The Ways that Never Parted

Edited by ADAM H. BECKER and ANNETTE YOSHIKO REED

> Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism 95

Mohr Siebeck

Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism Texte und Studien zum Antiken Judentum

Edited by Martin Hengel and Peter Schäfer



The Ways that Never Parted

Jews and Christians in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages

Edited by ADAM H. BECKER and ANNETTE YOSHIKO REED

Mohr Siebeck

ADAM H. BECKER, born 1972; M.A. in Classics from New York University; M.St. in Syriac Studies from Oxford University; he will finish his dissertation and receive his Ph.D. from Princeton University in 2003.

ANNETTE YOSHIKO REED, born 1973; Ph.D. from Princeton University; currently a postdoctoral Research Associate at Princeton University in the Department of Religion and Program in Jewish Studies.

978-3-16-158695-8 Unveränderte eBook-Ausgabe 2019 ISBN 3-16-147966-1 ISSN 0721-8753 (Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism)

Die Deutsche Bibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at *http://dnb.ddb.de*.

© 2003 by J. C. B. Mohr (Paul Siebeck), P. O. Box 2040, D-72010 Tübingen.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems.

The book was printed by Gulde-Druck in Tübingen on non-aging paper and bound by Held in Rottenburg.

Printed in Germany.

Foreword

This volume arises from the fortuitous and fortunate coincidence of two originally unrelated events. The first is a series of workshops and colloquia initiated by Peter Schäfer in 2000, with generous funding from John Wilson, formerly Dean of the Princeton University Graduate School. The aim was to foster collaborative research between faculty and doctoral students in the Religions of Late Antiquity subfield of the Department of Religion, while providing the Department's students with unique opportunities for professional development. Each year, two graduate students choose a topic of interdisciplinary interest and, under the guidance of Peter Schäfer, organize a series of workshops on that theme, followed by a colloquium. At each workshop, a graduate student paper is presented, followed by discussion geared towards providing the student with guidance about how best to rework the paper into a formal conference presentation. The student papers are finally presented at the concluding colloquium, alongside papers from the faculty participants and invited scholars from other institutions, who are selected by the two organizers. Following the success of the first colloquium, "In Heaven as it is on Earth: Imagined Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religion" (January 14-15, 2001),¹ planning soon began for a second workshop and colloquium, this time organized by Adam H. Becker and Annette Yoshiko Reed. For this, they conceived of a timely topic that draws on the special strengths of Princeton's Department of Religion: an exploration of the continued interchange between late antique and early medieval Jews and Christians, which approaches the two religions as "Ways that Never Parted."

The second event was the creation of a formal Research Partnership between Princeton and Oxford in April 2001. One of the first twelve projects approved by that Partnership was on "Culture and Religions of the Eastern Mediterranean." Convened by Simon Price at Oxford and Fritz Graf at Princeton, this project seeks to make use of the ample resources of both universities in the area of late antique religions, in order to promote interdisciplinary research and to enhance the excellence of graduate studies through joint projects and graduate student exchanges.²

¹ The papers from the 2001 colloquium will also be published as a volume: *Heavenly Realms and Earthly Realities in Late Antique Religions*, ed. Ra'anan S. Abusch and Annette Yoshiko Reed (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, forthcoming).

² For more information, see http://www.classics.ox.ac.uk/faculty/oxprinceton.html.

Foreword

It soon became clear that the "Ways that Never Parted" project was an ideal fit for the new Oxford–Princeton partnership. Martin Goodman and Simon Price organized a seminar on the same topic, involving Oxford students and faculty from a broad range of related fields, and they oversaw the planning for a group of the Oxford participants to travel to Princeton for the culminating conference on January 9–11, 2002.

As the first event in the Oxford-Princeton Research Partnership, the conference brought together faculty and students from Princeton and Oxford, along with selected speakers from other institutions. As part of the unique combination of interdisciplinary research and graduate student training in the "Culture and Religions of the Eastern Mediterranean" project, Martin Goodman and Simon Price also worked with Fritz Graf to arrange two evening workshops during the conference, at which doctoral students from Oxford and Princeton shared their dissertation research with a group of faculty and students from both institutions. Together with the conference itself, these sessions helped to lay the groundwork for further cooperation and collaboration, strengthening the connections between scholars and students from different fields between (and even within) the two universities. The conference itself was organized by the editors of the present volume, under the guidance of Peter Schäfer, and the expenses were met jointly by Princeton and Oxford. The costs of the conference were covered from the fund established to support the yearly workshops and colloquia in Princeton's Department of Religion, while the Oxford visit and graduate student sessions were generously funded by the Oxford-Princeton Research Partnership.

The "Ways that Never Parted" proved to be a wonderful theme for a conference. A great deal of intellectual excitement was generated by the participation of scholars and students from Princeton, Oxford, and other universities, representing an unusually broad array of fields: Jewish Studies, Christianity, and even Paganism. The present book results from this conference. We believe that it successfully conveys the intellectual vigor of this event and, moreover, offers an excellent indication that the Oxford–Princeton project will go from strength to strength. revolutionizing our understanding of the culture and religions of the Eastern Mediterranean world.

Martin Goodman Simon Price Peter Schäfer

Table of Contents

Foreword by MARTIN GOODMAN, SIMON PRICE, and PETER SCHÄFER	V
ANNETTE YOSHIKO REED & ADAM H. BECKER Introduction: Traditional Models and New Directions	1
PAULA FREDRIKSEN What "Parting of the Ways"? Jews, Gentiles, and the Ancient Mediterranean City	35
DANIEL BOYARIN Semantic Differences; or, "Judaism"/"Christianity"	65
ROBERT A. KRAFT The Weighing of the Parts: Pivots and Pitfalls in the Study of Early Judaisms and their Early Christian Offspring	87
ANDREW S. JACOBS The Lion and the Lamb: Reconsidering Jewish–Christian Relations in Antiquity	95
MARTIN GOODMAN Modeling the "Parting of the Ways" 1	19
DAVID FRANKFURTER Beyond "Jewish Christianity": Continuing Religious Sub-Cultures of the Second and Third Centuries and Their Documents	31
E. LEIGH GIBSON The Jews and Christians in the <i>Martyrdom of Polycarp</i> : Entangled or Parted Ways?	.45
AMRAM TROPPER Tractate Avot and Early Christian Succession Lists	59
ANNETTE YOSHIKO REED "Jewish Christianity" after the "Parting of the Ways": Approaches to Historiography and Self-Definition in the Pseudo-Clementines	89

viii Ta	able of Contents	
	he Judaizing of Christian Scripture	233
DANIEL STÖKL BEN EZRA Whose Fast Is It? The Ember D	ay of September and Yom Kippur 2	259
	Not Conscientious in the Deed! ' Celibacy 2	283
	nception: Jewish Redemption History	307
AVERIL CAMERON Jews and Heretics – A Category	y Error?	345
JOHN G. GAGER Did Jewish Christians See the F	Rise of Islam?	361
	ral <i>Limes</i> : Questioning the "Parting of Empire	373
List of Contributors		393

Introduction

Traditional Models and New Directions

by

ANNETTE YOSHIKO REED & ADAM H. BECKER

For those who seek the origins of our modern conceptions of Judaism and Christianity as ultimately related yet essentially distinct religions, the idea of the "Parting of the Ways" proves powerfully attractive, offering a reassuringly ecumenical etiology of the religious differences between present-day Christians and Jews.¹ In this model Judaism and Christianity are likened to two paths that branched off from a single road, never to cross or converge again.² Even as their common origin is affirmed, the allegedly fundamental distinction between the two is explained as a result of a mutual decision, long ago, to part their fates and go their separate ways.

Scholars still debate the determinative catalyst for this "Parting" and whether or not such a split was inevitable.³ Nevertheless, it is generally agreed that there was a fateful turning point in the first or early second century CE, after which "there were no relations between Jews and Christians except hostile ones."⁴ As a result, most research on Late

¹ On the place of contemporary ecumenical concerns in the "Parting" model, see Judith Lieu, "The Parting of the Ways': Theological Construct or Historical Reality?" *JSNT* 56 (1994): 106–9. On the use of various familial metaphors to communicate the same concepts, see Daniel Boyarin, *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Judaism and Christianity* (Stanford: Stanford UP, 1999), esp. 1–6.

² I.e., as illustrated by Figures 1 and 2 in Martin Goodman's piece in this volume, "Modeling the 'Parting of the Ways."

³ See further: James J. D. Dunn, *The Partings of the Ways Between Christianity and Judaism and their Significance for the Character of Christianity* (London: SCM, 1991), esp. 238; idem, ed., *Jews and Christians: The Parting of the Ways, AD 70 to 135* (Cambridge: Eerdmans, 1992), esp. 367–68; Lawrence Schiffman, "At the Crossroads: Tannaitic Perspectives on the Jewish-Christian Schism," in *Jewish and Christian Self-Definition*, vol. 2, *Aspects of Judaism in the Graeco-Roman Period*, ed. E. P. Sanders (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981), 155–56.

⁴ George Dix, "The Ministry in the Early Church," in *The Apostolic Ministry: Essays on the History and Doctrine of Episcopacy*, ed. K. E. Kirk (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1946), 228. In his view, this situation came into being "after 70."

Antiquity and the early Middle Ages has progressed on the assumptions that (1) Judaism and Christianity developed in relative isolation from one another and (2) the interactions between Jews and Christians after the second century were limited, almost wholly, to polemical conflict and mutual misperception.

Our literary and archaeological data, however, attest a far messier reality than this unilinear spatial metaphor allows. Contrary to the "Parting" model, our sources suggest that developments in both traditions continued to be shaped by contacts between Jews and Christians, as well as by their shared cultural contexts.⁵ Even after the second century, the boundaries between "Jewish" and "Christian" identities often remained less than clear, consistent with the ambiguities in the definition of both "Jew" and "Christian."⁶ Likewise, attention to the entire range of our extant evidence suggests that the continued diversity of Judaism and Christianity found expression in the variety of ways in which Jews and Christians interacted in different geographical, cultural, and social contexts.⁷ Accordingly, a growing number of scholars have begun to challenge the "Parting" model, citing its methodological paucity, its inadequacy as an historical account, and its inability to explain much of our primary evidence.⁸ Spurning the simplicity of the notion of a single,

⁸ Important critiques of this model include Boyarin, *Dying for God*; Lieu, "Parting of the Ways"; P. S. Alexander, "'The Parting of the Ways' from the Perspective of Rabbinic Judaism," in *Jews and Christians*, 1–26; Steven Katz, "Issues in the

⁵ See, e.g.: Marc Hirshman, A Rivalry of Genius: Jewish and Christian Biblical Interpretation in Late Antiquity, trans. B. Stein (Albany: SUNY, 1996); Israel Yuval, "Easter and Passover as Early Jewish-Christian Dialogue," in Passover and Easter: Origin and History to Modern Times, ed. P. Bradshaw and L. Hoffman (Notre Dame: U. of Notre Dame Press, 1999), 98-124; idem, Two Nations in Your Womb: Dual Perceptions of the Jews and of Christians (Tel Aviv: Am Oved, 2000) [Hebrew]. Other examples are discussed by Abusch, Koltun-Fromm, Salvesen, Stökl Ben Ezra, and Tropper in this volume.

⁶ Ignatius's comments in *Magnesians* 10.3 often serve as the representative example for those who claim that "Jew" and "Christian" became clear-cut and mutually exclusive religious identities in the first century CE. However, counter-examples abound, both from this period and well beyond; see Lieu, "Parting of the Ways," 110– 14; Daniel Boyarin, "Semantic Differences; or 'Judaism'/'Christianity'," in this volume.

⁷ E.g.: Leonard Victor Rutgers, "Archaeological Evidence for the Interaction of Jews and non-Jews in Antiquity," *AJA* 96 (1992): 101–18; John G. Gager, "Jews, Christians, and the Dangerous Ones in Between" in *Interpretation in Religion*, ed. S. Biderman and B. Scharfstein (Leiden: Brill, 1992), 249–57; W. Kinzig, "'Non-Separatists': Closeness and Co-operation between Jews and Christians in the Fourth Century," *VigChr* 45 (1991): 27–53; R. Kimelman, "Identifying Jews and Christians in Roman Syrio-Palestine" [http://www2.bc.edu/~cunninph/kimelman_identifying.htm]. See also Paula Fredriksen, "What 'Parting of the Ways'? Jews, Gentiles, and the Ancient Mediterranean City," in this volume

early, and decisive separation between the two religions, many have turned to explore new approaches for understanding the relation-ship(s) between Jews and Christians in the centuries after their purported "Parting."⁹

The present volume seeks to further the discussion and debate about the "Parting of the Ways" by demonstrating what we stand to gain by approaching Judaism and Christianity as "Ways that Never Parted" - or, in other words, as traditions that remained intertwined long after the Second Temple had fallen and the dust had settled from the Jewish revolts against Rome. Whereas most treatments of early Jewish-Christian relations focus on the first and early second centuries CE¹⁰ and/or limit their discussions to the conflicts of later centuries.¹¹ the articles in this volume consider the points of intersection, sites of interaction, and dynamics of interchange between Jews and Christians in the period between the Bar Kokhba Revolt and the rise of Islam. Rather than approaching Judaism and Christianity as monolithic entities that partook in a single act of separation, we here attempt to illuminate the broad range of regional and cultural variation in the encounters between different biblically-based religious groups - including Jews and Christians, but also those so-called "Jewish Christians" and "Judaizers" who so strain the dichotomous definitions of modern scholarship. In the process, we hope to highlight the value of studying Judaism and Christianity as traditions that continued to impact one another, in constantly changing but consistently meaningful ways, throughout Late Antiquity and into the Middle Ages.

Separation of Judaism and Christianity after 70 CE: A Reconsideration," JBL 103 (1984): 43–76; Martha Himmelfarb, "The Parting of the Ways Reconsidered: Diversity in Judaism and Jewish-Christian Relations in the Roman Empire, 'A Jewish Perspective'," in Interwoven Destinies: Jews and Christians Through the Ages, ed. Eugene Fisher (New York: Paulist, 1993), 47–61; John G. Gager, "The Parting of the Ways: A View from the Perspective of Early Christianity: 'A Christian Perspective'," in Interwoven Destinies, 62–73. See also Boyarin, Fredriksen, and Becker in this volume.

⁹ Lieu, for instance, stresses that "The problem with the model of the 'parting of the ways' is that, no less than its predecessors on the pages of Harnack or Origen, it operates essentially with the abstract or universal conception of each religion, whereas what we know about is the specific and the local" ("Parting of the Ways," 108).

¹⁰ One refreshing exception to this tendency is the volume, *Christian–Jewish Relations through the Centuries*, ed. Stanley E. Porter and Brook W. R. Pearson (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 2000), in which contributions about Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages bridge the usual gap between discussions of the New Testament and of the modern period.

¹¹ A recent example: William Horbury, Jews and Christians in Contact and Controversy (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1998).

From Supersessionism to Common Origins and "Parted Ways"

In speaking of the "Parting of the Ways" as an historical model, we here mean to denote the notion of an early and absolute split between Judaism and Christianity, but also the "master narrative" about Jewish and Christian history that pivots on this notion. In its basic parameters, this narrative can be summarized as follows: in the first century CE, Judaism was characterized by great diversity, and the Jesus Movement was still negotiating its relationship to Jews and Judaism, both inside and outside the (still fluid) boundaries of its own communities. As a result, Christbelievers of both Jewish and non-Jewish ethnicities engaged in a range of exchanges with non-Christian Jews, such that even the conflicts between them were typically predicated on close contact and competition. In the wake of the destruction of the Second Temple and the Bar Kokhba Revolt, however, the two religions decisively institutionalized their differences. With the Jerusalem Church's alleged flight to Pella, apostolic "Jewish Christianity" lost its last bastion of authority, and the church would thenceforth be dominated by the antinomian "Gentile Christianity" espoused by the apostle Paul and embraced by non-Jews throughout the Roman Empire. Concurrent with the church's geographical shift from the Land of Israel to the urban centers of the eastern Mediterranean, Christianity emerged as a fully independent system of belief and practice, self-defined as non-Jewish in its theology, its ritual practice, and the ethnicity of its adherents. Instead of dwelling on contemporary forms of Judaism, followers of this religion turned to grapple with their ambivalent relationship to Greco-Roman culture. From that point onwards, Judaism's relevance for Christian self-definition would be limited to the Jewish scriptures that the church appropriated as its Old Testament and to the "literary Jews" of the Christian imagination, constructed from biblical paradigms to serve as pawns in intra-Christian debates.

According to this "master narrative," the parallel developments in Judaism were no less momentous or monolithic.¹² With the rise of the rabbinic movement, it is asserted that the diversity of Second Temple Judaism all but disappeared. The "Council of Yavneh," allegedly convened by Rabban Gamaliel II around 90 CE, put an end to sectarian disputes among the Jews; not only were the Pharisees/Rabbis empowered as the leaders of the whole nation, but they expelled the Christ-believers who remained in their midst by means of the *birkat ha-minim* ("blessing [= curse] on the heretics"). Under the religious leadership of the Rabbis, Jews would choose to live in self-imposed isolation from the rest of the

 $^{^{12}}$ For a more extensive account of the (rabbinic) Jewish side of the story of the "Parting of the Ways," see Schiffman, "At the Crossroads," 115–56.

Introduction

Greco-Roman world, just as indifferent to Christians and "pagans" as these Gentiles allegedly were to Jews and Judaism. Even when the Roman Empire became Christian and the enemy "Esau/Edom" truly took on the garb of a brother, Christians and Christianity remained far outside the bounds of Jewish concern, interest, or even curiosity, such that classical Judaism successfully resisted any influence from Christian traditions, beliefs, or practices. And hence – according to the view of early Jewish and Christian history that still dominates the scholarly discourse – these two religions came to be separate, conflicting, and categorically different, even despite their common origins in Second Temple Judaism.

The historicity and plausibility of many elements in this account have been questioned in recent years. For instance, the very concept of a mutual "Parting" owes much to the claimed correspondence between rabbinic traditions about the institution of the birkat ha-minim at Yavneh (b. Berakhot 28b-29a) and early Christian traditions about the expulsion of Christ-believers from synagogues (John 9:22; 12:42; 16:2). However, Peter Schäfer, Daniel Boyarin, and others have convincingly established that the "Council of Yavneh" was a much later construct, rather than an historical event.¹³ As such, scholars can no longer point to 90 CE as the end of all early intra-Jewish diversity nor appeal to the birkat ha-minim as a Jewish counterpart to (and cause for) Christian anti-Judaism. At the same time, New Testament scholars such as Raymond Brown have shown that the Judaism of the Jesus Movement was hardly limited to a single, Torah-observant "Jewish Christianity" in conflict with a single, antinomian "Gentile Christianity," dismissing the traditional assumption that early Christian attitudes towards the Torah were wholly determined by ethnicity.¹⁴ Likewise, Gerd Lüdemann and others have deconstructed the

¹³ See further: Peter Schäfer, "Die sogennante Synode von Jabne," Judaica 31 (1975): 54–64 [1: Zur Trennung von Juden und Christen im 1.–2. Jh. n. Chr.], 116–24 [2: Der Abschluss des Kanons]; Daniel Boyarin, "A Tale of Two Synods: Nicaea, Yavneh, and Rabbinic Ecclesiology," Exemplaria 12 (2000): 21–62; idem, "Justin Martyr Invents Judaism," Church History 70 (2001): 127–32. Furthermore, Reuven Kimelman has shown that the NT and patristic sources traditionally cited in support are far less univocal on this point than some scholars have made them out to be ("Birkat Ha-Minim and the Lack of Evidence for an Anti-Christian Jewish Prayer in Late Antiquity," in Jewish and Christian Self-Definition, vol. 2, Aspects of Judaism in the Graeco-Roman Period, ed. E. P. Sanders with A. Baumgarten and Alan Mendelson [Philadelphia: Fortress, 1981], 234–40). See also Katz, "Issues," 48–53; Günter Stemberger, "Die sogennante 'Synode von Jabne' und das frühe Christentum," Kairos 19 (1977): 14–21.

¹⁴ Raymond E. Brown, "Not Jewish Christianity and Gentile Christianity but Types of Jewish/Gentile Christianity," *CBQ* 45 (1983): 74–79.

myth of the Jerusalem Church's flight to Pella,¹⁵ thereby shedding doubt on the widespread view of the demise of authentically apostolic "Jewish Christianity" during the first Jewish Revolt.¹⁶ Furthermore, a variety of scholars have demonstrated that a critical reading of our late antique and early medieval sources does not support any simple model of separation; for even those authors who most vigorously assert the mutual exclusivity of "Judaism" and "Christianity" provide us with many clues about the continued complexity of the situation "on the ground."¹⁷

Nevertheless, the notion of the "Parting of the Ways" continues to influence contemporary scholarship, particularly with regard to the relationship between Jews and Christians after the second century. When faced with cases in which Jews and Christians clearly interacted, scholars tend to presume as a matter of course that any post-"Parting" contacts must have been exceptional in nature and polemical in thrust. When common traditions are discovered in Jewish and Christian sources, it is usually assumed that these are isolated examples of the unidirectional "influence" of one self-contained entity on another, as opposed to the products of any substantive intercredal interchange or the fruits of their common participation in a shared cultural or discursive context.¹⁸ Evidence that Judaism continued to hold an attraction for some Christians is typically explained away as the idiosyncratic propensities of isolated and individual Judaizers, who are merely "exceptions to the rule" in a church to which "living" forms of Judaism had long become irrelevant. Likewise, evidence for the existence of authors and groups who blurred

¹⁶ On the problems with the generalizations about the early demise of "Jewish Christianity," as well as the traditional concept of "Jewish Christianity" more broadly, see the contributions by Frankfurter, Gager, and Reed in this volume.

¹⁷ Note the repeated efforts by certain Christians to discourage others from adopting Jewish practices (e.g., *Didascalia* 26), frequenting synagogues (e.g., Origen, *Homilies* on Leviticus 5.8; Chrysostom, *Homilies Against the Jews*, passim), and even calling themselves "Jews" (e.g., Augustine, *Epistle* 196; Cyril of Jerusalem, *Cat.* 10.16). See further: Judith Lieu, *Image and Reality: The Jews in the World of the Christians in the Second Century* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1996), esp. 39–56; Robert Louis Wilken, John Chrysostom and the Jews: Rhetoric and Reality in the Late Fourth Century (Berkeley: U. of California Press, 1983), esp. 66–94; Gager, "Dangerous Ones in Between."

¹⁸ In most modern scholarship, it is only the "mother religion" Judaism that exerts "influence" on the "daughter religion" Christianity. For the methodological problems with this tendency (and the scholarly category of "influence" more broadly), see Peter Schäfer, *Mirror of His Beauty: Feminine Images of God from the Bible to the Early Kabbala* (Princeton: Princeton UP, 2002), 217–43, esp. 229–35.

¹⁵ See esp. Gerd Lüdemann, "The Successors of Pre-70 Jerusalem Christianity: A Critical Evaluation of the Pella-Tradition," in *Jewish and Christian Self-Definition*, vol. 1, *The Shaping of Christianity in the Second and Third Centuries*, ed. E. P. Sanders (Philadelphia: Fortress, 1980), 161–73. For further references, see Annette Yoshiko Reed, "Jewish Christianity' after the 'Parting of the Ways'," in this volume.

the supposedly firm boundaries between "Jewish" and "Christian" identities is lumped together under the rubric "Jewish Christianity" and dismissed as an anachronistic remnant of an age long past. In short, our data for the complex relationship between Judaism and Christianity in the late antique and early medieval periods are too often read through assumptions about their "parted ways."

To understand the enduring popularity of the concept of the "Parting of the Ways," it is helpful to consider its origins in the reaction against the supersessionist views that once dominated research on post-biblical Judaism and Christian Origins.¹⁹ In the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the academic discourse on these topics was dominated by Protestant Christian voices, and most scholars viewed Jesus as the founder of a new religion that was, from the very moment of its inception, categorically opposed to the Judaism of its time. Reading the triumphalism of ancient Christian literature as an expression of historical fact, they reconstructed post-biblical Judaism in the image of a religion ripe for replacement by emergent Christianity. The result was the socalled Spätjudentum ("late Judaism") described by influential historians such as Wilhelm Bousset (1865-1920) and Adolf von Harnack (1851-1930): an allegedly ossified system of belief and practice, a pale reflection of Israel's glorious patriarchal and prophetic past, a legalistic religion purportedly devoid of spiritual value and lacking in any attraction for non-Jews.²⁰ Inasmuch as this "late Judaism" was dismissed as largely irrelevant to the subsequent growth of the church,²¹ it is perhaps not surprising that so few students of Christianity felt any need to peer over - let alone to cross - the disciplinary boundaries that separated

¹⁹ On the images of Jews and Judaism in earlier research and their relationship to the often vitriolic anti-Judaism/anti-Semitism of late nineteenth and early twentieth century New Testament scholarship, see George Foot Moore, "Christian Writers on Judaism," *HTR* 14 (1921): 197–254; Susanna Heschel, "The Image of Judaism in Nineteenth Century New Testament Scholarship in Germany," in Jewish-Christian Encounters over the Centuries; Symbiosis, Prejudice, Holocaust, Dialogue, ed. Marvin Perry and Frederick M. Schweitzer (New York: Peter Lang, 1994), 215–40.

²⁰ See Wilhelm Bousset, *Die Religion des Judentums in neutestamentlichen Zeitalter* (Berlin: Ruether and Reichard, 1903); see discussion in Shaye J. D. Cohen, "Adolph Harnack's 'The Mission and Expansion of Judaism': Christianity Succeeds Where Judaism Fails," in *The Future of Early Christianity: Essays in Honor of Helmut Koester*, ed. Birger A. Pearson (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1991), 163–69; and Andrew S. Jacobs, "The Lion and the Lamb," in this volume.

 $^{^{21}}$ A related trend is the tendency to depict Christianity – even in the apostolic period – as a Greco-Roman cult with no special link to Judaism at all; see the discussion in Stanley E. Porter and Brook W. R. Pearson, "Why the Split? Christians and Jews by the Fourth Century," *Journal of Greco-Roman Christianity and Judaism* 1 (2000): 103–7.

them from their counterparts in the field of Jewish History.²² And, indeed, in light of the bleak image of Judaism once current in Christian scholarship, the lack of movement in the other direction should surprise us even less.²³

The metaphor of "parted ways" has some precedent in scholarship from this period: in at least one case – a 1912 collection of essays entitled *The Parting of the Roads* – the title of a work compares post-biblical Judaism and early Christianity to two divergent paths, even as the articles therein remain mired in the supersessionist assumptions of the time.²⁴ The image of "parting" did not become linked to a competing model until decades later, when questions about the origins of anti-Semitism were brought to bear on the study of the New Testament and early Christianity. For this, the key figure was James Parkes (1896–1981), a British clergyman who over his lifetime produced a number of books on Jewish– Christian relations and the history of anti-Semitism.²⁵ Parkes' interest in these topics was first sparked in the late 1920s, in reaction to the rise of anti-Semitism among nationalist students across Europe.²⁶ In 1930 he published the first of his many books: *The Jew and his Neighbor*, an exploration of the history of anti-Semitism, which approaches the

²² Important exceptions include August Friedrich Gfrörer in the nineteenth century (see e.g. *Kritische Geschichte des Urchristentums* [2 vols.; Stuttgart: Schweizerbart, 1835]) and George Foot Moore in the early twentieth (see esp. his seminal article "Christian Writers on Judaism," on which see below).

²³ The most important exception is Abraham Geiger (1810–1874), whose books were widely read by Christian scholars at the time; furthermore, his approach to Jesus and early Christianity in *Das Judentum und Seine Geschichte* (3 vols., Breslau: Schletter, 1864–71) and other works presages many of the "new" postwar developments discussed below; see further Heschel, "Image of Judaism," 225–32; eadem, *Abraham Geiger and the Jesus (Chicago: U. of Chicago Press, 1998).*

 $^{^{24}}$ F. J. Foakes Jackson, ed., *The Parting of the Roads: Studies in the Development of Judaism and Early Christianity* (London: Arnold, 1912), cited in Lieu, "Parting of the Ways," 101, as an "anticipation" of the concept of the "Parting of the Ways." Despite the supersessionist stance of the book as a whole, it is notable that the contribution of Ephraim Levine ("The Breach between Judaism and Christianity") attempts "to trace the narrative of religious progress to the point where Judaism and Christianity parted company" (p. 285) and dates this development to 70 CE – contrary to the view of this development as the result of Paul's genius in understanding Jesus' true message as found, for instance, in the introduction to the book (pp. 11–12).

²⁵ Sidney Sugarman, Diana Bailey, and David A. Pennie, eds., A Bibliography of the Printed Works of James Parkes, with Selected Quotations (Southampton: U. of Southampton Press, 1977). On Parkes' broader project, see Robert Andrew Everett, Christianity Without Antisemitism: James Parkes and the Jewish-Christian Encounter (New York: Pergamon, 1993).

²⁶ For Parkes's memoirs on his "Involvement in the Jewish Question," see *Voyages* of *Discovery* (London: Victor Gollancz, 1969), 111–35, penned under the pseudonym John Hadham.

massacres of Jews during the First Crusade (1096 CE) as the background to the debates about the "Jewish Question" in his own time.²⁷ For his Oxford doctoral thesis, Parkes sought to uncover the very roots of the phenomenon of anti-Semitism by going back to the period of Christian Origins and by attempting to pinpoint the initial moment of Christianity's separation from Judaism. The result was his influential 1934 book, *The Conflict of the Church and the Synagogue.*²⁸

By the time of its publication, Parkes' scholarly work on the prehistory of modern anti-Semitism had become even more relevant to the contemporary situation. On May 1, 1934, the Nazi party periodical *Der Stürmer* issued a special fourteen-page publication accusing Jews of using Christian blood in their Passover baking and other rituals.²⁹ In the same month of the same year, Parkes began the preface to his book with the following words:

The publication of a study of the causes of anti-Semitism needs neither justification nor explanation at the present time. But a word may be said of the material offered in the present work. The progress of events from the mediaeval ghetto to modern Europe is fairly well known. That the roots of the present situation lie in the mediaeval past is generally agreed. The present work tries to go a stage further, and to answer the question: why was there a mediaeval ghetto?³⁰

Insofar as *The Conflict of the Church and the Synagogue* analyzed the period of Christian Origins as part of a broader inquiry into the causes of modern anti-Semitism, this book represented a radical departure from contemporaneous research on the New Testament, "late Judaism," and early Christianity, which continued to view these topics through the lens of Christian beliefs about the church's deserved status as the new and true Israel. Whereas such studies tended to assume the distinctiveness of Christianity vis-à-vis Judaism even in the lifetime of Jesus, Parkes stressed the continuity of the two in the apostolic age and prioritized the question of the precise moment of their divergence thereafter.

²⁷ James Parkes, *The Jew and his Neighbour: A Study of the Causes of Antisemitism* (London: SCM, 1930). For a more recent investigation of Jews and Christians during the First Crusade, see Robert Chazan, *In the Year 1096: The First Crusade and the Jews* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1996); idem, *European Jewry and the First Crusade* (Berkeley: U. of California Press, 1987).

²⁸ James Parkes, The Conflict of the Church and Synagogue: A Study in the Origins of Anti-Semitism (London: Soncino, 1934).

²⁹ The Nazi appropriation of the blood libel myth, together with other traditional tropes of anti-Semitism, led many to seek the origins of Nazi anti-Semitism, despite its special virulence, in the Christian past. On this particular myth, see A. Dundes, ed., *The Blood Libel Legend: A Casebook in Anti-Semitic Folklore* (Madison: U. of Wisconsin Press, 1991).

³⁰ Parkes, Conflict, vii.

The resultant account of early Jewish-Christian relations anticipated, in nearly every detail, the "Parting" model that now dominates research on these topics. Most notable is the third chapter, which, in fact, bears the title "The Parting of the Ways."³¹ Countering assertions about the inherent theological differences between Judaism and Christianity with a socio-political analysis of the events between the birth of Jesus and the Bar Kokhba Revolt, Parkes concluded that "the definite separation into two religions took place towards the end of the first century,"³² and he argued that "the end of the first century is the time of the definite emergence of Christianity as a new religion."33 Although Parkes himself most often spoke of this critical moment as "the separation,"³⁴ he can be credited with innovating, articulating, and popularizing the concept of the "Parting of the Ways" as we now know it.³⁵ This model, in short, owes its origins to the integration of the study of Christian Origins into the historiography of anti-Semitism/anti-Judaism, whereby Christian hostility towards Jews (both modern and medieval) forms the impetus and

³² Parkes, Conflict, 91.

³³ Parkes, Conflict, 92.

³⁴ Terms like "the separation" and "the split" would also used by Marcel Simon in his seminal 1948 book Verus Israel: Étude sur les relations entre Chrétiens et Juifs dans l'Empire Romain (135–42) (Paris: Editions de Boccard, 1948); English version: Verus Israel: A Study in the Relations Between Christians and Jews in the Roman Empire, AD 135–425, trans. H. McKeating (Oxford: Oxford UP, 1986), xiv. Notably, Simon chooses to begin his inquiry "at the moment when the Church became fully conscious of its own autonomy and universal mission" (p. xii), which he dates to 135 CE, arguing against an earlier date of 70 CE (pp. xiv–xvi, plus his response to critiques of this choice in his 1964 Postscript, pp. 386–88).

³⁵ Already in the 1950s and 1960s, we find the "Parting of the Ways" used in titles of scholarly books and articles about the separation of Christianity from Judaism in the first or early second century CE; see, e.g., Abraham Cohen, *The Parting of the Ways: Judaism and the Rise of Christianity* (London: Lincolns-Prager, 1954), esp. ch. 5; Morton Scott Enslin, "Parting of the Ways," *JQR* 51 (1961): 177–97. More recent examples are cited above. See also: Robert Murray, "The Parting of the Ways," *Christian–Jewish Relations* 20 (1987): 42–44; Richard Bauckham, "The Parting of the Ways: What Happened and Why," *Studia Theologica* 47 (1993): 135–51; Vincent Martin, *A House Divided: The Parting of the Ways Between Synagogue and Church* (New York: Paulist, 1995).

³¹ This, to our knowledge, is the earliest attestation of this phrase that reflects its current sense; cf. Lieu, "Parting of the Ways," 101–2, who expresses uncertainty about its exact origins and cites James Dunn's 1991 book as her earliest example. For a critique of Parkes' formulation, see Nicholas de Lange, "James Parkes: A Centenary Lecture," in *Cultures of Ambivalence and Contempt: Studies in Jewish–Non-Jewish Relations*, ed. Siân Jones, Tony Kushner, and Sarah Pearce (London: Vallentine Mitchell, 1998), 42–44.

Modern Author Index

Abraham, I. 15 Abusch, R. S. 335 Albeck, Ch. 159, 160, 162 Alexander, P. S. 2, 14, 18, 20, 23, 52, 191 Alon, G. 11, 191 Alter, R. 309 Althusser, L. 67, 77 Amezaga, L. D. 171 Anderson, M. J. 317 Asad, T. 71 Aschkenasy, N. 336 Auerbach, M. 324 Auf der Maur, H. 260 Austin, J. L. 84 Baer, H. A. 135 Bagnell, R. S. 50 Bailey, D. 8 Baird, R. D. 79 Bammel, E. 364 Barcellon, F. S. 173 Barclay, J. 39, 43, 46 Bardy, G. 109, 173 Barnard, L. W. 149, 270 Barnes, T. D. 60, 148, 376 Baron, S. W. 50 Barrett, C. K. 270 Barthélemy, D. 242, 247, 255 Bauckham, R. 10, 136, 137 Bauer, W. 19, 88, 185 Baumgarten, A. I. 12, 21, 80, 101, 104, 205, 206, 223, 229 Baur, F. C. 35, 199-201, 208 Beard, M. 75, 78 Beatrice, P. F. 172 Becker, A. H. 202, 264, 377 Bell, C. 261 Berchman, R. M. 287 Berger, P. 371 Bergman, J. 229 Bergren, T. 138, 139 Berliner, A. 264 Betz, H. D. 69 Bhabha, H. K. 66, 73, 74, 111, 112, 114 Bickerman, E. 165, 166, 167

Biggs, C. 200 Bihlmeyer, K. 155 bin Gorion, M. J. 308, 312 Birnbaum, E. 287, 289 Blidstein, Y. 165 Bloch, R. S. 43 Block, P. 325 Blumenkranz, B. 49, 56, 264, 275 Boccaccini, G. 12, 88, 89, 90 Bockmuehl, M. 132 Borgen, P. 288 Bori, P. C. 208 Bourdieu, P. 67 Bousset, W. 7, 98, 99, 205 Bovon, F. 269 Bowersock, G. W. 36, 46, 57, 116 Boyarin, D. 1, 5, 14, 17, 20, 59, 60, 75, 85, 96, 120, 132, 145, 157, 168, 178, 180-82, 184, 186, 195, 202, 225, 227, 289, 294, 295, 297, 304, 305, 308, 309, 318, 335, 370, 373, 375 Bradshaw, P. 280 Brakke, D. 73 Braun, T. 102 Braverman, J. 236, 251, 254 Brenner, A. 309 Brent, A. 178 Broadhurst, L. 145 Brock, S. 238, 240, 373, 374, 375, 376, 377, 378, 380, 386, 388, 389 Brown Tkacz, C. 254. See C. Tkacz. Brown, D. 236 Brown, P. 287, 342 Brown, R. 5, 73, 200, 264, 270, 309, 342 Brubaker, L. 347 Buell, D. K. 350 Bultmann, R. 13 Burgess, R. W. 377, 380 Burrus, V. 350 Busto Saiz, J. R. 247 Buttenweiser, M. 341 Buxton, R. 40 Cameron, A. 117, 341, 342, 347, 348, 351, 360, 384

Campenhausen, H. von 149, 152, 172, 173.178 Carleton Paget, J. 49, 50, 56, 58, 60, 104, 110, 190, 194, 195, 201, 366 Casula, L. 262 Chadwick, H. 172, 174 Charlesworth, J. H. 20, 133 Chavasse, A. 259-60, 265-67, 266, 272.276 Chazan, R. 8 Chidester, D. 66 Chilton, B. 13, 14 Chuvin, P. 362 Clark, E. A. 105, 106, 302, 316, 355 Cohen, A. 10 Cohen, G. D. 339 Cohen, S. J. D. 12, 14, 42, 50, 52, 67, 68, 69, 82-83, 89, 90, 98, 99, 170, 180-186, 268, 271, 319 Collins, J. J. 140 Conway, A. J. 259, 262, 273, 274 Cook, M. 390 Cormack, R. 342 Corrigan, K. 346-47 Cox, C. 245 Crenshaw, J. L. 166 Crone, P. 231, 361-62, 364-65, 371 Culler, J. 179 Curletto, S. 315 Dagron, G. 341, 343 Dan, J. 324, 328, 329, 340 Daniélou, J. 137, 190, 194, 231, 242, 259, 260, 280 Daumas, F. 141 David, Y. 329 Davies, W. D. 11, 62, 132 Dawson, D. 286 de Certeau, M. 350 de Jonge, M. 133, 140-42, 316 de Lange, N. 10, 21, 102, 109, 110, 111, 241, 257, 343 de Ste. Croix, G. E. M. 57 De Wette, W. 98 Dechow, J. F. 355 Dehandschutter, B. 146, 147 Denis, A-M. 135 Déroche, V. 341, 342, 383 Deutsch, N. 80, 331, 333 Di Segni, R. 311 Dillon, J. M. 170 Dinari, Y. 319 Dines, J. 253

Dinur, B. Z. 160, 163 Dix, G. 1 Donner, F. 386 Dorival, G. 246 Drake, H. A. 44 Dreyfus, F. 364 Drijvers, H. J. W. 374, 384, 385 Droge, A. 358 Dummer, J. 358 Dundes, A. 9 Dunn, J. D. G. 1, 10, 16, 18, 35, 87, 88, 90, 192, 235 Efroymson, D. 37 Ehrhardt, A. 178 Ehrman, B. D. 89 Eilberg-Schwartz, H. 305 Elm, S. 350 Enslin, M. S. 10 Epstein, J. N. 161, 187 Everett, R. A. 8 Feldman, L. 41, 45, 49, 50, 52, 271 Ferguson, E. 176 Fernández Marcos, N. 239, 245 Finkelstein, L. 162, 163, 165, 324 Fischer, L. 259, 260 Fitzmyer, J. A. 268 Flusser, D. 13, 14, 135 Foakes Jackson, F. J. 8 Fonrobert, C. 21, 184, 195, 196, 203, 375 Fossum, J. 136 Foucault, M. 65 Fraade, S. D. 66, 287 Frankel, Y. 163 Frankel, Z. 160 Frankfurter, D. 14, 131, 132, 134, 137, 139, 140, 142, 143, 150, 151, 190 Fredriksen, P. 11, 13, 36, 37, 43, 47, 54, 55, 95, 227 Freeland, J. P. 259, 262, 273, 274 Freier, B. 50 Frend, W. H. C. 15, 57, 72, 172 Freyer Stowasser, B. 335 Gafni, I. 382 Gager, J. G. 2, 3, 11, 13, 39, 41, 50, 100, 132, 225, 228, 231, 273, 358, 361, 369 Gaston, L. 13, 367 Geiger, A. 8, 15 Gentry, P. 244, 245 Gfrörer, A. F. 7 Gibson, E. L. 59, 145, 151

Glucker, J. 166, 168, 169 Godu, G. 263 Gokey, F. X. 154 Goldenberg, R. 152, 271 Goldman, S. 335 Goldschmidt, D. 275 Goldstein, J. A. 67, 68 Goldstein, M. 370 González Luis, J. 247 Goodblatt, D. 163 Goodman, M. 20, 43, 119, 172, 179, 183-85, 359 Goranson, S. 132 Grant, R. M. 174, 175, 176, 358 Grätz, H. 11, 12, 15, 324 Graves, R. 115 Green, A. 337 Grégoire, H. 148 Griffith, S. H. 285, 298, 386, 391 Grözinger, K.-E. 328 Gruen, E. 36, 38, 39, 41, 43, 44, 46, 49, 55 Gutas, D. 389, 390 Guttmann, A. 160 Hadham, J. See J. Parkes Haelewyck, J.-C. 135 Haines-Eitzen, K. 100 Hall, J. M. 68, 70, 75-77 Hall, R. G. 135-36 Hall, S. 269 Halperin, D. J. 328 Halperin, D. M. 72 Hanson, A. E. 40 Hanson, A. T. 173 Hanson, R. P. C. 172, 176 Harder, K. J. 171 Hare, D. 14 Harl, M. 246 Harlow, D. C. 134 Harnack, A. von 3, 7, 49, 50, 57, 98, 99, 100, 101, 102, 103, 104, 193, 195, 273 Harrington, D. J. 310 Hasan-Rokem, G. 21, 84 Hastings, A. 178 Hata, G. 351 Hayes, C. 20, 223 Hayman, P. 341 Hayward, C. T. R. 251, 253, 315 Heather, P. 63 Heber, W. 228 Hengel, M. 43, 166

Herford, R. T. 163 Herr, M. D. 325 Heschel, S. 7, 8 Hezser, C. 20, 185 Hilgenfeld, A. 357 Himmelfarb, M. 2, 15, 16, 140, 322, 340, 341 Hirshman, M. 2, 21, 308 Hoffman, J. G. H. 389 Hoffman, L. 310 Holl, K. 259 Hollander, H. W. 142 Honigman, S. 239 Horbury, W. 3, 60, 102, 311 Horner, T. 104 Horowitz, Ch. M. 314, 319, 320 Horowitz, E. 117 Humphries, M. 351 Inowlocki, S. 237 Irshai, O. 35, 37 Isaac, J. 11 Jacobs, A. 383 Jaffee, M. S. 12, 89, 90, 98, 302 Janini, J. 259, 266 Janowitz, N. 20 Jaubert, A. 269 Jay, P. 253 Jefford, C. N. 171 Jenkins, G. 241 Johannessohn, M. 252 Johnson, M. D. 165 Jones, C. P. 39, 58 Jones, F. S. 196-201, 203, 206, 208, 212, 225 Juster, J. 100 Kalmin, R. 195, 381, 382 Kamesar, A. 21, 112, 113, 239, 248, 249, 250, 253, 254 Kapah, J. 163 Katz, S. 2, 5, 19 Kedar, B. 254 Kelly, J. N. D. 174 Kimelman, R. 2, 5, 110, 370, 376 King, P. D. 63 King, R. 75 Kinzig, W. 2, 104 Kister, M. 162 Kittel, G. 157 Kitzinger, E. 342 Klausner, J. 15 Klijn, A. F. J. 189, 190, 191, 193, 194, 195, 198, 199, 231

Klingshirn, W. 265 Knibb, M. A. 133 Knight, J. 136, 137, 138 Knohl, I. 265 Koester, H. 13, 19, 200 Kofsky, A. 348 Koltun-Fromm, N. (also N. Koltun), 296, 376 Koren, S. 319 Kraemer, R. 106 Kraft, R. A. 12, 15, 133, 137, 139, 190 Kraus, M. 256 Krauss, S. 183, 311, 324 Kritzman, L. D. 65 Kronfeld, Ch. 78, 79, 80, 81, 82 Kugel, J. 335 Kuyt, A. 327, 328 Labov, W. 74, 76, 77, 81 Lakoff, G. 81, 82, 83, 84 Lamont, M. 261 Lamoreaux, J. 386 Lampe, P. 264, 268 Lane Fox, R. 36, 39, 57, 58, 131 Lapin, H. 110 Lasker, D. J. 390 Laupot, E. 72 Lauras, A. 264, 275 Le Boulluec, A. 178, 350, 351, 353 Leclerg, H. 263 Lejav, P. 271 Leon, H. J. 264 Lerner, M. B. 160, 163 Lesses, R. M. 323 Lévi, I. 341 Levine, A.-J. 106 Levine, E. 8 Levine, L. I. 36, 46, 48, 51, 335, 375 Levinson, J. 335 Lewis, D. M. 69 Lieberman, S. 319, 322, 325, 339 Liebeschuetz, J. H. W. G. 63 Lieu, J. 1, 2, 3, 6, 8, 10, 16, 21, 37, 52, 58, 59, 73, 104, 148, 158-59, 225, 348, 350, 353, 359, 383 Lightfoot, J. B. 35, 157 Lightstone, J. N. 156 Lim, R. 346 Linder, A. 38, 47, 60, 63, 110 Lloyd, G. E. R. 315 Loomba, A. 75, 108, 117, 118 Luckmann, T. 371 Lüdemann, G. 5, 193, 199, 201, 203

Lukyn Williams, A. 100 Luz, U. 273 Lyman, R. 355, 357, 358 MacCulloch, D. 65 Mack, B. L. 288 MacMullen, R. 59, 131 Maier, H. 157, 172 Malina, B. 191, 217 Malti-Douglas, F. 335 Mansfeld, J. 287, 357 Marienberg, E. 312, 319 Markus, R. 63, 352, 354 Marmorstein, A. 184, 229 Marshall, J. W. 14, 132, 150, 151 Martin, V. 10 Martyn, J. L. 137 McKane, W. 256 McKay, H. 271 Meier, J. P. 264, 270 Mendels, D. 349, 350 Mendelson, A. 21 Mercier, R. 377, 380 Meyer, B. F. 21 Milani, C. 114 Miles, J. 77, 96 Milikowsky, Ch. 161 Millar, F. 13, 36, 44, 45, 49, 57 Mimouni, S. C. 46, 115, 189, 193, 199, 200 Montefiore, C. 15 Moore, G. F. 7, 12, 51, 177 Moore-Gilbert, B. 107 Morgan, C. 77 Morin, G. 259, 260, 266 Morony, M. G. 375 Morray-Jones, C. 330, 331 Mortley, R. 358 Moutsoulas, E. 356 Munck, J. 192, 201 Munnich, O. 246 Murray, R. 10, 134 Musurillo, H. 57 Naeh, Sh. 265 Nathan, G. 265 Nautin, P. 177, 240 Needham, R. 78 Neusner, J. 15, 17, 20, 66, 88, 89, 132, 166, 376 Newman, H. 370 Nickelsburg, G. 12 Niditch, S. 105 Nocent, A. 260

Nock, A. D. 42 Norelli, E. 135, 136, 137-38, 139 North, J. A. 75, 78, 104 Norton, G. J. 241 O'Donnell, J. J. 131 Olson, K. A. 237 Olster, D. M. 99, 341, 384 Osier, J. P. 311 Owens, J. R. 296 Pagels, E. 19, 235 Pardes, I. 70 Parkes, J. 8-12, 16-18, 58, 60, 66, 373 Pastis, J. Z. 60 Pasto, J. 98 Pearson, B. A. 69 Pearson, B. W. R. 3, 7 Peers, G. 342 Pennie, D. A. 8 Perkins, J. 109 Phillips, C. R. 348 Pietri, C. 262 Pines, S. 273, 361--65, 381, 390 Pinsent, J. 287 Pomeroy, S. B. 171 Poole, F. J. P. 159 Porter, S. E. 3, 7 Porton, G. G. 308 Potter, D. S. 40 Pourkier, A. 355, 356 Pratt, M. L. 74 Price, S. R. F. 40, 57, 75, 78, 359 Putman, H. 389 Rabello, A. M. 56 Radin, M. 271 Rapaport, S. 338 Reed, A. Y. 316, 317, 331 Reeg, G. 307, 314, 324, 325, 326, 333 Reeve, M. D. 315 Reinhartz, A. 11, 310 Reinhold, M. 271 Reinink, G. J. 189, 191, 193, 194, 198, 384, 386 Reynolds, J. 36, 49, 51, 219 Richardson, P. 45 Ridings, D. 358, 359 Riegel, S. K. 199 Riggi, C. 356, 360 Rives, J. B. 56 Rohrbacher-Sticker, C. 329 Rokéah, D. 210 Rordorf, W. 149, 174 Roskies, D. 307

Roth. C. 95 Rouwhorst, G. 266 Rubenstein, J. 381 Ruether, R. R. 11, 17, 62, 66, 98, 204 Runesson, A. 98, 213 Rutgers, L. V. 2, 36, 50, 227, 264 Sachot, M. 72 Said, E. 107, 113 Saldarini, A. 14, 132, 160, 162, 163, 165 Salvesen, A. 241, 245, 246, 248, 252, 253 Sanders, E. P. 13, 21, 35, 45, 54, 89, 132 Sanders, J. T. 350 Satran, D. 147, 383 Schäfer, P. 5, 6, 14, 21, 39, 41, 42, 82, 160, 165, 179, 271, 322, 324, 329, 330, 331, 332, 333, 337, 341 Schaper, J. 240 Schiffman, L. 1, 4, 89, 191, 192, 322 Schlichting, G. 311 Schlüter, M. 322 Schoeps, H. J. 198, 199, 203, 212, 226 Schramm, T. 267 Schümmer, J. 259 Schürer, É. 13, 44, 45, 133, 135, 140 Schwartz, M. 70 Schwartz, S. 20, 36, 62, 68, 82-83, 88-92, 228 Segal, A. F. 69, 80, 93, 96 Seltzer, C. 60 Shanks, H. 20 Sharvit, S. 161 Shepardson, C. C. 345, 351, 352 Sherwin-White, A. N. 57 Shmuel, Y. E. 340, 341 Shoemaker, S. J. 104 Shuler, P. 289 Sigal, P. 184 Siker, J. S. 103 Sillet, H. 357 Silver, A. H. 341 Sim, D. C. 132 Simon, M. 10, 12, 17, 49, 63, 101-4, 110, 115, 133, 137, 139, 191, 192, 193, 195, 209, 324, 352, 353, 357 Singer, M. 134 Skehan, P. W. 239 Slotki, J. J. 340 Smith, J. Z. 179 Smith, W. C. 71

Soisalon-Soininen, I. 241 Sourvino-Inwood, C. 53 Sperber, D. 51 Spiegel, G. 105 Spivak, G. 111, 118 Stanton, G. N. 37, 138, 139, 360 Stark, R. 350, 359 Stemberger, G. 5, 17, 66, 160, 206 Stendahl, K. 13 Stern, D. 307 Stern, M. 271 Stern, S. 119, 185 Stern, S. M. 274, 361-66 Stökl Ben Ezra, D. (also D. Stökl) 261, 268, 269, 271 Stone, M. E. 138 Stowers, S. 36 Strecker, G. 88, 194, 198, 201, 203, 208, 211, 212, 218, 227 Stroumsa, G. G. 21, 104, 136, 342, 360, 383 Stroumsa, S. 391 Studer, B. 262 Sugarman, S. 8 Sundberg, A. C. 235 Sussman, Y. 162 Swain, S. 167 Swanson, M. 390, 391 Swartz, M. 312, 332 Talbert, C. H. 309 Talley, T. J. 259, 267 Tannenbaum, R. 36, 49, 51, 219 Ta-Shma, I. 319 Taylor, J. 61, 115, 120, 134, 190, 192, 228 Taylor, M. 49, 57, 58, 103-4, 110 Taylor, S. 380 Telfer, W. 178 Teugels, L. 184 Tkacz, C. 255 Trevett, C. 139, 143 Trevijano, R. 178 Tropper, A. 119, 160, 162 Tugwell, S. 171 Turner, V. 261 Tyson, J. 269 Ulrich, E. 239, 242, 246 Urbach, E. E. 110, 162 Vallée, G. 353, 355, 356, 357 van Bekkum, W. 341 van Damme, D. 269

van den Oudenrijn, M.-A. 206 van der Kooii, A. 247 Van Roey, A. 391 Van Voorst, R. E. 199, 203 Venetianer, L. 277 Verheyden, J. 192 Vermes, G. 13, 44, 45 Verstrepen, J.-L. 259, 263, 267 Vessev, M. 112 Vielhauer, P. 194 Visotzky, B. 20, 191, 195, 202 von Staden, H. 353 Waddington, W. H. 148 Waegemann, M. 341 Wahrmann, N. 324 Waitz, H. 200, 201, 203 Walter, C. 346 Walzer, R. 363 Wander, B. 52 Wasserstrom, S. 363, 384 Waszink, J. 358 Wehnert, J. 192 Wehnhar, J. 224 Weidman, F. 146 Wellhausen, J. 98 Werner, E. 276 Westenholz, J. G. 264 Wevers, J. W. 239, 244 White, L. M. 98 Wiesen, D. S. 256 Wiessner, G. 377 Wilckens, U. 268 Wilken, R. 6, 104, 117, 228, 340, 353 Williams, F. 356 Williams, M. 62 Williams, R. 19 Willis, G. G. 259 Wilson, S. G. 102, 183, 226 Wisse, F. 351 Wolf, K. B. 342, 386 Wolfe, P. 108 Wolfson, E. 312, 315, 327, 331 Wunderer, C. 277 Wünsche, A. 340 Yahalom, J. 341 Yerushalmi, Y. 106 Young, F. 238, 358 Young, R. 75, 112 Yuval, I. 2, 184, 185, 225, 308, 340 Zeitlin, S. 324 Ziegler, J. 252

Subject Index

'Abd al-Jabbar 273, 362-66 'Abd al-Malik (Umayyad caliph) 384 Acts, book of 48, 53, 199-200, 208, 231, 269, 280, 353, 365, 367-70 Aeschylus 43 Alexander Polyhistor 236-37 Alexandria 39, 54, 176, 238-39, 241, 290 Ambrose 38, 351 amixia 41, 43 amoraic period 19, 181, 381 Anahid 380 anti-Christian polemics 58-60, 241, 214, 362, 364 Antigonus of Sokho 161, 163, 168 anti-Jewish literature. See contra Iudaeos tradition. anti-Judaism 8-10, 12, 21, 38-39, 47, 56, 58, 61, 62, 103, 210, 228, 230, 253, 271, 284, 347, 352, 369, 371, 377-78, 383, 387 Antioch 157, 159, 206, 375 anti-Paulinism 138, 211, 198, 363-64 Aphrahat 238, 255, 284-87, 289-90, 294-304, 305-6, 377-81 Aphrodisias, inscriptions from 36, 49, 51, 219 Apocalypse of Abraham 133 Apocalypse of Elijah 133, 134 apocalypticism 38, 53-54, 102, 136, 137, 158, 340, 376, 384 - and Christian exegesis 38, 344 - early medieval 341, 352, 388 Second Temple Jewish and early Christian 53, 55, 135, 137-38 Apollinarius 349 apostolic history 200-1, 208-11, 198 apostolic succession 160, 172, 173-74, 176-89 Aquila 60, 239, 241, 246, 249, 251-52 Arab conquest 62, 374, 384-85, 387 Arian controversy 200, 354 Aristobulos 256 Aristotle, Aristotelian logic 388-89 Artapanus 45, 236

Ascension of Isaiah 133-39, 141, 309 Asia Minor 40, 53, 107, 141-43, 146, 152.158 Augustine 38, 47, 51, 60, 239, 251, 253, 265, 315 Avot de Rabbi Nathan 162, 165, 182, 302 - 5baptism 209-10, 212, 218-19, 223, 294 Bar Haninah 113 Bar Kokhba 91 Bar Kokhba Revolt 4, 10, 35, 74, 64, 192.212 Baruch, book of 235 2 Baruch 211 3 Baruch 134 Beraita de Niddah 311. 318–23 biblical exegesis. See also midrash. - as shared discourse and common ground 79, 253, 296-97, 392 - channels for mediating traditions about 296-97 - Hellenistic Jewish 237-38 - in Jewish-Christian debates 247, 218 - proto-orthodox/orthodox Christian 234-35, 238, 240 birkat ha-minim 4-5, 60, 371, 344 bnay gyāma 285 Byzantine Empire 311-12, 320, 325, 341-43, 346-47, 351, 363-66 Caesarea 109, 176, 236, 246 Caiaphas 207, 212 Caligula 46 canons - conciliar 38, 26, 62 - scriptural 36, 101, 234-38, 254, 368 Cataphrygians 354 celibacy 65-66, 283-86, 288-89, 295-96, 298-302, 304-6 Celsus 40, 123, See also Origen Chludov Psalter 346, 347 Christian Hebraism 257 "Christian Jews," 83, 84, 87, 210, 215, 217, 267, 270, 278 "Christian Judaism," 192, 271

Christianity. See also Judaism and Christianity. - efforts to forge distinctions from "Judaism" 77, 84-85, 86, 94, 129, 230, 268-69, 369-70 - geographical diversity of 144, 248, 374, 377-78 - negotiation of Jewish heritage 159, 202, 255, 261-62, 274, 229-33 - varieties of 88-89, 133-35 Christian-transmitted Jewish texts - so-called "apocrypha," 237-38 - so-called "pseudepigrapha," 134-36 Christmas, 263, 264 Chronicle of Arbela 374, 381 Chrysostom, John 6, 50-51, 60, 63, 96, 157, 256, 268, 274, 369, 371 circumcision 50, 90, 110, 209, 212, 221, 261, 298, 379 Claudius, census of 53 Clearchus of Soli 42 1 Clement 171, 172-73, 269-70, 280 Clement of Alexandria 174, 177-78. 186, 236, 239, 255, 287, 353 Clement of Rome 172-75, 177, 187, 198 Codex Theodosianus 38, 53, 27, 77 colonial mimicry 73, 109, 78 Constantine 61, 246, 320, 355, 362, 374-76.386 contra Iudaeos tradition 37-38, 49, 60-62, 353, 361, 375, 378-88 - and "pagan" anti-Judaism 47 - rhetoric and reality in 38, 22, 58-61, 97-105, 384 conversion, converts 41-43, 47-50, 52-53, 55-56, 68, 117, 186, 248-49, 364, 381, 387, 392 Corinth 172-74 Cyprian 143, 172-73, 177, 186, 269, 280 Cyril of Jerusalem 6 Daniel, book of 110, 204, 376 Debate between Simon the Jew and Theophilus the Christian 99 Decius 338 Delos 52 Demetrius 236 Diaspora, Jews in, 20, 43-44, 48, 49, 51-56, 91, 156 Diatesseron, 194. See also Tatian

Didascalia Apostolorum 6, 185, 193, 376.382 Didymus the Blind 246 Dio Cassius 42, 46, 167 Diocletian 56 Diogenes Laertius 166, 167 Dionysius of Alexandria 176-77, 187-88 Dionvsius of Halicarnassus 237 Discourse on Priesthood 385, 387, 389 Dome of the Rock 384 Domitian 55 Dositheus 205 East Syrians 374, 382, 387 Easter 148, 158, 142, 230, 263, 273, 279.281 Ebionites 92, 191, 193-94, 198-99, 226, 247, 267 Edessa 238 Egypt 50, 114, 111, 210, 290-91 Elijah (biblical figure) 284 Elisha (biblical figure) 284 Elisha ben Abuva 93 Elvira, Synod of 60, 266 Ember Days 263-64, 267, See also Fast of the Seventh Month. 1 Enoch 134, 317, 299 2 Enoch 134 3 Enoch 330-32 Ephrem 238, 255, 345, 351, 358 Epiphanius 194, 199-201, 207, 247-48, 346, 354--60 Epistle to Diognetus 352 Epistle to the Hebrews 11, 275, 278-79, 276, 385 Epistula Petri 190, 198, 241. See also Pseudo-Clementines. 2 Esdras 135 Essenes 89, 183, 349, 353, 356 Esther, book of 235 Eupolemus 166, 178, 236 Euripedes 43 Eusebius of Caesarea 58, 125, 146, 148-49, 155, 157, 173, 177-78, 187-88, 194, 236-37, 245, 247, 255, 256, 348-50, 354-55, 358-59, 373 Exodus, book of 215, 219, 253, 276, 278, 279, 334, 341 - exegesis of 251, 290-92, 294, 299, 301-104, 329 - LXX 12, 54, 244-245

exodus of Israel from Egypt 271-72, 290 Exodus Rabbah 303 Ezra-Nehemiah (1 Esdras) 235, 298 4 Ezra 138, 211 5 and 6 Ezra 136, 138, 139, 141 Fast of the Seventh Month 259-67, 269-72, 274-81 fasting 262, 264, 266-67, 271-72, 275, 299, 333, 392 Filastrius of Brescia 351 fourth century, as critical era for Jewish and Christian self-definition 12, 17, 22, 66, 44, 87, 94, 204, 226-29 Franks 62 Gaius Julius Philippus 148 Galen 315, 353 Galilee 80, 114, 115, 205 Genesis 51, 55, 27, 95, 105, 209, 253, 317, 319, 326, 336 Genesis Rabbah (Bereshit Rabbah) 230, 318, 326, 338 "Gentile Christianity," 4, 5, 35, 56, 92, 200, 201, 203, 231, 366, 369 Gentiles - and "Jewish" observances 42, 18, 54, 60, 221, 230, 262, 268-70, 280-81 - attraction to Judaism 47, 50-52, 384 - Christian missions to 52-53, 111, 193, 206, 208 - Jewish missions to 43, 49-52, 225 - Jewish perceptions of 54-55, 92, 370 - perceptions of Jews and Judaism 37-42 - salvation of 141-42, 111, 215-19, 222-23, 225 Geonic period 181, 321, 292 Germanicus 151 God-fearers 49, 51, 219–20, 223, 230, 381 Golden Calf 208, 275 Gospel of John 5, 95, 96, 71, 152 Gospel of Luke 152, 166, 173, 215, 281, 310 Gospel of Mark 206, 261, 248 Gospel of Matthew 15, 132, 140, 148, 166, 194, 275, 299, 301, 310, 355, 372 - and "Jewish Christians," 206, 174, 215-17, 274 - on Pharisees, 50, 25, 207

Gospel of the Twelve Apostles, 384 gospels - canonical 37, 28, 150, 310 - "Jewish-Christian" 194 Gregory of Nazianzus 347 hairesis 350, 354-55, 327 halakhah 45, 84, 100, 137, 142, 151, 158-59, 197, 210, 285, 302, 311, 316, 320-22, 367 heavenly ascent 136-38, 308, 282, 322-23, 328-29, 331, 335 Hebraica veritas 242, 249, 217, 252-54, 257 Hegesippus 173-75, 178, 194, 203, 348, 356 Hekhalot literature 322-23, 328-29, 297, 331, 333, 338 Hekhalot Rabbati 328, 332 Heliodorus 317 Hellenismos 67, 68 Hellenistic Jews 41-43, 60, 236-39 Hemerobaptists 349, 356 Heracleon 201 heresiology 37, 85, 180-86, 187, 189, 192-94, 198-99, 231, 351-52, 355, 357, 360 "heresy" 59, 92, 97, 172, 180, 184, 186, 202, 231, 345-46, 348-51, 353-55, 357, 359, 367-68, 386. See also haireses; minut. Hermippus of Smyrna 42 Herod 45, 91, 122 Herodians 356 Hexapla 238, 240-41, 245-46, 248, 251, 253, See also Origen Hillel 91, 161, 162-63, 165-66, 169, 305, 370 Hippolytus 143, 174, 266, 353, 356-57 Holocaust 7, 11, 100, 101 Homer 238, 358 Honorius (emperor) 53 hybridity 67, 75, 75 Hephtzibah 341 Iberia 63 iconoclastic controversies 342-44, 346, 347, 365 idolatry 208-10, 218-19, 223, 342, 356 Ignatius 2, 72, 136, 151, 154 ihidāye, ihidāyutha 285, 296–99 Innocentius of Tortona 352 Ioudaios, Ioudaioi 45, 33, 96

Ioudaismos 67-71 Irenaeus of Lyons 19, 174-78, 177, 177, 184, 186, 193-94, 199, 209, 234-35, 239, 246, 247, 269, 348-49 Isidore of Seville 62, 253 Islam 53, 71, 231, 233, 261, 346-47, 360-61, 362-67, 371-72, 386, 391 Iuxta Hebraeos 245, 249, 251-53, 255 James (apostle) 198-99, 204, 223 Jerome 21, 83, 84, 92, 112-14, 117, 236, 246-56, 315, 317, 351 Jerusalem 68, 239, 330, 367 - apocalyptic speculation about 385 - as Aelia Capitolina 35, 179 - Muslim occupation of 385 - Sassanian invasion of 116-17, 352 Jerusalem Church 4, 5, 192, 198-201, 204, 206, 223, 231, 363 Jerusalem Temple 35, 45, 48-49, 53, 184, 205, 209-10, 320, 382 - destruction of 4, 18, 98, 151, 385 - hopes for rebuilding of 380, 353 Jesus 7, 12, 13, 35, 59, 79-80, 91, 96, 98, 114–15, 150–51, 155, 175, 190, 196, 199, 209, 215, 225, 228, 235, 276, 278, 299, 309, 311, 386 - and Moses 214-19 - Jewish traditions about 312, 331, 366, 370-71 Jesus Movement 4, 5, 14-15, 18, 52-53, 71, 200, 213-14, 235, 367 Jesus-belief and Jewish identity 74, 84, 58, 133, 136, 139, 147, 152, 158, 159, 190, 206, 269, 371-72 "Jew" and "Christian," - assertions of difference 77, 84-85, 86, 94, 129, 230, 268-69, 369-70 - overlaps and fuzzy boundaries between 132, 138-41, 144, 203-4, 226-33, 269 - problems in defining and labeling 82-84, 90-93, 120, 128, 134, 151-52, 203, 273 Jewish-Christian relations 3, 8, 9, 16, 17, 22, 60, 96-97, 65, 101-4, 106-7, 109, 114-18, 197, 226, 228, 353, 374, 383, 393 "Jewish Christianity" 4, 5, 6, 80, 102, 137, 190-202, 204, 206, 208-9, 213, 217, 223-28, 230, 270, 361, 364-66, 370-71

"Jewish Christians" 57, 115, 94, 184, 194, 203, 205, 218, 231, 269, 271, 297, 362-72 Jews and Christians - contacts between 58-59, 40, 102, 109-13, 118, 130, 159, 227, 232, 234, 262, 277-78, 280, 371 - competition between 48-49, 242, 278, 351, 361, 384 - as participants in shared cultural contexts 180, 156, 309-11, 343-44, 388-93 - debates between 102, 266, 388-92 John (apostle) 147 John of Damascus 346, 355 John of Fenek 387 John of Patmos 150 John the Baptist 96, 205-7, 210, 214 Joseph (biblical figure) 46, 325 Joseph and Asenath 336 Josephus 50, 91, 166, 178, 236-37, 240, 257, 310, 353, 382 Joshua (biblical figure) 284 Jubilees 133, 208 Judaism - emergence as "religion" 74-78, 47, 84-85, 87, 94 - diversity in Late Antiquity 5, 88, 94 - diversity in Second Temple period 14-15, 88-89 Judaism and Christianity - anachronism of modern concepts of 38-39, 32, 70-84, 89-92, 120, 132-36, 138, 142 - as part of a single semantic family 79 - 84- continued convergences between 234, 256-58, 388-93 - emergence as distinct "religions" 74-78, 47, 84-85, 87, 94 - fluid nature of boundaries between 84-85, 203-4, 228-30 "Judaeo-Christianity" 79-80 Judaizers, Judaizing 3, 6, 41-43, 51-52, 60, 89, 127, 151, 157-58, 190, 228, 231, 246, 250, 267-68, 273-74, 278, 365, 369-71, 386 "Judeo-Christians" 268, 269, 241, 281 Judith, book of 235 Julia Severa 51 Julian the Apostate 252, 380

Julius Africanus 110-11, 236-37, 240 Justin Martyr 20, 58, 81, 84, 93, 99, 181, 193, 209, 211, 269, 349-50, 352-53 Juvenal 42, 52, 271, 275 kalām 390-91 Kallah Rabbati 160 Karaites 180 Karka d-Ladan 381 kashrut (dietary laws) 45, 151, 190-91, 198, 209, 285, 302, 367 Laodicea 61 late Judaism. See Spätjudentum. latreia 44, 52 Lent 263, 264, 235, 279 Letter of Aristeas 238 Liber Pontificalis 266, 270 Luke (evangelist) 204, 269-70 Maccabees, books of 48, 68, 235, 237 Macrobius 45 al-Mahdī (Abbasid caliph), 389 "magic," 51, 267, 289, 323, 391 Maimonides 163, 255 Mani 92, 234 Manichaeans 89, 360, 390 Marcion 37, 38, 59, 74, 92, 193, 207, 217, 227, 234, 269, 348, 353 Marcionites 59, 74, 193, 247, 268, 349, 354 Marcus Julius Alexander 90 Martin Luther 95 martyrdom 59, 74, 75, 139, 150-51, 154-57, 208, 281, 349, 376, 378-69, 381. See also persecution. Martyrdom of Pionius 58, 151-52, 126 Martyrdom of Polycarp 58, 60, 145, 150, 152-59, See also Polycarp martyrological traditions 38, 58, 113, 159, 308-13, 315, 319, 324-129, 334-44, 376, 378-82 Matthew (evangelist) 175 Megasthenes 42 Mekhilta 289, 290, 293 Melchites 386, 387 Melito of Sardis 235, 349 Menahem 312, 341 Mesopotamia 284, 296, 362, 365, 374, 375, 376, 392 messianism 54, 80, 122, 214, 218, 231, 342, 371, 386 Metatron 313, 318, 322, 327-29, 331, 333, 339-40, 342

midrash 238, 288, 290-93, 294, 297, 300, 302, 304, 317 Midrash Tanhuma 182 Miltiades 349 minut, minim 4, 5, 102, 124, 128, 181, 182, 185, 195, 205, 207, 382 Miriam (biblical figure) 292-95 Mishnah 14, 163-64, 170, 182, 186, 276 - Pe'ah 164 - Yoma 245-75, 82 - Ta'anit 282 - Megillah 235, 275 - Hagigah 161, 168-69 - Yevamot 305 - Sanhedrin 205 - 'Eduyot 164 - 'Avot 159-61, 163-71, 177-83, 186-89, 235, 238, 330 - Niddah 205, 288, 320 - Yadaim 164, 235 monotheism 45-46, 110, 183, 218, 221 Montanism. See "New Prophecy." Montanus 59, 92 Moschos 45, 69 Moses 45, 161, 164-65, 169, 197, 204, 206, 209-11, 213-18, 221-24, 230, 240, 253, 276, 283-96, 298-303, 305-6, 312, 328-33, 348-49, 356, 358-59 Mosul 238, 362, 389 al-Muqammiş, Dāwūd ibn Marwān 391 Muslims 62, 261, 375, 384, 386, 390-91 Nazarenes (Nazoreans, Nazoraeans) 83, 92, 191-93, 268, 353, 356, 370 Nazareth 55, 61, 114-15 Nestorians 361, 387 "New Prophecy" 59, 139, 143, 350 Nicaea, Council of 19, 228, 354 Nicetes 152, 154, 155 Nicholas of Lyre 255 Nisibis 238, 391 Nonnus of Nisibis 391 North Africa 173, 281 Novatians 354 Numbers, book of 152, 156, 245, 253, 278-79, 286, 291-93, 304 Numbers Rabbah 318, 339, 340 Numenius of Apamea 40 Ocellus of Lucanus 42

Old Latin (Vetus Latina) 249, 251-54 Old Testament - as Christian link to Judaism 235, 222, 261-62, 274 - as source of "bookish" influence 273, 275-77 - translation of. See Aquila; Hexapla; Iuxta Hebraeos; Jerome; Origen; Old Latin; Septuagint; Symmachus; Theodotian; Vulgate. Origen 3, 6, 21, 47, 58, 109-12, 114, 117, 174, 177, 233, 235-46, 248, 250-51, 253-57, 268, 355 "Parting of the Ways" 7-12, 15 - critiques of 2-3, 5-7, 15-24, 38, 61-63, 77, 87, 203-4, 225-27, 261, 268-69, 281, 366-72, 375, 388, 393 - from different perspectives 123-31 - traditional view of 1-2, 4-5, 35-36, 123-24, 192-93, 261-62, 281, 367, 374 Pastoral Epistles 136, 174 Paul (apostle) 4, 12, 13, 44, 50, 53, 54, 55, 69, 91, 133, 151, 174, 185, 192, 193, 199-200, 208, 212, 217, 225, 231, 269, 362, 367-68, 371 Paul of Tella 242, 246 Paulians 354 Pauline Epistles 199, 296 - Rom 41, 19, 55, 281 - 1 Cor 138, 106, 235 - 2 Cor 37, 19, 56 - Gal 37, 15, 56, 69, 357 - Col 357 – Phil 37 Pelagians 38 Pella, flight to 4, 5, 192, 198 Pentecost 263, 264 persecution 39, 56-59, 83, 139, 146-47, 151-59, 238, 252, 375-81 Persian Empire. See Sassanian Empire. Pesah (Passover) 158, 230, 240, 281 Peshitta 238, 242, 246, 269 Peter (apostle) 198-200, 203-6, 213 Pharisees 4, 37, 83, 89, 92, 183, 206-7, 222, 349, 353, 356 Philip the Arab 339 Philip the Trallian 147, 148 Philo of Alexandria 42, 46, 50, 54, 90-91, 236-37, 256, 286-90, 301, 304, 353 Philostorgius 46

Philostratus 167, 309, 310 Piacenza Pilgrim 114-17 Plato, Platonists 287, 323 Pliny the Younger 57 Polycarp 145-49, 151, 348. See also Martyrdom of Polycarp. Porphyry 40, 389 postcolonial criticism 66, 74-78, 97, 106-9, 111, 118 prophecy 136-38, 143, 249, 267, 283, 292-93, 296, 299, 303 Pseudo-Clementine literature 198-203, 225, 227-33, 369 Pseudo-Methodius, Apocalypse of 384 Purim 51, 148, 203 Pythagoreans 354, 357 qaddishutha 284-86, 297-300, 301-5 Quartodecimanism 158, 230 R. Abbahu 334-35 R. Eliezer ha-Kappar 187 R. Gamaliel 4, 160-63, 169, 171, 206, 211, 327 R. Ishmael 307-14, 316, 318, 320-29, 331-40, 342 R. Joshua 290 R. Judah ha-Nasi 160-62, 163, 165, 169, 171, 186--88 R. Nehuniah ben ha-Qanah 320, 321 R. Simeon ben Gamaliel 326-27, 336 R. Tarfon 162 R. Yehuda ben Batira 303-4 R. Yohanan bar Nappaha 313, 334, 335 R. Yohanan ben Zakkai 161, 162, 169-70 rabbinic movement 45, 54-55, 92, 142 - and late antique Judaism 88, 95, 203 - attitudes towards Gentiles 54-55 - attitudes towards non-rabbinic Jews 127, 96, 185-86 - comparisons with early Christianity 66, 73-74, 87, 160, 180-87, 227 - construction of "orthodoxy" and assertion of authority by 73-74, 165-66, 168-69, 171-72, 187 - contacts with Jewish and Gentile Christians 207, 191, 230, 249, 284, 286, 296-97, 371 - early history of 19-20, 184-85 - impact of Christianity on 66, 72-74 - social structures of 171, 186-87 - Torah study in 169, 138, 305-106

"religion," 66, 71-72 - and ethnicity, 39-40, 35 - as embedded in ancient cultures, 39-40, 53-54, 70-71 - disembedding of, 71-72 - in ancient Mediterranean urban life, 43-45, 50-51, 60 Revelation, book of 62, 132, 136-39, 141, 150, 158 ritual practice - as boundary-marker 262, 268-69, 274-75 - Gentile participation in Jewish 50-52, 20, 60, 221, 230, 262, 268-70, 280 - 81- of earliest Christians 268-70, 280-81 ritual purity 45, 133, 135-36, 138-39, 143, 158, 190, 198, 213, 223-125, 231, 266, 300, 312, 315-16, 319-24, 330, 333-35 Roman Empire 10, 18, 19, 22, 97, 106, 109-112, 166, 172, 226, 229, 231, 352, 359, 373, 378, 382, 387 - Christianization of 4, 61-63, 72-74, 106, 229, 374 Roman Palestine 15, 109-18, 157, 132, 167, 184, 200, 228, 234, 241, 243, 250, 254, 312, 320, 341 Rome (city) 176, 231-32, 263, 265, 270-72, 277 Rosh ha-Shanah 264, 276, Rufinus 113, 197, 221, 224, 230, 249, 250, 251 Sadducees 37, 89, 168, 180, 183, 205-6, 349, 353, 356 Salome 45 Samaritans 89, 205, 349, 356 Samson 309, 310, 323 Sas[s]anian Empire 116-17, 238, 253, 302, 375-76, 381, 385-88 Scillitan martyrs 57 Seder Eliahu Zuta 159 Sefer Zerubbabel 341 Seleucia-Ctesiphon 381 self-definition - Jewish and Christian 226-27, 339 - Hellenistic Jewish 41 - Jewish, of certain Christ-believers 132-35, 138, 189

(self-definition) - proto-orthodox/orthodox Christian 37, 233-34, 361 - rabbinic 72-73, 87, 128, 184-87 Seneca 40 Septuagint 46, 54, 59, 238, 239-46, 248-49, 251-54 Sextus Empiricus 169 sexual ethics 283-87, 291-94, 297, 299-301, 303-7 Shabbat (Sabbath) 47, 52, 58, 60, 147, 152, 157, 180, 266, 270-71, 282, 284, 298, 301, 320 - "Great Sabbath" 147, 152, 157 Shabbat Shuva 272, 277 Shammai 91, 161, 162, 163, 305 Shapur II 376, 377, 378, 380 Shepherd of Hermas 270, 280 Sibylline Oracles 55 Sifre 165, 290-97, 299, 301-4, 306 Simeon bar Sabba'e 377, 380-81 Simeon ha-Zaddik (high priest) 161, 163, 168 Simon Magus 205, 357 Siricius I (pope) 266 Smyrna 58-59, 145-46, 150-51, 156, 348 Song of Songs 110, 234, 355 Song of Songs Rabbah 326 Sophocles 43 Sophronius 116 Spain 266, 277, 386 Spätjudentum (late Judaism) 7, 9, 12, 13, 14, 98, 190 St. Sylvester 352 Stoics 353, 356 Strabo 48 Strategios (Christian monk) 116-18 Sukkot 264, 271, 275-76, 282 Sulpicius Severus 72 supersessionism 7-8, 97-100, 126, 157, 194, 211, 214, 231, 278 Susanna, book of 110 Symmachus 239, 241, 247, 251-52 synagogues 48-49, 50-51, 58, 115-116, 157, 159, 250, 265, 277-78, 320-121, 370, 372, 378, 380, 384 Syria 144, 200, 195, 280, 368 Syrohexapla 242, 243, 246 Tacitus 40, 41, 42, 72

Talmud Bavli (Babylonian Talmud) 91, 161, 182, 337, 382 - Berakhot 5, 308, 318, 325, 337 - Shabbat 163, 273, 302, 304-5, 328, 329, 330 - 'Eruvin 318, 325 - Pesahim 318, 325 - Yoma 277, 281 - Rosh ha-Shanah 282 - Ta'anit 220, 325 - Megillah 250, 277 - Hagigah 93, 330, 340 - Yevamot 220, 302, 305 - Ketubbot 325 - Gittin 308, 335 - Oiddushin 220, 325 - Bava Mesi'a 318, 335 - Bava Batra 310, 325, 335 - Sanhedrin 54, 325, 335, 341, 380 - 'Avodah Zarah 325, 337, 338 - Menahot 340 - Hullin 308, 325, 338 - Bekhorot 320 Talmud Yerushalmi (Palestinian Talmud), 229, 382 - Berakhot 325, 341 - Yoma 282 - Ta'anit 282 - Hagigah 325 - 'Avodah Zarah 56 - Horayot 335 Talmudim 14, 83, 161, 244, 321, 382 tannaitic period 19, 160, 163-65, 168-70, 181, 184-88, 234, 290, 295-97 Tatian 194, 235, 294, 296, 349, 358 Temple. See Jerusalem Temple. Tertullian 38, 51, 57, 93, 175-77, 187, 266, 268-69, 349, 353 Testament of Abraham 133 Testament of Isaac 134 Testaments of the Twelve Patriarchs 133, 135, 140-42, 316 The Story of the Ten Martyrs 307, 311-14, 323-26, 328, 332, 336, 338, 339-42 Theodore of Mopsuestia 246

Theodoret of Cyrrhus 357 Theodosius II 36, 62, 314 Theodotion 239, 241, 244, 245, 246, 249, 252 Theophrastus 42 Tiberius Julius Alexander 90 Timothy I 375, 389 Tobit, book of 55, 141, 235, 237 Toledot Yeshu 311, 370, 371 Torah 5, 55, 275, 348 - and rabbinic authority 166, 137, 183, 188 - in Pseudo-Clementine literature 199. 209-10, 213-19 - observance by Christ-believers 133, 135-36, 139-41, 143, 147, 158, 190, 198, 210, 221, 225, 230, 269, 367-69, 371 - Oral and Written 166, 174 - rabbinic chain of transmission of 162-65, 168-69 - revelation to Moses at Mt. Sinai 162, 132, 168, 305, 329-130 Tosefta 230 - Hallah 308 - Megillah 275 - Yevamot 305 - Sanhedrin 213 - 'Avodah Zarah 213 - Horavot 335 "two-ways" soteriology 214-19, 368 Valentinus, Valentinians 27, 83, 92, 193, 349, 354 Valerius Maximus 55 Visigoths 62 Vulgate 249, 253-55, 336 "Wave Theory" 74-76, 84-85, 88, 146 Wisdom of ben Sira 166, 235, 238-39 Wisdom of Solomon 235 Yavneh (Jabne) 4, 5, 11, 183 Yom Kippur 261, 263-66, 268-69, 272-73, 275-81 Zeno of Verona 351 Zipporah (biblical figure) 283, 285, 287, 290-94, 305 Zoroastrians 375

Texts and Studies in Ancient Judaism Alphabetical Index

Albani, M., J. Frey, A. Lange (Ed.): Studies in the Book of Jubilees. 1997. Volume 65. Avemarie, Friedrich: Tora und Leben. 1996. Volume 55. Becker, A. H., A. Y. Reed (Ed.): The Ways that Never Parted. 2003. Volume 95. Becker, Hans-Jürgen: Die großen rabbinischen Sammelwerke Palästinas. 1999. Volume 70. see Schäfer, Peter Cansdale, Lena: Qumran and the Essenes. 1997. Volume 60. Chester, Andrew: Divine Revelation and Divine Titles in the Pentateuchal Targumim. 1986. Volume 14. Cohen, Martin Samuel: The Shi ur Oomah: Texts and Recensions. 1985, Volume 9. Crown, Alan D.: Samaritan Scribes and Manuscripts. 2001. Volume 80. Doering, Lutz: Schabbat. 1999. Volume 78. Ego, Beate: Targum Scheni zu Ester, 1996. Volume 54. Engel, Anja: see Schäfer, Peter Frey, J .: see Albani, M. Frick, Peter: Divine Providence in Philo of Alexandria. 1999. Volume 77. Gibson, E. Leigh: The Jewish Manumission Inscriptions of the Bosporus Kingdom. 1999. Volume 75. Gleßmer, Uwe: Einleitung in die Targume zum Pentateuch. 1995. Volume 48. Goldberg, Arnold: Mystik und Theologie des rabbinischen Judentums. Gesammelte Studien I. Ed. by M. Schlüter and P. Schäfer. 1997. Volume 61. Rabbinische Texte als Gegenstand der Auslegung. Gesammelte Studien II. Ed. by M. Schlüter and P. Schäfer. 1999. Volume 73. Goodblatt, David: The Monarchic Principle, 1994. Volume 38. Grözinger, Karl: Musik und Gesang in der Theologie der frühen jüdischen Literatur. 1982. Volume 3. Gruenwald, I., Sh. Shaked and G.G. Stroumsa (Ed.): Messiah and Christos. Presented to David Flusser. 1992. Volume 32. Halperin, David J.: The Faces of the Chariot. 1988. Volume 16. Herrmann, Klaus (Ed.): Massekhet Hekhalot. 1994. Volume 39. see Schäfer, Peter Herzer, Jens: Die Paralipomena Jeremiae. 1994. Volume 43. Hezser, Catherine: Form, Function, and Historical Significance of the Rabbinic Story in Yerushalmi Neziqin. 1993. Volume 37. see Schäfer. Peter - The Social Structure of the Rabbinic Movement in Roman Palestine. 1997. Volume 66. Hirschfelder, Ulrike: see Schäfer, Peter Horbury, W.: see Krauss, Samuel Houtman, Alberdina: Mishnah und Tosefta. 1996. Volume 59. Ilan, Tal: Jewish Women in Greco-Roman Palestine. 1995. Volume 44. Integrating Jewish Woman into Second Temple History. 1999. Volume 76. - Lexicon of Jewish Names in Late Antiquity. 2002. Volume 91. Instone Brewer, David: Techniques and Assumptions in Jewish Exegesis before 70 CE. 1992. Volume 30. Ipta, Kerstin: see Schäfer, Peter Jacobs, Martin: Die Institution des jüdischen Patriarchen. 1995. Volume 52. Kasher, Aryeh: The Jews in Hellenistic and Roman Egypt. 1985. Volume 7. Jews, Idumaeans, and Ancient Arabs. 1988. Volume 18. Jews and Hellenistic Cities in Eretz-Israel. 1990. Volume 21. Knittel, Thomas: Das griechische, Leben Adams und Evas⁴. 2002. Volume 88. Krauss, Samuel: The Jewish-Christian Controversy from the earliest times to 1789. Vol.I. Ed. by W. Horbury. 1996. Volume 56. Kuhn, Peter: Offenbarungsstimmen im Antiken Judentum, 1989. Volume 20. Kuyt, Annelies: The ,Descent' to the Chariot. 1995. Volume 45. Lange, A .: see Albani, M. Lange, Nicholas de: Greek Jewish Texts from the Cairo Genizah. 1996. Volume 51.

Lehnardt, Andreas: Qaddish. 2002. Volume 87.

Leonhardt, Jutta: Jewish Worship in Philo of Alexandria. 2001. Volume 84.

Lohmann, Uta: see Schäfer, Peter

Loopik, M. van (Transl. a. comm.): The Ways of the Sages and the Way of the World. 1991. Volume 26. Luttikhuizen, Gerard P.; The Revelation of Elchasai. 1985. Volume 8.

Mach, Michael: Entwicklungsstadien des jüdischen Engelglaubens in vorrabbinischer Zeit. 1992. Volume 34.

Mendels, Doron: The Land of Israel as a Political Concept in Hasmonean Literature. 1987. Volume 15. Moscovitz, Leib: Talmudic Reasoning, 2002. Volume 89.

Mutius, Georg von: see Schäfer, Peter

Necker, Gerold: see Schäfer, Peter

Olyan, Saul M.: A Thousand Thousands Served Him. 1993. Volume 36.

Otterbach, Rina: see Schäfer, Peter

Prigent, Pierre: Le Judaisme et l'image. 1990. Volume 24.

Pucci Ben Zeev, Miriam: Jewish Rights in the Roman World. 1998. Volume 74.

Pummer, Reinhard: Early Christian Authors on Samaritans and Samaritanism. 2002. Volume 92.

Reed, A. Y .: see Becker, A. H.

Reeg, Gottfried (Ed.): Die Geschichte von den Zehn Märtyrern. 1985. Volume 10.

- see Schäfer, Peter

Renner, Lucie: see Schäfer, Peter

Reichman, Ronen: Sifra und Mishna. 1998. Volume 68.

Rohrbacher-Sticker, Claudia: see Schäfer, Peter

Salvesen, A. (Ed.): Origen's Hexapla and Fragments. 1998. Volume 58.

Samely, Alexander: The Interpretation of Speech in the Pentateuch Targums. 1992. Volume 27. Schäfer, Peter: Der Bar-Kokhba-Aufstand. 1981. Volume 1.

Hekhalot-Studien, 1988, Volume 19.

Schäfer, Peter (Ed.); Geniza-Fragmente zur Hekhalot-Literatur. 1984. Volume 6.

- see Goldberg, Arnold

- in cooperation with Klaus Herrmann, Rina Otterbach, Gottfried Reeg, Claudia Rohrbacher-Sticker, Guido Weyer: Konkordanz zur Hekhalot-Literatur. Band 1: 1986. Volume 12.
- Band 2: 1988. Volume 13.
- Schäfer, Peter, Margarete Schlüter, Hans Georg von Mutius (Ed.): Synopse zur Hekhalot-Literatur. 1981. Volume 2.
- Schäfer, Peter (Ed.) in cooperation with Hans-Jürgen Becker, Klaus Herrmann, Ulrike Hirschfelder, Gerold Necker, Lucie Renner, Claudia Rohrbacher-Sticker, Stefan Siebers: Übersetzung der Hekhalot-Literatur. Band 1: §§ 1–80. 1995. Volume 46.
- Band 2: §§ 81-334. 1987. Volume 17.
- Band 3: §§ 335-597. 1989. Volume 22.
- Band 4: §§ 598-985. 1991. Volume 29.
- Schäfer, Peter, and Hans-Jürgen Becker (Ed.) in cooperation with Anja Engel, Kerstin Ipta, Gerold Necker, Uta Lohmann, Martina Urban, Gert Wildensee: Synopse zum Talmud Yerushalmi. Band I/1-2: 1991. Volume 31.
- Band I/3-5: 1992. Volume 33.
- Band I/6-11: 1992. Volume 35.
- Band III: 1998. Volume 67.
- Band IV: 1995. Volume 47.
- Schäfer, Peter, and Shaul Shaked (Ed.): Magische Texte aus der Kairoer Geniza. Band 1: 1994. Volume 42
- Band 2: 1997. Volume 64.
- Band 3: 1999. Volume 72.
- Schäfer, Peter (Ed.): The Talmud Yerushalmi and Graeco-Roman Culture I. 1998. Volume 71.
- Schäfer, Peter and Hezser, Catherine (Ed.): The Talmud Yerushalmi and Graeco-Roman Culture II. 2000. Volume 79.

Schäfer, Peter (Ed.): The Talmud Yerushalmi and Graeco-Roman Culture III. 2003. Volume 93. Schlüter, Margarete: see Goldberg, Arnold

- see Schäfer, Peter

Schmidt, Francis: Le Testament Grec d'Abraham. 1986. Volume 11. Schröder, Bernd: Die ,väterlichen Gesetze'. 1996. Volume 53. Schwartz, Daniel R.: Agrippa I. 1990. Volume 23. Schwemer, Anna Maria: Studien zu den frühjüdischen Prophetenlegenden. Vitae Prophetarum Band I: 1995. Volume 49. Band II (mit Beiheft: Synopse zu den Vitae Prophetarum): 1996. Volume 50. Shaked, Shaul: see Gruenwald, I. - see Schäfer. Peter Shatzman, Israel: The Armies of the Hasmonaeans and Herod. 1991. Volume 25. Siebers, Stefan: see Schäfer, Peter Sivertsev, Alexei: Private Households and Public Politics in 3rd - 5th Century Jewish Palestine. 2002. Volume 90. Spilsbury, Paul: The Image of the Jew in Flavius Josephus' Paraphrase of the Bible. 1998. Volume 69. Stroumsa, G.G.: see Gruenwald, I. Stuckenbruck, Loren T.: The Book of Giants from Qumran. 1997. Volume 63. Swartz, Michael D.: Mystical Prayer in Ancient Judaism. 1992. Volume 28. Sysling, Harry: Tehiyyat Ha-Metim. 1996. Volume 57. Urban, Martina: see Schäfer, Peter Veltri, Giuseppe: Eine Tora für den König Talmai. 1994. Volume 41. - Magie und Halakha. 1997. Volume 62. Visotzky, Burton L.: Golden Bells and Pomegranates. 2003. Volume 94. The Ways that Never Parted. 2003. Volume 96. Weyer, Guido: see Schäfer, Peter Wewers, Gerd A.: Probleme der Bavot-Traktate. 1984. Volume 5. Wildensee, Gert: see Schäfer, Peter

Wilson, Walter T .: The Mysteries of Rigtheousness. 1994. Volume 40.

For a complete catalogue please write to the publisher Mohr Siebeck • P.O. Box 2030 • D-72010 Tübingen/Germany Up-to-date information on the internet at www.mohr.de