NEIL MARTIN

Regression in Galatians

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 2. Reihe 530

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament · 2. Reihe

Herausgeber / Editor Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber/Associate Editors

Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala)

Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) · Janet Spittler (Charlottesville, VA)

J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)

530



Neil Martin

Regression in Galatians

Paul and the Gentile Response to Jewish Law

Neil Martin, born 1973; 2008–11 Vice President of Innovation for Zondervan Harper Collins in Grand Rapids, Michigan; 2011–13 Associate Pastor of Crossroads Bible Church in Grand Rapids; 2019 DPhil in New Testament at Oxford University; currently Biblical Studies Tutor at the Pastors' Academy in London as well as serving on the staff of Oxford Evangelical Presbyterian Church.

orcid.org/0000-0001-7294-9010

ISBN 978-3-16-159762-6/eISBN 978-3-16-159763-3 DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-159763-3

ISSN 0340-9570/eISSN 2568-7484 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 2. Reihe)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data are available at http://dnb.dnb.de.

© 2020 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany. www.mohrsiebeck.com

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was printed on non-aging paper by Laupp & Göbel in Gomaringen, and bound by Buchbinderei Nädele in Nehren.

Printed in Germany.

οί ύπομένοντες τον θεόν ἀλλάξουσιν ἰσχύν

Acknowledgements

This monograph is a slightly-revised version of my DPhil thesis, submitted to the Faculty of Theology and Religion at Oxford University in August 2019. The project has its origins in a classroom question put to Professor Jeff Weima during an inspiring series of lectures on New Testament letters at Calvin Seminary in the Spring of 2013. Gal 4.8–11 was the topic of discussion, and I still remember the moment clearly:

If Gentile Christians in Galatia were under pressure to embrace Jewish Law, why did Paul accuse them of going back to something they had done *before*? Was it because they were thinking about Judaism in the way they used to think about their pagan past?

As soon as the idea formed in my mind, I was hooked. Might this help explain Paul's notorious negativity about law in the letter? Might it even clarify the central dichotomy between works of the law and faith? By the autumn of that year, the question had become a DPhil proposal, by the following summer I had moved with my whole family to Oxford to begin an academic journey that would go on to stretch and energise me more than I could ever have imagined.

In my lengthy list of thank-yous, first place goes to my supervisor, Professor Markus Bockmuehl, whose warmth, humour, and kindness at difficult moments – maintained while never relaxing his formidably high academic expectations – are the main external influences under which this project has grown to maturity. His gentle but persistent pulling at loose threads, his relentless prioritisation of primary sources and original languages, his armchair excursuses into potentially-helpful adjacent fields of interest (of which his knowledge is bafflingly encyclopaedic) have left their mark on every paragraph. Together with Professor Jörg Frey and the team at Mohr Siebeck, I would also like to thank him for facilitating the project's publication.

Alongside Professor Weima, early encouragers included Professors Douglas Moo and Mary Vanden Berg. Professors David Lincicum and Justin Hardin offered valuable orientations to doctoral work at Oxford. Professor Peter Thonemann generously shared his vast expertise in the first-century epigraphy of Asia Minor. Professors Teresa Morgan and Jennifer Strawbridge provided incisive feedback as assessors in internal oral evaluations. Particular thanks go to my examiners, Professors Nathan Eubank and Cilliers Breytenbach, whose mastery of the subject area and interest in the research question yielded the blend of encouragement and detailed feedback that has driven the process of

refinement for publication. To all these I am very grateful while continuing to accept responsibility for the demerits of the project as my own.

Many kind individuals have helped me in various ways along this journey. Kylie Crabbe was my one-woman guide to the arcane inner-workings of the Oxford system. Ed Brooks and Mark Earngey lightened the atmosphere as *Studienkameraden* in German. Matt Albanese, did a far better job of understanding my work in Galatians than I did his in Septuagint Isaiah. Neither Ruth nor I have words enough to thank our dear friends Pat Brittenden and Andy Young for their wisdom, support, and timely encouragements to keep going.

Several scholars read portions of the manuscript prior to submission. Drs David Rudolph and Mark Garcia made formative contributions. My new boss, Dr Garry Williams at the Pastors' Academy in London, read and made comments on the entire thesis. Clarissa Boehm offered valuable assistance with Latin translations, Hannah DiWakar with German, and Ruth with French.

This project was funded through a trust overseen and supported by members of Crossroads Bible Church in Grand Rapids where I served as Associate Pastor during my studies at Calvin – among them too many dear friends to name. Particular thanks go to Rod Van Solkema, to John and Rosa Vander Kolk, and to the B-Less board: Tony and Mary-Ellen Kubat, Justin and Marguerite Sellers, Trip and Kelly Corl, Derek and Tiffany DeLange, Dan and Faith Van Enk, and Don and Lynn Howe. Because of you, part of our hearts will always be in Michigan. We deeply appreciate your ongoing partnership in the gospel.

At home, I realise now that three of our four amazing children have no clear memory of life before Daddy became deeply engrossed in Galatians. 'When will you finish your Theseus?' became our familiar breakfast-table refrain (and where can you go after that? An Odysseus?) Ginny, Willow, Sam and Robin have been patient, enthusiastic, and interested beyond anything remotely resembling the call of duty. I love you all so much! Under my desk, special credit goes to my four-legged research assistant, Nornour, without whose insistence on regular riverside walks many of the key moments of inspiration captured in this book might never have happened. But above all, thanks are due once again to my wonderful wife, to my better half, and to my chief blessing in this world, Ruth. It has been and it remains an honour and a pleasure to pursue and to depend wholly upon Paul's God together, sweetheart. With you, I lay this book at his feet, praying anything that is true will find its target, and anything that is not will be forgotten.

Seven years on from the beginning of this journey, it's a poignant moment to be finally releasing the fruits of my labours into the world. This project has been a companion, a teacher, a task-master, an adversary, and a source of inspiration for longer than anything else I have ever worked on. I wouldn't have missed it for the world. Next time I ask a smart alec question in class, though, I'll make sure the answer doesn't need *quite* so much Greek!

Contents

Acknowledgements	VII
Maps, Figures, and Tables	XV
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1. Regression in Galatians	1
2. Proposal	4
3. Consequences	5
4. Methodology	5
5. Argument	6
Chapter 2: Galatians in Context: Where? When? Who?	13
1. Introduction	13
2. Where Were the Galatian Churches?	14
3. When Was Galatians Written?	25
4. Galatians: Dramatis Personae	37
4.1 Paul	
4.2 The Galatians 4.3 The Influencers	
5. Conclusion	
Chapter 3: Galatians in the Pagan Religious Context	
of Asia Minor	49
1. Introduction	49

X Contents

2. Sources	51
2.1 Literary Sources	51
2.1.1 Strabo	
2.1.2 Pliny the Younger	53
2.1.3 Dio Chrysostom	
2.1.4 Pausanias	
2.1.5 Aelius Aristides	
2.1.6 Apollonius of Tyana	
2.2 Epigraphic Sources	
2.2.1 Votive Offerings	
2.2.2 Confession Inscriptions	
2.2.3 Funeral Dedications, Doorstones, and Honorary	
Inscriptions	66
2.2.4 Curses and Magical Texts	68
3. Analysis	71
·	
3.1 Regional Specificity	
3.2 Religious Change	
3.3 Ethical Consciousness	
3.4 Religious Motivation	
3.5 Reciprocity in Divine-Human Relationships	
3.5.1 Non-Circularity	
3.5.2 Priority	
3.5.3 Incongruity and Efficacy	
3.5.4 Superabundance and Singularity	
3.6 Tangible and Lasting Memorialisations of Devotion	84
4. Galatians in the Pagan Religious Context of Asia Minor	86
4.1 Galatians and the Emperor Cult	86
4.1.1 Background	
4.1.2 Application and Critique	
4.1.2.1 Bruce Winter	
4.1.2.2 Brigitte Kahl	
4.1.2.3 Justin Hardin	
4.1.2.4 Thomas Witulski	
4.2 Galatians and "Indigenous" Anatolian Cults	
4.2.1 Background	94
4.2.2 Application and Critique	
4.2.2.1 Clinton Arnold	
4.2.2.2 Susan Elliott	
5 Conclusion	90

Contents XI

Chapter 4: Paul and Returning to Paganism	101
1. Introduction	101
2. Paul and the Gentiles	101
3. Paul and the Challenge of Pastoring Gentile Converts	104
3.1 1 Corinthians 8.1–13	
3.2 Romans 14.1–15.13	
4. Enslavement to the Stoicheia	112
4.1 Enslavement in Context	
4.2 Enslavement to the Stoicheia as a Jewish Experience	
4.3 Enslavement to the Stoicheia as a Gentile Experience	
4.3.1 Knowledge of God in Gal 4.8–11	
4.3.2 Repetition Vocabulary in Gal 4.8–11	117
4.4 The Stoicheia as Common Components of Religious	4.00
Practice	120
4.4.1 Martinus de Boer – Judaism, Paganism, and	101
Calendrical Observances	121
4.4.2 J. Louis Martyn – Judaism, Paganism, and Cosmic	100
Dualities	122
of Worth	123
4.4.4 Returning to the Stoicheia tou Kosmou	
5. Enslavement to the Stoicheia and its Parallels	131
5.1 Enslavement to the Stoicheia and the Curse of the Law	131
5.2 Paul on Jews and Religious Works	132
5.3 Paul on Gentiles and Religious Works	135
6. Conclusion	139
7. Excursus – Mission and Habituation after the New Testament	140
Chapter 5: Galatians in the Jewish Religious Context of Asia Minor	143
1. Introduction	143
2. Sources	147
2.1 Literary Sources	149

XII Contents

2.1.1 Jewish Literary Sources	149
2.1.2 Pagan Literary Sources	149
2.1.3 Christian Literary Sources	152
2.2 Material Culture	
2.2.1 The Synagogues at Sardis and Priene	157
2.2.2 The Noah Coins of Apamea Kibotos	
2.3 Epigraphic Sources	
2.3.1 Vows	
2.3.2 Grave Inscriptions	
2.3.3 Dedications	
2.3.4 Declarations of Loyalty	
2.3.5 Magical Texts	167
3. Analysis	169
3.1 Distinctiveness	169
3.2 Hostility	170
3.3 Engagement	
3.4 Sympathisation	172
3.5 Integration.	
3.6 Conversion	175
4. Galatians in the Jewish Religious Context of Asia Minor	177
4.1 Is Paul Talking About Regression to Godfearer Status?	177
4.2 Is Paul Talking About Regression Construed More Broadly?	
5. Conclusion	183
6. Postscript – Regression and Pauline Christianity	187
Chapter 6: The Galatian Reception of the Influencers' Me	_
	193
1. Introduction	193
2. Paul Within Judaism	194
2.1 Matthew Thiessen – Proselyte Status as an Invalid Category	194
2.2 Michael Wyschogrod – Ongoing Obligation to the Noachide	
Laws	198
2.3 Paula Fredriksen – Gentile Circumcision as an Historical	
Anomaly	199
3. Regression as a Rhetorical Ploy	201
- · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	

Contents	XIII
----------	------

3.1 Similarities Between Jewish Christianity and Paganism3.2 Similarities and Differences Between Jewish Christianity	202
and Paganism	206
4. Regression and Non-Circularity	208
4.1 Different Forms of Non-Circularity	210
4.2 Non-Circularity and the Actors in Galatians	
4.2.1 Paul's Audience	
4.2.2 Paul Himself	
4.2.3 The Influencers	
4.3 Regression and Non-Circularity	215
5. Postscript: Regression in the History of Reception	216
5.1 Ignatius' Letters	218
5.2 Justin's Dialogue with Trypho	
5.3 Origen	
6. Conclusion	222
Chapter 7: Conclusion	225
Bibliography	231
1. Primary Sources	231
2. Secondary Literature	243
Index of Ancient Sources	263
Index of Modern Authors	287
Index of Subjects	293
Index of Places	305

Maps, Figures, and Tables

Map 1	Asia Minor – Select Ancient Sites	16
Map 2	Asia Minor – Graeco-Roman Epigraphy and Material Culture	52
Map 3	Asia Minor – Jewish Epigraphy and Material Culture	148
Fig. 1	Tentative Pauline Chronology	36
Fig. 2	Votive dedication. Pisidian Antioch. Sanctuary of Mēn Askaēnos. Roman Imperial Period. Reproduced courtesy of Cambridge University Press.	64
Fig. 3	Matar standing flanked by lions. Arslankaya Rock, Western Phrygia. Early sixth century B.C. Reproduced courtesy of Brill Academic Publishers.	75
Fig. 4	Meter seated with lion. Gordion. Late third/early second century B.C. Reproduced courtesy of the Gordion Excavation Project.	75
Fig. 5	Meter with headdress and tympanum, standing with Attis and lion. Provenance unknown. Late second century B.C. Museo Archeologico, Venice. Photo: Luisa Ricciarini. Reproduced courtesy of Bridgeman Images.	75
Fig. 6	Noah Coins. Apamea. Early second century A.D. Public domain.	160
Fig. 7	The Role of the στοιχεῖα in the Galatian Crisis	207

Table 1	στοιχεῖον citations, Blinzler Corpus. Reproduced courtesy of SAGE Publications.	129
Table 2	στοιχεῖον citations, First Century B.C. and A.D. Corpus. Reproduced courtesy of SAGE Publications.	130

Maps produced in collaboration with Michael Athanson, deputy Map Librarian and Geospatial Data Specialist at the Bodleian Libraries, University of Oxford. Map Data provided by ArcGIS Image Service.

All scripture references are cited from the New Revised Standard Version

unless otherwise noted.

Chapter 1

Introduction

1. Regression in Galatians

Paul's letter to the Galatians prickles with restless concern. Jewish Christian Influencers are teaching his Gentile readers that faith in Christ requires thoroughgoing identification with the Jewish people and their religious customs. If they capitulate – in Paul's mind at least – a return to *the norms of their pagan past* will necessarily follow.

In what sense could this possibly be true? Is Judaism now equivalent to pagan worship in Paul's mind? And if not, why does he oppose the Galatians' openness to Jewish calendrical commitments and dietary restrictions and even to circumcision with such passion? Why not rather welcome these things as encouraging signs of commitment? In the ancient world, conversion to Judaism involved a radical reconstitution of ethnic identity – "abandoning," as Philo has it, "kinsfolk,... country,... customs,... temples and... gods" (*Virtues* 102). So why does Paul describe it in Galatians using the language of *regression*?

Gal 4.8–11, with its extraordinary concentration of regressive terminology, stands at the centre of this interpretative enigma:

Formerly, when you did not know God, you were enslaved to beings that by nature are not gods. Now, however, that you have come to know God, or rather to be known by God, how can you turn back again to the weak and beggarly στοιχεῖα?¹ How can you want to be enslaved to them again? You are observing special days, and months, and seasons, and years. I am afraid that my work for you may have been wasted.

The interest in "days, and months, and seasons, and years" to which Paul alludes in these verses has been triggered, we assume, by the ministry of the *Jewish* Christian Influencers at work among his readers. The reference to "beings that by nature are not gods," however, clearly signals the simultaneous relevance of their past *pagan* commitments to the present crisis. In some sense, accepting Jewish Law is reanimating that past – even to the point where their knowledge of God is in doubt. Paul's use of the verb $\dot{\epsilon}\pi\iota\sigma\tau\rho\dot{\epsilon}\phi\omega$ (Gal 4.9) powerfully captures the sense of returning to a past state. For the Galatians, in Paul's opinion, Jewish Law traced the path back to slavery.

l Paul's use of the notoriously fluid term στοιχεῖα in Galatians will be analysed in detail in Chapter 4. Until that point in the argument, the word is rendered in the original Greek.

This passage, however, is only the tip of the regressive iceberg.² Paul frames his diagnosis in regressive terms in Gal 3.3, strikingly dichotomising terms for beginning (ἐνάρχομαι) and completing (ἐπιτελέω). The paired narratives of 3.23–29 and 4.1–7 are predicated on the danger and folly of regression: Those who trust in Christ have been liberated from the supervision of the law as a παιδαγωγός (3.24-5) - how can they now willingly return to this state of bondage? Those who trust in Christ have entered into their long-promised inheritance as sons of God (4.4-5) – how can they now willingly return to the state of heirs under "guardians and managers" (ὑπὸ ἐπιτρόπους καὶ οἰκονόμους – 4.2)? Regression broods over Paul's allegorical interpretation of the Abraham narrative in 4.21–31 – embracing Jewish law implies turning back from Sarah to Hagar, from the new covenant to the old. Regression is reemphasised in 5.1 – "For freedom Christ has set us free. Stand firm, therefore, and do not submit again to a yoke of slavery" (emphasis mine). Capitulation to the Influencers in 5.4 entails "falling away from grace" (ἐκπίπτω). The striking use of the Aorist, ἐτρέχετε, in 5.7 highlights the fact that the Galatians are no longer running well. Even in Paul's retelling of the Antioch incident, the problem with Peter's behaviour is couched in regressive terms. Peter had built again (πάλιν οἰκοδομῶ) "the very things that [he] once tore down," thus demonstrating his identity as a "transgressor" (2.18) – a fault from which Paul is clearly keen to exonerate himself (cf. 5.11).

Throughout Christian history, careful readers of the letter have wrestled with the tension that this diagnosis of regression introduces into Paul's argument. Augustine captures the problem with typical clarity in his commentary on Gal 4.8–9: "When [Paul] says *turn back* he is certainly not saying that they are turning back to circumcision – they had never been circumcised" (*Com. Gal.* 33.3). Even if the Galatians had been enthusiastic participants in local Jewish communities prior to Paul's arrival, regression hardly covers their new passion for *exclusive* devotion to the God of Israel. Augustine prefigures traditional reformation exegesis in his response to this difficulty, bridging the gap between paganism and Judaism *from the Jewish side*. Like pagans, he argues, Jews were obsessed with the "slavish" observance of legal rites to the extent that they were "carnal" (*Com. Gal.* 34.4). Only when Judaism had been subjected to this "carnal" distortion can it be equated to paganism and embracing Judaism to regression. By making these equations, Paul was launching a direct assault on his religious past.

But should the same Paul who willingly divided the work of global evangelisation with law-observant Jewish Christians in Gal 2.9 be thought to condemn Jewish rites as the equivalent of enslavement to pagan gods only two chapters later? Not all early Christian authors were willing to accept this result. For

² Elliott, 2003, 254-5.

Jerome, Jewish law was only "weak and miserable" in comparison to the new dispensation revealed in Christ (*Com. Gal.* 4.9). His interpretative instinct remains influential today thanks, in large part, to J. Louis Martyn and John Barclay, for whom Sabbath-observance and circumcision are equivalent to paganism in Galatians only in the sense that they represent a return to the logic of "the old age" prior to Christ's coming.³ Shaped by Paul's emphasis on "special days, and months, and seasons, and years," Ambrosiaster's concentration on calendrical observances as the key point of contact between the Galatians' pagan background and the Jewish Christianity of the Influencers (*Com. Gal.* 4.10) also finds a modern echo in the work of Martinus de Boer.⁴

Emphasising the rhetorical impact of Paul's regression language is not, however, the only way to facilitate more positive interpretations of his attitude to his Jewish heritage. The problem in Galatia might have had less to do with the unacceptability of Jewish legal observances themselves than it did with their use for purposes the apostle deemed unacceptable. Following James Dunn and N. T. Wright, many interpreters trace the origins of the Galatian crisis to the use of law as a racial identity marker without which Gentiles lacked the necessary qualifications for fellowship with Jews.⁵

In recent years, contextual studies have sought solutions to the regression problem in a deeper understanding of the Galatians' religious background. For Justin Hardin, Brigitte Kahl, Bruce Winter, and Thomas Witulski, the Galatians' submission to Jewish law was an attempt to negotiate their obligations to the emperor cult, "normalising" their abstention from participation in various ways. For Susan Elliott and Clinton Arnold, their attraction to Jewish law is to be understood with reference to the analogous attractions of local pagan cults. Recent contributions from the "Paul within Judaism" school question whether the argument of Galatians applies to Jews at all, explaining the extremity of Paul's concern on the basis that legal observances were inappropriate for Gentiles though remaining thoroughly appropriate for Jews. The specific accusation of regression, however, remains unexplained.

Each of these interpretative possibilities will be subjected to detailed scrutiny in the chapters that follow. Wherever regression is explicitly confronted, however, we find the attempts to explain Paul's logic inadequate. None of the alternatives satisfactorily tackles *both* the bluntness with which the Apostle associates his readers' behaviour with their pagan past *and* the tension between

³ Martyn, 1997a, 393–400; Barclay, 2015, 389–91; 404–10.

⁴ De Boer, 2011, 252-61.

⁵ E.g. Dunn, 2006b, 352–3; Dunn, 2008, 8–9, 12, 17, 23–8; Wright, 1991, 3; Wright, 1997, 29–35.

⁶ Hardin, 2008; Kahl, 2009; Winter, 1994, 123-43; Winter, 2015, 226-49 Witulski, 2000.

⁷ Elliott, 1999, 661–83; Elliott, 2003; Arnold, 2005, 429–49.

⁸ Thiessen, 2016; Fredriksen, 2017; Wyschogrod, 2004, 188-201.

his apparent acceptance of law-observance among Jews (Gal 5.3, 6; 6.15) and his insistence upon its dangers among Gentiles (3.4, 4.11, 5.2, 4).

2. Proposal

In this study, I propose that Paul's warnings about regression are more central to his overarching argument than has been acknowledged in extant works. As I read his intentions, the heart of the problem with the Galatians' incipient conversion lay *neither* in the supposition that Judaism was inherently "legalistic," *nor* in the supposition that Jewish legal observances, though valuable in themselves, were being used to erect false boundaries around God's covenant community. The problem lay rather in their capacity to trigger *the reanimation of religious assumptions to which the Galatians had become habituated in their pagan past* (Gal 4.8–11) fundamentally distorting and even eviscerating their Christian faith (4.11; 5.2–4).

As in 1 Cor 8.1–13 – where Paul, I argue, addresses a situation closely parallel to the situation in Galatia – "strong" Christians were encouraging "weak" Christians to embrace practices that were powerfully associated with religious assumptions rooted in their pagan background. In Galatia, however, the problem was not actual re-immersion in local cults. The problem was exposure, under the auspices of Jewish Christianity, to basic components of religious practice familiar from their past, and the consequent reanimation of the assumptions habitually associated with those practices in the present.

Paul, I argue, did *not* equate paganism and Judaism in Galatians, neither did he deny that it was possible or desirable for ethnic Jews to remain law-observant as believers in Christ. His concern focused on the fundamental components of religious practice they shared. He did not believe that Jewish Christianity, as it was being (mis)appropriated by his readers, was the same thing as Jewish Christianity as it was being practiced by ethnic Jews, and his critique of this (mis)appropriation of Judaism should not be understood as a critique of Judaism itself. His concern was rather with *the Galatians' reception of Jewish law*. Paul feared that the ministry of the Influencers was reawakening expectations characteristic of the Galatians' *pagan* past – expectations about the efficacy of religious works that Paul deemed inimical both to Judaism and to faith in Christ.

⁹ Contra Martin, 1995, 437–61. See also Hardin, 2008, 141–2.

3. Consequences

In the light of this proposal, I conclude that the dispute between the Apostle and the Influencers in Galatia was less theological than it was pastoral and missiological. Paul's animus towards the Influencers was not focused so much on what they said as it was on who they were saying it to, and on their failure to anticipate or accommodate the weaknesses that he perceived among this audience – weaknesses connected to the enduring magnetism and intuitive plausibility of their entrenched religious presuppositions.

These conclusions have significant consequences for our reading of the letter. The Galatian crisis becomes a worked example of Paul's larger theology of accommodation – a concrete manifestation of the dire consequences that he anticipated for "weak" Christians exposed to the inconsiderate behaviour of "strong" Christians (1 Cor 8.11; Rom 14.15, 20–21). The key dichotomy between faith and works in Gal 2–3 is also radically recontextualised. The emphasis shifts from a comparison between faith as Paul saw it and works as they appeared to his Jewish contemporaries, to a comparison between faith viewed from an integrated Pauline/Jewish perspective and works viewed from the pagan perspective – or at least from the pagan perspective as Paul conceived it.

4. Methodology

Where were the Galatian churches? When was the letter written? Who were the Influencers in Galatia and what were their motives? These classic contextual questions, kindled by the frustrating reality that we are eavesdropping on just one side of a many-sided conversation, rightly occupy the attention of all serious exegetes. In this study, while competing solutions are reviewed and the boundaries around what can be known with confidence are assessed and respected, I neither attempt, nor defend, a complete reconstruction of my own. Definition is sought only to the extent that it is necessary to adjudicate the proposal.

Extrabiblical data illuminating potential components of the Galatians' religious background are used to define the envelope of possible options, to shape and test the proposal, and to facilitate the assessment of alternative solutions. The quest for a complete, objective, or prescriptive account of this background, however, is explicitly eschewed as illusory. I do not seek to discern or to define the essential attributes of pagan, Jewish, or Christian worship, or to mount an objective comparison between them. My focus lies rather on Paul's assertion that embracing Jewish-Christian observances entailed regression *for his readers* and *on what he thought this meant*.

Other contributors to the regression question have sought to identify *features that are unique to the religious background of the region* and to use these

features to a greater or lesser extent to control exegesis. ¹⁰ While sources that may constitute evidence of distinctive local religious practices and assumptions are considered in this study, however, I do not make such distinctiveness a criterion for consideration. I am interested in *both* the total religious experience of the Galatians – including commonplaces of belief and practice as well as local peculiarities to the extent that we have access to either from the available data, *and* Paul's distinctive personal perspective on that experience as we find it encoded in his correspondence, interpreted in the light of his larger Jewish milieu.

5. Argument

In broad outline, the argument of the following chapters alternates between biblical exegesis and scrutiny of extrabiblical data, before drawing conclusions. Exegesis moves progressively from a wide to a narrow field, from situating Paul and the Galatian letter in their larger chronological and geographical context to engagement with the specific concerns of the Galatian crisis and regression as Paul's central diagnostic motif. Assessment of extrabiblical sources from the region begins with the Graeco-Roman religious background and progresses to the Jewish religious background.

Chapter 2: Galatians in Context: Where? When? Who?

Chapter 2 situates the project within the larger landscape of research into the underlying historical context of Galatians, exploring the major options and defining the limited number of commitments which will form the handrails for our discussion as it progresses.

While noting the historical importance of the debate about northern and southern Galatian destinations for the letter and the present (and perhaps decisive) renaissance of the southern option, for this project, the viability and importance of decoupling questions about location from questions about the readers' pre-existent religious sensibilities is stressed.

Chronological questions are pursued in some depth, weighing the relative strength of the various sources and datums relevant to the foundation of the Galatian churches and the writing of the letter with reference to Jewett, Campbell and other key interlocutors, and drawing on travel data made available through the Stanford Geospatial Network Model of the Roman World, ORBIS. 11 For this project, however, the primary conclusion is uncontroversial:

¹⁰ E.g. Elliott, 1999; Elliott, 2003; Arnold, 2005, 429-49; Witulski, 2000, 204-18.

¹¹ Jewett, 1979; Campbell, 2014; www.orbis.stanford.edu.

5. Argument 7

whenever Paul wrote the letter to the Galatians, the congregations he addressed were still relatively immature.

Paul, the Galatians, and the Influencers are each briefly introduced on the basis of the available data. Here it becomes apparent that agnosticism with respect to the identity and motives of the Influencers is not only *necessary* for secure exegesis but that it also forms *no obstacle* to satisfying exegesis. For structural efficiency in the argument that follows I assume the Influencers were ethnic Jews, but the underlying logic of the proposal is unaffected by alterative characterisations.

Chapter 3: Galatians in the Pagan Religious Context of Asia Minor

Chapter 3 begins to probe the question of the Galatians' religious background. The letter famously, and infuriatingly, offers us only *Paul's* perspective on the crisis it addresses; there are no sources to which we can appeal to adjudicate the nature of the problem as *his readers* would have seen it. Literary, epigraphic, and archaeological sources may still be consulted, however, in an effort to define the possible range of the Galatians' religious influences and to inform our judgements about the relative probability and compatibility of each.

In upland Anatolia we find commonalities at the level of religious practice both within the region and spanning its borders, as well as local idiosyncrasies; no one cult can be elevated with any confidence to the status of an interpretative key. Boundaries between sacred and profane space are carefully guarded. Past acts of devotion are memorialised with a particular focus on the creation of tangible and enduring monuments. Religious actions are repeated according to sacred calendars. Local cults display an attentiveness to religious ethics driven more, it seems, by a concern to keep doing what has worked in the past than by fear. Diachronic factors emerge as of particular importance. Diverse conceptions of divine-human reciprocity are attested.

Extant attempts to expound Galatians in its pagan religious context inform our understanding but none of them adequately represents the range and balance of these influences or avoids distortion in consequence. Empire-critical exegeses of the Galatian crisis are examined, as are appeals to the ritual practice of the Cybele cult and to the Lydian-Phrygian confession stelae as possible backgrounds for the attraction of circumcision, but none provides a comprehensive survey of the kinds of powerful and enduring religious assumptions upon which Paul's warnings about regression in Galatians seem to hang.

Chapter 4: Paul and Returning to Paganism

Chapter 4 turns once more to Paul himself – to the assumptions about pagan religion evident in his Jewish milieu, evident in his wider correspondence, and embedded in the argument of Galatians itself.

Paul, the first-century Jew, is interpreted first within the first-century Jewish debate about Gentiles and Gentile religion, identifying the principle danger of regression as idolatry – the endowment of human beings with roles and functions reserved to God. Paul's analysis of Gentile converts using the language of "weakness" (associated with longstanding habituation to pagan religious assumptions) and "strength" in 1 Corinthians 8 (perhaps also in Romans 14–15) then leads us back into Galatians, where similar pastoral concerns are evident. A detailed exegesis of Paul's regression language follows, centring on a rigorous reassessment of the enigmatic phrase $\tau \grave{\alpha}$ $\sigma \tau o \iota \chi \epsilon \tilde{\iota} \alpha$ to $\tilde{\iota} \kappa o \sigma \mu o \upsilon$ in Gal 4.3 that takes into consideration every known instance of $\sigma \tau o \iota \chi \epsilon \tilde{\iota} \alpha$ in the literature of the first centuries B.C. and A.D. In Galatians, I conclude that $\sigma \tau o \iota \chi \epsilon \tilde{\iota} \alpha$ functions as a reference to the "fundamental components of religious behaviour" common to pagan and Jewish worship.

In dialogue with Richard Hays' influential analysis of the narrative substructure of the letter, I conclude that "enslavement under the στοιχεῖα" in Galatians 4 is equivalent to "imprisonment under in the law" and "life under the curse" in Galatians 3, and that all three expressions have relevance to Jews *and* Gentiles. ¹² Gentile perceptions of "works" are found to be just as important, if not more important, than Jewish perceptions in the crucial interpretative debate about "the works of the law" in Galatians 2 and 3, noting in particular the striking contrast between Jewish and Gentile knowledge in Gal 2.15–16: Jewish Christians (probably *all* Jews) "know that a person is justified not by the works of the law." "Gentile sinner[s]," however, lack this knowledge and the protections afforded by it in their appropriation and practice of religious observances. Pagan, and not Jewish, presuppositions about the efficacy of works in divinehuman interactions emerge as the foil against which the letter's call to action is designed to make sense.

The chapter concludes with a brief excursus exploring vulnerability to the reanimation of entrenched pagan religious assumptions as a theme in the growth and spread of the church in the early centuries of the Christian era.

Chapter 5: Galatians in the Jewish Religious Context of Asia Minor

In Chapter 5, our attention shifts to Jewish influences in Galatia and among the Galatians. Even if Paul believed his readers' habitual religious expectations were inimical to his own in many ways and that they remained dangerously close to the surface of their experience, ready to re-emerge at any moment, why would he think *Jewish Christianity* particularly likely to trigger this re-emergence? And why would he conceive of this danger as somehow more acute than the equivalent danger associated with his own vision of Christian

¹² Hays, 2002.

discipleship, which was itself associated with religious observances like baptism (Gal 3.27) and various ethical laws (5.13–6.10).

Following the pattern established in Chapter 3, Chapter 5 assesses these questions in the light of extant literary and epigraphic sources and the material culture of Asia Minor in the early Christian period. Lessons for Galatians are appropriated by tracing the interplay of actions and reactions within and between pagan and Jewish communities. Evidence of Jewish distinctiveness is related to evidence of pagan hostility, pagan hostility to Jewish engagement, Jewish engagement to pagan sympathisation, pagan sympathisation to Jewish integration, and Jewish integration to cases of pagan conversion. In each case, tensions and outlying examples fill out the complexities of the landscape.

Applying this material to Galatians, we explore the possibility that Paul's readers were former Godfearers and that Paul's regression vocabulary describes a return to Godfearing behaviour in their new Christian context or at least a movement in the general direction of a Godfearing past. In the former scenario, the incompatibility of the Influencers' call to circumcision and the Godfearing lifestyle – with its characteristic engagement in the Jewish community and its enthusiasm for socially-acceptable elements of Jewish piety without any sense of exclusive commitment – is particularly striking. In the latter, the focus of Paul's concern on his readers' regression to their former religious affiliations (Gal 4.8) forces the conclusion that, in his mind, law-observant Jewish Christianity was *equivalent to paganism*, directly contradicting the evidence of 2.6–10. Even if this difficulty could be resolved, it is far from clear that conversion would have yielded the benefits of "social normalisation" that have been claimed for it.

I conclude that Paul's concerns are best interpreted in conjunction with primary source data suggesting not only that Judaism in Asia Minor in the period was capable of accommodating and reimagining many of the trappings of pagan religious devotion to its own ends, but that pagans also reimagined Jewish traditions according to their own presuppositions. Through the practices used by Jewish Christians to articulate their new faith, Paul's readers were expressing the quintessential religious expectations of their old faith.

On the susceptibility of Paul's own gospel to similar accusations, the important question is not whether it *eliminated* the dangers associated with the Galatians' former pagan commitments, but whether it *minimised* them in comparison to other options. Noting the transition from warnings to ethics in the movement from Gal 3–4 to 5–6, and flagging avenues for further research, I suggest that Paul deliberately minimised exposure to observances with the potential to reawaken entrenched religious assumptions for *new converts*, and that he laid out a path of spiritual transformation for *established believers* designed to neutralise their influence in the longer term.

Chapter 6: The Galatian Reception of the Influencers' Message

In Chapter 6, responses to the regression problem tied less closely to specific facets of the underlying religious context take centre stage. Dialogue with Torah-observant portraits of Paul highlights the importance of the distinction between Jewish law as observed by Jewish Christians and Jewish Law as observed by Gentile Christians. ¹³ None of these portraits, however, provides a compelling explanation for the extent of the danger Paul associates with the latter while apparently embracing the former not only for others but also for himself. Dialogue with scholars treating Paul's regression language as a rhetorical ploy highlights the importance of both the similarities and the differences between the Influencers' concept of Jewish calendrical observances, food laws, and circumcision, and the equivalent concept in the minds of Paul's Galatian readers. ¹⁴ Dialogue with both groups facilitates the clarification of the proposal under development.

The danger of Jewish observances for Paul's readers lay neither in their fundamental inappropriateness for Gentiles nor in high-level *religious assumptions* about worth and reciprocity that the Influencers and the Galatians may or may not have held in common. The danger lay rather in their common dependence on *basic elements of religious practice* – the calendrical observances and vows and purifications and memorialisations of devotion that undergirded Jewish Christianity and every form of pagan devotion attested within the envelope of options observable in our region and period. In Paul's mind, the enduring strength of the association between these $\sigma \tau o \iota \chi e \tilde{\iota} \alpha$ and the religious expectations they had encoded in the Galatians' pagan past left his readers profoundly vulnerable. Far though it may have been from the Influencers' intentions, Jewish Christian practice for Paul's Gentile converts threatened to reawaken the assumptions of their former religious lives, destroying their Christian faith from within.

Selections from Ignatius, Justin, and Origen augment this reconstruction of the Galatian crisis, highlighting continuing awareness of Jewish law as a threat to Gentile Christians (even when it was deemed appropriate for Jewish Christians) and the consequent potential for a return to the clutches of the former evil age. Origen, in particular, sees Paul's regression motif as a reference to the reanimation of pagan thoughtforms under the guise of Jewish practice, drawing on Galatians in his *Homilies on Exodus* to explain the Israelites' persistent inclination to return to Egypt.

¹³ Thiessen, 2016; Fredriksen, 2017; Wyschogrod, 2004.

¹⁴ De Boer, 2011, 252–61; Martyn, 1997*a*, 393–400; Barclay, 1988, 63–4; Barclay, 2015, 329–446.

Index of Ancient Sources

1. Old Testament

Genesis		9.15-17	102
1.2	118	37.34–6	102
1.9	118	69.22-3	107
1.11	118		
6.14	160	Isaiah	
8	159	6.3	168
12.3	135	14.1	43
16-21	194	44	102
17	196	44.1	103
18.18	135	44.2	103
		44.3	103, 135
Exodus		44.4	103
5.23	221	44.8	103
15.26	221	44.9	103
34	162	44.9–20	102
		44.12	103
Leviticus		44.14	103
18.5	134	44.18	103
19.14	107-8	44.21	103
		44.24	103
Deuteronomy			
27.26	133–4	Jeremiah	
28	162	10.2–5	102
Joshua		Obadiah	
5.2-12	197	20	143-4
Psalms		Zechariah	
1.1-5	102	5.1-5	163
9.5	102		

2. New Testament

T 1		10.10	20
Luke	200	18.18	29
22.25	209	18.23	20, 23-4, 31
1-4-		19.1	23 69
Acts	27	19.19	
9.19b–31	27	21	38
9.25	27–8	21.21	38, 44, 195
9.26	27–8	21.26	38 44
11	32–3	21.28	
11.27-30	31–3	22.10	33
11.28	31	28.23	33
11.29 12.19–24	31 35	D	21
	23	Romans	
13–14	33	1	139
13.1–3		1.18–32	103
13.14 13.16	39 23	1.19–20	102 102
		1.20	
13.26	23	1.21–3	107
13.43	23, 39, 153	1.24	103
13.44–6	153	1.26	103
13.48	23, 33	1.28	103
13.49–50	39	1.32	107
13.50	23, 153	2.7	134
14.1 14.8–20	39, 153 153	2.12-13	132
		2.15	134
15 15.1	32–5, 136, 154	6 7	189
15.1–2	31, 33, 136 31–2	7.12	132 134
15.1–2	31–2	9.30–33	108
15.24–9	199		108
15.36–41		11.7–12	212
15.30–41	32–3, 35 154	11.25 14	188
16.1–5	35	14–15	8
16.1–6	20, 153	14.1–15.13	108, 110–12,
16.1–8	20, 133	14.1–13.13	139, 190, 226
16.3	153, 197	14.2	108–10
16.4	197	14.5	109–10, 229
16.6	24, 30–31	14.6	110
16.11–39	31	14.13	108
16.13–15	177	14.15	5, 228
17.1–9	31	14.13	5, 111, 228
17.10–15	31	14.21	109
17.16–34	31	15.1	110
	29		
18.4 18.6–7	29	15.19	18
		15.26	18
18.11	29–30	15.31	18, 44
18.12	29	16.5	18
18.12–17	29, 31, 181		

1 Corinthians		Galatians	
1.23	107	1–2	22
1.25	104	1–4	189
1.26–31	104	1.1	44
1.27	104	1.1–5	213
4.1	104	1.1–3	-
			14, 15, 16, 17
4.1–5	106	1.4	45, 203, 218
4.7	212	1.6	25, 117, 196,
7.1	104	4 6 0	215
8	8, 106, 108,	1.6–9	205
	139, 141, 143	1.7	42
8–10	108	1.7–9	41
8.1	108	1.8	44, 96, 117,
8.1–13	4, 104, 111–2,		196, 215
	139, 190, 226	1.9	96
8.4	104, 108, 110	1.11	26
8.7	104–5, 108,	1.11f.	41, 44
	110, 112, 139,	1.11-12	26, 218
	193	1.13-2.1	118
8.9	104	1.15-16	28-9
8.9-13	111	1.16a	26
8.10	104, 108	1.16b-17	26
8.10-11	107, 139	1.17	18, 118
8.11	5, 191, 228	1.18	26, 28–9, 34
8.13	107–8	1.18-21	29
9.22	104, 190	1.20	26
10.9	108	1.21	28
10.27–8	104	1.21–3	26
11	189	1.22	18
11.30	104–5	2	8, 154
12.13	115	2–3	228
12.13	104	2.1	18, 26, 28–9,
16.1	18, 31	2.1	32, 34, 118
16.5	18	2.1.10	
	18	2.1–10	20, 26, 28–35
16.15	18	2.1–14	45
20 : 4:		2.1-21	27
2 Corinthians	10	2.2	18
1.1	18	2.4	32
1.8	18	2.4–5	33, 44
1.16	18	2.5	34
2.13	18	2.6–10	9, 204, 226
7.5	18	2.9	2, 18, 202
8.1	18	2.10	31
9.2	18	2.11-21	28, 31
11	215	2.12	31
11.9f.	18	2.13	18, 32, 35
11.32-3	27	2.15	104, 137, 139
		2.15–16	8, 137–9, 213,
			219, 222

2.15-21	198	3.25	135
2.16	137–8, 194,	3.25-6	115
	226	3.26–7	188, 197
2.18	2, 225	3.26–9	113–5
	*		
3	8	3.27	9
3.1	16, 39, 96,	4	8
	112, 132, 186	4–5	221
3.1-5	132, 135	4.1–2	115
3.1-6	113	4.1-5	115
3.1-14	137	4.1-7	1, 114-5, 131-
3.1-4.7	112		2, 225
3.1–4.11	131	4.1-8	93
3.1–4.31	112	4.2	2
			-
3.1–5.12	112	4.3	8, 92, 94, 113–
3–4	9, 229		6, 123, 126–7,
3.2	132, 135, 194		131–2, 134,
3.3	2, 98, 221, 225		139, 183, 225
3.4	4	4.3-5	115
3.5	113, 132, 135,	4.3-7	131
	194	4.4	115, 134–5
3.6-9	113, 185	4.4–5	2
3.6–13	135	4.5	115–6, 131
3.6–4.7	113	4.6–7	113, 115
3.6f.	41	4.8	9, 39, 117,
3.7–14	132		135, 178
3.9	135	4.8-9	2, 111, 116,
3.10	96, 131–3,		131
	135, 138, 185,	4.8-10	92, 221
	194	4.8-11	1, 4, 98, 101,
3.10-12	132	1.0 11	112, 116, 119,
3.10–14	101, 131–3,		139, 179–80,
	137, 139, 196		185, 205, 218,
3.13	19, 96, 131,		225
	134–5	4.8–20	94, 113
3.13-14	114–5, 134–5	4.8-5.12	112
3.14	132, 135	4.9	112-3, 117,
3.15-17	83		126-7, 135,
3.15-18	185		178, 204, 225
3.15–29	204	4.9–10	120
3.17	185	4.10	
			3, 188, 202
3.19	134	4.11	4, 113, 116–7,
3.23	115, 131		182
3.23-5	114	4.13	17, 24
3.23-9	1, 93, 114–5,	4.14–16	18
	131, 225	4.17	41, 44, 185
3.23-4.7	98	4.17-18	113
3.23-4.11	93	4.21f.	41
3.24	38	. = = = -	=
	2		
3.24–5	<i>L</i>		

4.21–31	2, 98, 113,	Philippians	21
	185, 194, 196,	3.2	215
	225	3.6	133, 196
4.24	83	4.15	18
4.25	18, 131, 183		
4.30-5.1	113	Colossians	
5–6	9, 189, 229	2.8	127
5.1	2, 94, 98, 112,	2.18	71, 127, 201
	117, 177, 179,	2.20	127
	221, 225		
5.1-12	113	1 Thessalonians	
5.2	4, 128, 204	1.7f	18
5.2–3	39	2.14	18
5.2–4	4, 111, 199,	2.14–16	44
	226	4.1	18
5.3	4, 42, 136,		
	154, 196–7	2 Timothy	
5.4	2, 4, 41, 204	3.11	18
5.6	4, 128	3.15	153
5.7	2, 42, 113		
5.10	42	Titus	
5.10–12	41	1.12	39
5.11	2, 111, 197		
5.12	42, 98, 112	Hebrews	
5.13	112	5–6	217
5.13-24	190	5.11-14	129
5.13-6.10	9, 189–90	5.12	126
5.18	190	6.1	217
5.19-21	229	11.11–14	134
5.19-26	188		
5.22-26	229	2 Peter	
5.25	190	3.18-13	129
6.1-5	96		
6.1-10	229	Revelation	
6.2	191	2.9	45, 153, 177
6.12-13	39, 41, 44, 185	3.9	45, 153, 177
6.13	42, 44		
6.14	127, 213		
6.15	4, 128		
6.16	190		

3. Non-Canonical Christian Sources

Ambrosiaster		Bede	
Com.Gal		Ecc. Hist.	
4.10	3	1.3	141
		1.32	141
Aristides			
Frag.		Chrysostom, John	
3.2.2	129	Adv. Jud.	
3.2.4	129	1.3.4-5	217
3.3.2	129	1.5.7-8	217, 219
3.3.3	129	1.6.2-4	217
3.3.4	129	2.1.4	218
4.1.1	129	2.2.4	218
4.1.5	129	3.4.7	217
7.3.3	129	8.5.5-6	218
7.4.2	129	Com. Gal.	
		2.4	38, 44
Athenagoras		4.8	39
Res.			37
2.5.4	129	Hom. Act.	
2.5.8	129	XXV	32
3.2.2	129		
3.2.6	129	Clement of Alexandria	
		Paed.	
Supp.	120	1.6.33	116, 125–6
10.5.7	129	2.1.7	129
16.3	217	2.4.43	129
16.3.12	129 129	3.12.89	129
16.4.2 16.5.1	129	3.12.100	129
19.4.3	129	Durat	
22.2.2	129	<i>Prot.</i> 1.5	120
22.5.6	129	5.64	129 129
22.9.2	129	5.65	129
22.12.4	129	5.66	129
22.12.7	129	8.78	129
22.12.9	129	6.76	129
22.12.9	12)	Strom.	
Augustine		1.11.50	125–6, 29
		1.11.52	125–6, 29
Com.Gal		1.11.53	125–6, 29
33.3	2	2.6.31	129
34.4	2, 217	2.11.51	129
		5.4.20	129
		5.6.32	129
		5.8.46	129
		5.8.48	129

5.8.49	126, 129	Eusebius	
5.10.62	129		
5.14.105	129	Eccl. Hist.	
5.14.106	129	3.36	154
6.8.62	125–6, 29	4.18.6–8	155
6.11.84	129	5.24.2-6	155
6.15.117	125–6, 29		
6.15.131	129	Gregory of Nazianzus	
6.16.140	129	0	
		Or.	
6.16.141	129	18.5	184
6.16.145	129		
6.16.148	129	Ignatius	10, 154
7.6.34	129	Eph.	218
8.8.23	129	19.3	218–9
Ec. Proph.		19.5	210-9
3.3.2	129	Mag.	154
18.2.1	129	8.1	219
26.2.2	129	9.1	219
		9.2	219
26.2.5	129	10.2	219
Ex. Theo.		10.3	219–20
3.48.4	125-6, 129	10.5	217 20
4.81.3	129	Phld.	219
	12)	5.2	154
Frag.		6.1	45, 176, 182,
42.11	129		218
		6.2	218
Clement of Rome		7.2	218
77		9.2	219
Hom.	120		
5.10.5	130	Tral.	218
6.3.1–4	130	Smyr.	218
6.5.1–5	130	5.2	218
6.13.1–2	130	5.2	210
6.19.1–5	130	Imam a assa	
6.24.1–3	130	Irenaeus	
6.25.1–2	130	Haer.	
10.9.1-6	130	1.4.2	129
10.25.1-3	130	1.4.3	129
19.12.5-6	130	1.5.4	125–6, 9
20.3.6-10	130	4.2.7	38
		7.2.7	50
Rec.		Jerome	
8.15.1–3	125, 130	Jeronic	
		Com. Gal.	
Commodian		1.1	44
Instr.		1.2	17
1.24.11–14	157	2.1	28
		2.3–5	33
1.37	157	3.1a	39

4.9	3	Melito	
5.1	217	Per. Pas.	
Epist.		36	220
78.39.2	17	40	156
70.57.2	1 /	72	156
Vir. ill.		81	156
14.1	17	91–2	156
53.1	17	92	156
122.1	17	94	156
Justin	10		
		Origen	
Apol. Mai.	400	Cels.	
60.11	129	Prol. 5	125-6
Apol. Min.		1.26	168
5.2	129		100
		Comm. Jo.	
Dial.	174	2.21–33	221
1.1	155	Hom. Ex.	10
8.3	155, 176, 181	3.3	221
10.3	155	7.2	221
14.1	151		
19.2	151	Hom. Jer.	220
23.3	129, 179	12.13.1	220
27.5	43	Hom. Jos.	
46–7	219	4.1	221
46.1	38, 219		
47.1	38, 220	Hom. Lev.	
47.2	220	10.1.4	220
47.3	220	10.2.3	220
47.4	220		
49.1	181	Tatian	
55.1	181	Orat.	
62.2	129	9.3.6	129
67.2	155	21.3.1	129
123.1	43, 176	21.3.7	129
	,	36.1.4	129
Marius Victorinus		39.1.8	129
Com. Gal.			
2.1	28	Tertullian	
2.12–13	37	Marc.	
4.9	217	1.20	217
•••		5.2.1	37
		5.4	126
		Mart. Perpetua and Felicitas	140
		ana Felicitas	

Theophilus		2.2–3	103
Ad. Aut. 1.4.15 1.5.10 1.6.2 2.15.3 2.15.5 2.35.2	129 129 129 129 129 129	2.5 3.1-5 4.1-4 4.1-5 5.17 7.2 8.2	103 157 179 157 157 129 129
Act. Paul and Thecla Apoc. Adam	19	Mart. Pionius 3 4 8.4 13	175, 180 156 156 89 156
1.3 2.8	130 130	Mart. Polycarp 8.2	154
Barnabas, Ep. 2.4–5 2.10 3.6 4.6	157 157 182 157, 219	12.2 13.1 17.2–18.1 Pseudo-Clementine Recognitions	154 154 154
4.6–14 11.1–3 14.1–5 Diognetus, Ep. 2.2	156 151 156	I.31.1 Shepherd of Hermas 21.3	87 129

4. Intra- and Post-Biblical Jewish Sources

Josephus		12.148-153	143
4 - 4 -		14.66–8	150
Ag. Ap	111	14.115	150
1.162–5	144	14.185f.	145
1.170	43–44	14.200	145
1.209–12	150	14.203-4	145
2.80	150	14.213	145
2.92–6	150	14.221	145
2.112–4	150	14.226	145
2.147-8	150	14.241-3	145
2.148	150	14.244–6	145
2.258-9	150	14.247–55	145
Ant.		14.256–8	145
1.155–6	102	14.259-61	166
3.183	129	14.257	145
11.285	43	14.260	145

14.261	145	52	129
14.266	145	84	129
16.165	167, 172	104	29
16.166–7	145	126	129
16.171	145	127	129
18.85–129	27	131	129
20.17–96	176	146	129
20.43	197	140	129
		Decalogue	
20.49–53	35	31	129
War.			
1.377	129	Dreams	
2.285–92	145	1.21	129
2.306	145	1.212	129
6.47	129	D	
		Drunkenness	166
7.43–45	166	177	166
D1 '1		Embassy	
Philo		81	129
Abraham		245	147, 150
69–70	102	361	54
81	129	301	34
		Eternity	
162	129	6	129
Agriculture		29	129
39	43	61	129
136	129	74	129
	12)	78	129
Alleg. Interp.		82	129
1.14	129	90	
3.121	129		129
T \ \ \ \ \ ~ .		103	129
Περὶ ἀριθμῶν sive		107	129
Άριθμητικά		109	125–6, 129
5a	129	111	129
21a	129	113	129
27a	129	116	129
73a	129	123	129
73b	129	144	129
74	129	77	
99	129	Flaccus	
		55	129
Cherubim		125	129
122-24	209	Genesis	
127	129		120
0 1 7:0		4.8b	129
Contempl. Life		4.51b	129
3	129	Giants	
3–4	120	22	129
4	129	<i>LL</i>	14)
Cuartien		Good Person	
Creation	120	141	166
38	129		

Heir		1.52	170
134	125–6, 129	1.209	129
140	125–6, 129	1.266	129
152	129	1.294	129
190	129	1.328	129
197	129	2.151	129
209	129	2.255	120, 129
210	129	4.178	170
226	129	4.176	170
		Unchangeable	
227	129	46	129
282	129		
Moses		Virtues	
1.96	129	73	129
1.97	129	102	1, 170
1.155	129	W	
	129	Worse	120
1.156		8	129
1.216	129		
2.53	129		
2.65	129		
2.88	129	Let. Aris.	
2.121	129	16	102
2.148	129		
2.154	129	4 Ezra	133
2.251	129	8.31-6	138
2.267	129		
2.286	129	Jos. Asen.	
		11.4–6	176
Names		11	1,0
61	129	Jub.	
77	129	1.9	102
On Diantina		2.19	102
On Planting	120		
10	129	3.31	102
Prelim. Studies		11.16	102
117	129	15.25–6	195
150	129	15.30–32a	195
130	12)	20.6–7	102 - 3
Providence		23.23–4	102
2.45	129		
2.53	129	1 Macc.	
		15.15-24	144
Rewards			
44	129	4 Macc	
Sacrifices		12.13	129
74	129		
77	147	Pseudo-Philo	133
Spec. Laws		1 50000 1 11110	133
1.2–3	171	Pss. Sol.	
1.7	44		102
1.51–3	176	2.1–2	102
-	* *		

Gen. R.

102

38.13

Sib. Or.		3.3-4.1	102-3
1–2	175		
1.85-6	149	T. Reub.	
1.88-96	149	4.6	103
1.137-46	149		
1.174–9	149	Tob.	
1.184	149	13.6	102
1.195-8	149		
2.227-9	149	Wis.	
1.230-2	149	7.17	129
1.261-82	80, 149	7.17-19	121-2
1.308-23	149	12-15	103
2.206-7	125-6	12.23-7	103
2.230-2	149	13.1–2	121-2
3.79-82	125-6	13.1-5	102
8.337	125-6	13.6-8	102
		13.10-15	102
Sir.		13.11-19	102
41.8	102	13.16	103
		14.12–14	103
T. Dan.		14.17	103
5.8	102	14.21	103
		15.7	102
T. Jud.		19.6	118
23.2	102	19.7	118
		19.18	129
T. Naph.			
3.3–5	102–3		
	5. Rabbinic S	ources	
Yeb.		b. Pesah.	
47b	43	22b	107
48b	43	62.b	107
UUT	J	02.0	107

Sifre Deuteronomy

138

26

6. Qumran Sources

CD (The Damascus		4Q174 (Florilegium)	
Document)		I.1-7	195
VI.14-21	195		
XII.8-11	195	11QTa (The Temple	
XIV.3-6	195	Scroll)	
1QpHab		XXXIX.7	195
12	102	XL.5-6	195
1QS (The Community Rule)	133	Qumran Hodayot	133, 211
4Q169 (Com. Nahum)			
II.7-9	195		

7. Graeco-Roman Sources

Aelius Aristides		Anonymus Londin	Anonymus Londinensis	
Hier. Log.		Iatrica		
I.31	55	4.26–31	130	
I.31	55	14.1–44	130	
II.9	79	15.7–19	130	
II.27	60, 97	17.11–25	130	
II.80	79	191–6	130	
III.7	79	19.18–26	130	
III.21-3	79	20.1–49	130	
IV.16	55			
IV.45-7	55, 85	Antiochus of Athe	ens	
	4	Frag. Ap.		
Alexander of Aph	rodisias	110.15	130	
Met.		110.17	126	
2.1	125–6	110.24	130	
Fat.				
203.22	125–6	Apion		
		Frag. Glos. Hom.		
Alexander Polyhis	stor	109	130	
Prep.		A 11 ' CT		
IX.17	150	Apollonius of Tya	na	
IX.19-21	150	Apotelesmata		
IX.23	150	1376–7	130	
IX.25-6	150	- ·		
IX.29	150	De Horis	400	
		7.177	130	

Let.		Fin.	
26	56	5.43	106
43	56, 108	El	
75	56	Flac.	144
		43	144
Apuleius		68	144, 149
		Prov. Cons.	
Met.	71	5.10	152
III.5	89	0.10	102
III.29	88	Tusc.	
XI.5	112	4.7-8	188
.			
Aristonicus		Comarius	
Sig. Il.		Lap. Phil.	
21.281	130	2.291.7–12	130
	130	2.292.13–295.1	130
Sig. Od.		2.295.3–13	130
2.61	130	2.293.3-13	130
Arius Didymus		Cornelius Alexander	
		Frag.	
Phys.		9.53	43
Frag. 21	130		
Frag. 23	130	Demetrius	
Frag. 38	130	Demetrus	
		Eloc.	
Artemidorus		207	130
Onir.			
1.67.23	44	Dio Cassius	
1.07.23	44	II:	
D41		Hist.	1.5
Boethus		49.32.3	15
Frag.		51.2.1	15
7.11	130	53.26.2–4	15
7.34	130		
,,,,		Dio Chrysostom	
Cicero		Disc.	
4		38.38	88
Att.		38.44	53
109.2–3	50	40.3	54, 61, 210
110.3	14		. , . , .
111.2, 4	14	Diodorus Siculus	
113.9	14	Diodorus Sicurus	
114.2, 14	14	Bib. Hist.	
115.4, 14, 23	14	32.11.4	130
355.2	14		
366.1	14	Diogenes Laertius	
372.2	14		
413.6	1.4	Vit. Phil.	
713.0	14		
413.0	14	7.55.6	29

Rom. Ant.	Dionysius of Halicarna	issus	Galen	
Lys. 456.5-457.5 125-6 15-16 130 472.1-4 125-6 Dem. Hipp. Aph. 17b.794.8 119 37 130 Hipp. Nat. Hom. 52 52 130 58.8 125-6 53 130 Plac. Hipp. Plat. Comp. Verb. 2 130 Sem. 19 6 130 A, 4.566.8-9 119 14 130 Gaius Musonius Rufus 22 130 Gaius Musonius Rufus Ars. Rhet. Frag. Min. 42 130 10 130 42 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Heraclitus Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 130 15.3 130 Epictetus 22.1-25.11 130 Disc. 41.1-12 130 1.11.12-13 151 43.11-14 130 1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.9.19-20 151 55.1-3 130 2.9.19-21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4-5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85-93 49	Rom. Ant.		Ex. Hipp.	
15-16	1.20.3	130	455.10-16	125-6
15-16	Luc		456.5-457.5	125-6
Dem. Hipp. Aph. 37 130 48 130 52 130 53 130 Comp. Verb. 2.4.1.1-7 119 2 130 6 130 7 130 14 130 22 130 Ars. Rhet. Frag. Min. 10 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Heraclitus Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 1. Pr. 3 130 Epictetus Alleg. Mol-3 130 Epictetus 22.1-25.11 30 15.3 1.11.12-13 151 1.22.4 151 2.8.23 188 49.3-4 130 2.9.19-20 151 2.9.19-21 176 2.15.20 106 65.4-5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85-93 49 2.104 <td>•</td> <td>130</td> <td>472.1–4</td> <td>125-6</td>	•	130	472.1–4	125-6
Den. 130	13-10	150	Hinn Anh	
37 130 Hipp. Nat. Hom. 52 130 58.8 125-6 53 130 Plac. Hipp. Plat. 2.4.1.1-7 119 Comp. Verb. 2.4.1.1-7 119 2 130 Sem. 4.4.566.8-9 119 14 130 Gaius Musonius Rufus Ars. Rhet. Frag. Min. 42 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Heraclitus Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 130 7.14 130 Epictetus 22.1-25.11 130 Disc. 41.1-12 130 1.11.12-13 151 43.11-14 130 2.8.23 188 49.3-4 130 2.9.19-20 151 48.6 130 2.9.19-21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4-5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85-93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Hero of Alexandria Voc. Hipp. 13			• • •	119
S2				11)
Flac. Hipp. Plat. Comp. Verb. 2.4.1.1–7 119 2 130 Sem. 19 6 130 4, 4.566.8–9 119 14 130 Gaius Musonius Rufus 22 130 Frag. Min. 42 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 130 T.14 130 Epictetus Alleg. 30 Disc. 41.1–12 130 1.11.12–13 151 43.11–14 130 1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.9.19–20 151 48.6 130 2.9.19–20 151 55.1–3 130 2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp.				
Plac. Hipp. Plat.			58.8	125–6
Comp. Verb. 2.4.1.1–7 119 2 130 Sem. 6 130 4, 4.566.8–9 119 7 130 Gaius Musonius Rufus Ars. Rhet. Frag. Min. Frag. Min. 10 130 Heraclitus Mat. Med. Alleg. 7.14 130 1. Pr. 3 130 15.3 130 Epictetus 22.1–25.11 130 Disc. 41.1–12 130 1.11.12–13 151 43.11–14 130 1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.8.23 188 49.3–4 130 2.9.19–20 151 55.1–3 130 2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Hero of Alexandria Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 <t< td=""><td>53</td><td>130</td><td>Plac Hinn Plat</td><td></td></t<>	53	130	Plac Hinn Plat	
2 130	Comp Verh			119
6 130 Xem. 7 130 4, 4.566.8–9 119 14 130 Gaius Musonius Rufus 22 130 Frag. Min. 42 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. Alleg. 1. Pr. 3 130 Epictetus 22.1–25.11 15.3 130 Epictetus 40.1–3 1.11.12–13 151 1.22.4 151 2.8.23 188 49.3–4 130 2.9.19–20 151 2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Hero of Alexandria Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	-	130		117
7 130 14 130 22 130 Ars. Rhet. 10 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 130 Epictetus Disc. 1.11.12–13 151 43.11–14 130 1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.8.23 188 49.3–4 130 2.9.19–20 151 55.1–3 130 2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Epicatius Herodotus Pan. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 34.23–35.8 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130				
14			4, 4.566.8–9	119
Gaius Musonius Rufus Ars. Rhet. 10 130 Frag. Min. 42 130 Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. 7.14 130 1. Pr. 3 130 15.3 130 Epictetus 22.1-25.11 130 Disc. 41.1-12 130 1.11.12-13 151 43.11-14 130 1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.8.23 188 49.3-4 130 2.9.19-20 151 55.1-3 130 2.9.19-21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4-5 130 Epiphanius Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85-93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 32.4 130 1. Prol. 9-17 130 34.1-2 130 1. Prol. 340-47 130 1.1.1-3 130				
Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 Epictetus Disc. 1.11.12-13 1.11.12-13 1.22.4 1.51 2.8.23 1.88 2.9.19-20 1.51 2.9.19-21 1.76 5.8.3 2.15.20 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. 80.1.5 Figh and Service of Alexandria Froi. 34047 34.23-35.8 130 Herod. 34047 130 130 Herod. 34047 130 130 Herod. 34047 130 1.11.1-3 130 Herod. 34047 130 1.11.1-3 130 1.11.1-3 130 1.11.1-3 130 1.11.1-3 130			Gaius Musonius Rufus	
Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 Epictetus Disc. 1.11.12-13 1.11.12-13 1.22.4 1.51 2.8.23 1.88 2.9.19-20 1.51 2.9.19-21 1.76 5.8.3 2.15.20 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. 80.1.5 Figh and Service of Alexandria Froi. 34047 34.23-35.8 130 Herod. 34047 130 130 Herod. 34047 130 130 Herod. 34047 130 1.11.1-3 130 Herod. 34047 130 1.11.1-3 130 1.11.1-3 130 1.11.1-3 130 1.11.1-3 130			Frag Min	
Dioscorides Pedanius Mat. Med. 1. Pr. 3 130 Epictetus Disc. 1.11.12–13 1.11.12–13 1.22.4 1.51 2.8.23 1.88 2.9.19–20 1.51 2.9.19–21 1.76 5.8.3 2.15.20 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130		120	_	130
Mat. Med. 130 15.3 130 15.3 130 15.3 130 15.3 130 15.3 130 15.3 130 15.3 130 15.5 130	10	130		
The state of the s	Dioscorides Pedanius		Heraclitus	
The state of the s	16 : 16 1		Alleg.	
Epictetus 15.3		120	O	130
### August	1. Pr. 3	130		130
### August	Emintotus		22.1-25.11	130
1.11.12–13 151 43.11–14 130 1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.8.23 188 49.3–4 130 2.9.19–20 151 55.1–3 130 2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	Epicieius			130
1.22.4 151 48.6 130 2.8.23 188 49.3-4 130 2.9.19-20 151 55.1-3 130 2.9.19-21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4-5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85-93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23-35.8 130 1. Prol. 9-17 130 48.1-2 130 1. Prol. 340-47 130 1.1.1-3 130	Disc.		41.1–12	130
2.8.23	1.11.12-13	151	43.11–14	130
2.9.19-20 151 55.1-3 130 2.9.19-21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4-5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85-93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23-35.8 130 1. Prol. 9-17 130 48.1-2 130 1. Prol. 340-47 130 1.1.1-3 130	1.22.4	151	48.6	130
2.9.19–21 176 58.3 130 2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	2.8.23	188	49.3–4	130
2.15.20 106 65.4–5 130 Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. Hist. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	2.9.19-20	151	55.1–3	130
Epiphanius Herodotus Pan. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	2.9.19-21	176	58.3	130
Pan. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. 1-Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	2.15.20	106	65.4–5	130
Pan. 80.1.5 177 1.85–93 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. 1-Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	Eninhanius		Herodotus	
80.1.5 177 1.85–93 49 2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	Брірнаніцэ		Herodotus	
2.104 43 Erotianus Voc. Hipp. Hero of Alexandria 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	Pan.		Hist.	
Erotianus Voc. Hipp. Hero of Alexandria 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	80.1.5	177	1.85–93	49
Voc. Hipp. Hero of Alexandria 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23-35.8 130 1. Prol. 9-17 130 48.1-2 130 1. Prol. 340-47 130 1.1.1-3 130			2.104	43
Voc. Hipp. 32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23–35.8 130 1. Prol. 9–17 130 48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	Erotianus		II C A1 4	
32.4 130 Pneu. 34.23-35.8 130 1. Prol. 9-17 130 48.1-2 130 1. Prol. 340-47 130 1.1.1-3 130	Voc. Hipp.		nero of Alexandria	
48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130		130	Pneu.	
48.1–2 130 1. Prol. 340–47 130 1.1.1–3 130	34.23-35.8	130	1. Prol. 9-17	130
		130		130
			1.1.1–3	130
			1.7.1–13	130

Def.		Longinus	
104.1.1–7	130	Sub.	
136.1.8–16	130	2.2	130
Geom.		2.2	130
1.1.31–6	130	Lucian	
Ster.	120	Zeux.	
2.67.1–5	130	8–11	14
Hesiod		Lucius Annaeus Cornu	tus
Works and Days	149	Nat Dan	
works and Days	147	<i>Nat. Deo.</i> 4.1–7	120
Homer		4.1-7 15.13-19	130 130
Homei		16.10–15	130
Od.		43.8–14	130
4.373-4	64		
		48.5–15	130
Horace		53.12–18	130
-		76.1–5	130
Epod.	4.5	т .	
9.17–20	15	Lysias	
Odes.		Lys.	
IV.2.39-40	87	30.18	79
IV.4.25-27	87		
IV.4.73-76	87	Macrobius	
IV.14.15-16	87		
IV.14.37-40	87	Sat.	
		2.4.11	54
Sat.			
1.4.139–43	152	Marcus Aurelius	
1.5.96–104	152	Med.	
1.9.60–78	152	8.18	125-6
1.9.67–70	171	0.10	120 0
1.9.67–72	106	Marcus Terentius Varro)
Juvenal		Civ.	
C		4.31	152
Sat.	5.4	<i>a</i>	
6.16	54	Cons.	
14.96–106	152, 171	1.22.30	152
14.98–9	54	3.6	
Livy		Martial	
Livy		Epig.	
Hist.		4.4	150
29.10.4-29.11.14	77		
		Memnon of Heracleia	
		Hist.	
		8.8–20.3	14

Michael Attaliates		Philostratus	
Pon. Nom. 35.819	29	<i>Vit. Apoll.</i> 8.2 16	56 69
Moderatus			
Frag.		Philoxenus	
3.16–23	130	Frag.	120
Nicomachus of Gerasa		285.2–4 317.2–6	130 130
Int. Arit.		Plato	
I.22.2.24	119	Tim.	
Pausanius		48b	124
Descr. Attica			
IV.1–6	54	Pliny the Elder	
Descr. Phocis,		Nat.	
Ozolian, Lochri		5.25.95 5.42.146–7	17
XV.2-3	54	6.2.6–7	
XXXII.3–6	54	0.2.0	
Descr. Laconia		Pliny the Younger	
XXII.4	54	Let.	
Descr. Achaia		10.35	53
XVII.8-12	54	10.49	53
DI:1 1		10.50	53
Philodemus		10.51 10.100	53 53
Choices		10.100	33
XIV.1–12	130	Plutarch	
Piety		Frag.	
Frag. 13.347–364	130	106	130
Death		157	130
32.28–36	130	179	130
Music		213	130
Frag. 15.9–18	130	Lives Ant.	
Poems		24.1–6 61.2	50 15
XXIX.1-6	130	01.2	13
Signs		Lives Arist.	120
57.1–7	130	6.3	130
Frank Criticism		Lives Brut.	
Fr. 7	106	30.1–31.7	50
Fr. 10	106	Lives Cam.	
Col. XXIVa	106	6.4	151

Lives Demetr. 5.1	130	737.C 738.D	130 130
	130		150
Lives Fab. 4.7	130	<i>Mor. Fac.</i> 945.A	130
	150		130
Lives Marc.		Mor. Prim. Frig.	
14.10	130	947.E	130
17.8	130	954.D	130
Mor. Lib. Ed.		Mor. An. Ignis	
12.C	130	956.F	130
Mor. Adul. Am.		957.A	130
63.D	130	957.B	130
	130	958.C	130
Mor. Superst.		Mor. Soll. An.	
166A	151	980.A	130
169C	151		
Mor. Quaest. Rom.		Mor. Quaest. Plat.	
263.E	130	1003.C	130
	150	1003.F	130
Mor. Fort. Rom		1004.A	130
317.A	130	1004.C	130
Mor. Is. Os.		1009.E	130
353.E	130	1011.E	130
376.D	130	Mor. Comm. Not.	
376.E	130	1069.F	130
	150	1077.E	130
Mor. E. Delph		1085.B	130
387.E	130	1085.C	130
Mor. Def. Orac.		1085.D	130
414.F	130	1085.E	130
422.A	130		
422.E	130	Mor. Adv. Col.	120
426.F	130	1112.A	130
427.D	130	1113.B	130
428.A	130	1114.B	130
428.C	130	D1- A1	
428.F	130	Pseudo-Archetas	
430.C	130	Frag.	
		26.7–10	130
Mor. Frat. Amor.	120	32.10-20	130
484.F	130		
Mor. Quaest. Conv.		Pseudo-Lucian	
636.A	130	Amores	
669C-672C	151	19.12	125–6
669D	151	17.14	123-0
729.B	130		
733.A	130		

Seneca the Younger		Hist.	
Brev. Vit.		2.9	17
10.2–4	188	5.3–4	150
10.2-4	100	5.4–5	152
Civ.		5.5	171
6.11	152	5.5	1/1
T.		Teucer	
<i>Ep.</i>	107	Teucei	
50.3	107	Duo. Sig.	
50.7–9	107	7.195.19–24	130
50.9	107	7.197.20-3	130
104.1	30	7.199.3-7	130
_		7.200.15-18	130
Severus		7.201.27-30	130
Instr.		7.203.14	130
13.5–12	130	7.205.1-2	130
13.3–12	130	7.206.10	130
Sextus Empiricus		7.207.26	130
Sextus Empiricus		7.209.4–9	130
Pyrr. Hyp.		7.210.21	130
3.152	125–6	7.212.1–2	130
		1.212.1-2	150
Strabo		Theon	
Geog.		-	
1.3.12	130	Frag.	
2.5.16	130	53.21	130
2.5.34	130		
12.3.32	51	Trypho of Alexandria	
12.3.32	51	Περὶ τρόπων	
12.5.1	14	204.2	130
	51	1.2.1–1.3.2	130
12.5.3		1.4.1–1.5.3	130
12.8.14	51	1.11.1–10	130
12.8.19	82	1.20.1–5	130
15.1.59	130		
16.2.35–7	150	2.1.1–2.3.2	130
		2.29.1–4	130
Suetonius		Tr. :	
Aug.		Tyrannion	
31.1	68	Frag.	
76	150	1.42.13–17	130
70	150		
Dom.		Virgil	
12.2	182	,	
		Ec.	
Tacitus		IV.15-17	87
4		IV.24-30	87
Ann.	17		
13.35	17		
15.6	17		

Xenophon of Athens		Orph. Hym.	
Anab.	50	5.4 (Vita Aesopi) Vita G	125–6
Zeno of Citium		78.1-10 (Vita Aesopi) Vita Pl	130
Test. Frag.		275.1–276–7	130
100.2	125–6	(Vita Aesopi) Vita W	
		79.5–9	130
Hist. Aug.		Oracles Chaldaïques 39	125–6
4.18.5	90		
18.5–7	88		

8. Other Sources

Beowulf		403–4	142
102-14	141	1134–5	141
1260-8	141	1254	141
		1595	142
Hêliand			
389	142	Nabonidus Chronicle	49

9. Inscriptions and Papyri

Beichtinschriften		37	66, 83
1	79	39	63, 83
3	83–4	40	83
4	65	41	63
5	83	43	65, 185
6	83	44	63
7	80	45	65, 80, 210
8	65, 80	47	83
9–11	83	50	65, 80
10	83	51	80
11	79, 83	52	63
15	96	54	63, 83
17	65, 80	55	83
19	65, 78, 185	56	63
20	80	57	63, 65, 78
33	185	58	78, 80
35	85	59	65, 78, 96
36	65, 185	61	65, 210

62	59, 79, 80	5	60, 162
63	59	8	187
64	80	9	60, 187
65	59, 65, 78	15	60, 162
67	63, 82	16	60, 162
68	83, 85	37	185
69	85, 96	42	162
71	59, 65, 79	88	85
72	83, 185	99	58
73	83		
74	83	I.Ancyra	
76	80	2	68
78	63	29	59
79	83	66-138	68
106	65, 79	194	58
107	185	197	58
108	66, 80, 90	200	58
109	83	201	58
110	65, 185	206	58
111	65	300	67
112	65, 83, 185		
113	66, 79, 210	IJO	
115	185	14	165, 171, 173
120	65	27	165
121	65	37	166
123	185	40	167
123	103	43	167
CIL XIII		49	161
1366	59	57	158
1500	37	59	158
CMRDM		62	159
242	63	63	158
272	03	67	159, 161
ETAM 11		68	159, 101
2	58	71	162
2	38	72	159
ETAM 15		76	159
54	162	70 77	159, 162
70	162	78	
			159, 162
71 72	162	80	162
	162	81	162
73	162	82	162
74	162	83	159, 161–2
75	162	84	162
145	162	85	159, 162
325	162	86	158–9
H L.: Dil. :	0.5	87	159
Hosios kai Dikaios	95	92	159, 161
1	79, 213	95	159, 161

00	150 150	ICAM	
98	158–159	LSAM	76
116	161	20	76
123	159, 161	14144 171	
124	162	MAMA VI	1.60
125	159, 161	287	163
129	161	164164 1777	
132	159, 161, 162	MAMA VIII	(7
135	158	5	67
168	164, 184	262	67
169	167	297	76 50
171	163, 183	298	58
172	162–3, 184	396	76
173	162–3, 184	164164 177	
174	162, 184	MAMA XI	66–7
175	163	1	67
176	163	5	67
177	162	13	67
178	162	24	67
179	162	35	163
189	164	38	163
196	164, 183	63	69
213	162, 184	70	76
218	161	77	67
M1-5	69	80	163
M1	168	107	67
M4	168	232	69
M5	168	255	57, 76
		256	76
I.Pessinous		258	66
23	58	271	164
24	76	279	76
25	58	282	57
31	80	297	57
51	80	298	57
64	76	345	66
96	80		
171	58, 76	Miletos	
174	58	95	162
206	80		
		MSL	
I.Pisid.Cen.		156–165	74
5	59, 79		
83	79	New Documents	
133	67	from Lydia	
149-152	68	55	59
154	68	New Religious Texts	
159	79, 185	from Lydia	
168	68	3	79
244–7	76	6	79, 213
			, -

13	79	V.370-446	70
19	79, 213	VII.155–67	70
38	79, 213	VII.222–49	70
39	79, 213	VII.284–99	70
53	79	VII.300a-310	70
108	79, 213	VII.319–34	70
131	59	VII.376–84	70
185	57	VII.467–77	70
188	63	VII.478–90	70
100	03	VII.505–28	70
PDM		VII.593–619	70
XVI.1–92	70	VII.664–85	70
AV1.1-72	70	VII.795–845	70
PGM		VII.993–1009	70
I.222–31	70, 168	VII.1009–16	69
I.262–347	69	VII.1009=16 VII.1017=26	69–70
	69		
II.64–184 III.1–164		VIII.1–63	70 70
	69–70	IX.1–14	70 70
III.187–262	70 69	X.1-23 X.36-50	70 69–70
III.282–409			
III.424–66	70–1	XII.1–13	70
III.494–611	69–70	XII.14–95	70
IV.1–25	69	XII.107-21	70 70
IV.52–85	70	XII.121–43	70 70
IV.86–7	69	XII.201–69	70
IV.94–153	70	XIII.1–343	70–1
IV.296–466	70	XIII.646–734	70
IV.475–829	70–1	XIII.734–1077	70
IV.850–929	69–70	XV.1–21	70
IV.930-1114	70, 82	XVI.1–75	70
IV.1167–1226	168	XVIIa.1–25	70
IV.1331–89	70	XVIIb.1–23	70
IV.1390-1495	70	XVIIIb.1–7	70
IV.1596-1715	70	XIXa.1-54	70
IV.1716-1870	69	XXIIa.18–27	69
IV.1872-1927	70	XXIIb.1–26	168
IV.2006-2125	70	XXIII.1-70	70
IV.2241-2358	70, 82	XXXII.1–19	70
IV. 2441-2621	70	XXXIII.1–25	70
IV.2708-84	70	XXXV.1-42	69–70
IV.2785-2890	70	XXXVI.102-33	70
IV.2891-2942	70	XXXVI.134-60	70
IV.2943-66	70	XXXVI.161-77	69
IV.2967-3006	70	XXXVI.231-55	70
IV.3007-86	69-70, 168	XXXVI.283-94	70
IV.3086-3124	70	XXXVI.295-311	69, 168
V.96-172	70, 168	XXXVI.333-60	70
V.213-303	70	XXXIX.1-21	70, 126
V.304-69	70	XLIII.1-27	69–70

LVIII.1–14	70	532	87
LXIX.1–3	70	332	07
LXX.4–25	70–1	Phrygian Votive S	talas
LXXIX.1–7	69	1–609	
			73
LXXX. 1–5	69	11–69	57
LXXXVIII .1-19	70	297–335	57
LXXXIX.1-27	70	425	185
XCII .1-16	69		
XCIV.17-21	69	RECAM II	
CI.1-53	70	392	83
CII.1-17	70		
CXVI.1-17	70	SEG 28	
CXX.1-13	70	1568	60, 82, 213
CXXX.	70		
		SGRA	
		173	163
OGIS			

Index of Modern Authors

Aasgaard, R. 2005: 156	Bøgh, B. 2012: 75
Agostini, A. 2012: 63	Bourdieu, P. 1990: 140; 2000: 140
Allen, L. C. 1976: 143	Boyarin, D. 1997: 104, 214
Ameling, W. 2004: 147; 2009: 58, 147,	Boyce, M. 1975: 50
162, 167, 183	Boyce, M. et al. 1975: 50
Arndt, W. F. et al. 2000: 120	Brent, A. 1999: 87
Arnold, C. E. 1995: 71, 77, 120, 152,	Breytenbach, C. 1996: 14-15, 17-20,
168, 175, 201, 205, 217; 2005: 3, 6,	22–4, 73, 181, 188
78-9, 94-8, 186-7	Breytenbach, C. et al. 2018: 19, 25, 164
Ascough, R. S. 1998: 105	Brinsmead, B. 1982: 40
	Bru, H. et al. 2016: 164
Bandstra, A. J. 1964: 124-5, 127	Bruce, F. F. 1968-9: 32; 1982a: 131,
Barclay, J. M. G. 1987: 26, 40-2, 44;	133–4; 1982b: 18; 1988: 24
1988: 10, 39, 44, 98, 190–1, 203;	Bultmann, R. 2007: 1993
1996: 145, 167, 169, 218; 2010a: 203;	Burkert, W. 1983: 82; 1987a: 57, 60-1,
2010b: 203; 2011: 38, 109–10, 170–1,	84, 86, 1887; 1987b: 82
178, 180–1; 2015: 3, 10, 84, 92, 114–	Burton, E. D. 1921: 190
6, 120–1, 123–4, 133, 201, 203–5,	Butticaz, S. 2018: 137
207, 209–12, 214–5	
Barnett, R. D. 1975: 49	Cadoux, C. J. 1937: 32
Baron, S. W. 2007: 144	Cain, A. 2010: 39
Barrett, C. K. 1971: 105-6; 1994: 24	Campbell, D. A. 2014: 6, 20–22, 27
Barth, K. 1933: 203	Carlson, S. C. 2015: 137
Barton S. C. et al. 1981: 59, 76–7, 80, 84,	Cartledge, T. W. 1992: 57, 59, 61, 66,
86	82, 183, 185
Bauckham, R. J. 1979: 32; 1993: 45;	Chaniotis, A. 2009: 66, 72, 77, 82, 85,
1995: 199	97, 185; 2010: 88
Baur, F. C. 1845: 20–21, 37, 40	Charlesworth, J. H. 2009: 149
Belayche, N. 2007: 64	Chester, S. J. 2003: 45, 104, 106
Benario, J. 1960: 87	Cheung, A. T. 1999: 104, 107
Bergman, J 1987: 57, 60	Clauss, M. 1999: 59, 84, 87–9, 105, 185
Betz, H. D. 1975: 151; 1979: 19, 26, 28,	Cohen, S. J. D. 1986: 153; 1999: 94, 164,
112, 120, 131, 135, 190–1; 1986: 69	166, 170, 172, 177, 181, 196
Bickerman, E. J. 2007: 166	Collins, J. J. 2000: 165, 169–70, 172–3;
Blanco-Pérez, A. 2016: 64	2010: 195
Blass, F. et al. 1961: 114	Conzelmann, H. 1975: 110; 1987: 17
Blinzler, J. 1963: 120–30	Coogan, M. D. et al. 2007: 103, 144
Bockmuehl, M. N. A. 2003: 33, 38, 173;	Cooley, A. 2009: 68
2006: 133, 136	Cooper, S. A. 2005: 217

Cranfield, C. E. B. 1982: 114; 1994: 109 Fredriksen, P. 2017: 3, 9–10, 20, 38–9, Cross, F. M. 2002: 167 41, 91, 102, 137, 152, 180, 184, 189, Cumont, F. 1929: 174 199-201 Cusack, C. M. 1998: 141 Friedman, H. H. 2002: 107 Fung, R. Y. K. 1988: 190 Das, A. A. 2007: 108 Davies, J. P. 2016: 122 Gager, J. G. 1985: 132, 168, 171; 2015: Davies, W. D. 1955: 102 40 DeBoer, M. C. 2011: 3, 10, 18, 33, 39-Gagnon, R. 2000: 108-9 40, 104, 112, 115, 121, 126, 131-2, Gardner, P. D. 1994: 105 134-7, 185, 190-1, 201 Garland, D. E. 2003: 105-7, 110 Debord, P. 1982: 72-3 Gaston, L. 1979: 194, 196; 2005: 153; Delling, G. 1987: 144, 170-2, 176 2006: 92 DeMaris, R. E. 1994: 205 Gathercole, S. J. 2002: 194, 211 Deubner, L. 1943: 70 Gill, D. W. J. 2017: 90 Glad, C. E. 1995: 106, 108, 111 Devreker, J. et al. 1984: 76 Dibelius, M. 1936: 190; 1953: 23 Glare, P. G. W. 1990: 17 Dick, K. 1990: 114 Goodman, M. 1994: 90, 152, 165, 171, Dignas, B. 2002: 72-3 176; 2004: 170; 2018: 42 Donaldson, T. L. 1997: 197; 2007: 101-2, 164-6, 170-3, 195; 2010: 179 Habicht, C. 1998: 54 Drew-Bear, T. et al. 1990: 80; 1999: 58, Haenchen, E. 1971: 17, 24 Hafemann, S. J. 1990: 114; 2014: 135 85 Dunant, C. 1978: 82 Hall. S. G. 2012: 155 Dunn, J. D. G. 1988: 109; 1993a: 18, 20, Halton, T. P. 2003: 155 22, 24, 28–9, 31, 33, 35, 39, 44, 102, Hamman, A. G. 1995: 155 104, 113-4, 131, 135-7, 178, 188, Hanfmann, G. M. A. et al. 1983: 158, 167 190, 214; 1993b: 97, 135, 214; 2006a: Hansen, E. V. 1971: 50 26, 170, 178; 2006b: 3, 26, 194; 2008: 3, 132, 138, 180, 194 Hardie, M. M. 1912: 58, 63, 73 Dupont-Sommer, A. 1966: 144 Hardin, J. K. 2008: 3, 4, 62, 68, 86–90, 92-4, 147, 180 Harker, C. 2018: 92 Eastman, S. 2001: 186 Eckstein, H.-J. 1983: 106 Harnack, A. 1962: 144 Edelstein, E. J. et al. 1945: 55 Harrison, J. R. 2003: 83, 209-12 Ehrhardt, N 1988: 49 Hays, R. B. 1997: 104-7; 2000: 24, 133; Ehrman, B. D. 2003 vol. 1: 154; 2003 2002: 8, 131 vol. 2: 156, 217 Hemer, C. J. 1990: 23-4, 27-8, 30 Eidinow, E. 2007: 68; 2016: 88 Hoehner, H. W. 2010: 27 Elliott, M. W. 2014: 138 Holmes, M. W. 2007: 157

Feldman, L. H. 1993: 144, 153, 156, 165–6, 168, 170–2, 176–7, 181 Festugière, A. J. 1976: 82 Fitzmyer, J. A. 2010: 154, 199 Foster, P. 2012: 154, 218

Elliott, S. M. 1999: 3, 6, 97, 186; 2003:

1, 3, 6, 39, 77, 95, 97–9, 115

Eriksson, A. 1998: 107

Isaac, B. H. 1998: 183

Hübner, R. M. 1997: 154 Huttner, U. 2013: 144, 164

Horner, T. J. 2001: 154-5, 219

Horsley, G. H. R. et al. 2000: 79

Jay, J. 2013: 166 Jeremias, J. 1953: 106 Jewett, R. 1971a: 98; 1979: 6, 20, 22-3, Marek, C. et al. 2016: 14, 49-51, 67, 71, 27–31, 34, 35 73, 77, 80, 87–8, 146–7, 163, 166 Jewett R. et al. 2007: 106, 109 Martin, N. C. 2018: 124-30 John, F. 2016: 42, 62, 76–7, 93–4, 97–8, Martin, T 1995: 4, 93, 205 Martyn, J. L. 1997a: 3, 10, 17, 18, 20, 29, Joly, R. 1979: 154 34-5, 39, 41, 102, 104, 114, 121-3, Jones, C. P. 2005a: 56; 2005b: 56 131, 133, 135, 137, 190, 198, 201, 203; 1997b: 45, 131, 204 Matera, F. J. 1992: 196 Kahl, B. 2009: 3, 80, 91–2, 94, 180–1 Karris, R. 1973: 108 McCreedy, W. O. 2005: 154 Käsemann, E. 1971: 203; 1973: 108-9 Meeks, W. A. 2003: 72 Keener, C. S. 2019: 39, 44, 123 Meggitt, J. J. 1994: 105 Kelp, U. 2013: 67 Meijer, P. A. 2007: 126 Kindt, J. 2012: 69 Meiser, M 2007: 115 Kister, M. 2019: 138 Meyer, H. A. W. 1880: 20, 22 Klein, J. M. 2016: 75 Mitchell, M. M. 2000: 217; 2010: 45 Kraabel, A. T. 1968: 163; 1992a: 164, Mitchell, S. 1993 vol 1: 14, 51, 66; 1993 vol 2: 64, 71-2, 78, 88, 217; 1999a: 170, 174; 1992b: 158, 169; 1992c: 159, 164; 1992d: 158, 174; 1992e: 165, 173-5, 177, 184; 1999b: 58; 158, 174-5; 1992f: 147, 158, 162, 2012: 19, 23-5 Mitchell, S. et al. 1998: 51, 66, 68; 2010: 174 Kreider, A. 2016: 140 Moga, I 2007: 71 Lagrange, M.-J. 1950: 108 Moo, D. J. 2013: 28–9, 32, 108–9, 133 Lane Fox, R. 2005: 54, 73, 83, 89, 156, Morgan, T. 2007: 72, 80; 2015: 198 167, 180-1 Moses, R. E. 2014: 121 Levick, B. 1967: 51, 87; 2011: 63 Muddiman, J. 1994: 93, 182 Levine, L. I. 2000: 159 Munck, J. 1959: 20, 27, 33–5, 37, 39–40, Levinskaya, I. A. 1996: 153, 165 42, 177 Lightfoot, J. B. 1874: 18; 1886: 127; Murphy O'Connor, J. 2002: 30; 2012: 20, 2007: 149 24-5, 27-8, 30, 33-5, 39, 42, 182 Lightstone, J. N. 1985: 169 Murray, M. 2003: 42, 44–5, 151, 153–4, Linders, T. 1987: 60–1, 66, 86 166, 217–9 Lipinski, E. 1973: 144 Musurillo, H. 1972: 156 Littman, E. 1916: 144 Longenecker, B. W. 1998: 131, 186, 196 Nanos, M. D. 1996: 109; 2002: 39, 42, Longenecker, R. N. 1990: 18, 32, 114, 176, 178, 180 133, 188, 196 Neyrey, J. 1988: 186 Lüdemann, G. 2005: 20, 27, 33, 38, 44 Nock, A. D. 1957: 88 Luther, M. 1979: 28, 133 Nollé, J. 2007: 79 O'Neill, J. C. 1972: 190 Ma, J. 1999: 50 MacMullen, R. 1981: 140 Oakes, P. 2015: 26, 39, 135, 188 Madsen II, T. B. 1998: 190 Oldfather, W. A. 1998: 151 Malherbe, A. J. 1983: 105-6, 171, 176, Oliver, J. H. 1971: 30 Ophir, A. et al. 2018: 200 Marcovich, M. 1994: 154; 1997: 154-5 Overman, A. J. 1992: 164 Marek, C. 2018: 175

Parker, R. 1998: 54, 57, 82; 2011: 72, 77, 79–80, 82, 176, 185
Petrovic, A. et al. 2016: 88
Petsalis-Diomidis, A. 2010: 60, 89
Petzl, G. 1994: 63
Pilhofer, P. 2010: 180
Plassart, A. 1967: 30
Platt, V. J. 2011: 60
Pleket, H. W. 1965: 88–9
Plumer, E. A. 2006: 217
Poinsotte, J. -M. 2009: 157
Poplutz, U. 2016: 181
Potts, J. 2017: 60–1, 72, 78
Preisendanz, K. 1931: 126
Price, S. R. F. 1984: 64, 73, 80, 86, 88–9

Rajak, T. 1985: 90, 146, 171 Rambo, L. R. 1993: 230 Ramsay, W. M. 1899: 18, 28, 34, 86; 1906: 64; 1912: 64; 1924: 68 Rauer, M. 1923: 108 Reynolds, J. M. et al. 1987: 165 Riches, J. K. 2008: 131, 217 Ricl, M. 1992: 78, 85; 1997: 63 Robinson, D. W. B. 1965: 114 Roller, L. E. 1999: 59, 61, 74-6, 82, 98 Ropes, J. H. 1929: 42, 190 Rostad, A. 2006: 57, 62, 79, 85, 96 Rudolph, D. J. 2011: 37, 109, 170; 2016: 107, 109–10 Rusam, D. 1992: 121–30 Russell, J. C. 1994: 141-2

Sanday, W. et al. 1898: 103 Sanders, E. P. 1977: 101-2, 133, 194, 209 Saunders, N. J. 2001: 142 Schäfer, R. 2004: 17, 20, 24, 35, 197 Scheidel, W. et al. 2007: 58 Schoedel, W. R. 1985: 45, 218-9 Schreiner, T. R. 2010: 214 Schürer, E. 2014: 159, 164–5, 169–72, 177 Schwartz, D. R. 2004: 145 Schwartz, S. 2010: 54, 162, 169-70, 183 - 4Schweizer, E. 1988: 121-30 Scott, J. M. 1993: 133 Seager, A. R. 1972: 158

Shaw, B. D. 1993: 140 Shelton, J. -A. 1988: 79 Sherwin-White, A. N. 1984: 50 Silva, M. 2001: 20–21, 33–4, 133 Simon, M. 1986: 168–9 Skarsaune, O. 1987: 43 Smith, J. K. A. 2013: 140 Squire, M. 2009: 60 Stanley, C. D. 1990: 133 Steinleitner, F. S. 1913: 62, 78 Stendahl, K. 1963: 194; 1976: 26 Stern, M. 1976: 150, 152 Stowers, S. K. 1994: 109–10

Taylor, C. 2007: 142
Theissen, G. 2004: 104–6, 109
Thiessen, M. 2016: 3, 9–10, 38, 194–7
Thiselton, A. C. 2000: 105–6
Thonemann, P. 2013: 67
Tomson, P. J. 2017: 40
Trebilco, P. R. 1991: 23, 83, 90, 144, 156, 158–9, 162–7, 169, 172, 174, 183
Tuckett, C. M. 2019: 128

Van der Horst, P. W. 1990: 23, 157, 165, 177; 2008: 164; 2014: 144, 162, 164, 166, 173, 177

Van der Kolk, B. A. 2014: 216

Van Lennep, H. J. 1870: 168

Van Nuffelen, P. 2010: 145, 173

Van Straten, F. T. 1981: 60–1, 86

Versnel, H. S. 1981: 54, 79

Vallance, J. T. 2012: 124

Weijenborg, R. 1969: 154
Weima, J. A. D. 2016: 25
Weinreich, O. 1919: 76
Weiss, H. 1995: 188–9
Wendel, A. 1931: 61
Wendt, H. 2016: 69
Wengst, K. 1971: 156
Williams, A. L. 1935: 156
Williams, B. L. 1993: 114
Williams, M. 1998: 144
Wilson, S. G. 1995: 144, 154–5, 169, 177, 217
Wilson, T. A. 2007: 96, 134
Winston, D. 2007: 102–3

Winter, B. W. 1994: 42, 44, 90, 104, 180; 2001: 104; 2015: 3, 87, 90, 180–1

Wittgenstein, L. 2009: 114

Witulski, T. 2000: 3, 6, 68, 94; 2007: 87 Wright, N. T. 1991: 3, 131, 135, 194;

1997: 3, 194; 2013: 133, 135

Wyschogrod, M. 2004: 3, 9-10, 134-6, 138, 171, 182, 198-9, 219

Yadin, Y. 1983: 195

Index of Subjects

Abraham 91, 113, 132, 135, 184, 195-6

- Covenant 197
- Narrative 2, 41, 122-3, 178

Accommodation 104–12, 143, 220, 228, see also Weakness, Strength

Actium, Battle of 14-15

Acts, Book of

- Historical analysis 22-3
- Source-critical analysis 22
- Value as a source for Paul's biography 20–23

Æthelbert, King of Kent 141

Agatharchides of Cnidus 149-50

Agdistis 51

Ahura Māzda 50

Alexander the Great 50

Alexander Polyhistor 150

Amyntas, King of Galatia 15, 17, 51

Anaeitis 66

Anāhitā 50

Antioch (Pisidian)

- Mēn temple see Mēn
- Poor exemplar for other cities in Asia
 Minor 87
- Thriving synagogue community 153
 Antioch (Syrian)
- The Antioch Incident 2, 27–31, 35,

Antiochus I, Seleucid King 14

Antiochus III, Seleucid King 143

Antiochus IV, Seleucid King 147

Apamea Kibotos

Noah coins 80, 147, 159–60, 170, 172, 184

Aphrodisias

Synagogue inscription 23, 165–6

Apollo 66

Apollonius Molon 150, 171

Apollonius of Tyana 55-6

Apostolic Council, the

- Described in Gal 2.1-10? 32-34
- Prior to the Antioch Incident? 27–8,
 31
- Triggered by a revelation? 33

Apostolic Decree, the 33, 198–9 *see also* Noachide commandments

Aretas, King of Nabatea 27, 32

- Jurisdiction over Damascus 27, 29

Artemis 50, 66, 89

 Greek name attached to a pre-existent mother goddess tradition 77

Asclepius 55, 58, 85, 89

Asia Minor 49-100

- Conceptualised as a single "religious realm" 72
- Attis, Consort of Cybele 54, 74-7, 98 see also Cybele
- An extra-Anatolian innovation? 98

Augustus, Caesar 14-15, 50-1, 59, 86-7

- The Augustan "Golden Age" 87, 146

Baptism 188–9

Barnabas 23, 25-6, 32-3, 35, 153, 178

Bewitchment 96, 132

Cicero 50

Circumcision 1-3, 9, 26, 32-3

- An encouraging sign of commitment?1, 182
- A focus for contemporary pagan hostility 180
- Inappropriateness for those already granted membership of Abraham's family through faith in Christ 198–9, 227
- Incongruity with regression language 2, 217
- As morally neutral 128

- Motives for circumcision in Galatia
 97
- Rejected not for Jews but for Gentiles only 194, 196, 202
- Valid only for eight-day-old infants 195–6, 201, 227

Claudia Capitolina 165

Claudius Caesar, Emperor 30

Cognitive-Affective Religiosity 88 Collection for Congregations in Judea,

the 18, 21

Collegia 145

- Illicit collegia prohibited 181

Colossians 71, 127, 175, 201, 217

Commensality 170

Commodian 157, 173

Confession Inscriptions *see* Lydian-Phrygian Confession Stelae

Corinthian Church, the 104

- The "Weak" in Corinth are Gentiles
- Habituation to idol worship 105–8, 193, 228
- Bidirectional relationships between intellect and patterns of physical action 229–30

Conversion to Judaism 90, 229-30

- Antithesis of a return to Godfearer status 178–9, 227
- Benefits accruing to the Galatians?
 180-2, 227
- Benefits accruing to the Influencers?
 182
- Circumcision a necessary for membership of Abraham's family 195, 220
- Circumstances necessitating conversion 176
- Dangerous for Gentile Christians?
 182–7
- No guarantee of acceptance as equals among Jews 181
- As a path to social stability 91
- Pagan perception of converts 176-7
- Proselyte status an invalid category?
- Proselytes received but not actively sought 171, 200

Covenantal Nomism 132, 209

Croesus, King of Lydia 49

Curse of the Law, the 131-2, 134

- Applicability to Gentiles 132, 135–9
- Applicability to Jews 132–5
- Articulated in Jewish terms 135–6
- As exile 133
- Individualistic and corporate readings
 133–4
- Limited to Gentiles in Galatians? 132
- Relationship to enslavement under the στοιχεῖα 131, 136
- Accursedness and failure to embrace legal provisions for atonement 134

Curses 68-9

- The "children's children" curse 163
- "The curses written down in Deuteronomy" 162–3, 184
- The "flying sickle" curse 163

Cybele Cult 7, 39, 54, 61, 74–7, 95, 97–9, 186, 226 see also Attis

- Cybele as "mistress of all the elements" 122
- Ecstatic forms of worship? 75–6, 78, 98
- Greek and Roman influence 74-7
- Origins 74
- Ritual castration and circumcision 75, 97–9, 186–7, 193
- The Galli Cybele's eunuch priesthood? 76, 95, 97–9

Cyprian of Carthage 140

Cyril 175

Cyrus, King of Persia 49

Decius, Emperor 90

Deiotarus, Tetrarch in Galatia 14

Delphi Inscription 30

Dio Chrysostom 53-4

Dionysius 151

Dokimeion Quarry 58

Doorstones 67

Gradual eastward spread 67

Emperor Cult 3, 86-94

- Coexistence with traditional cults 89
- Cult temple construction in Asia Minor 86, 88
- Empire-critical interpretations of Galatians 7
- General obligation to participate? 90

Popularity 87–9

Epictetus 151, 157

"Epigraphic Habit" in Asia Minor 58

Epiphanius 175

Eratosthenes 150

Eumenes II, Attalid King 80

Eye Movement Desensitisation and Reprocessing (EMDR) 229

Faith and Works 5, 228

Flood Stories 80

Fourteen – Significance in Pauline

Thought 29, 32

Funeral Dedications 66

Gaius Caesar (Caligula), Emperor 27, 147

Gaius Marcius Censorinus 167

Γαλατία and Γαλάται as Keys to the Destination of the Letter? 16–17, 20

Galatia

- Contextual "envelope" 99-100, 212
- North Galatian (Landschaft) hypothesis 15, 17, 19
- Paul's initial visit 17
- Roman province 15, 17
- Settlement by Celtic mercenaries 14,
 17
- South Galatian or (Provinz) hypothesis 15, 17, 19

Galatian Christians

- Addressed using second-person terminology 44
- Behaviour incompatible with knowing God 116–7
- Element-worshippers before meeting Paul? 121–3
- Interpretative significance of their response to the Influencers 46–7
- Relatively immature at the point Paul wrote 7, 47, 111
- Seeking to avoid Roman persecution?
 180

Galatian Churches

- Location of the Galatian churches 14– 25
- Planted during the second missionary journey? 24, 30–1

 Planted during the third missionary journey? 24, 31

Galatian Crisis

- A call to proselyte conversion 19, 45, 90, 94
- Apostasy to paganism? 205
- Attributable not to overlapping pagan and Jewish religious expectations but to overlapping religious practices 216
- Attributable to the threat of Roman persecution? 93, 180
- Attributable to the threat of Jewish persecution? 93
- Centrality of circumcision 1, 95–99, 186–7, 201
- Extremity of Paul's warnings 193, 199–201, 204, 222
- Less theological than pastoral and missiological in nature 228
- Originating in Jewish legalism? 2
- Symptomatic and systemic responses 190–1

Galatians, Epistle to the

- Absence of introductory thanksgiving formula 25
- Addressing two distinct groups within the Galatian churches 92–3, 190
- Ambiguous destination 14
- An "Apologetic Letter"? 112
- Audience are former Godfearers? 39– 40, 178
- Audience are Gentiles 38–9, 194
- Bringing Jewish and Gentile religious experience into contact 93
- Eschatological/apocalyptic themes 45, 122–3, 203, 213–5, 218
- First- and second-person terminology 114–6
- Graeco-Roman religious background 5–9
- Jewish religious background 5, 8–9
- A very Jewish letter 39
- Linguistic connections to the religious world of first century Asia Minor 19, 96
- Structure 113-5
- Written in theologically and rhetorically sophisticated Greek 18

 Written not so much to the Galatian Christians as to the Influencers? 40

Galatians, Ethnic Grouping

- Abstention from pork 54
- Celtic settlers 50, 54
- Paradigmatic opponents of Roman power? 91–2
- Recruited into Roman legions 17

Gallio, Proconsul of Achaia 29-30, 34

- Encounter with Paul 29-31
- Letter to Claudius see Delphi Inscription
- Tour of duty in Corinth 29–30

Gentile attitudes to Judaism 101

- Attraction 101
- Hostility 101

Godfearers 172-3

- The Galatians as former Godfearers 2, 9, 39–40, 177–9, 193
- Not circumcised 9, 173
- Not required to foreswear pagan religious affiliations 173
- In Acts 13-14 153
- In Sardis see Sardis
- Inscriptional evidence 161, 164-6
- Integrated into synagogue communities 169–70
- More readily accepted than proselytes in pagan culture 171

Grace perfections (John Barclay) 209

- Incongruity 83
- Efficacy 83
- Non-Circularity 81–2, 208–16, 227 see also Reciprocity
- Priority 82-3, 210-11
- Singularity 84
- Superabundance 84

Grave Inscriptions 162 see also Curses

- Absence from Jewish graves in Palestine 162, 183
- "Altars" used as grave markers 167
- Use of curses from Deuteronomy 163–3

Gregory the Great 140–1 Gregory of Nazianzus 175, 184

Hadrian, Emperor 56 Habituation of Religious Norms 105, 140–2, 187

- Challenged through catechesis 140– 41, 221
- Only felt when a change is attempted
 221

Habitus 140

Hadrian, Emperor 160

Hagar and Sarah 2, 97, 185-6

Healing Cults 55, 79

Helena of Adiabene 35, 176

Helios 66

Henotheism 83, 145, 173

Heracles 80

Hermippus of Smyrna 144

Herod Agrippa 35

Hestia 76

Hittite Empire, the 49, 77

- Deification of Hittite kings 87

Homonadensians 15

Honorary inscriptions 67-8

Res Gestae Divi Augusti 68

Horace 152

Hosios kai Dikaios 58-60, 77-8

Hygeia 58, 76

Iconium 153

Ignatius of Antioch 154

"Incubation" in Pagan Temples 55

Influencers in Galatia, the

- Addressed using third-person terminology 44
- Agnosticism concerning their identity and motives 7, 41, 46, 226
- As Christians 1, 42, 44–7, 178, 205, 214
- Choice of the term, 'Influencers' 41–2
- Concerns of the Influencers not to be equated with concerns of the Galatian Christians 41, 45, 98, 201, 205, 208, 216–7, 227 see also "Slippage"
- Demands 219
- As ethnic Jews 7, 42, 44–7
- As exegetes of the Abrahamic narratives 113, 123
- As legalistic Jews emphasizing divine retribution? 96–7, 193
- As locals 40
- As a militant, principled Judean faction with widespread influence? 40, 218

- As persuasive advocates of Jewish legal observances 42
- As questioning the origin and authority of Paul's ministry 26
- As "the Strong" in Galatia 215
- As Torah-observant 1
- As "old age" thinkers 214
- As Gentile Converts? 42–6
- Similarities to Paul 215
- Speculative reconstructions 97, 123
- As urging proselyte conversion 178– 9, 193
- As visitors 44

Isis 58-9

Izates, King of Adiabene 176, 197

James, Brother of Jesus 31

Jesus Christ

- Crucifixion date 27
- Death and resurrection conveying all the benefits of proselyte conversion 198

Jewish Attitudes to Gentiles 101–4, 196, 219

- Equation of Gentile religion and idolatry 8, 102, 185–6, 214
- General distaste for Gentile gods and forms of worship 102
- Gentiles exchanging the roles and responsibilities of the creator and the creature 103, 185–6, 226
- Gentiles as Ger Toshav (indwelling strangers) 198
- Harsh exclusion 101
- "Patterns of universalism" 101
- Quasi pluralism 101

Jewish Christianity

- Likely to reanimate pagan religious assumptions of Gentile converts? 143 see also Pagan Religious Presuppositions
- Viable as long as Jewish Christians do not impose legal observances on Gentiles 219

Jewish Diaspora in Asia Minor 147

- Alignment of Jewish and pagan interests 156
- No evidence of ghettoisation 170
- Josephus as a key witness 144

- Protection of privileges 145
- Scale of Jewish population 144–7,
 150

Jewish Influence on Gentile Culture 158–9, 162–4, 175

Jews Influenced by Gentile Culture 159, 162–4, 183–4

Jewish Involvement in Gentile Culture 172, 175

- Apologetic texts 172
- Associations and guilds 164
- Burial societies 163
- Diaspora Jews superficially indistinguishable from Greeks 172

Jewish Magic 163, 184

- Use of Jewish angel names 168
- Moses as a master of the "divine arts"
 168
- Use of Hebrew letters 168, 184
- Use of the divine name 168, 184

Jewish Social Integration 155, 174-5

- Jews in secular occupations 158, 165
- Incorporation of pagan architectural, decorative, and linguistic norms 158, 174

Jewish Social Distinctiveness 146, 155, 169–70

- Allegiance to transnational community 169
- Circumcision 157, 169–70
- Exemption from military service 169
- Festivals 156, 164, 183
- Negative pagan responses 149–52, 170–1, 180
- Positive pagan responses 150–1
- Sabbath observance 146, 151–2, 157– 8, 171
- Special courts 146
- Special foods 146, 151–2, 157, 169, 171
- Temple tax 145, 169

Jewish Syncretism 9, 157, 174-5, 183

- Hypsistarians as a syncretistic cult 175
- Jewish status under Roman Rule 146 see also Julius Caesar/Julian privileges for Jews
- Jewish charter/formal constitution 90, 146–7

- Immunity from pagan cult obligations 89, 91
- Privileges extended to Gentile converts? 180
- Willingness to pray for the emperor
 92

Jewish Vows 161-2, 183 see also Vows

- Absence of comparable examples from Palestine 183
- Distinctive elements 162
- Prevalence 161

Joseph and Aseneth 176

Judaism

- Deterioration of Jewish-Christian relations 155–6, 217
- Dualities a feature common with pagan cosmology 122, 227
- Egyptian and Hellenistic renderings of Jewish origins 170–1
- Emerging distinction from Christianity 154, 169–70
- Eschatological expectations 200, 203
- Jews and justification by works 4, 8, 137–9, 213, 219, 222
- "Judaisms" 101
- Jewish monotheism 173
- The Ten Commandments 188
- Ubiquity of grace in Jewish thought?

Judas Maccabeus 150

Julia Severa 67, 164, 183-4

- As a Godfearer 165

Julius Caesar 14, 145

- Assassination 146
- Julian privileges for Jews 146-7

Justin Martyr 154-5

Juvenal 152, 175

Kubaba 74

L. Calpurnius Longus 68

Law 133

- And the Abraham story 135
- As "boundary marker" 4
- Enslavement, imprisonment, and accursedness 8
- Misappropriated in Galatia 4
- Observance intrinsically unachievable? 133–4, 136, 196

- From the pagan perspective 5
- Ας παιδαγωγός 2
- As racial identity marker 3
- And slavery 1
- Torah readings in diaspora synagogues 158–9, 161, 169

Law of Christ, the 191

Law Observance

- Applicability to Gentiles 194–7
- Dangers for Gentile Christians 136–8, 182–7, 202, 204, 208, 219–20, 226
- Equivalent to paganism? 180
- Ongoing observance acceptable/desirable for Jewish Christians 136, 194– 201, 202, 204, 208, 226
- Torah observance obligatory in the Jerusalem Church? 136

Lord's Supper, the 188-9

Lucius Verus (Emperor) 167

Lydian-Phrygian Confession Stelae, the 7, 61–66, 94–5, 99, 226

- Ancient precursors 63
- Dating 63 see also "Epigraphic Habit" in Asia Minor
- Exaltation of divine power 65
- Flattering the gods with ascriptions of ultimate power 83
- Geographical range 63, 72
- Indicative of a broader "climate of fear"? 94–6, 226
- Maintenance of religious purity 65
- Nomistic orientation? 94
- Relevance for New Testament exegesis 62–4, 96
- Ritual context 66
- "Setting up sceptres" 85

Maeander (River and Deity) 52–3, 82 Magical Texts 69–71

- Paucity of resources in Asia Minor 69
- Strategies deployed 70–71
- Similarities to votive offerings, confession texts, funerary inscriptions, and honorifies 71

Magicians 69

Māh 50

Marcus Aurelius, Emperor 88 Marcus Terentius Varro 151–2

Mark Antony 15

Matar Cult see Cybele Cult Mellitus, Abbott 141 Memnon of Heracleia 14 Mēn 50, 58–9, 65–6, 68, 80

- Priesthood of Mēn Askenos 51
- Temple in Pisidian Antioch 51, 58, 64, 68

Menorot 168

Meter 57, 58, 61, 66, 74-77, 80

- Ancestral Goddess of Sardis 56
- Known by many names 56
- Sacred black stone 77

Miletus 166

- Theatre inscription 166

Mirror Reading 7, 41

Mnaseas of Patara 149-50

Nebenadressat 22

Nemesis 89

New Perspective(s) on Paul 194, 214

- "Getting in" and "staying in" 194
- On Jewish responses to divine gifts 211

Nike 76

Nikomedes I of Bithynia 14

Noachide Commandments 173, 198

- Link to Apostolic Decree 199
 Noah
- Noah coins see Apamea Kibotos
- Ancient flood myths 149

Obsidian 142

Octavian see Augustus, Emperor Old Perspective on Paul 194, 214

 On Jewish responses to divine gifts 211–2

"Orans" Gesture, the 159

Pagan Gods 58-9

- Assembling personalised portfolios of religious devotion 83, 173
- And "Incongruous grace" 83
- Limited competence 83, 99
- Responsive to prayer 80
- Shrewd adaptability 84
- Significance of toponyms 57, 66, 80
- Unpredictability 80

Pagan Religion

- Analytical methodology 95

- "Collegiality" of the gods 171
- Differences between rural and urban contexts 72–3
- Divine punishment 79, 84
- Dualities in common with Jewish religious worldview 122, 201
- Ethical rigour 7, 76–8, 99
- Fear of the gods 79
- Festivals and rituals 156, 163, 183
- Inherent conservatism 79–80, 99, 206, 226
- Link to ethnicity 199
- Pagan religion as idolatry 8, 102, 185–6, 214
- Private cults 76
- Scope for extending/reimagining existing religious affinities 76–7
- Spontaneous gratitude to the gods 79,
 213

Pagan Religious Practice see also στοιγεῖον

- Diachronic analysis 74-7
- Memorialisation of past acts of devotion 7
- Ritual purity 185, 207-8, 228
- Sacred days and religious calendars 7, 185, 201, 207–8, 226, 228
- Separation of sacred and profane space 7, 185, 207–8, 226, 228
- Similarities to Jewish practices 201–8
- Establishing tangible and lasting memorials of devotion 187, 189, 207–8,
 228

Pagan Religious Presuppositions

- Enduring even after conversion to Christianity 5, 9, 10
- Differences from Jewish presuppositions 206–8, 222
- Perceptions of works 8
- Reanimated by exposure to Jewish Christianity 143 see also Jewish Christianity
- Similarities to Jewish presuppositions? 202–206, 208–212, 215, 222

πάλιν ἄνωθεν 117-20

- Recapitulating past experiences 118
- Returning to the beginning and repeating familiar procedures 118–9

"Parting of the ways," the *see* Judaism/Emerging distinction from Christianity

Paul

- Apostle to the Gentiles 194
- Arraignment before Gallio 29-31, 34
- Converted or commissioned? 26
- Encounter with the risen Christ 26, 37
- Escape from Damascus 27-8
- Familiarity with Galatia 100
- In fellowship with law observant Jews
 2
- Within Judaism 2, 3, 9–10, 37–8, 193–201
- As a Judaiser 189
- The "Law-free" apostle 37–8
- Past experience under the law 134,
 139
- Persecuted in Psidian Antioch, Lystra and Iconium 18
- Prevalence of the name Paul along the route of the first missionary journey
 19
- Relationship with Barnabas 32–3
- Self-awareness 189
- Supernatural origin of message 26
- Targeting Godfearers? 178, 200
- Use of ethnic identifiers for places 18

Pauline Christianity

- Centrality of "incongruous" grace 203–4
- Socially unstable 91–2, 181
- Too good to be true? 97

Pauline Chronology

- Absolute 27-36
- Chronological datums 6, 27-36
- Pauline texts as prime sources 20, 34
- Relative 26-7

Pauline Pastoral Strategy 104–112, 227, 29

- Deliberate minimisation of dangers associated with former religious commitments 9, 189–91, 229
- Offering symptomatic and systemic responses to the Galatian crisis 190– 1, 229
- Offering minimal ethical instruction
 190–1
- Pastoral naïveté? 191, 227

Pauline Visits to Jerusalem

- Intervals between visits in Galatians 28–29
- "Famine relief visit," the 31-2, 34-5
- Galatians as an exhaustive or inexhaustive account of Pauline visits? 22,
 34
- Jerusalem Council, the see Apostolic Council
- Visit with Cephas 26

Paul on Pagan Religion 5, 7

- Idolatry as the principle danger 8, 102, 185–6, 214
- Inversion of creator and creature roles 103, 139
- Influence of larger Jewish milieu 103–4

Paul's Missionary Journeys 23-4

- Habitual revisiting of churches planted on previous occasions, 24
- Relating itineraries to ancient road routes 24

Pausanius 54

Pergamum Magical Apparatus 168

περιτεμνόμενοι, οί 42-5

Persian Empire 49

- Conquest of Lydia 49
- Pyramidal administrative model 50
- Literary and scientific culture 50

Phrygian Empire, the 49

Pionius, Bishop of Smyrna 89, 156

Pliny the Younger 53

Plutarch 151

πόλις 14, 50, 72-3

Polycarp, Bishop of Smyrna 154

Proselyte Conversion see Conversion to Judaism

Phrygian Empire, the 14

Pythagorean Vision of the Basic Components of Reality 125

Reciprocity: Divine-Human 7, 65–6, 81–4

- Asymmetric reciprocal relationships 53, 61, 210
- Divine obligation initiated from the human side? 82–3, 211, 213–4, see also Reification

- Divine obligation initiated from the divine side 213–4, 216
- Human obligation to respond to divine gifts 210–16
- Humans and gods occupying a common realm of mutual obligation 71
- Master-slave paradigm 78-9
- Patron-client paradigm 78–9
- Responses as conditions for future gifts 210
- Responses as motives for future gifts with various degrees of efficacy 55, 212, 215
- Unprompted thank offerings 78–9, 213

Reciprocity: Human-Human 53-4, 210

 Driven by obligation on both sides 210

Reciprocity and "Non-Circularity" 208– 16, 227

Regression

- A central theme in Galatians 13, 98, 225
- Equating the "gospel" of the Influencers with the Galatians' former pagan religious paradigm? 96
- As a "gesture" at the Galatians' Godfearing past 179, 227
- Likened the Israelites' inclination to go back to Egypt 221
- Literary-critical solutions 94, 190
- To pagan norms 1, 179
- In Patristic exegesis of Galatians 10, 217–221
- As the reanimation of pagan religious assumptions 193, 206, 216, 222–3
- Regression to imperial cult observance 92
- As a rhetorical ploy 3, 11, 193, 201– 208, 222, 225, 227
- Triggered by exposure to Jewish law
 8

Reification 60, 189, 213-4

Roman Empire 51

- Roman rule of Asia Minor
- Decline of local cults? see Traditional Cults
- Attentiveness to local religious scruples 53

Rome

- The Roman Church
- Are "the weak" in Romans Jews or Gentiles? 108–10

Rosalia Celebration 163, 183

Rufina 167

Sabbath Observance among Christians 188–9

Sardis

- Godfearers in Sardis 159
- Occupations of synagogue members
 158
- Synagogue 147, 157–9, 161–2, 174,

Seleucid Empire 50

Seneca the Younger 30, 152

Septimus Severus, Emperor 159

Sergii family 66, 87

Sergius Paulus 66

Servinius Capito 164

Seven Ages of Man Tradition, the 29 Severus and Caracalla, Joint Emperors

Reforms allowing Jews to bear public office 159, 165

Sibylline Oracles, the 149

- Book 2 written in Phrygia? 149, 160
 σκάνδαλον Language
- In 1 Corinthians and Romans 107-8
- In Galatians 111
- "Slippage" 45–6, 98, 140, 185–7, 200, 222, 228

Social Pressure to Conform to Established Religious Norms 90

Sosthenes 29

τὰ στοιχεῖα τοῦ κόσμου 8, 112–131

- As building blocks of religious action 127, 206–8
- As earth, air, fire, water 121–3
- As fundamental components of pre-Christian living 126
- Problems with the 'physical elements' reading 121–3
- As morally neutral 127-8, 207-8
- Not used exclusively to refer to the physical elements 125–6
- And pre-established systems of worth 123, 203, 227

- As a reference to the natural order of the cosmos 124
- As a reference to worldly religious principles 127
- Worship of pagan gods equivalent to worship of the elements 120–2

στοιχεῖα as an Enslaving Power 112–131

- Applicable to Jews and Gentiles 113– 20
- In the Galatians' past experience 116
- In Paul's past experience 114

στοιχεῖα as Fundamental Components of Religious Behaviour 8, 226

- Common to pagans and Christians? 187–91
- Common to pagans and Jews 10, 127–8, 139, 184–7, 207–8

στοιχεῖον - Definitional Options 120

- Basic elements 121
- Demonic forces 92
- Fundamental principles 120, 217
- Heavenly bodies 120
- Meaning strongly correlated to context 124–5
- Physical elements the most common reading of the period 124
- Transcendent powers 120, 127

στοιχ Vocabulary in Galatians 190

- Attributable to later redaction? 94

Strabo 51–3

Strength 5, 8

- An ethnic identifier? 110
- Abstention from meat 108–9

Structuration Theory 45

Suidas and Zenobius 160

Tacitus 152

Tangible and Lasting Memorialisations of Devotion 84–6, 187, 189, 226

- Vertical significance 85–6
- Horizontal significance 85

Tectosages 14

τεκμορευειν 64

- As a communal religious practice 64

Telephos frieze, the 80

Teucer of Cyzicus 150

Tezcatlipoca 142

Θεὸς ὕψιστος 58-9, 174-5, 184

Tiberius Caesar, Emperor 27

Timothy 153-4, 197

- Circumcision 197

Titius Justus 29

Titus 26, 32-3, 154

Tolistobogii 14

Traditional Cults

- In decline under Roman rule? 51, 87–
 8
- Rate of traditional cult temple construction 88
- Coexistence with imperial cult 89

Trajan, Emperor 53, 90, 210

Trebonianus Gallus, Emperor 159

Triumvirate, the 50

Trocmoi 14

Tübingen Hypothesis, the 200

Tyche 76

Votive Offerings 57–61, 99

- Anatomical votives 60
- Not attested for emperor cult 53, 89
- Models of afflicted limbs 187 see also Votive Offerings/Anatomical votives
- Prevalence 58–9, 72
- "Rechargeable" votive offerings 61
- Relief carvings 57
- Restricted neither to rural nor urban settings 60
- Sacrificial equipment 186
- Significance of physical location 60– 1, 85, 213
- Tools of trade 187
- As tangible and enduring memorials of devotion 72, 99, 187, 189, 213
- Weapons of war 187

Vows 53-5

- Appropriateness of bargaining terminology 82
- Expectations related to the scale of the pledge made 53
- Fulfilment as an obligation 53–4, 59, 61, 210
- Generic form 57
- As a means to bind the gods? 60, 81-2
- As a means of entrusting possessions to the gods 82

- As a means to "incentivise" divine action 61, 81–2, 99, 206
- Vows Motivating Factors 59–60, 78–81
- Anatomical votives similar to confession texts? 63, 72
- Motives elusive 78
- Self-interest 60
- "This worldly" concerns 59–60, 84,
 99

Weakness 5, 8

- As an ethnic identifier? 105, 110
- In Galatians 111-2, 138-9, 216
- In the Hellenistic philosophical paradigm 106–7
- The necessity of unlearning weakness 107

- A sociological designation? 104-5
- As the state of struggling to leave the past behind 109
- As a synonym for law-observant Jews

Wittgensteinian Language Games 114 Works of the Law

- Associated with the curse 139
- Jewish and Gentile perspectives 137–
 9
- Paul concerned about significance for Gentiles in Galatians 138

χάρις 212

- In dedicatory inscriptions 82

Zeus 50, 58-9, 66, 76, 80, 85

Index of Places

Achaia	29-30, 34, 54	Colossae	201
Acmonia	67, 147, 162-	Corinth	29-31, 45
	3, 165, 167,	Corsica	49
	183	Cremna	51, 59
Aizanoi	60, 67, 76	Cyprus	35, 66
Alexandria	171	Cyzicus	150, 167
Amaseia	51	Daskyleion	144
Anatolia	7, 49, 54, 60,	Didyma	77
	94	Dokimeion	58
Ancyra (Ankara)	14, 25, 58, 68	Döşeme Boğazı	68
Antioch (In Pisidia)	18, 27, 50–1,	Pass, the	
	64, 68, 87,	Dyme	54
	137-9, 147,	Damascus	18, 26-7, 29,
	153		32, 34
Antioch (In Syria)	24, 30, 104,	Decapolis, the	118
	218	Derbe	24, 51, 147
Apamea Kibotos	51, 80, 147,	Egypt	77
	149, 159–60,	Ephesus	24, 77, 87, 89,
	170, 172, 184	•	145
Apamea Myrlea	53	France	49
Aphrodisias	23, 159, 165-	Γαλατία	16-17
	6, 173	Galatia	5, 14
Apollonia	67-8, 87	Southern	6, 14-25
Arabia	18, 26, 63	Northern	14-25
Arbēla	49	Roman Province	50-1
Ariassos	67	Galatian Pontus	15
Aşağıkurudere	58, 73, 85	Gerasa	118
Asia Minor	21, 49–100	Giymir	68
Aspendos	161	Gordion	14
Athens	31	Greece	21
Bahadınlar	83	Halicarnassus	80, 145
Berea	31	Halys river	14
Bethlehem	142	Hierapolis	147, 164
Bithynia	53, 90	Iconium	18, 50–1, 56–
Caesarea Maritima	155		8, 147, 153
Cappadocia	55	Iran	77
Carthage	140	Isauria	15
Cilicia	14, 18, 26, 50	Italy	49
Cnidus	149		

26–34, 93, 118, 136, 146, 185 Pessinus 24–5, 51, 54, Judea 18, 26, 141 58, 77, 122 Karacadağ 68 Philadelphia 45, 59, 76–7, Karakuyu 63–4 152, 154, 161, Katakekaumene Region, the Philippi 31
185 Pessinus 24–5, 51, 54, Judea 18, 26, 141 58, 77, 122 Karacadağ 68 Philadelphia 45, 59, 76–7, Karakuyu 63–4 152, 154, 161, Katakekaumene Re- 62 188, 218
Judea 18, 26, 141 58, 77, 122 Karacadağ 68 Philadelphia 45, 59, 76–7, Karakuyu 63–4 152, 154, 161, Katakekaumene Re- 62 188, 218
Karacadağ 68 Philadelphia 45, 59, 76–7, Karakuyu 63–4 152, 154, 161, Katakekaumene Re- 62 188, 218
Karakuyu 63-4 152, 154, 161, Katakekaumene Re- 62 188, 218
Katakekaumene Re- 62 188, 218
,
gion the
gion, the Philippi 31
Klaros 77 Phrygia 24, 62, 143,
Kocayaka 67 149, 159–60
Küçük Boruk 68 Pisidia 15, 50
Kumdanlı 64 Priene 159
Kula 65 Prusa 53
Kütahya 58, 73 Rome 51, 154–5
Ladık 57, 66, 164 Sağir 64
Laodicea 51–2, 145, Saittai 65
147, 162 Sardis 56, 144–5,
Lycaonia 15, 50 147, 157–9,
Lycus Valley, the 152 161–2, 166,
Lydia 62, 143 172, 174, 183
Lystra 18, 24, 50, Şeremet 57, 65
147, 153 Smyrna 45, 54, 80, 89,
Macedonia 21, 30, 49, 63 152, 154, 156,
Maeander River 52–3 166, 168, 180
Mağazadamları 59 Spain 49
Magnesia 77, 80, 154 Syria 18, 26, 154
Mahmutlar 67 Taurus Mountains 50
Maionia 60, 82, 212 Tavium 14
Mesoamerica 142 Teos 77
Mesopotamia 77, 143 Thessalonica 31
Miletus 145, 166 Thrace 49
Mysia 24 Tralles 165
Nicaea 88 Tyana 55–6
Nicomedia 53, 88 Uyuz Tepe 63
Paphlagonia 15 Yağlıbayat 66
Pamphylia 15 Zizimene 57
Patara 149