenagoras of Athens 75, 164–166, 184n156, 185
- [Ps.-]Justin
 - and Acts, source analysis 274, 276n150, 277
 - and angelophanies 275–277
 - antidocetic redaction of resurrection narratives 274–283, 284, 285, 381, 384, 386–387, 388, 389
 - and Apelles 277n151
 - dating and authorship of *On the Resurrection* 257–260
 - docetic Christology of opponents of 205n77, 260–269
 - on doubt and unbelief, general views 77, 222
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 264n11, 271–273, 279n156, 369n168, 381
 - and Gnostic *Treatise on the Resurrection* 215n110, 261–262n107
 - and Ignatius of Antioch 277–278, 284–285
 - and John, source analysis 272, 283
 - and Luke, source analysis 269–274

- and Mark, source analysis 269–271, 274, 276n149, 282
- and Matthew, source analysis 269–271, 276n149
- and prophecy 283–284
- as proto-orthodox 60
 - see also* apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; touch motif/test; Justin Martyr
- Ps.-Tertullian 44n37, 47, 130n152
- psychic (anthropological classification) 210–211, 214n108, 216–219, 220, 222, 223–224, 226, 228–229n156
- psychic body of Christ 44–48, 56–57, 124–125, 168, 232, 262n107, 355n113, 387, 390, 401, 429, 437, 452, 455
- Ptolemaeus (Valentinian) 85n2, 110–111n87, 218n124

- Quadratus 159n78
- Quispel, Gilles 110n86, 121n122

- Räsänen, Heikki 7
- Rasimus, Tuomas 35n10, 112–113n91
- rebuke 328–333
- reception, reception history
 - ancient bias and 22–25
 - as historical-critical tool 18–20
 - methodology 25–30
 - modern bias and 20–22, 409–412
- resurrection faith, as concept 66–67
- The Resurrection of the Flesh* (Tertullian) 178–182 *see also* Tertullian
- rewritten Bible concept 51, 112, 113, 126–127, 128–129 *see also* *Acts of John*; *Epistula Apostolorum*; gnostic (post-resurrection) dialogues; Ophites and the Ophite account
- Reynders, Bruno 113
- Richter, Georg 5, 10, 393n52
- Riley, Gregory J. 7, 9n24, 10, 98, 250n65, 388n30
- Robbins, Vernon K. 200n59
- Robinson, James M. 7, 8–9, 10, 20, 157n74, 437
- Roth, Dieter T. 235n2, 247n51

- Samaritan woman 216, 220
- Sandmel, Samuel 3, 23

- Satan 334–335
- Saturninus (or Saturnilus) and Saturnilians 35n10, 36n11, 40, 86n4, 91n22, 355n113
- Schäferdiek, Knut 288n8
- Schenke, Hans-Martin 35n10
- Schliesser, Benjamin 68n142
- Schmidt, Carl 372n174
- Schnackenburg, Rudolf 10, 463n61
- Schneider, Paul G. 301
- Schnelle, Udo 4, 392n48, 392n50, 466
- Schoedel, William R. 93n26, 94–95, 99, 101n58, 104, 106n73
- Schubert, Paul 418n28
- Schweizer, Eduard 432–433n95
- secondary orality 25
- Second Treatise of the Great Seth* 36n10, 42–43, 120n121
- Seitz, Oscar J. F. 73n160
- separationist Christology *see* docetism
- Serapion, bishop of Syrian Antioch 42–43n34
- Sethians 35, 37n14, 109
- shame, of unbelief 75–78 *see also* embarrassment, criterion of
- Shepherd, Thomas R. 334n34
- Shepherd of Hermas* 70, 73n160, 335n39
- Sim, David C. 66n134
- Simon Magus and Simonians 36n11, 40, 56n95, 77, 86n4, 125n141, 241n24, 263n113, 353–355
- Simon of Cyrene 41, 56, 241n24, 348
- Sirker-Wicklaus 308n104
- Skarsaune, Oskar 145n35, 152n55
- Slusser, Michael 39
- Smith, Daniel A. 98n45, 104n67
- Smith, Joseph P. 157n74
- Smyth, Herbert Weir 298n63
- Snyder, Glenn E. 173n127
- Socrates 95
- Sophia (aeon) 193–194, 222–223
- Sophia of Jesus Christ* 195, 267n126, 347, 348
- spiritual (anthropological classification) 58, 210–211, 214n108, 216–217, 218n125, 220–222, 224, 226, 229n156
- spiritual body/flesh 6–7, 11, 44–47, 57, 124–125, 192n23, 212–215, 232, 252, 260–261, 262n107, 264–266, 269n136,

- 355n113, 387, 402, 432n90, 437, 451–452, 455, 458, 462
- Stein, Robert H. 422n49
- Stichometry of Nicephorus* 286n5
- stigmata of Christ 168, 181–182, 183, 267n126, 385, 393–394
- Strecker, Georg 103n65
- Stroumsa, Guy G. 192
- Syntagma* (Hippolytus) 47
- systematic theology 6n12
- Talbert, C. H. 4, 131
- Tatian 228n155, 338–341
- Taylor, J. W. 66
- Tertullian
- and Acts 176–178
 - and *Acts of John* 306–307n97, 312n118
 - on angel Christology 240, 266, 269, 402n98
 - on ascension 177, 454
 - omission of appearance narratives 176–179, 181–182, 183, 185, 411n7
 - antidocetic redaction of resurrection narratives 179–181, 198–199, 252–254, 255–256, 284, 389, 402–403, 450–451
 - on Apelles 46, 178, 240n21, 266, 277n151, 431n88
 - on doubt and unbelief, general views 71, 306–307n97
 - flesh, redactional emphasis on 180n148385n14, 387, 388, 411n7, 450, 454
 - on gnostic interpretive methods and myths 50, 52n75, 53, 54n86, 111n90, 213, 231n161
 - and 1 John, 252–253
 - and John 179–181, 253–254, 385n14, 389, 431n88, 465
 - and LE of Mark 337, 349n92
 - and Luke 176n133, 177–178, 235, 243–251, 388, 395n60, 402–403, 411n7, 450–451
 - on Marcion and Marcionites 45, 54n86, 122, 130n154, 235–236, 238–241, 242–244, 245–254, 256, 266, 275n145, 312n118, 349, 381n6, 388, 395n60, 402n88, 450–451
 - and Matthew 176–177, 344
 - on prophecy 159n79
 - on Valentinus and Valentinians 44n39, 46–47, 52n75, 110–111n87, 179–181, 212–213
- see also* apostles, defense of; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; touch motif/test
- Testament of Benjamin* 75–76
- Testimonium Flavianum* 350n93
- Testimony of Truth* 45–46n48, 54, 71, 232–233n162, 354n110
- testing God 306–307
- Testuz, Michel 173n126
- Theodotus (Valentinian) 462n58
- Theodotus of Byzantium 126n145
- theophany 427–435
- Theophilus of Antioch 141, 160–164, 169, 182, 183, 184, 184n156, 258n93, 334n34, 413 *see also* doubt and doubt motif; touch motif/test
- Theophylact 431n88
- Thiselton, Anthony C. 69n143
- Thomas pericope
- and *Acts of John* 296, 303–309, 311
 - and Acts of Thomas 393n55
 - and the antidocetic hypothesis 2, 7, 9, 10, 382, 389–394, 427
 - and *Apocryphon of John* 192n24
 - and Augustine 336n42, 392n47
 - and 3 *Corinthians* 173
 - and *Epistula Apostolorum* 357–358, 367–368, 370–371, 385
 - and *Gospel of the Savior* 312n117
 - and Heracleon 217–218
 - and Irenaeus 167–168, 185
 - John’s portrayal of 382–383, 391–394, 408, 424–425, 426–428
 - and Origen 181, 218–219, 393n55, 413n13
 - and *Protevangeliem of James* 307
 - as recognition scene 15n45
 - and Tertullian 179–181, 252–254, 306n97, 389
 - and Theophilus of Antioch 161–162, 163, 184–185
 - in Valentinian interpretation 166n104, 179–181, 217–218
- see also* John (Gospel); doubt and doubt motif; touch motif/test

- Thomassen, Einar 45–46, 110–111n86–88, 216n116
- Thunder* 35n10
- Till, Walter C. 198n51
- 1 Timothy 77
- Tobit 55, 268, 421n45
- touch motif/test
- in *Acts of John* 57, 252–253, 311–312, 313–315, 320–324, 391
 - in *Adamantius Dialogue* 389
 - antidoctetic hypothesis and 2, 12, 108, 388–395, 409–410
 - 3 *Corinthians* omission of 175
 - docetization of 45, 56–57, 168, 252–253, 311–312, 313–315, 320–324, 390–391, 394, 407, 462
 - in *Epistula Apostolorum* 369–373, 375, 385, 389
 - in *Gospel of Marcion* 57, 251–254, 391
 - in Ignatius’s *Letter to the Smyrnaeans* 87, 88, 89n16, 92, 100, 102–103, 104, 107, 108, 132, 253, 255, 284, 389
 - Irenaeus’s omission of 168–169, 183
 - John’s portrayal of 391–394, 407–408, 424–425, 426–427
 - Justin’s omission of 154–155, 157, 158–160, 183
 - Luke’s portrayal of 394–396, 407–408, 419–423
 - in Matthew 390
 - in [Ps.-]Justin’s account 277–280, 284, 389
 - in *Second Apocalypse of James* 313–314, 391
 - in Tertullian’s account 252–254, 389
 - Theophilus’s omission of 161–163, 389
 - in Valentinian thought 45, 56–57, 85n2, 390, 462
- see also doubt and doubt motif
- Traditions of Matthias* 323–324
- Treatise on the Resurrection (Epistle to Rheginos)* 38, 46n48, 168n108, 211–215, 216n113, 221
- Trebilco, Paul 65, 85n2
- Trinity 192
- Tripartite Tractate* 38, 215, 220–226, 228n155,
- Tuckett, Christopher M. 38n17, 194n38, 195–196, 197n46
- Turner, John D. 35n10, 112n91, 188n6
- Tyson, Joseph B. 131, 236n8, 245, 247n53
- unbelief see doubt and doubt motif
- Valentinus and Valentinians
- anthropological taxonomies 58, 210–211, 216–217, 220–224, 225–226 see also hyllic; psychic; spiritual
 - Christologies, overview 44–47, 119, 401, 451–452n23, 457–458
 - on doubt 213–218, 220–226, 228–229n156
 - Eastern school 45–47, 57, 261n107, 451–452n23
 - and flesh tradition 56n100, 462, 464, 466n70
 - as gnostics 36–38, 109–112
 - and Ignatius’s *Letter to the Smyrnaeans* 86n4
 - and infancy narratives 446
 - interpretive methods 51–52, 56–57
 - and the Ophites 36–37, 109–111, 112n91, 121n122
 - and orthodoxy/heresy terminology 58–59
 - on piercing of Christ 429–430
 - resurrection views 168n108, 180–181, 212–215
 - Tertullian on 46–47, 110–111n87, 179–181, 212–213
 - on truth of Gospels 230n160, 269n136
 - Western school 44–45, 46–47, 56–57, 111n88, 451–452n23
- see also apostles, criticism of; doubt and doubt motif; eating motif/meal scene; Heracleon; touch motif/test; *Treatise on the Resurrection (Epistle to Rheginos)*; *Tripartite Tractate*
- Veilleux, Armand 313
- Vielhauer, Philipp 103n65
- Vinzent, Markus 7, 86n4, 131, 238–239n15, 245, 249n58, 251n72, 354n109, 372n175
- Virgil 48–49
- Waldstein, Michael 188n6
- Wedderburn, A. J. M 7
- Weigandt, Peter 373n178

- Whealey, Alice 258n93
Williams, Jacqueline A. 50
Williams, Michael A. 33–34, 35, 119n113,
193–194, 223
Wilson, R. McL. 198n51
Wisdom (divine personification) 116
Wisdom of Solomon 140
Wisse, Frederik 188n6, 189
women, testimony of 12, 145, 203, 247,
365–367, 418
worship of Jesus 13, 16, 61n115, 154, 167,
169, 190, 209, 301, 304, 309, 314n121,
357, 390, 453, 455, 457–459
Wright, N. T. 10–11
Wucherpennig, Ansgar 216n116
Wurst, Gregor 207n85
Zeylck, Lorne R. 196
Zuurmond, Rochus 362n142