JAMES R. HARRISON

Paul and the Ancient Celebrity Circuit

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
430

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament

430

James R. Harrison

Paul and the Ancient Celebrity Circuit

The Cross and Moral Transformation

Mohr Siebeck

James R. Harrison, born 1952; 1976 BADipEd; 1989 MA; 1997 PhD (Macquarie University); 2002–12 Head of the School of Theology, Wesley Institute, Sydney, Australia; currently Research Director, Sydney College of Divinity, Macquarie Park, Australia.

ISBN 978-3-16-154615-0 / eISBN 978-3-16-157019-3
DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-157019-3

ISSN 0512-1604 / eISSN 2568-7476
(Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available at *http://dnb.dnb.de.*

The book was typeset and printed on non-aging paper by Gulde Druck in Tübingen. It was bound by Buchbinderei Spinner in Ottersweier.

Printed in Germany.

Preface

My interest in the "celebrity circuit," ancient and modern, was first provoked as an undergraduate student at Macquarie University in 1973. In a striking lecture that formed part of an ancient history unit called *The Roman Nobility*, Edwin Judge, Professor of History, drew upon the documentary evidence to unveil the boasting culture of the republican *nobiles* ("nobles").[1] As I listened, I sensed that there was a collision of cultures occurring here between the humility espoused by the apostle Paul, who gloried in Christ and repudiated any self-elevation before God, and the self-advertisement of the Roman nobles, who sought not only to equal but also to surpass the glory of their famous consular ancestors. The more I thought about Judge's lecture in subsequent years, the more I realised that Paul's critique of the Roman boasting tradition had important implications for the relentless quest for fame pursued by late twentieth and early twenty-first century media luminaries.

I was also intrigued by the fact that some of the more reflective rock musicians of my generation aired ambivalence in their songs about the ephemeral nature of fame and the vacuousness of the Hollywood celebrity circuit. The Kinks' superb song, *Celluloid Heroes*, underscored the tension existing between the allurement of the Hollywood star system and the vulnerability of its casualties (Greta Garbo, Bette Davis, Marilyn Monroe), while nevertheless acknowledging that we all secretly desire to live in an insulated "fantasy world of celluloid villains and heroes."[2] The case is relentlessly pressed to breaking point by Bob Dylan in his 1965 song *Desolation Row*.[3] There Dylan, the 2016 winner of the Nobel Prize in Literature, reduces a cavalcade of celebrated figures from Western civilisation, fictional and historical, to absurdity in his desperate vision of a world gone awry. This "apocalyptic" song, ranking in quality and stature with T.S. Eliot's magnum opus *The Waste Land*, posed intriguing questions for me in relation to the gospel of the apostle Paul.

---

[1] For full details, see James R. Harrison, "Preface", in E. A. Judge, *The First Christians in the Roman World: Augustan and New Testament Essays*, ed. James R. Harrison, WUNT 229 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008), ix–x.

[2] For the lyrics of "Celluloid Heroes", accessed 27/08/2019, see https://www.lyrics.com › lyric › The+Kinks › Celluloid+Heroes.

[3] For the lyrics of "Desolation Row", accessed 27/08/2019, see https://bobdylan.com › songs › desolation-row. For the lyrics of Dylan's songs, see his official website above and Bob Dylan, *The Lyrics 1961–2012* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2016).

Was the apostle Paul, in radically dismissing all human boasting, speaking directly to the spiritual heart of the Roman world in a manner similar to Dylan in the late twentieth century? And with what transformative purpose morally? How did the shame of the cross overturn the deeply entrenched Graeco-Roman culture of esteem and, in a surprising case of social levelling, establish humility as its crowning virtue for the great man and his dependents? Why did Paul's leadership paradigm of "power in weakness" ultimately trump the famous "reluctance" of Augustus, who had consistently refused further powers when pressed upon him by an adoring Roman public? Should we speak about the "failure" of Augustus, as E. A. Judge has provocatively argued,[4] and, by contrast, about the unexpected and unconventional triumph of the apostle Paul's gospel in the Western intellectual tradition? And how did this cultural collision, still reverberating today, affect the civic ethics of Paul's converts, their communal ethos and paradigms of group identity, their pedagogical curriculum, and their understanding of honour and dishonour? It became clear that these questions could only be resolved by a detailed investigation of the phenomenon of celebrity culture in its modern and ancient context. The ethos of the Roman culture of self-advertisement had to be investigated from the republican perspective of the orations of Cicero, as much as from the paradoxical paradigm of Augustan leadership, which, in the intention of the Princeps, was designed to raise up a new generation of Roman leaders in his age of overflowing grace.

In addition to the introduction and conclusion, three new studies (Chapters 2–3, 6) appear in this collection of essays. Five previous studies of mine (Chapters 4–5, 7–9) have also been updated for the contribution that they make to our understanding of how the cross effected moral transformation in the face of the self-assertive values espoused by the luminaries of the ancient celebrity circuit. Each study has been given copyright release by their publishers. I express my gratitude to each press, all noted below, in allowing the republication of these essays.[5]

I am also deeply grateful for the support of the Mohr Siebeck staff after I aired the possibility of a third monograph with the press. I am indebted to Pro-

[4] E. A. Judge, *The Failure of Augustus: Essays on the Interpretation of a Paradox* (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars, 2019).

[5] James R. Harrison, "Paul and the Athletic Ideal in Antiquity: A Case Study in Wrestling with Word and Image," in *Paul's World. Pauline Studies: Volume IV*, ed. Stanley E. Porter (Leiden: Brill, 2007), 81–109; *idem,* "Paul and the Gymnasiarchs: Two Approaches to Pastoral Formation in Antiquity," in *Paul: Jew, Greek, and Roman. Pauline Studies: Volume V*, ed. Stanley E. Porter (Leiden: Brill, 2008), 141–78; *idem,* "The Imitation of the Great Man in Antiquity: Paul's Inversion of a Cultural Icon," in *Christian Origins and Classical Culture: Social and Literary Contexts for the New Testament*, ed. Stanley E. Porter and Andrew W. Pitts, TENTS 9 (Leiden: Brill, 2013), 213–54; *idem,* "Paul and Ancient Civic Ethics: Redefining the Canon of Honour in the Graeco-Roman World," in *Paul's Graeco-Roman Context*, ed. Cilliers Breytenbach, BETL 227 (Leuven: Peeters, 2015), 75–118; *idem,* "Paul and the Cultic Associations," *Reformed Theological Review* 58.1 (1999): 31–47.

fessor Jörg Frey, the managing editor of *Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament*, who has welcomed the book's inclusion in the series. The help of Elena Müller, Programme Director Theology and Jewish Studies, and Tobias Stäbler, Editorial Assistant Theology and Jewish Studies, has been invaluable in finalising the script. The encouragement of Dr. Henning Zietbritzki, the Managing Director of Mohr Siebeck, has also been a constant feature in my dealings with the press since my first 2003 publication. I have always appreciated Henning's warm interest in my scholarship. Many thanks to the Associate Editors who gave helpful feedback on the initial book proposal and especially to Professor J. Ross Wagner who encouraged me to consider submitting a third monograph to Mohr Siebeck.

The writing of the book has been enhanced by the many audiences that have heard elements of Chapters 2–9 delivered at various conferences around the world. By being asked penetrating questions after presentations and upon receiving helpful feedback in such contexts, I have experienced the truth of Proverbs 27:17: "As iron sharpens iron, so one person sharpens another" (NIV). I am especially thankful to a wide range of Pauline and ancient history scholars, far too many to be named, who, through their personal friendship and deep familiarity with the Graeco-Roman world, have contributed to my thinking in rich and diverse ways. Above all, without the support, love and encouragement of my wife, Elisabeth, this book would not have reached its completion.

This book is dedicated to Emeritus Professor Edwin Judge who, in his ninety-first year, has already published two books this year.[6] He awaits the appearance in print of the "Corpus of Christian Papyri" project, his great labour of love conducted in partnership with his Macquarie University colleagues since 1972 in its various evolutions, now submitted to a press for consideration for publication.[7]

[6] E.A. Judge, *Paul and the Conflict of Cultures: The Legacy of His Thought Today*, ed. James R. Harrison (Eugene: Cascade, 2019); *idem, The Failure of Augustus.*

[7] The "Corpus of Christian Papyri" project, formerly called the *Corpus Papyrorum Christianarum* (C.P.C.), was renamed "Papyri from the Rise of Christianity in Egypt" (P.C.E) from 1980 onwards. In private correspondence, Professor Judge summed up the results of the project thus: "'Papyri from the Rise of Christianity in Egypt', a long-term collective project of the Documentary Research Centre at Macquarie, reviewing 400 texts palaeographically, and re-editing 200 non-literary ones with extensive historical commentary and translation, is currently being considered by a press for publication."

Table of Contents

List of Abbreviations

ABR	*Australian Biblical Review*
AC	*L'antiquité classique*
AJA	*American Journal of Archaeology*
AJP	*American Journal of Philology*
Anc. Soc.	*Ancient Society*
AncW	*The Ancient World*
ANRW	*Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt*, ed. H. Temporini
ASSH Bulletin	*Australian Society for Sports History Bulletin*
Ath. Mitt.	*Mitteilungen des Deutschen Archäologischen Instituts, Athenische Abteilung*
BA	*The Biblical Archaeologist*
BBR	*Bulletin for Biblical Research*
BCH	*Bulletin de correspondance hellénique*
Bib	*Biblica*
BICS	*Bulletin of the Institute of Classical Studies*
BTB	*Biblical Theology Bulletin*
CA	*Classical Antiquity*
CB	*Classical Bulletin*
CBQ	*Catholic Biblical Quarterly*
CIG	*Corpus Inscriptionum Graecarum*, eds. A. Boekhio and I. Franzius
CIJ	*Corpus Inscriptionum Iudaicarum*, ed. J.B. Frey
CIL	*Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum*, eds. T. Mommsen, W. Henzen, et al.
CJ	*Classical Journal*
CPh	*Classical Philology*
CPJ	*Corpus Papyrorum Judaicarum*, ed. V. Tcherikover
CQ	*Classical Quarterly*
CTM	*Concordia Theological Monthly*
CurTM	*Currents in Theology and Mission*
DHA	*Dialogues d'histoire ancienne*
DocsAug	*Documents Illustrating the Reigns of Augustus and Tiberius*, eds. V. Ehrenberg and A.H.M. Jones
DocsGaius	*Documents Illustrating the Principates of Gaius, Claudius and Nero*, ed. E.M. Smallwood
EvQ	*Evangelical Quarterly*
FD	*Fouilles de Delphes*, ed. E. Bourget et al.
G&R	*Greece & Rome*
GRBS	*Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies*
HSCPh	*Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*
HTR	*Harvard Theological Review*

IAssos	*Die Inschriften von Assos*, ed. R. Merkelbach
ICreticae	*Inscriptiones Creticae*, ed. M. Guarducci
IDelos	*Inscriptions de Délos*, ed. A. Plassart et al.
IEph	*Die Inschriften von Ephesos*, ed. H. Wankel et al.
IG	*Inscriptiones Graecae*, ed. F. H. von Gaertringen et al.
IGLSyr	*Inscriptions grecques et latines de la Syrie*, eds. L. Jalabert and R. Mouterde
IGRR	*Inscriptiones Graecae ad res Romanas pertinentes*, R. Cagnat et al.
IIasos	*Die Inschriften von Iasos*, ed. W. Blümel
IKyzikos	*Die Inschriften von Kyzikos und Umgebung*, ed. E. Schwertheim
ILaodikeia am Lykos	*Die Inschriften von Laodikeia am Lykos*, ed. T. Corsten
ILS	*Inscriptiones Latinae Selectae*, ed. H. Dessau
IMagnesia	*Die Inschriften von Magnesia am Maeander*, ed. O. Kern
IMilet	*Milet. I.1–9*, ed. A. Rehm
IMylasa	*Die Inschriften von Mylasa. I. Inschriften der Stadt*, ed. W. Blümel
IPriene	*Die Inschriften von Priene*, ed. F. Hiller von Gaertringen
ISestos	*Die Inschriften von Sestos und des thrakischen Chersones*, ed. J. Krauss
IvO	Olympia: die Ergebnisse der *von dem Deutschen Reich veranstalteten Ausgrabung. V. Die Inschriften*, eds. W. Dittenberger and K. Purgold
JAC	*Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum*
JBL	*Journal of Biblical Literature*
JETS	*Journal of the Evangelical Theological Society*
JGRChJ	*Journal of Greco-Roman Christianity and Judaism*
Jh. Österr	*Jahreshefte des Österreichischen Archäologischen Institutes in Wien*
JHS	*Journal of Hellenic Studies*
JJMJS	*Journal of the Jesus Movement in Its Jewish Setting*
JRA	*Journal of Roman Archaeology*
JRS	*Journal of Roman Studies*
JSJ	*Journal for the Study of Judaism*
JSNT	*Journal for the Study of the New Testament*
JSNTPHRP	*Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic and Roman Period*
JSNTSup	*Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series*
JTS	*Journal of Theological Studies*
MAAR	*Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome*
MAMA	*Monumenta Asiae Minoris Antiqua*, ed. W. M. Calder et al.
MH	*Museum Helveticum*
Michel	*Recueil d'inscriptions grecques,* ed. C. Michel
Neot	*Neotestamentica*
New Docs	*New Documents Illustrating Early Christianity,* eds. G. H. R. Horsley (vols. 1–5); S. R. Llewelyn (vols. 6–9), and S. R. Llewelyn and J. R. Harrison (vol. 10)
NovT	*Novum Testamentum*
NTS	*New Testament Studies*
OGIS	*Orientis Graeci Inscriptiones Selectae*, ed. W. Dittenberger

P. Univ. Athen. inv. 2782	A.N. Oikonomides, "*The Lost Delphic Inscription with the Commandments of the Seven and P. Univ. Athen. 2782*," *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik 37 (1980): 179–83*
P. Brem.	*Die Bremer Papyri*, ed. U. Wilcken
PBSR	*Papers of the British School at Rome*
PCPS	*Proceedings of the Cambridge Philological Society*
PGM	*The Greek Magical Papyri in Translation*, ed. H.D. Betz
P. Kramer	*"… vor dem Papyrus sind alle gleich!" Papyrologische Beiträge zu Ehren von Bärbel Kramer*, ed. R. Eberhard et al.
P. Lond.	*Greek Papyri in the British Museum*, ed. F.G. Kenyon et al.
P. Mich.	*Michigan Papyri. I. Zenon Papyri*, ed. C.C. Edgar
PMLA	*Publications of the Modern Language Association of America*
P. Oxy.	*Oxyrhynchus Papyri*, eds. B.P. Grenfell and A.S. Hunt et al.
RAC	*Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*
RE	Realencyclopädie der classischen Altertumswissenschaft
REG	*Revue des études grecques*
REL	*Revue des études latines*
ResQ	*Restoration Quarterly*
RIC^{2}	*Royal Imperial Coinage*
RIDA	*Revue internationale des droits de l'antiquité*
RTR	*Reformed Theological Review*
SEG	*Supplementum Epigraphicum Graecum*
SIG^{3}	*Sylloge Inscriptionum Graecarum*, ed. W. Dittenberger
SJT	*Scottish Journal of Theology*
SR	*Studies in Religion/Sciences Religieuses*
TAM	*Tituli Asiae Minoris*, ed. E. Kalinka et al.
TAPA	*Transactions of the American Philological Association*
TDNT	*Theological Dictionary of the New Testament*
TrGF	*The Context of Ancient Drama*, eds. E. Csapo and W.J. Slater
TynBul	*Tyndale Bulletin*
USQR	*Union Seminary Quarterly Review*
VC	*Vigiliae Christianae*
VEv	*Vox Evangelica*
VSpir	*La vie spirituelle*
WUNT	*Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament*
YCS	*Yale Classical Studies*
ZPE	*Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik*
ZWT	*Zeitschrift für wissenschaftliche Theologie*

Chapter 1

"The Bold and the Beautiful": Fame and Celebrity in Antiquity and the Modern World

The idea that history may be explained by the study of the "great man" began in the modern era with a pioneering publication of Thomas Carlyle (1795–1881) in 1840.[1] Although Jean-Jacques Rousseau had been Carlyle's immediate predecessor in reviving the long-lost interest in the classical ideal of heroic virtue,[2] Carlyle seized the popular imagination by producing not only a moral-philosophical assessment of the heroic past but also by proposing an ethical interpretation of the role that political leaders, the modern inheritors of the heroic mantle, should now play in the world.[3] Carlyle depicted the great man as a divinity, prophet, poet, priest, man of letters and king. For Carlyle, the "Man of Letters" was the ultimate hero.[4] He endorsed Fichte's estimate that the literary elites were a "perpetual priesthood" unfolding "the Godlike to men."[5] In so doing, Carlyle bypassed Napoleon, the kingly paradigm of heroic virtue,[6] preferring instead to make his own quiet gambit for deflected glory as a Scottish "man of letters." Carlyle also sought to endorse the divine right of the aristocratic elites to rule by promoting a society governed by the excellent, or, as he pompously

---

[1] The phrase employed in the chapter's title, "The Bold and the Beautiful", alludes to the most-watched television soap opera in the world. The show premiered on CBS on March 23, 1987, and it depicts the celebrity family members connected with the fictional fashion house, Forrester Creations, based in Los Angeles. Regarding the "great man" in history, see T. Carlyle, *On Heroes, Hero-Worship, and the Heroic in History: Six Lectures* (New York: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1906; orig. London: Chapman and Hall, 1841). Carlyle (*ibid.*, 28) sums up his thesis with these words: "No great man lives in vain. The History of the world is but the Biography of great men." For discussion of Carlyle's views, see E. Bentley, *The Cult of the Superman: A Study of the Idea of Heroism in Carlyle and Nietzsche with Notes on Other Hero-Worshippers of Modern Times* (London: R. Hale, 1947); D. Garofalo, "Communities in Mourning: Making Capital Out of Loss in Carlyle's Past and Present and Heroes," *Texas Studies in Literature and Language* 45.3 (2003): 293–314.

[2] See J.-J. Rousseau, "Discourse on the Virtue a Hero Most Needs or On Heroic Virtue," in *idem*, *The "Discourses" and Other Early Political Writings*, ed. V. Gourevitch, Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).

[3] L. Eriksonas, *National Heroes and National Identities: Scotland, Norway and Lithuania*, "Multiple Europes" 26 (Brussels: Peter Lang, 2005), 32.

[4] Carlyle, *On Heroes*, 149–88

[5] Carlyle, *On Heroes*, 189–235

[6] Carlyle, *On Heroes*, 151.

categorised this spiritual elite, the "Able-man".[7] However, the "great man" model for understanding the evolution of history came under serious attack at the hands of Herbert Spencer, dislodging the approach from mainstream historical investigation of the past.[8] In the view of Spencer, "great" men were simply the products of their social environment. While some monographs still attribute historical agency primarily to the actions of great men,[9] researchers now situate historical figures within the complex and variegated currents of society at large, though there has been a recent explosion in "heroic" studies across many disciplines.[10] Thus it should not surprise us that no satisfying history of celebrity has yet been written. The deep interconnectedness of celebrities with their social and historical context makes analysis difficult. Moreover, the fan base of celebrities must also be factored in as an actor on the historical stage of celebrity if the phenomenon is to be properly evaluated.

However, writers in antiquity celebrate the rise, achievements, and virtues of the "great man". Plutarch not only wrote contrasting biographies of Greek and Roman leaders, but also prefaced his parallel lives with a comparison (συγκρίσις) of the figures whom he was discussing. The anonymous *De Viris Illustribus* ("Deeds of Famous Men") provides seventy-seven biographical sketches of republican luminaries for its audience to consider as *exempla*. Last, Valerius Maximus' *Facta et Dicta Memorabilia* ("Memorable Doings and Sayings") also

---

[7] Carlyle, *On Heroes*, 206–08. Note, *ibid*., 166: "Find in any country the Ablest Man that exists there; raise him to the supreme place, and loyally reverence him: you have a perfect government for that country; no ballot-box, parliamentary eloquence, voting, constitution-building, or other machinery whatsoever can improve it a whit. It is in the perfect state; an ideal country."

[8] H. Spencer (*The Study of Sociology* [New York: D. Appleton and Co., 1896], 31) writes: "If it may be a fact that the great man may modify his nation in its structure and actions, it is also a fact that there must have been those antecedent modifications constituting national progress before he could be evolved. Before he can re-make his society, his society must make him. So that all those changes of which he is the proximate initiator have their chief causes in the generations he descended from. If there is to be anything like a real explanation of these changes, it must be sought in that aggregate of conditions out of which he and they have arisen."

[9] For example, S.B. Ferrario (*Historical Agency and the "Great Man" in Classical Greece* [Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2014]) argues that a development occurs from the agency of the polis displayed at the time of early Athenian democracy to the emergence of individual agency under the unprecedented conquests of Alexander the Great. In Ferrario's view (*ibid*., 354), Alexander represents the "culmination" of the individualism that led to the emergence of the "great man" theory. On the great man in antiquity, see E.A. Judge, "The Changing Idea of the Great Man," in *Paul and the Conflict of Cultures: The Legacy of His Thought Today*, ed. J.R. Harrison (Eugene: Cascade Books, 2019), 122–137.

[10] See M. Jones, "What Should Historians Do with Heroes? Reflections on Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Britain," *History Compass* 5.2 (2007): 493–54; J. Price, *Everyday Heroism: Victorian Constructions of the Heroic Civilian* (London and New York: Bloomsbury Academic, 2014). For bibliographic references to "heroism" across the disciplines, see "Heroism Science: Promoting the Transdisciplinary Study of Heroism in the 21st Century," at https:// www.heroismscience.wordpress.com/, accessed 11.05.2017.

recounts *exempla*, Roman and foreign, for the consideration of posterity.[11] Whereas modern scholars are reticent about speaking of the influence that individuals can *singehandedly* impose upon history, there was no such reticence in antiquity. These virtuous figures, precisely because of their fame and accomplishments, were worthy of imitation. This book, collecting together previously published essays and new contributions on the topic of celebrity, is interested in the moral transformation that the ancients thought such figures offered to their contemporaries and posterity. The collision of this venerable moral tradition, indissoluably linked to the accomplishments of ancient luminaries, with the gospel of the apostle Paul represents a significant flashpoint in the western intellectual tradition and in the development of social relations in antiquity, the reverberations of which continue to be felt in our culture today. What, then, is the nature of celebrity in its modern and ancient context?

1.1. Research on Celebrity in Its Modern and Ancient Context

1.1.1. Scholarship on the Modern Phenomenon of Celebrity

Precisely when the phenomenon of "celebrity" began in the modern era remains a moot point in scholarship.[12] No authoritative history of celebrity has been written, though, as we will see, R. Garland, not unreasonably, traces the beginnings of the celebrity cult back to ancient times.[13] But, in many respects, the

[11] For full details, see Chapter 7.

[12] For books from 2000 onwards discussing celebrity, see R. Shickel, *Intimate Strangers: The Culture of Celebrity in America*, 2nd ed. (Chicago: Ivan R. Dee, 2000; orig. 1985); G. Turner et al., *Fame Games: The Production of Celebrity in Australia* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000); C. Rojek, *Celebrity* (London: Reaktion, 2001); M. Orth, *The Importance of Being Famous: Behind the Scenes of the Celebrity-Industrial Complex* (New York: H. Holt, 2004); P.D. Marshall, *The Celebrity Culture Reader* (New York: Routledge, 2006); J. Gaffney and D. Holmes, *Stardom in Postwar France* (New York: Berghahn Books, 2007); D.A. Herwitz, *The Star as Icon: Celebrity in the Age of Mass Consumption* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008); K.O. Ferris and S.R. Harris, *Stargazing: Celebrity, Fame, and Social Interaction* (New York and London: Routledge, 2011); R. van Krieken, *Celebrity Society* (New York and London: Routledge, 2012); K. Sternheimer, *Celebrity Culture and the American Dream: Stardom and Mobility,* 2nd ed. (New York: Routledge, 2015). See also D. Beer and R. Penfold-Mounce, "Researching Glossy Topics: The Case of the Academic Study of Celebrity," *Celebrity Studies* 1.3 (2010): 360–65. For a Marxist approach to celebrity, see P.D. Marshall, *Celebrity and Power: Fame in Contemporary Culture* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997).

[13] See R. Garland, *Celebrity in Antiquity: From Media Tarts to Tabloid Queens* (London: Duckworth, 2006). Note also L. Braudy (*The Frenzy of Renown: Fame and Its History* [New York: Vintage Books, 1997], 3–113), who traces the origins of celebrity back to Alexander the Great, followed hard on the heels by Cicero and Augustus. In sharp contrast, contrast F. Inglis (*A Short History of Celebrity* [Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2010]) who argues that the history of celebrity was set in motion by the Romantics during the eighteenth century. Because of the Romantic emphasis upon living for the passions, new ideologies about self-

answer to the question about the origins of modern celebrity is predetermined by the perspective (entertainment, politics, literature, philosophy, military?) with which the scholar, consciously unconsciously, approaches the question.[14] Furthermore, consideration must also be given to the countries and continents (Europe? England? America?) from which the choice of the majority of celebrities has been made, including the urban sophistication and media penetration of the regions in which each celebrity operated.[15] Once again, each of these factors will largely predetermine one's answers regarding the origins and development of celebrity, either at a national or trans-national level. What follows, therefore, is in no way meant to be a history of the rise of the modern celebrity. Rather the selection, spanning the eighteenth to the early twenty-first century, is illustrative of the phenomenon of fame and is provided as a useful counterpoint to our ensuing discussion of ancient celebrity. Needless to say, the selection below is determined, to some extent, by my personal interests.

1.1.1.1. The So-Called "Origins" of Modern Celebrity from the Eighteenth to the Twentieth Century: A Survey of Representative Figures

What candidates might be mooted as possibilities for being the originator of the modern celebrity cult? If one considers celebrity from a political perspective, then Giuseppe Garibaldi (1807–1882) looms large as a potential candidate for being the first modern celebrity. His numerous scandals, exotic war stories, adventuring spirit, and lofty idealism in spearheading the unification of Italy

---

hood and individuality emerged. Outlining a complex interaction of diverse forces, Inglis (*ibid.*, 5) posits the following pathway of development from the individualisation of the emotions towards the ultimate emergence of celebrity: "The rise of urban democracy, the two-hundred-year expansion of its media of communication, together with the radical individualisation of the modern sensibility made fame a much more transitory reward and changed public acclaim from an expression of devotion into one of celebrity."

[14] S. J. Morgan, in his review of Inglis, *A Short History of Celebrity*, correctly observes: "… the problem facing any student of celebrity is the sheer volume and bewildering variety of available subjects. Any choice of case studies will therefore be highly personal." See http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/review/994, accessed 19.04.2017.

[15] S. J. Morgan (review of Inglis, *A Short History of Celebrity*) makes a telling point about the importance of locale in the development of celebrity: "… the eastern United States played a vibrant role in international fame culture after the opening up of the literary lecture circuit in the 1830s, not to mention the intercontinental promotional activities of Phineas Barnum, who among other triumphs introduced the 'Swedish Nightingale' Jenny Lind to enraptured audiences across America in the 1850s. However, it does draw out very neatly the importance of major urban centres in providing the *necessary conditions* for the first celebrity cultures to thrive, including places to see and be seen, proximity to the centres of political and/or financial power, a thriving press and a large, literate audience. These are factors often ignored by contemporary theorists, who hold that the mass audiences and means of communication which enable the culture of celebrity to survive did not exist before the 20th century" (my emphasis). See http://www.history.ac.uk/reviews/review/994, accessed 19.04.2017.

meant that he dominated the attention of the international printing presses.[16] "Garibaldimania" even spread to Britain, but whether it permeated all the English provinces, or was merely a locally contested event fought out between the radicals and conservatives, as a recent study of 1854–1861 Newcastle-upon-Tyne has argued,[17] is beyond the scope of this work to determine.

By contrast, if the origins of modern celebrity are explored from the perspective of literature, then "Byromania" is another equally viable option.[18] The widespread international celebrity of Lord Byron (1788–1824), it has recently been argued,[19] was less generated by the publication of his poetry volumes than by his widespread fame in periodicals, newspapers and magazines of the time. However, there are other candidates who emerge as genuine possibilities for being among the first celebrities in the modern era, at least in an American context. The American poet Walt Whitman (1819–1892), for example, was famous for his volume of poems, the *Leaves of Grass*, rewritten and expanded over his career until the original 12 poems numbered over 400. But equally important for the promotion of Whitman's fame was a photograph taken of the poet by a Philadelphian firm, operated by Samuel Broadbent and W. Curtis Taylor. The much celebrated "Butterfly" portrait of Walt Whitman was taken by Taylor in the spring of 1877. It shows Whitman, in smoking jacket and large felt hat, looking intently at his extended right index finger, upon which had alighted a delicate butterfly with expanded wings.[20] As has been well observed of the photograph,[21] Whitman was a poseur of epic proportions who understood well "that photography was one of several cultural developments that would change the way in which literature was promoted and produced." Each of these potential candidates for first modern celebrity understood the centrality of the print media and photography for a much wider dissemination of their fame than they could achieve political and literary careers alone.

Irrespective of who might be thought to be the "first" celebrity from our three examples above, by the early twentieth century, famous literary elites (Ezra Pound, T.S. Eliot, James Joyce, Wyndham Lewis) continued to create

---

[16] L. Riall, *Garibaldi: Invention of a Hero* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2007); *idem*, "Garibaldi: The First Celebrity," *History Today* 57.8 (2007): 41–47.

[17] M.P. Sutcliffe, "Negotiating the 'Garibaldi Moment' in Newcastle-upon-Tyne (1854–1861)," *Modern Italy*, 15.2 (2010): 129–44.

[18] On Byromania, see F. Wilson, ed., *Byromania: Portraits of the Artist in Nineteenth and Twentieth Century Culture* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 1999); T. Mole, *Byron's Romantic Celebrity: Industrial Culture and the Hermeneutic of Intimacy* (Houndmills and New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2007); G. McDayter, *Byromania and the Birth of Celebrity Culture*, Studies in the Long Nineteenth Century Literature (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2009).

[19] See McDayter, *Byromania and the Birth of Celebrity Culture*.

[20] For the picture, see D.H. Blake, *Walt Whitman and the Culture of American Celebrity* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2006), 2.

[21] Blake, *Walt Whitman*, 4.

markets for their works and the establishment of their fame by networking, reviewing and editing their literary productions, even though they rejected the baseness of popular culture in preference for their own elite cultural products.[22] Similar networks operated between the American novelists Jack Kerouac and William S. Burroughs, the Beat Poets (Allen Ginsburg, Lawrence Ferlinghetti, Gregory Corso, among others), and Bob Dylan in the late 1950's and the early 1960's. Media influences were again prominent in these interconnections of fame. Ginsburg's photograph appeared on the album cover of *Bringing It All Back Home*, whereas in D.A. Pennebaker's documentary film, *Don't Look Back*, covering Dylan's 1965 UK tour, Ginsberg made a cameo appearance in the clip for Dylan's song *Subterranean Homesick Blues*.[23] Thus, by the time of the early twentieth century, media and literary networking was clearly a crucial step for the famous to acquire the exalted status of celebrity.

Also interesting for our purposes is how the mythology of celebrity was constructed and deconstructed in the twentieth century. Two examples from the American literary world will suffice. The American novelist Ernest Hemingway was often captured in iconic outdoor photographs, either fishing, hunting or attending bull fights. During the 1950's he was involved in two plane crashes, won the Nobel Prize, and five films were made from his fiction. Consequently, the "Hemingway myth" became inextricably entwined with his masculinity and the perception that he was a literary genius. Hemingway's quasi-mythological status as a male was reinforced at a popular cultural level by a host of articles titled "Hemingway, Rogue Male," "Hemingway: America's No 1 He-Man," "Hemingway: War, Women, Wine, and Words," and "Hemingway: King of the Vulgar Words and Seduction." Surprisingly, these were published in the trashy men's pulp magazines of the 1950's as opposed to the more elite male publications of Esquire and Playboy. This lurid and misogynistic genre of popular publishing enhanced Hemingways' status as a literary giant with a new audience, while also establishing him as an American mid-century icon of machismo.[24]

By contrast, the famous American novelist Philip Roth – winner of the 1960 National Book Award in Fiction with his first novella *Goodbye, Columbus* (1959) and author of the controversial *Portnoy's Complaint* (1969) – went on to win the Pulitzer Prize with his novel *American Pastoral* (1997). But, after this

---

[22] See A. Jaffe, *Modernism and the Culture of Celebrity* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

[23] See M. Jacobi, "Bob Dylan and Collaboration" and D.R. Schumway, "Dylan as Cultural Icon," in *The Cambridge Companion to Bob Dylan*, ed. K.J.H. Dettmar (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009), respectively, 69–79 and 110–21.

[24] See D.M. Earle, *All Man!: Hemingway, 1950s Men's Magazines, and the Masculine Persona* (Kent: Kent State University Press, 2009); T. Strychacz, "Masculinity," in *Ernest Hemingway in Context*, ed. D.A. Moddelmog and S. Del Gizzo (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), 277–86. More generally, see J. Smith, *The Thrill Makers: Celebrity, Masculinity, and Stunt Performance* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012).

high-point of fame, Roth re-evaluated the celebrity he had acquired, while, ironically, his subsequent novels went on to win further plaudits. The paradox is potent. A late surge of creativity in his mid-sixties after the Pulitzer Prize resulted in a series of novels whose quality was hailed by literary critics across the world.[25] However, as Roth explains in his valedictory interview with Alan Yentob for the BBC in 2014, summarised in *The Guardian* (May 17, 2004), he withdrew from the "celebrity game" while writing these new works:

(Roth) reports that, in old age, "the last thing I wanted to do was to make myself more visible then I already was. The visibility unnerved me. And so I moved to the country." Roth retreated to an isolated farmhouse in Connecticut. He describes, almost for the first time, the conditions under which he wrote the sequence of novels that followed *American Pastoral*. "I find it very congenial to live in the natural beauty of the place I have in Connecticut. I work during the day, do some exercise late in the day" – he swims regularly – "and so I haven't lost contact with what I've been doing all day."[26]

Roth's abdication from the celebrity circuit finds its counterparts in other modern writers and entertainers who, while remaining in the public eye of their profession, nevertheless critiqued the shallowness of the celebrity industry.[27]

---

[25] See *I Married a Communist* (1998), *The Human Stain* (2000), *The Dying Animal* (2001) and *The Plot Against America* (2004). For discussion, see M. Shipe, "The Twilight of the Superheroes: Philip Roth, Celebrity, and the End of Print Culture," in *Roth and Celebrity*, ed. A. Pozorski (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2013), 101–18.

[26] See "Bye-bye … Philip Roth talks of fame, sex and growing old in last interview," at https://www.theguardian.com › Arts › Books › Philip Roth, accessed 16.04.2017. For further discussion of Philip Roth and the phenomenon of celebrity, Pozorski, *Roth and Celebrity*, *passim*.

[27] For example, Mark Twain, the American novelist, writes regarding the universal seduction of fame: "Celebrity is what a boy or a youth longs for more than for any other thing. He would be a clown in a circus; he would be a pirate, he would sell himself to Satan, in order to attract attention and be talked about and envied. True, it is the same with every grown-up person; I am not meaning to confine this trait to the boys." Mark Twain, *Autobiography of Mark Twain, Vol. 2*, ed. H.E. Smith et al. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2013), 232. Numerous pop and rock stars show strong ambivalence about fame in their songs: e.g. David Bowie ("Fame;" "The Stars [Are Out Tonight]"); Harry Chapin ("W.O.L.D."); Counting Crows ("Have You Seen Me Lately"); Eagles ("After the Thrill is Gone"); Lady Gaga ("Paparazzi"); Billy Joel ("The Entertainer"); Josh Joplin ("Camera One"); Alanis Morissette ("Celebrity"); The Kinks ("Celluloid Heroes"); The Smashing Pumpkins ("Bullet with Butterfly Wings"); Peter Sarstedt ("Where Do You Go To My Lovely?"); Chris Rea ("Tennis"); Warren Zevon ("Splendid Isolation"). Supremely, Bob Dylan's song, "Desolation Row" – an apocalyptic depiction of the demise of modernity ranking in quality with T.S. Eliot's "The Waste Land" – invokes famous figures from the Bible (Noah, Cain, Abel, Good Samaritan), history (Einstein, Nero), fiction (Ophelia, Romeo, Cinderella), and literature (Ezra Pound, T.S. Eliot) as characters or allusions in the song. Dylan reduces these celebrated symbols of Western civilisation to absurdity in his desolate vision of the modern world. For an insightful discussion of the song, see C.H. Jones, *Bob Dylan and the End of the (Modern) World* (PhD diss., University of Texas, Dallas, 2013), 112–20. There is little doubt that the lyrical quality of songs like "Desolation Row" earned Dylan, controversially in the perspective of some, the Nobel Prize for Literature in October 2016.

The withdrawal of Roth from celebrity and his continuing literary success in self-imposed exile is diametrically opposed to how the American novelist Scott Fitzgerald, along with his manic depressive wife Zelda, were eventually undone by their celebrity. With the success of Scott's novel *This Side of Paradise* (1920), the Fizgeralds skilfully courted public fame by exploiting the (up till then) little ventured avenues of the popular press, magazines, theatre and cinema through the twenties and early thirties.[28] Scott dubbed Zelda as "the first American Flapper" of the Jazz Age[29] and portrayed himself as hedonistic and intellectual. But by 1935 their ascendant star had waned, plunging Scott into drunken degradation and a declining literary output until his eventual death in 1940,[30] while Zelda was confined to specialist clinics until her death by an outbreak of fire in her hospital in 1948.

The powerful role of the photojournalism in promoting celebrity in the first half of the twentieth century must not be underestimated.[31] R. Linkof, in an excellent thesis, explores the democratising effect of tabloid celebrity. He argues that between 1890 and 1940 there was a dissolution of the Victorian aristocratic social system, resulting in the emergence of the "photojournalistic culture of celebrity."[32] The traditional social hierarchies were overcome by bridging the distance between the privileged elites and mass audiences through the photos taken of the elites, which were published for all to see in the popular tabloids (e.g. *Picture Post*, *Tatler*, *Illustrated News*, *Daily Mirror*).[33] A radical change in conceptions of class and social difference occurred with the emergence of the press photographer as a social actor.[34] The glamourous "debutante" balls of the aristocracy were widely photographed,[35] and, with the gradual decline of the aristocracy, all their social events became an excuse for a torrent of self-advertisement in the tabloids.[36] This was not by any means the preserve of the aristocracy: the "lighter side of the war" in 1916 was captured with pictures of smiling

[28] See T.W. Galow, *Writing Celebrity: Stein, Fitzgerald, and the Modern(ist) Art of Self-Fashioning* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011); R. Prigozy, "Introduction: Scott, Zelda, and the Culture of Celebrity," in *The Cambridge Companion to Scott Fitzgerald,* ed. R. Prigozy (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 2002), 1–27.

[29] The Jazz Age is brilliantly depicted in Fitzgerald's *The Great Gatsby* (1925) and in Baz Luhrmann's 2013 film of the novel. See the interesting comparison between the book and the film provided by D.R. Shumway "Gatsby, the Jazz Age, and Luhrmann Land," *The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* 14 (2015): 132–37. On the Jazz Age, see F. Scott Fitzgerald's essay, "Echoes of the Jazz Age," *Scribner's Magazine* 90.5 (1931): 459–65.

[30] *The Last Tycoon* remained unfinished at Fitzgerald's death and was published in 1941.

[31] See R. Linkof, *The Public Eye: Celebrity and Photojournalism in the Making of the British Tabloids, 1904–1938* (PhD thesis, University of Southern California, 2011).

[32] Linkof, *The Public Eye*, 33.

[33] Linkof, *The Public Eye*, 41–47, 55–59.

[34] Linkof, *The Public Eye*, 31–32, 53.

[35] Linkof, *The Public Eye*, 301–22.

[36] Linkof, *The Public Eye*, 320.

nurses and soldiers on the Western Front.[37] Thus the consolidation of Fleet Street in the first half of the twentieth century as the mainstay of the newspaper industry led inexorably to the rise of the paparazzi and the stalking of celebrities which are so much part of modern culture.

Last, the famous book of D.J. Boorstin revealed with great clarity for his American readers the image-dominated celebrity culture that had begun to emerge in the USA by the early 1960's.[38] Boorstin argued that American culture was being increasingly infiltrated by "the menace of unreality"[39] in the form of a media-constructed reality, which was orchestrated by "pseudo-events" (e.g. the ubiquitous television debate). These pseudo-events, Boorstin opined, tended "to be more interesting and more attractive than spontaneous events," because they were controlled and calculated, but, consequently, less "real."[40] In particular, the *human* pseudo-event increasingly dominated twentieth century society. Here untalented celebrities become media fabrications "known for (their) well-knownness" (e.g. Zsa Zsa Gabor) as opposed to any accomplishment of lasting social or cultural value.[41] Boorstin's analysis was prophetic. The rampantly narcissistic worlds of Paris Hilton, the Kardashians, and Donald Trump would inevitably appear at the beginning of the new century.[42]

But even before the self-absorption of banal celebrities, along with their adoring cohorts, had gripped popular culture, an increasing preoccupation with public fame is reflected in the shift in value priorities espoused in the top "tween" TV shows from 1967 to 2007.[43] This change in value priorities is particularly telling. "Fame" was rated as the top value in 2007, followed hard on the heels by "Achievement" and "Popularity" in second and third place, whereas "Fame" had only been rated fifteenth (out of sixteen) in previous decades. By contrast, "Community Feeling" dropped to eleventh in 2007, whereas it had been first in 1967, 1977, and 1997, and second in 1987.[44] But, by 2007, self-assertion and individualism had eclipsed the moral tradition of social consciousness in "tween"

---

[37] Linkof, *The Public Eye*, 97–101.

[38] D.J. Boorstin, *The Image: A Guide to Pseudo-events in America* (New York: Atheneum, 1961). For a helpful discussion of the significance of Boorstin's book, see N. Gabler, "Toward a New Definition of Celebrity – the Norman Lear Center," at https://learcenter.org/pdf/Gabler.pdf, accessed 07.09.2017.

[39] Boorstin, *The Image*, 57.

[40] Boorstin, *The Image*, 37.

[41] Boorstin, *The Image*, 57; cf. "A sign of a celebrity is often that his name is worth more than his services" (*ibid*., 220).

[42] On celebrity and Donald Trump, see P. Dreier, "Zsa Zsa, Donald, and America's Celebrity Culture," at http://www.huffingtonpost.com/peter-dreier/zsa-zsa-and-donald_b_13716396.html, accessed 07.09.2017.

[43] See Y.T. Uhls and P.M. Greenfield, "The Rise of Fame: An Historical Content Analysis," Cyberpsychology 5.1. (2011) at https://cyberpsychology.eu/article/view/4243/3289, accessed 08.09.2017.

[44] See Uhls and Greenfield, "The Rise of Fame," Table 4.

TV culture. Y.T. Uhls and P.M. Greenfield conclude regarding TV shows like *Hannah Montana*, which depict highly successful teenagers living out their "career dream" amidst their drab and dull peers: "it is likely that tweens observing teenage characters with high status jobs that emphasize public recognition and material success will aspire to be like these social models."[45] This slavish imitation of vacuous "show biz" icons will inevitably breed a superficial and self-obsessed set of "disciples" who will not sacrificially invest themselves for others beyond either their immediate circle or their own self-interest. Nor will they experience the radical moral transformation that occurs from the early Christian understanding of our indebtedness to God and, consequently, our obligation to meet the needs of others (Rom 13:8–10), no matter who that might be (12:9–21; cf. Luke 6:27–36).

What features of celebrity are prominent in the early years of the first quarter of the twenty-first century?

1.1.1.2. Celebrity in the Early Twenty-First Century

In this section, the new trends in the international celebrity cult are briefly flagged and analysed. At the outset, perhaps the most important trend among the recent developments of international celebrity, departing from its largely elite focus, is the "decisive turn towards the ordinary."[46] First, the advent of reality TV (e.g. *Big Brother*, *Survivor*, *The Apprentice*, *The Bachelor*, *The X Factor*, *The Voice*) and the Internet has spawned a "celebrity culture … increasingly populated by unexceptional people who have become famous and by stars who have been made ordinary."[47] There is a distinct cycle of fame (or "six stages of celebrity") for participants in these programmes.[48] Even elite versions of these shows have been devised (*Dancing with the Stars*, *Celebrity Survivor*).[49]

---

[45] Uhls and Greenfield, "The Rise of Fame."

[46] J. Gamson, "The Unwatched Life Is Not Worth Living: The Elevation of the Ordinary in Celebrity Culture," *PMLA* 126.4 (2011): 1061–69, at 1061–62. See also P.D. Marshall, "The Promotion and Presentation of the Self: Celebrity as a Marker of Presentational Media," *Celebrity Studies* 1.1 (2010): 35–48.

[47] Gamson, "The Unwatched Life," 1062. Whereas in the old Hollywood studio system before the late 1940's "celebrity was tightly controlled," now "one often encounters photos that demonstrate simultaneously celebrities' extraordinary glamour and awesome beauty on the red carpet and their just-like-us, unglamorous trips to the grocery store or a restaurant." Further, from the 1970's onwards the gossip columns and tabloids "puncture the public image of celebrities with the often sordid or ugly 'truths' of their private lives, their ordinary human foibles, their feet of clay" (*ibid.*, 1063).

[48] See R.A. Deller, "Star Image, Celebrity Reality Television and the Fame Cycle," *Celebrity Studies* 7.3 (2016): 373–89. See also L.C. Hellmueller and N. Aeschbacher, "Media and Celebrity: Production and Consumption of 'Well-Knownness'," *Communication and Research Trends* 29.4 (2010): 3–35.

[49] Gamson, "The Unwatched Life," 1065, 1066. As Gamson explains (*ibid.*, 1065), "The Internet drastically widens the pool of potential celebrities by lowering the entry barriers – a

Index of References

Old Testament

Apocrypha

Pseudepigrapha

Rabbinic Literature

Qumran

New Testament

Ancient Literary Sources

Inscriptions

Papyri

Coins

Ostraca

Modern Author Index

Subject Index