MARTIN SANFRIDSON

Paul and Sacrifice in Corinth

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament 2. Reihe 623

Mohr Siebeck

Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament · 2. Reihe

Herausgeber / Editor Jörg Frey (Zürich)

Mitherausgeber / Associate Editors Markus Bockmuehl (Oxford) · James A. Kelhoffer (Uppsala) Christina M. Kreinecker (Leuven) · Tobias Nicklas (Regensburg) Janet Spittler (Charlottesville, VA) · J. Ross Wagner (Durham, NC)

623



Martin Sanfridson

Paul and Sacrifice in Corinth

Rethinking Paul's Views on Gentile Cults in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10

Mohr Siebeck

Martin Sanfridson, born 1992; 2017 BA in Theology; 2018 Master of Theology; 2022 PhD in Biblical Studies. orcid.org/0000-0003-0638-0449

ISBN 978-3-16-162671-5 / eISBN 978-3-16-164023-0 DOI 10.1628/978-3-16-164023-0

ISSN 0340-9570/eISSN 2568-7484 (Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament, 2. Reihe)

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliographie; detailed bibliographic data is available on the Internet at *https://dnb.dnb.de*.

© 2025 Mohr Siebeck Tübingen, Germany.

This book may not be reproduced, in whole or in part, in any form (beyond that permitted by copyright law) without the publisher's written permission. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations and storage and processing in electronic systems.

Printed on non-aging paper.

Mohr Siebeck GmbH & Co. KG, Wilhelmstraße 18, 72074 Tübingen, Germany www.mohrsiebeck.com, info@mohrsiebeck.com

For Rebecca

With love

Preface

This book, which is a slight revision of my PhD dissertation, represents one step on my journey to better understand the apostle Paul, his message, and his surroundings. The completion of this study would not have been possible without the support of my family, friends, and colleagues. My supervisory committee has been vital during my four years at McMaster University, and their guidance through the program has been a considerable support. My supervisor Dr. Matthew Thiessen has been pivotal in my undertaking of this project. He was the first one to nudge me in the direction of writing my thesis on 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 and the connections between these two chapters in 1 Corinthians and ancient rituals of animal sacrifice. Even though I was not thrilled about the idea initially (originally, what in the end became my dissertation was supposed to be only one chapter), I soon realised that there was an opening for my project in the scholarly discussion and that my reading of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 would add something to the literature on Paul, 1 Corinthians, and the Paul within Judaism reading of the apostle. Not only did Matt provide insightful comments, feedback, and careful corrections on my writing, he also gave me much needed encouragement about my project. Additionally, since I wrote my dissertation in my home-office during the lockdowns of the Covid-19 pandemic, I very much appreciated when we were able to meet in-person – especially the times we shared dinner and a beer at The Phoenix on campus.

I am also grateful to my other two committee members. Dr. Hanna Tervanotko provided me with many helpful comments and corrections that I would not have noticed myself. Dr. Daniel Machiela also provided me with helpful feedback and points on how to further strengthen my argument. Their joint expertise in Early Judaism and the Hebrew Bible further nuanced my thoughts in several areas of the thesis.

I also wish to dedicate a special thanks to the faculty at the Religious Department at McMaster (especially Doreen Drew) for their help during all parts of the PhD program, and especially during the latter phases of the completion of this thesis. The staff at Mills Library also deserves a special thank you. The librarians of Mills Library went above and beyond to make sure I had the books I needed – sometimes even personally delivering them to my doorstep! Without their dedication, I would not have been able to complete my research.

Preface

I am grateful to the people at Mohr Siebeck for their help and advice in turning this study into a monograph in their WUNT II-series. First of all, I would like to thank profs. Jörg Frey and Markus Bockmuehl for their insightful comments on the original manuscript. Second, I am grateful to the editorial department for their help with formatting the manuscript and turning it into the book that is now in your hands.

Finally, my family has been an endless source of support, comfort, and happiness during the writing of my thesis. For their friendship and support, I am indebted to my parents, Anders and Gudrun, as well as my in-laws, Anders and Anna. Even though they have been on the other side of the Atlantic during the completion of this project, their enthusiasm for my work has been a great support. Rebecca, my wife, was not only my biggest supporter, but, as a PhD candidate in Early Christianity at the University of Toronto, she has also been a vital discussion partner and provided helpful critique of my work, always encouraging me to think about aspects that I perhaps missed and supported me when I hit roadblocks in my writing. I dedicate this work to her with all my love.

Our two boys were both born during the writing of this book, and without their company and joyful presence, my endeavour to write this book would have been a considerably poorer experience.

Table of Contents

PrefaceV	ΊI
Abbreviations	XI
Chapter 1: 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 and Paul's Relationship	
	1
to Judaism	. 1
1.1 The Interpretative Crux of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10	. 8
1.2 Methodology and Approach	
1.3 Outline of Study	
·	
Chapter 2: Roman Corinth and the Corinthian Ekklēsia	23
2.1 Corinth: A Greek and Roman City	24
2.2 The Corinthian Ekklēsia	
2.3 Conclusion	
Chapter 3: Animal Sacrifice in the Ancient Greek	
and Roman World	71
	/ 1
3.1 Ancient Greek Sacrifice	75
3.2 Dining on the Sacrificial Meat	
3.3 Ancient Roman Sacrifice 10	03
3.4 Banqueting on the Sacrifice	17
3.5 The Imperial Cult	23
3.6 Cults and Sacrifice in Ancient Corinth	29
3.7 Conclusion	35
Chapter 4: Adhering to the Social Norms of the Ancient City:	
Not Attending Cults as a Case of Social Disruption13	37
4.1 Previous Research on 1 Corinthians 8	39
4.2 Socially Disruptive Behavior in the Ancient City: Consequences	~ ~
of Not Living According to the Social Norms	
4.2.1 Pliny the Younger's Letter to Trajan	
4.2.2 The Mishnaic Tractate Avodah Zarah 17	/1

4.2.3 The Roman Concept of Superstitio	179
4.3 1 Corinthians 8 and Maintaining Social Ties	186
4.4 Conclusion	209
Chapter 5: Flee the Worship of Idols! Paul's Instructions	
in 1 Cor 10:14–33	210
5.1 "Flee the Worship of Idols": Paul's Prohibition in 1 Cor 10:14-22	
Aimed at Participation in Animal Sacrifice	211
5.2 Paul's Ban on Idol Worship in 1 Cor 10:19-22	225
5.3 Buying Food at the Market and Dining with Outsiders	253
5.4 Conclusion	
Chapter 6: Conclusion	263
6.1 Impacts on Reading Paul within Judaism	
Bibliography	271
Primary Sources and Translations	
Secondary Sources	
Index of References	323
Index of Modern Authors	336
Subject Index	

Х

Abbreviations

AB	Anchor Bible
AGRW	Associations in the Greco-Roman World: A Sourcebook. ed. Richard S.
	Ascough, Philip A. Harland, and John S. Kloppenborg. Waco: Baylor Univer-
	sity Press, 2012
AGJU	Arbeiten zur Geschichte des antiken Judentums und des Urchristentums
AJA	American Journal of Archaeology
AJEC	Ancient Judaism and Early Christianity
AnBib	Analecta Biblica
ANRW	Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt: Geschichte und Kultur Roms
	im Spiegel der neueren Forschung
ANTC	Abingdon New Testament Commentaries
ASE	Annali di Storia dell'Esegesi
ASMA	Aarhus Studies in Mediterranean Antiquity
ATR	Anglican Theological Review
BBB	Bonner biblische Beiträge
BBR	Bulletin for Biblical Research
BDAG	Danker, Frederick W., Walter Bauer, William F. Arndt, and F. Wilbur
	Gingrich. Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament and Other Early
	Christian Literature. 3rd ed. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2000
BECNT	Baker Exegetical Commentary on the New Testament
BETL	Bibliotheca Ephemeridum Theologicarum Lovaniensium
BEvT	Beiträge zur evangelischen Theologie
BHGNT	Baylor Handbook on the Greek New Testament
Bib	Biblica
BibInt	Biblical Interpretation
BIS	Biblical Interpretation Series
BJS	Brown Judaic Studies
BNTC	Black's New Testament Commentaries
BRLA	Brill Reference Library of Judaism
BSac	Bibliotheca Sacra
BTB	Biblical Theology Bulletin
BZ	Biblische Zeitschrift
BZAW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die alttestamentliche Wissenschaft
BZNW	Beihefte zur Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft
CBQ	Catholic Biblical Quarterly
CBR	Currents in Biblical Research
CEJL	Commentaries on Early Jewish Literature
CIL	Corpus Inscriptionum Latinarum. Berlin, 1862–
CNT	Commentaire du Nouveau Testament

ConBNT	Coniectanea Neotestamentica
CP	Classical Philology
CRINT	Compendia Rerum Iudaicarum ad Novum Testamentum
DCLY	Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Yearbook
DCLS	Deuterocanonical and Cognate Literature Studies
DHAsup	Dialogues d'histoire ancienne supplément
Did	Didaskalia
DSD	Dead Sea Discoveries
EC	Early Christianity
EKKNT	Evangelischer-katholischer Kommentar zum Neuen Testament
EvT	Evangelische Theologie
ExAud	Ex Auditu
FAT	Forschungen zum Alten Testament
GNS	Good News Studies
GOTR	Greek Orthodox Theological Review
GRA	Greco-Roman Associations: Texts, Translations, and Commentary. II, North
	Coast of the Black Sea, Asia Minor. ed. Philip A. Harland. BZNW 204. Berlin:
	de Gruyter, 2014
GRBS	Greek, Roman, and Byzantine Studies
HBT	Horizons in Biblical Theology
Hesperia	Hesperia: The Journal of the American School of Classical Studies at Athens
HNT	Handbuch zum Neuen Testament
HR	History of Religions
HTA	Historisch Theologische Auslegung, Neues Testmanent
HTR	Harvard Theological Review
HTS	Harvard Theological Studies
IEJ	Israel Exploration Journal
IJRR	Interdisciplinary Journal of Research on Religion
Int	Interpretation
JAC	Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum
JAJ	Journal of Ancient Judaism
JBL	Journal of Biblical Literature
JECH	Journal of Early Christian History
JGRChJ	Journal of Greco-Roman Christianity and Judaism
JHS	Journal of Hellenic Studies
JJMJS	Journal of the Jesus Movement in Its Jewish Setting
JJS	Journal of Jewish Studies
JQR	Jewish Quarterly Review
JR	Journal of Religion
JRA	Journal of Roman Archaeology
JRASup	Journal of Roman Archaeology Supplementary Serie
JRCA	Journal of Religious Competition in Antiquity
JRS	Journal of Roman Studies
JSJ	Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Pe-
	riod
JSJSup	Supplements to the Journal for the Study of Judaism
JSNT	Journal for the Study of the New Testament
JSNTSup	Journal for the Study of the New Testament Supplement Series
JSOTSup	Journal for the Study of the Old Testament Supplement Series

Abbreviations

XII

JSP	Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha
JSPL	Journal for the Study of the I setuepigraphia Journal for the Study of Paul and His Letters
JSQ	Jewish Studies Quarterly
JTS	Journal of Theological Studies
KD	Kerygma und Dogma
KEK	Kritisch-exegetischer Kommentar über das Neue Testament
LCL	Loeb Classical Library
LCS	Library of Classical Studies
LibCL	Library of Classical Studies
LNTS	Library of New Testament Studies
LSJ	Liddell, Henry George, Robert Scott, Henry Stuart Jones. A Greek-English
	<i>Lexicon.</i> 9th ed. with revised supplement. Oxford: Clarendon, 1996
NCB	New Century Bible
NCBC	New Cambridge Bible Commentary
NEchtB	Neue Echter Bibel
Neot	Neotestamentica
NICNT	New International Commentary on the New Testament
NICOT	New International Commentary on the Old Testament
NIGTC	New International Greek Testament Commentary
NovT	Novum Testamentum
NovTSup	Supplements to Novum Testamentum
NTAbh	Neutestamentliche Abhandlungen
NTL	New Testament Library
NTOA	Novum Testamentum et Orbis Antiquus
NTR	New Testament Readings
NTS	New Testament Studies
NTTS	New Testament Tools and Studies
Numen	Numen: International Review for the History of Religions
ONTC	Osborne New Testament Commentaries
OTS	Old Testament Studies
PAAJR	Proceedings of the American Academy for Jewish Research
PNTC	Pillar New Testament Commentary
P. Oxy	The Oxyrhynchus Papyri
PRSt	Perspectives in Religious Studies
PTMS	Princeton Theological Monograph Series
RB	Revue biblique
ResQ	Restoration Quarterly
RGRW	Religions in the Graeco-Roman World
RRE	Religion in the Roman Empire
RVV	Religionsgeschichtliche Versuche und Vorarbeiten
SAPERE	Scripta Antiquitatis Posterioris ad Ethicam Religionemque pertinentia
SBLDS	Society of Biblical Literature Dissertation Series
SBLECL	Society of Biblical Literature Early Christianity and Its Literature
SBLSP	Society of Biblical Literature Seminar Papers
SBLSymS	Society of Biblical Literature Symposium Series
SBS	Stuttgarter Bibelstudien
SBT	Studies in Biblical Theology
SCJ	Studies in Christianity and Judaism
SEÅ	Svensk Exegetisk Årsbok

XIV	Abbreviations
SEG	Supplementum epigraphicum graecum
SHR	Studies in the History of Religions
SNTW	Studies of the New Testament and Its World
SNTSMS	Society for New Testament Studies Monograph Series
SP	Sacra Pagina
SPB	Studia Post-Biblica
SPhilo	Studia Philonica
SR	Studies in Religions
ST	Studia Theologica
STDJ	Studies on the Texts of the Desert of Judah
STRev	Sewanee Theological Review
SupVC	Supplements to Vigiliae Christianae
TANZ	Texte und Arbeiten zum neutestamentlichen Zeitalter
TAPA	Transactions of the American Philological Association
TBN	Themes in Biblical Narrative: Jewish and Christian Traditions
ThH	Théologie Historique
ThLZ	Theologische Literaturzeitung
THNZ	Theologischer Handkommentar zum Neuen Testament
TOTC	Tyndale Old Testament Commentaries
TrinJ	Trinity Journal
TSAJ	Texte und Studien zum antiken Judentum
TynBul	Tyndale Bulletin
VC	Vigiliae christianae
VT	Vetus Testamentum
VTSup	Supplements to Vetus Testamentum
WTJ	Westminster Theological Journal
WUNT	Wissenschaftliche Untersuchungen zum Neuen Testament
ZNW	Zeitschrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche

Chapter 1

1 Corinthians 8 and 10 and Paul's Relationship to Judaism

In 1 Cor 8:8 Paul writes to the Christ followers in Corinth: "Food will not bring us before God's judgement; we are neither worse off if we do not eat, nor are we better off if we eat."¹ This, and the general gist of 1 Corinthians 8, has led several interpreters to ask questions about the apostle's relationship to Judaism. Trent A. Rogers notes: "There is considerable debate in 1 Cor 8–10 whether Paul essentially reinforces Jewish teaching concerning idolatry or if he shapes early Christian teaching in a direction radically different than Judaism."² Many scholars opt for the latter alternative and claim that Paul had severed his ties to his native Judaism. Peter J. Tomson remarks on 1 Corinthians 8 and 10: "Our text serves as the *locus classicus* for the near-consensus in New Testament scholarship that Paul no longer attached positive significance to the commandments of his Jewish past."³

The reason why scholars argue that 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 are to be understood this way is that by allowing the Corinthian Christ followers to eat food offered to idols – $\epsilon i \delta \omega \lambda \delta \theta \upsilon \tau \circ \varsigma$ – Paul has taken a decisive step away from Judaism. In his commentary on 1 and 2 Corinthians, Ben Witherington makes the following statement: "[1 Corinthians] 8–10 make clear how *far from Judaism Paul had moved* on the matter of food."⁴ With reference to Paul's instruction that the Corinthians need not inquire about the origins of the food they buy at the market in 10:25, $\mu \eta \delta \epsilon \nu \, d\nu \alpha \varkappa \rho (\nu \upsilon \tau \epsilon \varsigma \, \delta i \dot{\alpha} \, \tau \dot{\eta} \nu \, \sigma \upsilon \varkappa \epsilon (\delta \eta \sigma \iota \nu, C. K. Barrett writes:$

It is clear that only by careful inquiry ($\dot{\alpha}\nu\dot{\alpha}\varkappa\rho\sigma\varsigma\varsigma$) could a Jew satisfy himself on these points [regarding the origins of the meat]; and a quick reading of *Abodah Zarah* suffices to show

¹ Unless otherwise noted all translation of New Testament texts are my own and based on NA28.

² Trent A. Rogers, *God and the Idols: Representations of God in 1 Corinthians 8–10*, WUNT II/427 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2016), 205.

³ Peter J. Tomson, *Paul and the Jewish Law: Halakha in the Letters of the Apostle to the Gentiles*, CRINT 3/1 (Assen/Maastricht: Van Gocrum; Minneapolis, Fortress, 1990), 187.

⁴ Ben Witherington, *Conflict and Community in Corinth: A Socio-Rhetorical Commentary on 1 and 2 Corinthians* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans; Carlisle, Paternoster Press, 1995), 199 (my emphasis).

Chapter 1

the repeated investigations διὰ τὴν συνείδησιν that were incumbent upon the devout Jew. Paul is nowhere more un-Jewish that in this μηδὲν ἀναχρίνοντες.⁵

In a similar fashion, Gordon Fee asserts Paul's supposed un-Jewishness. Commenting on 1 Cor 10:26, where Paul quotes Ps 23:1 LXX – "for the earth and everything that is in it belongs to the Lord" – in order to support his argument that the Corinthians need not ask about the origins of food, Fee argues: "[Paul's use of Ps 23:1 LXX] is *full of irony toward his Jewish heritage*.... Apart from Paul's radical statements on circumcision, it is hard to imagine anything more un-Jewish in the apostle than this."⁶ Witherington's, Barrett's, and Fee's reasoning seem to be supported by other ancient Jewish texts roughly contemporary with 1 Corinthians that deal with the eating of food that has come into contact with gentile cults and/or cultic objects.

To mention but a few examples, we clearly see how the rabbis who are recorded in the Mishnah strongly opposed the type of food Paul seemed so lax about. In *m. Avodah Zarah* 2.3, we read: "Meat which is being brought into an idol is permitted. But that which comes out is prohibited, because it is like sacrifices of the dead."⁷ In the Jewish work *Joseph and Aseneth*, Joseph refuses to kiss Aseneth due to the fact that her mouth has been in contact with food offered to idols.⁸ As he puts it in the narrative, he cannot kiss someone who "blesses dead and mute idols with her mouth and eats bread of strangling from

⁵ C. K. Barrett, "Things Sacrificed to Idols," NTS 11 (1965): 138-53, 146 (my emphasis).

⁶ Gordon D. Fee, The First Epistle to the Corinthians, rev. ed., NICNT (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2014), 532 (my emphasis). Fee's point is that, whereas Ps 24:1 (= 23:1 LXX) was used by the rabbis in order to bless their food, which was, in Fee's words, "thoroughly investigated" before it was eaten, Paul used the words from the Psalm to justify the eating of all kinds of food, "even those forbidden in his own Jewish heritage." There are a couple of problems with Fee's argument. First, Paul's statements on circumcision are neither radical nor un-Jewish - for a counterargument against the notion that Paul was against circumcision, see my "Are Circumcision and Foreskin Really Nothing? Re-Reading 1 Corinthians 7:19 and Galatians 5:6; 6:15," SEÅ 86 [2021]: 130-47; Ryan D. Collman, The Apostle to the Foreskin: Circumcision in the Letters of Paul, BZNW 259 (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2023). Second, the approach of Roy E. Ciampa and Brian S. Rosner (The First Letter to the Corinthians, PNTC [Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010], 489) is more historical: "Paul's citation of Psalm 24:1 is consistent with the prevalent Jewish understanding of its relevance for the way God's people approach the food that he graciously provides. Paul is thoroughly Jewish and biblical in his understanding that creation is good and that the food we receive has been provided for us by God and should be received with thanksgiving (cf. 1 Cor. 10:30) and with the understanding that food, like everything else in creation, exists to fulfill the purpose God has in mind for it, namely, his glory (cf. 1 Cor. 10:31)."

⁷ Translation from Jacob Neusner, *The Mishnah: A New Translation* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1988).

⁸ There has been debate regarding the question if this is a Jewish or Christian text. The majority view today is that it is a Jewish text. Cf. John J. Collins, "*Joseph and Aseneth*: Jewish or Christian?" *JSP* 14 (2005): 97–112.

their table and drinks from their cup of libation" (8.5).⁹ Indeed, Aseneth herself testifies to the defiling nature of food offered to idols in 11.9: "I ate from their sacrifices and my mouth has been defiled from their table."¹⁰ The *Didache*, a text written with both Jewish and gentile Christ followers in mind, instructs Christ followers that they "make certain to stay away from food offered to idols ($\epsilon i \delta \omega \lambda \delta \theta \nu \tau \sigma \varsigma$); for it is the worship of dead gods."¹¹

Two additional examples will further demonstrate how inconceivable it was to some Jews in Paul's time to eat food offered to idols. The author(s) of the Community Rule from Qumran does not only forbid members of eating food offered to idols, but prohibits any member of the community to "eat of *any* of their possessions, or drink or accept anything from their hands" (1QS 5.16).¹² According to Josephus, every member of the community strictly followed this rule – even those who the community expelled:

Those they have convicted of sufficiently serious errors they expel from the order. And the one who has been reckoned out often perishes by a most pitiablefate. For, constrained by the oaths and customs, he is unable to partake of food from others. Eating grass and in hunger, his body wastes away and perishes.¹³

Our final example comes from the book of *Jubilees*. In a similar fashion to 1QS, *Jubilees* 22:16 instructs the Jewish reader to "separate from the nations,

¹¹ My translation, based on the Greek text from *The Apostolic Fathers: Greek Texts and English Translations*, 3rd ed., ed. and trans. Michael W. Holmes (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2007). Greek text: ἀπὸ δὲ τοῦ εἰδωλοθύτου λίαν πρόσεχε, λατρεία γάρ ἐστιν θεῶν νεκρῶν.

¹² Translation from Florentino García Martínez and Eibert J. C. Tigchelaar, eds., *The Dead Sea Scrolls: Study Edition*, 2 vols. (Leiden: Brill; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1997). The reference to "their" possessions, drink and anything from their hands seems to be a reference to everyone outside the Qumran community, not only gentiles. Cf. Alison Schofield, *From Qumran to the Yahad: A New Paradigm of the Textual Development for The Community Rule*, STDJ 77 (Leiden: Brill, 2009), 203.

¹³ The Jewish War 2.143. Translation from Steve Mason, Judean War 2, Flavius Josephus: Translation and Commentary 1B, (Leiden: Brill, 2008). In addition to the community's strict rules regarding what members were allowed to eat, the Damascus Document goes further and forbids members to "sell clean animals or birds, to the gentiles (לגוים) lest they sacrifice them" (CD^a 12.8–9; translation from García Martínez and Tigchelaar). For discussions on the Qumran community, and especially the Essene-Qumran hypothesis, see Sidnie White Crawford, *Scribes and Scrolls at Qumran* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2019), 269–308; John J. Collins, *Beyond the Qumran Community: The Sectarian Movement of the Dead Sea Scrolls* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2010).

⁹ My translation, based on the Greek text from Eckhart Reinmuth, ed., Joseph and Aseneth, SAPERE 15 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2009). Greek text: ήτις εὐλογεῖ τῷ στόματι αὐτῆς εἴδωλα νεκρὰ καὶ κωφὰ καὶ ἐσθίει ἐκ τῆς τραπέζης αὐτῶν ἄρτον ἀγχόνης καὶ πίνει ἐκ τῆς σπονδῆς αὐτῶν ποτήριον.

¹⁰ My translation. Greek text: καὶ ἔφαγον ἐκ τ<ῶν> θυσι<ῶν> αὐτῶν καὶ τὸ στόμα μου μεμίαται ἐκ τῆς τραπέζης αὐτῶν.

Chapter 1

and do not eat with them."¹⁴ The issue here, as in 1QS, is not only that Jews should stay away from food offered to idols, but from all food connected with gentiles.

When we read Paul's seemingly lax statement about eating food connected to gentile cults in 1 Cor 8:8 alongside these texts, it appears as though Witherington, Barrett, Fee, and other like-minded scholars are correct in their remarks on how far Paul has moved away from Judaism.¹⁵ This provides a serious challenge to one of the more recent developments in Pauline studies: the Paul within Judaism school.¹⁶ In short, scholars in the Paul within Judaism school argue that Paul never left Judaism or his Jewish way of life; rather, the apostle remained a faithful Jew. Moreover, he never saw the Jewish law as invalid *per se* – it just did not apply to *gentile* Christ followers – and he still regarded Judaism as something positive and drew on his Jewish heritage when instructing gentile Christ followers with regards to how their life in the Jesus movement should look.¹⁷ This school has made several contributions to the re-

¹⁶ Even though the Paul within Judaism school has in many ways gone beyond the conclusions of E. P. Sanders' magisterial work *Paul and Palestinian Judaism* published in 1977, and indeed has criticized some of Sanders' conclusions, this work remains the foundation that set off the Paul within Judaism school.

¹⁷ For a selection of the key works produced by the Paul within Judaism school (and readings adjacent to it) see: Mark D. Nanos and Magnus Zetterholm, eds., *Paul within Judaism: Restoring the First-Century Context to the Apostle*, (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2015); Gabriele

¹⁴ Translation from James C. VanderKam, *Jubilees: The Hermeneia Translation* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2020).

¹⁵ The idea that Paul left Judaism for something else (which scholarship up to recently labelled "Christianity") has been around almost since the time of Paul himself and can be found in the New Testament. The author of Acts describes how some are spreading a rumour about Paul and that he is teaching Jews to abandon the law of Moses: "And they have heard that you teach all Jews who are living among gentiles to defect from Moses, saying that they should not circumcise their children, not live according to the customs" (Acts 21:21). The elder of the ekklēsia in Jerusalem tells Paul to prove this rumour to be false by purifying himself along with other four men, in order to show his faithfulness to the Jewish law. This Paul agrees to do. Later, in Acts 25:8 (cf. 28:17), Paul is brought before Festus in Caesarea and some Jews from Jerusalem starts accusing him. Paul answers by saying that he has done nothing wrong against the law of the Jews (τὸν νόμον τῶν Ἰουδαίων), the temple, or Caesar. These two reports in Acts show that there were from an early stage in the Jesus movement those who clearly thought Paul had acted in violation with the Jewish law an encouraged other Jews to do the same. However, it is also evident that this is not the picture the author of Acts agrees with, since he clearly rejects the rumours in Acts 21 and portrays Paul's defence in 25:8 as something that represents the "true Paul." According to Acts, Paul lives according to the law (cf. 21:24b). Cf. Karin Hedner Zetterholm, Jewish Interpretation of the Bible: Ancient and Contemporary (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2012), 131; Matthew Thiessen, Contesting Conversion: Genealogy, Circumcision, & Identity in Ancient Judaism & Christianity, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 119-20; Joseph B. Tyson, Marcion and Luke-Acts: A Defining Struggle (Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2006), 75.

Boccaccini and Carlos A. Segovia, eds., Paul the Jew: Rereading the Apostle as a Figure of Second Temple Judaism (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2016); Rafael Rodríguez and Matthew Thiessen, eds., The So-Called Jew in Paul's Letter to the Romans (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2016); Mark D. Nanos, The Irony of Galatians: Paul's Letter in First-Century Context (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2002); idem, The Mystery of Romans: The Jewish Context of Paul's Letter (Minneapolis: Fortress, 1996); idem, "Paul's Non-Jews Do Not Become 'Jews,' but Do They Become 'Jewish'?: Reading Romans 2:25-29 within Judaism, Alongside Josephus," JJMJS 1 (2014): 26-53; idem, "Callused,' Not 'Hardened': Paul's Revelation of Temporary Protection until All Israel Can Be Healed," in Reading Paul in Context: Explorations in Identity Formation: Essays in Honour of William S. Campbell, ed. Kathy Ehrensperger and J. Brian Tucker, LNTS 248 (London: T&T Clark, 2010), 52-73; idem, Reading Paul within Judaism (Eugene: Cascade: 2017); Paula Fredriksen, "Judaism, the Circumcision of Gentiles, and Apocalyptic Hope: Another Look at Galatians 1 and 2," in The Galatians Debate: Contemporary Issues in Rhetorical and Historical Interpretation, ed. Mark D. Nanos (Peabody: Hendrickson, 2002), 235-60; eadem, "Judaizing the Nations: The Ritual Demands of Paul's Gospel," NTS 56 (2010): 232-52; eadem, "The Question of Worship: Gods, Pagans, and the Redemption of Israel," in Paul within Judaism: Restoring the First-Century Context to the Apostle, ed. Mark D. Nanos and Magnus Zetterholm (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2015), 175-201; eadem, Paul: The Pagans' Apostle (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2017); Matthew Thiessen, "Paul's Argument against Gentile Circumcision in Romans 2:17-29," NovT 56 (2014): 373-91; idem, Paul and the Gentile Problem (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016); idem, "Paul, the Animal Apocalypse, and Abraham's Gentile Seed," in The Ways that Often Parted: Essays in Honor of Joel Marcus, ed. Lori Baron, Jill Hicks-Keeton, and Matthew Thiessen, SBLECL 24 (Atlanta: SBL Press, 2018), 65-78; Caroline Johnson Hodge, "Olive Trees and Ethnicities: Judeans and Gentiles in Rom. 11:17-24," in Christians as a Religious Minority in a Multicultural City: Modes of Interaction and Identity Formation in Early Imperial Rome, ed. Jürgen Zangenberg and Michael Labahn, JSNTSup 243 (London: T&T Clark International, 2004), 77-89; eadem, If Sons, then Heirs: A Study of Kinship and Ethnicity in the Letters of Paul (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007); Pamela Eisenbaum, Paul Was not a Christian: The Original Message of a Misunderstood Apostle (New York: HarperOne, 2009); Anders Runesson, "Placing Paul: Institutional Structures and Theological Strategy in the World of the Early Christ-Believers," SEÅ 80 (2015): 43-67; idem, "Particularistic Judaism and Universalistic Christianity? Some Critical Remarks on Terminology and Theology," JGRChJ 1 (2000): 120-44; Rafael Rodríguez, If You Call Yourself a Jew: Reappraising Paul's Letter to the Romans (Eugene: Cascade, 2014); Matthew V. Novenson, "The Jewish Messiahs, the Pauline Christ, and the Gentile Question," JBL 128 (2009): 357-373; idem, "Paul's Former Occupation in Ioudaismos," in Galatians and Christian Theology: Justification, the Gospels, and Ethics in Paul's Letters, ed. Mark W. Elliot et al (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2014), 24-39; Kathy Ehrensperger, "Called to be Saints'-The Identity-Shaping Dimension of Paul's Priestly Discourse in Romans," in Reading Paul in Context: Explorations in Identity Formation: Essays in Honour of William S. Campbell, ed. Kathy Ehrensperger and J. Brian Tucker, LNTS 248 (London: T&T Clark, 2010), 90-109; eadem, "The Question(s) of Gender: Relocating Paul in Relation to Judaism," in Paul within Judaism: Restoring the First-Century Context to the Apostle, ed. Mark D. Nanos and Magnus Zetterholm (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2015), 245-76; eadem, Searching Paul: Conversations with the Jewish Apostle to the Nations, WUNT 429 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2019); William S. Campbell, Paul and the Creation of Christian Identity (London: T&T Clark, 2008); idem, "Reading Paul in Relation to Judaism: Comparison or Contrast?" in Earliest Christianity within the Boundaries of Judaism: Essays in Honor of Bruce Chilton, ed. Alan

reading of Pauline texts which non-Paul within Judaism scholars often have regarded as decisive texts in their argument that Paul abandoned his native Judaism. Despite this, the Paul within Judaism school has given little attention to 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 and the challenge it provides to the Paul within Judaism school.¹⁸ This lacuna in the Paul within Judaism reading of Paul is somewhat strange, since, as Peter S. Zaas points out: "Paul's treatment of the question of whether or not the Corinthians brethren are free to eat meat originating from pagan sacrifices ... is perhaps the most crucial case in point for understanding Paul's need to promote his audience's observance of the halakhic requirements for Gentiles."¹⁹ The question is, then, do 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 provide a challenge to the Paul within Judaism school that bares its Achilles heel? Or, can we read Paul's instructions in these two chapters of 1 Corinthians as something that belongs within Judaism? In contrast to Witherington, Barrett, and Fee, I think we can.

The way forward, I propose, lies in understanding the background and demography of the ancient city of Corinth, the Corinthian *ekklēsia*, and a nuanced understanding of animal sacrifice in Greek and Roman antiquity – and how these rituals affect our reading of what Paul says in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10. By paying close attention to these three things, we can (1) solve what has long been a quagmire in Pauline studies, namely the supposed contradictions

¹⁸ Even though Romans and Galatians often are the focus of the Paul within Judaism school, scholars have dealt with parts of 1 Corinthians as well, see David Rudolph, A Jew to the Jews: Jewish Contours of Pauline Flexibility in 1 Corinthians 9:19-23, 2nd ed. (Eugene: Pickwick Publications, 2016); Mark D. Nanos, "Paul's Relationship to Torah in Light of His Strategy 'to Become Everything to Everyone' (1 Corinthians 9.19-23)," in Paul and Judaism: Crosscurrents in Pauline Exegesis and the Study of Jewish-Christian Relations, ed. Reimund Bieringer and Didier Pollefeyt, LNTS 463 (London: T&T Clark, 2012), 106-40; Caroline Johnson Hodge, "Married to an Unbeliever: Households, Hierarchies, and Holiness in 1 Corinthians 7:12-16," HTR (2010): 1-25; eadem, "'Mixed Marriage' in Early Christianity: Trajectories from Corinth," in Corinth in Contrast: Studies in Inequality, ed. Steven J. Friesen, Sarah A. James, and Daniel N. Scholwalter, NovTSup 155 (Leiden: Brill, 2014), 227-44; Anders Runesson, "Paul's Rule in All the Ekklesiai," in Introduction to Messianic Judaism: Its Ecclesiastical Context and Biblical Foundations, ed. David Rudolph and Joel Willitts (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2013), 214–23. There are, however, to my knowledge only a handful of contributions to the reading of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10, see chapters one and two in Mark D. Nanos, Reading Corinthians and Philippians within Judaism (Eugene: Wipf & Stock, 2017); Kathy Ehrensperger, "To Eat or Not to Eat - Is this the Question? Table Disputes in Corinth," in Decisive Meals: Table Politics in Biblical Literature, ed. Nathan MacDonald, Luzia Sutter Rehman, and Kathy Ehrensperger, LNTS 449 (London: T&T Clark, 2012), 114-33.

¹⁹ Peter S. Zaas, "Paul and the Halakhah: Dietary Laws for Gentiles in 1 Corinthians 8–10," in *Jewish Law Association Studies VII: The Paris Conference Volume*, ed. S. M. Passamaneck and M. Finley (Atlanta: Scholars, 1994), 233–45, 236.

J. Avery-Peck, Craig A. Evans, Jacob Neusner, BRLA 49 (Leiden: Brill, 2016), 120–50; *idem*, *The Nations in the Divine Economy: Paul's Covenantal Hermeneutics and Participation in Christ* (Lanham: Lexington Books, 2018).

between 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 – see below – and (2) read the apostle's instructions as something that belongs within Judaism and the ongoing debate on how to be faithful to the god of Israel when living in a city dominated by gentile norms, customs, and cults.

I argue that Paul was engaged in something many Jews were at the time, namely the question of how to relate to and fit into a mainly gentile society and not becoming socially ostracised. Furthermore, most likely Paul does not address Jewish Christ followers in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10, but gentile ones (cf. 1 Cor 8:7), and he does not apply Jewish dietary laws, or other Jewish laws as seen in 1 Cor 7:18, to them. As Zaas notes: "[Paul's] apostolic vocation forced him to wrestle with the question of the application of the halakhah to the community life of non-Jews."20 Consequently, 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 say nothing about Paul's understanding of Jewish food laws as they apply to those they were intended for, i.e., himself and other Jews. In addition, there was no one view of food in the Judaism of Paul's time, and there existed many approaches to what Jews could eat and with whom they could eat.²¹ As Karin Hedner Zetterholm points out: "Far from declaring Jewish law null and void, Paul is engaged either in establishing a halakah concerning idol food for Jesus-oriented gentiles, or teaching them an existing local Corinthian Jewish halakah."22 Hence, my view is that Paul is trying to navigate the gentile Christ followers' status as exclusively committed to the god of Israel and to the Jewish Jesus movement on the one hand, and that he is trying to give them instructions that will allow them to continue their daily life in Corinth with as little disruption as possible on the other. Therefore, Paul has two interests in mind: the Jewish requirements of the Jesus movement and the demands that came with living in a predominantly gentile society.

²⁰ Zaas, "Paul and the Halakhah," 233.

²¹ On Jewish flexibility with regards to Torah, see Anders Runesson, "Entering a Synagogue with Paul: First-Century Torah Observance," in *Torah Ethics and Early Christian Identity*, ed. David Miller and Susan Wendell (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2016), 11–26. With regards to food in particular, see E. P. Sanders, *Judaism: Practice & Belief 63 BCE – 66 CE* (London: SCM Press; Philadelphia: Trinity Press International, 1992), 216; *idem, Jewish Law from Jesus to the Mishnah: Five Studies* (London: SCM; Philadelphia: Trinity Press International, 1990), 281; David Rudolph, "Paul and the Food Laws: A Reassessment of Romans 14:14, 20," in *Paul the Jew: Rereading the Apostle as a Figure of Second Temple Judaism*, ed. Gabriele Boccaccini and Carlos A. Segovia (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2016), 151–81.

²² Karin Hedner Zetterholm, "The Question of Assumptions: Torah Observance in the First Century," in *Paul within Judaism: Restoring the First-Century Context to the Apostle*, ed. Mark D. Nanos and Magnus Zetterholm (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2015), 79–103, 99 (emphasis original). Hedner Zetterholm (*ibid*, 96) even notes that Paul's type of reasoning in 1 Corinthians 8 "bears resemblance to the rabbinic idea of *mar'it 'ain*, the principle according to which one must refrain from acts that are permitted but inappropriate because they may lead a less knowledgeable Jew to draw false conclusions and cause him or her to do something that is not permitted."

Chapter 1

Paul was not the only Jew in antiquity that tried to balance these two interests, and to argue that he has left his Jewish way of life behind because he allows his Christ followers to eat food offered to idols is, I think, unwarranted.²³ In addition, if we take into account that Paul is most likely addressing *gentile* Christ followers in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 – something I argue in chapter four – it is even more problematic to say that Paul had abandoned his Jewish way of life or Judaism as a whole.²⁴ Rather, Paul's instructions were part of a *Jewish* discussion: "From a Jewish-legal point of view, Paul's position is highly intelligible, and it is consistent with both contemporary and subsequent Jewish attitudes toward Gentile observance of the halakhah."²⁵

1.1 The Interpretative Crux of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10

Virtually all literature on 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 recognise that there are tensions between these two chapters.²⁶ The primary source for these tensions, as

²³ Alex T. Cheung (*Idol Food in Corinth: Jewish Background and Pauline Legacy*, JSNTSup 176 [Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999], 154) points out that, "it is not at all clear that the scrupulous inquiry about food, supposedly encumbering upon devote Jews, was something prevalent in first-century Diaspora Judaism, or became only the stance of the most zealous Rabbis after the two revolts. Paul's advice might be no more liberal than that of many Diaspora Jews of his time who wished to maintain their participation in the wider community."

²⁴ As Ehrensperger ("Called to be Saints'," 106) notes: "That 'the earth is the Lord's and all that is in it' (Ps. 25.1) is not questioned in any way by the setting of the laws that regulate which parts of God's creation are at the disposition of the people of Israel. The impure animals are impure for the covenant people, as is emphasized in an almost mantra-like manner in Leviticus 11: 'it is unclean/impure for you (11.4, 5, 6, 7); 'they are unclean for you' (11.8); 'they are untouchable for you' (11.10–11, 12, 23) etc. As with other purity regulations, these apply to the covenant partner Israel and not to the nations. Gentiles are not required to keep purity laws, particularly not (all of) those that are related to ritual impurity, as these are only relevant for Jews in their relationship with God."

²⁵ Zaas, "Paul and the Halakhah," 237.

²⁶ 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 have been the focus of a number of studies. The more significant works on these two chapters in 1 Corinthians include, Gerd Theissen, "Die Starken und Schwachen in Korinth: Soziologische Analyse eines theologischen Streites," EvT 35 (1975): 155–72; Hans-Josef Klauck, Herrenmahl und hellenistischer Kult: Eine religionsgeschichtliche Untersuchung zum ersten Korintherbrief, NTAbh 15 (Münster Westfalen: Aschendorff, 1982); Wendell Lee Willis, Idol Meat in Corinth: The Pauline Argument in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10, SBLDS 68 (Chico: Scholars, 1985; repr. Eugene: Wipf & Stock, 2004); Herman Probst, Paulus und der Brief: Die Rhetorik des antiken Briefes als Form der paulinischen Korintherkorrespondenz (1 Kor 8–10), WUNT II/45 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1991); Margaret M. Mitchell, Paul and the Rhetoric of Reconciliation: An Exegetical Investigation of the Language and Composition of 1 Corinthians 8–10 in Its Context, SCJ 5 (Waterloo, ON: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1993); Paul D. Gardner, The Gifts of God and the Authentication of a Christian: An Exegetical Study of 1

most scholars perceive it, is that Paul allows, albeit reluctantly, the Corinthian Christ followers to eat "food offered to idols" (είδωλόθυτος) in 1 Corinthians 8. Two chapters later, however, he strictly forbids the Christ followers to eat it this time expressed as drinking the cup of daimonia and partaking of the table of daimonia (1 Cor 10:21). Because of the contrasts between 1 Corinthians 8 and 10, and due to this supposed contradiction in Paul's instructions, scholars have offered a plethora of solutions.²⁷ I put forth a reading of Paul's instructions in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 that seeks to resolve any tensions between the two chapters. Moreover, I argue that when we pay close attention to the historical context the Corinthian Christ followers would have found themselves in, the tensions others have found are in fact not there. Paul's instructions are both consistent and coherent. Here, I present a brief outline below of the various views scholars have of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10, and then offer a concise sketch of how my proposed reading both resolves many of the tensions others have perceived and differs from the majority of scholarship on 1 Corinthians 8 and 10.

Gregory W. Dawes perfectly catches the conundrum that faces the interpreter of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10:

Corinthians 8–11:1 (Lanham: University Press of America, 1994); Christoph Heil, Die Ablehnung der Speisegebote durch Paulus: Zur Frage nach der Stellung des Apostels zum Gesetz, BBB 96 (Weinheim: Beltz Athenäum, 1994); Derek Newton, Deity and Diet: The Dilemma of Sacrificial Food at Corinth, JSNTSup 169 (Sheffield: Sheffield Academic Press, 1998); Cheung, Idol Food in Corinth; John Fotopoulos, Food Offered to Idols in Roman Corinth: A Social-Rhetorical Reconsideration of 1 Corinthians 8:1–11:1, WUNT II/151 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2003); Richard Lion-Seng Phua, Idolatry and Authority: A Study of 1 Corinthians 8.1–11.1 in the Light of Jewish Diaspora, LNTS 299 (London: T&T Clark, 2005); Rogers, God and the Idols.

There are also several studies that look into the rhetorical structure of 1 Corinthians, including chapters 8 and 10. Since my focus is on the historical situation and the practice of eating food offered to idols and the Greek and Roman practices of animal sacrifice, and how those practices can inform our reading of 1 Corinthians 8 and 10, I do not engage with the rhetorical structure of the letter. Some of the more important works on this topic include, Wilhelm Wuellner, "Greek Rhetoric and Pauline Argumentation," in Early Christian Literature and the Classical Intellectual Tradition: In Honorem Robert M. Grant, ed. William R. Schoedel and Robert L. Wilken, ThH 53 (Paris: Éditions Beauchesne, 1979), 177-88; Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, "Rhetorical situation and Historical Reconstruction in 1 Corinthians," NTS 33 (1987): 386-403; John Fotopoulos, "The Rhetorical Situation, Arrangement, and Argumentation of 1 Corinthians 8:1-13: Insights into Paul's Instructions of Idol-Food in Greco-Roman Context," GOTR 47 (2002): 165-98; idem, "Arguments Concerning Food Offered to Idols: Corinthian Quotations and Pauline Refutations in a Rhetorical 'Partitio' (1 Corinthians 8:1-9)," CBQ 67 (2005): 611-31; Mitchell, Paul and the Rhetoric of Reconciliation; Probst, Paulus und der Brief. Joop F. M. Smit, "The Rhetorical Disposition of First Corinthians 8:7-9:27," CBQ 59 (1997): 476-91.

²⁷ I will explore these under the next heading.

For many years chaps. 8 and 10 of 1 Corinthians have posed difficulties for interpreters. The principal difficulty has been that of finding a consistent teaching on the issue of 'food offered to idols' (8:1). At first sight, 1 Cor 8:7–13 would seem to imply that the eating of food offered to idols is itself a morally neutral act which should be avoided only because of the effect it may have on others. This position seems to be repeated in 10:23–11:1. Yet chap. 10 also contains a passionate denunciation of idolatry, and 10:14–22 suggests that eating food offered to idols is quite simply unacceptable.²⁸

Hence, the tension that arises from the contrast in Paul's instructions in 1 Corinthians 8, and what he later writes in chapter 10, is the key in why these two chapters have presented scholars with an interpretative dilemma. The most common solutions are as follows.

Johannes Weiss proposed one solution to the tensions between 1 Corinthians 8 and 10 in the early 1900s.²⁹ He suggested that the two chapters came from two different letters and that someone other than Paul joined together these two letters, which in turn led to the appearance that the apostle contradicts himself.³⁰ The predominant reason as to why some have suggested that 1 Cor 8:1–11:1 is made up of more than one letter is the disruptive nature of $10:1-22.^{31}$ Indeed, for Weiss the crux lay in Paul's severe tone in 10:1-22 and the more lax, allowing tone in chapter 8 and $10:23-11:1.^{32}$ Even though the suggestion that 1 Cor 8:1–11:1 consists of more than one letter would provide us with a neat solution to the problem, scholars have, by and large, abandoned this suggestion and now view 1 Cor 8:1–11:1 as one, integral, and cohesive unit, and that these chapters of 1 Corinthians were meant to be read as such in its original

²⁸ Gregory W. Dawes, "The Danger of Idolatry: First Corinthians 8:7–13," CBQ 58 (1996): 82–98, 82.

²⁹ Johannes Weiss, *Der erste Korintherbrief*, KEK 5 (Göttinen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1910). Several scholars have followed Weiss, see, *inter alia*, Wolfgang Schenk, "Der 1. Korintherbrief als Briefsammlung," *ZNW* 60 (1969): 219–63; Robert Jewett, *Paul's Anthropological Terms: A Study of Their Use in Conflict Settings*, AGJU 10 (Leiden: Brill, 1971), 23–27; Walter Schmitals, "Die Korintherbriefe als Briefsammlung," *ZNW* 64 (1973): 263–88; L. L. Welborn, *An End to Enmity: Paul and the "Wrongdoer" of Second Corinthians* (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2011), 400; Khiok-Khng Yeo, *Rhetorical Interaction in 1 Corinthians 8 and 10: A Formal Analysis with Preliminary Suggestions for a Chinese, Cross-Cultural Hermeneutic*, BIS 9 (Leiden: Brill, 1995).

³⁰ Cf. David R. Hall (*The Unity of the Corinthian Correspondence*, JSNTSup 251 [London: T&T Clark, 2003], 46): "It is often asserted that 8.1–13 and 10.1–22 must belong to different letters because they present two inconsistent points of view."

³¹ Cf. Barrett, "Things Sacrificed to Idols," 149.

³² Weiss, Der erste Korintherbrief, 212.

Index of References

Old Testament

Genesis		21:25	204
6:5	231		
		Psalms	
Exodus		23:1 LXX	2,255
6:7	95	77:58 LXX	252
15:11	146	81:1 LXX	146
22:28	146	82:1	146
32	212, 221	95:5 LXX	150, 231
32:6	226	97:7	150
		134:15-17 LXX	200
Leviticus		134:17 LXX	201
1:1-17	95	135:15-17	200
10:12-15	222		
17-18	203	Isaiah	
19:14	155	13:10	202
		13:17-18	202
Numbers		14:29	202
18:4-7	248	15:17	202
25:1-2	204	44:9-20	201-202
31:16	204	44:15-17	201
		65	247
Deuteronomy		65:3-4	248
6:4–5	149	65:3	248
6:4	149	65:11	248
12:2–3	178		
13:12-17	178	Jeremiah	
13:18	175	10:14	201
17:7	163	51:17	201
32	253		
32:8	149	Ezekiel	
32:17	226–227, 252	40:46	248
32:21	252	41:22	248
32:38	253	44	248
		44:15-16	248-249
1 Kings		44:16	248
16:31	204		

Daniel		Habakkuk	
3	153	2:19	201
6	153		
		Malachi	
		1:7	249
		1:12	249

324

Deuterocanonical Works

1 Maccabees		4 Maccabees	
1:15	52	5:2	205
1:47	156		
5:68	178	Wisdom of Solomo	n
10:83	156	13–15	201-203
2 Maccabees		Sirach	
6:18-7:42	153	32:23	52
6:18-31	153		

New Testament

Matthew		3:6	159
2:13	159	3:22-29	239
5:29	159	3:22	239
8:25	159	5:1-20	238
9:10-11	197	5:29	157
10:28	159	7:37	157
10:35-36	187	14	213
11:19	197	14:3	157
12:14	159	14:24	247
12:24	239	15:26	185
12:26-27	239		
16:25	159	Luke	
18:14	159	4:33	238
19:17-19	53	5:25	157
26	213	5:30	197
26:28	247	6:9	159
27:37	185	7:34	197
		9:25	159
Mark		11:14–20	239
1:30	157	11:15	239
2:4	157	11:51	159
2:15-16	197	12:52-53	187
2:15	157	13:3	159

15:4	159	2:12	159
19:6–7	197	2:22	199
22	213	3:1-2	52
22:20	246–247	3:24	159, 217
23:38	185	5:24 6:5–11	217
25.58	185	6:11	
I. I			159, 217
John 2.5	229	6:23	159, 217
3:5	238	8:1	159, 217
5:3	157	8:2	217
6	157	8:38	148, 241
6:39	159	8:39	217
7:20	238	9:4–5	52
8:48-49	238	11:25	213
8:52	238	12:16	213
10:10	159	13:1-7	185
10:20-21	238	14	138, 160
18:9	159	14:1-15:5	138
19:19	185	14:14	208
		14:15	158
Acts		14:21	160
2:9-11	51	15:17	217
5:37	159	15:26	215
9:33	157	16:1–2	55
15	203, 205	16:1	46
15:20	203	16:3-5	55
15:29	203, 205	16:3	217
17:17	240	16:4	46
17:18	240	16:5	45
18	42-43, 50-51	16:23	55, 57–58, 189
18:2	169	10.25	55,57 56,169
18:4	50-51	1 Corinthians	
18:7	43	1:2	20, 44, 46, 48, 159,
18:8	42-43	1.2	217, 265
18:11–12	42	1:4	159, 217
18:11-12	42	1:5–6	149
18:12	42	1:9	
19	170–171	1:10–13	215, 217 42, 152
			· ·
20:7	68 4	1:10	45, 49, 152, 265
21		1:11	55
21:21	4	1:13–16	48
21:24	4	1:14	42
21:25	203, 205	1:16	45
25:8	4	1:18	159
27:34	159	1:19	159
28:8	157	1:24	48
28:17	4	1:26	56, 58
		1:30	159, 217
Romans		2:1-5	43
1:18-32	50, 201–202	2:1	43

		•	
2:8	146, 241		209, 211–213, 219,
3:16	208		225–228, 242, 244–
4:9	148		245, 252, 254–255,
4:10	213		258, 261, 263–269
4:15	217	8-10	1, 6–11, 13–16, 79,
5:1–13	55	0 10	129, 186, 207
5:1-2	42	8:1-11:1	10–11, 13, 15, 156,
5:7	218		210, 212, 226, 261
5:9–13	163, 266	8:1-10:22	13
5:9–12	164, 186, 193	8:1-10:13	13
5:9-11	42	8:1-13	10, 13
5:9	41, 163	8:1-4	140, 143
5:10	163, 216	8:1-3	143
5:11	45, 197, 265	8:1	10, 43, 139, 140,
5:13	163		154, 158, 205
6	208	8:3	158
6:3	148, 241	8:4-6	147
6:6	45, 265	8:4	143, 147, 150, 154,
6:9	50		175, 198–200, 205,
6:11	50		212, 225–226
6:13	208	8:5-6	143, 146, 149–150
6:15	208	8:5	131, 143–144, 147–
6:15-19	42		148, 159
6:18	208	8:6	144, 147–149, 243
6:19	208	8:7-13	10, 48, 140, 152
7:1-16	58	8:7	7,16, 50, 138, 140,
7:1	41, 43, 139		142, 151–152, 159,
7:8	48		191, 197, 199, 205–
7:10-13	48		206, 208, 212, 255,
7:12-15	210		260-261
7:12	45, 265	8:8	1, 154, 206, 212,
7:13-14	186, 208		225, 252
7:15	45, 265	8:9-12	159
7:17–24	156, 193	8:9	154, 197, 204, 261
7:18-20	20	8:10	12, 14, 156–157,
7:18–19	53		205-206, 255
7:18	7, 48, 50–52, 54	8:11	45, 138, 141, 158–
7:19	52–53		160, 265
7:21-22	48, 58	8:12	206
7:22	52	8:13	45, 71, 79, 133,
7:25-40	139		135, 151, 155, 204,
7:25–38	56		211, 253, 260–261,
7:25	139		265
8	9, 13–15, 49, 137,	9	11, 155, 160, 206,
	141–142, 155–156,		261
	159–162, 164, 173–	9:9–13	155
	174, 177, 179, 185–	9:13	222–223
	188, 190–192, 194–	10-11	221
	195, 197–198, 205–		

Index of References

326

10	10, 13, 155–156,	10:21	9, 16, 103, 133,
	164, 173–174, 177,		146, 213, 218, 228,
	179, 205–206, 211–		230, 231, 242–245,
	212, 216, 226, 242,		247, 250-251, 258
	244, 254–255, 258,	10:22	212-213, 252
	263–269	10:23–11:1	10, 12, 260
10:1-22	10, 12–13, 141,	10:23-33	14, 137
10.1-22	211–212, 231	10:23-33	261
10.1 12			
10:1-13	54, 211–212	10:25-31	190
10:1-10	212	10:25–29	14, 207–208, 210–
10:1	53–54, 196		211, 264–265
10:7	13, 211–212, 221,	10:25–26	261
	226	10:25	1, 121, 206–208,
10:8	212		253–255
10:9	159, 212	10:26	2,255
10:10	159	10:27-30	261
10:13	212	10:27-28	71, 135
10:14-33	137, 210, 261	10:27	121, 156, 188, 207-
10:14-22	10, 12–16, 21, 137,		208, 210, 212, 255-
	143, 156, 164, 186,		256
	198, 207, 209–214,	10:28-29	261
	217-220, 222, 225-	10:28	206, 211
	228, 242–244, 249,	10:29-30	260–261
	254, 261–267		255
10.14	-	10:29	
10:14	13, 208, 211–214,	10:31-11:1	261
	231, 245, 251, 253,	10:31	261
	267	10:33–11:1	261
10:15	213	11	43, 49, 156, 206,
10:16-20	214		213, 218
10:16–18	213, 225	11:2-6	42
10:16-17	214, 217–219, 224–	11:6	46
	225	11:10	148
10:16	214–218, 221, 225,	11:17-34	59, 62–63
	242, 257	11:17-32	48
10:17	220	11:18-22	60
10:18	215-218, 221-225,	11:18	42, 46, 49, 64
	227, 242	11:20-34	19
10:19-22	153, 213, 224–225,	11:20	47, 265
	241–242	11:21-22	60
10:19	103, 198–200, 205,	11:21	60
10.17	212, 219, 225–227	11:22	47, 59–60, 64
10:20-22	13, 103, 225, 241 -	11:22–26	216, 218
10.20-22	242		- · · - ²
10.20 21		11:25	247
10:20-21	48, 219, 224, 230-	11:34	64
10.20	231, 252	12:1	139
10:20	133, 199, 212, 215–	12:2	48, 50, 159, 199,
	218, 218, 225–227,		201
	230–231, 242–245,	12:12–13	220
	251–252, 262	12:13	48–49, 52, 58, 220

12:17	208		
12:25	42, 49	Galatians	
12:27	220	1:8	146, 241–242
13:1	241	1:22	46
14:16-24	55	2:9	215
14:16	55	2:11-14	197
14:22-25	210	2:18	148
14:23-25	164, 187	2:20	220
14:23	47	3:19	148, 241
14:30	157	3:20	146
15	213	3:26-27	217
15:8	171	3:26	159
15:18	159	3:27-28	49, 220
15:24	146, 241	4:8-10	201
16:1-4	61	4:8	50, 146-147
16:1	46, 139	4:9	146-147, 242
16:2	65, 67, 69	4:14	146, 241–242
16:8–9	171	5:6	159, 217
16:8	42	6:11	163
16:9	45	6:16	53
16:15-16	57		
16:19	55	Ephesians	
16:21	11	4:4-6	148
2 Corinthians		Philippians	
1:1	20, 44, 265	1:1	159
2:1	41	1:5	215
2:3-4	41	2:1	215
2:14	131	3:4-5	52
2:15	159	3:10	215
4:3	159		
4:4	146–147	1 Thessalonians	
4:9	159	1:1	11, 46
6	164	1:9-10	198
6:14–16	164	1:9	43, 50, 198–199,
6:14	215	201	
6:16	164, 198–199	2:1-2	43
7:9–16	55	4:3-7	201
8:4	215	4:3-5	50
8:8-15	61	4:16	148
8:13-14	61		
9:1-15	61	2 Thessalonians	
9:13	215	2:10	159
11:4-5	55	3:6	163
11:19	213	3:14	163
11:14	146, 241–242		
11:23-33	170	1 Timothy	
12:7	241	4:1	239
13:13	215		

Philemon		2:11-17	162
2	45	4:3-5	162
6	215		
19	163	2 Peter	
21	163	3:9	159
Hebrews		Revelations	
6:4–6	160	1:10	68
		2:14	203, 205
James		2:20	203-205
1:11	159	9:20	199, 239, 242
2:19	239	12:17	53
		14:12	53
1 Peter		16:14	239
1:1	169	17	184
1:14–19	162	18:2	239

Old Testament Pseudepigrapha

1 Esdras			
2.7	156	Sibylline Oracles	
		3.19-34	201
Addition to Esther		3.545-555	201
14.17	258	3.586-590	201
		3.604-606	201
Bel and the Drago	n		
1-40	201	Testament of Dan	
		5.1	53
Joseph and Asenet	h		
8.5	3, 249–250	Testament of Job	
10.13	258	5.2	156
11.9	3, 249		
12.5	249	The Letter of Ariste	eas
21.14	249	134–139	201
Jubilees		The Letter of Jeren	ıiah
22.16	3	2–73	201
22.17	219		

Dead Sea Scrolls

1QS		CD^{a}	
5.16	3	12.8–9	3

Philo

168 235 1.276 235 179 235 2.25-44 234 Every Good Man Is Free On the Special Laws		
Every Good Man Is Free On the Special Laws		
Every Good Man Is Free On the Special Laws		
130 235 1.13–31 201		
1.131 223		
<i>On Drunkenness</i> 1.58.316 195		
6.20 195 1.221 223		
24.95 195 1.220–223 223		
2.165 150		
<i>On Providence</i> 2.255–256 201		
2.8 235 4.100–102 192		
On the Decalogue On the Virtues		
52-81 201 172 235		
On the Embassy to Gaius That the Worse Is Wont to Attack t	That the Worse Is Wont to Attack the	
349–367 127 Better		
65 235 46-47 235		
112 235		
280 162 The Eternity of the World		
281 50–51 47 235		
64 235		
On the Giants 76 235		
16 235–236		
Who Is the Heir to Divine Things?		
46 250		

Josephus

Against Apion		3.540	50
2.65	196	4.41	236
2.239-249	201		
2.281-284	192	Jewish Antiquities	
12.126	196	8.120	53
		12.241	52
The Jewish War		13.415-416	236
1.233	236	13.415	236
1.648-653	178	13.416	236
2.143	3	14.115	51
		14.291	236

Rabbinic Works

Mishnah Avodah Zara		4.4–5 4.4	255 175
1.7	177	4.8	258
2.3	2, 192, 204	5.5–9	258
3.1–3	174, 176, 178	5.5	193
3.1	175		
3.4	158, 177	Talmud	
3.6	174	Avodah Zarah	
4.3	177	5.5	255

Ancient Christian Works

Didache		14.2	153
6.2–3	205		
6.3	3, 203–205	Tertullian	
9.1–5	213	De Idolatria	
9.1–4	219	16	177
Martyrdom o	f Polycarp	The Epistle to	Diognetus
1.1	153	5.1-5	184
2.1	153		

Classical Works

Aelian		1.10-11	96
On the Characteris	tics of Animals		
11.17	251	Apollodorus	
		The Library	
Aeschylus		1.7.2	98
Prometheus Bound			
496-499	82	Apuleius	
		Metamorphoses	
Ammianus Marcell	inus	11.17	35
History			
24.6.17	113	Aristophanes	
		Birds	
Antiphon		518-519	103
First Tetralogy		1265	206

		On the Laws	
Peace		2.7.15–16	115
929–938	87	2.10.24	113
	87		117
1039-1040	82 246	2.11.26	110
1045-1095		2.12.29	
1053-1055	82	2.27	119
1191–1197	87	Tugoulan Diamutat	iona
Women at the The	amonhouia	Tusculan Disputat 3.22.53	26
Women at the The	-		20
37–38	127	Diodorus	- 4
A		The Library of His	
Aristotle		2.9.7	250
Politics	01	5.46.6-7	251
3.5.35–39	91	D' C '	
1		Dio Cassius	
Artemidorus		Roman History	12.4
Oneirocritica	11.6	47.18.3–19.3	124
2.33	116	51.20.7-8	124
		62.19	121
Aulus Gellius		Di ci	
Attic Nights		Dio Chrysostom	
16.13.9	49	The Third Discour	
_		97	86
Cato			
On Agriculture		Dionysus of Halic	
83	119	Roman Antiquities	
134	115	7.72.15	106
134.1–4	107	9	120
139	115		
141	115	Euripides	
		Ion	
Cicero		805	127
On Divination		1030-1034	246
1.1–2	112		
1.41.92	114	Suppliant Women	
1.52	113	28–29	127
2.15	113		
		Galen	
On the Nature of t		On the Properties	
1.2.3	115	3.6	110
1.17.45	182		
1.29.81	175	Heraclitus	
1.42.117	19	On the Universe	
2.3	115	126	200
2.8	108		
2.28.70	182	Herodotus	
2.28.71 - 72	19, 182	The Histories	
		1.132	80
		2.38-42	80

2 00		0.1	
3.99	80	Odes	
4.35	81	3.6	109
4.7	80		
4.60	80	Satires	
4.62-63	80	1.8.1-3	201
8.54	92	2.2.124	119
8.144	196		
01111		Juvenal	
		Satires	
TT		12.83–92	110
Herodas	22	12.83-92	119
Mimes	99		
		Lucian	
Hesiod		On Sacrifices	
Theogony		3	82
535-557	78	12	71
535-541	81	12-13	78
557	78		
	, 0	Prometheus	
Homer		19	82
		19	62
Hymn to Apollo	0.5		
480–501	95	The Double Indictn	
		2	97
Hymn to Demeter			
268–274	95	Toxaris, or Friends	hip
		25	246
Hymn to Hermes		28	246
94–137	84		
,,		Lucan	
Iliad		Civil War	
1	92	7.165–167	109
	92 94	/.103-10/	109
1.37-42		. .	
1.460-470	81	Livy	
6	76	History of Rome	
9	92	5.13.6	120
9.497-501	92	5.15	113
		5.52	115
Odyssey		10.39.2-4	182
1.22-25	80	22.1.17	115
3	76	23.36.10	113
3.430–463	78	29.10.6	115
3.456-460	81	36.35.12	115
3.459-463	102–103	39.16.8	108
12	92	39.16.9	108
18.151–152	246	41.14.7–9	113
		44.14.3	115
Horace			
Epodes		Macrobius	
2.61-66	119	Saturnalia	
		1.6.13	120

3.3.2	104	8.183 28.10	109 107
Menander			
Dyskolos		Pliny the Younger	
450-455	82	Letter to Trajan	
		10.33	167
Timon, or the Misa	nthrope	10.34	167-168
9	82	10.96	166-168
		10.97	166
Ovid			
Fasti		Plutarch	
1.337-338	104	Lives	
1.343–344	104	56	28
4.813-818	112		
		Moralia	
Pausanias		301	99
Description of Gre	PCP	729	206
1.24.2	82	12)	200
2.1.2	25–26	Porphyry	
2.3.6	36	On Abstinence from	n Killing Animals
2.3.7	38	2.24	116
2.4.5	135	2.34.1-2	81
2.35.8	132	2.34.4	81
7.27.10	132	2.36.3-4	81
9.40.11–12	251	2.30.3-4	01
9.40.11-12	231	Seneca	
Plato		Epistles	
Alcibiades		121.4	182
2.149–150	96	123.16	182
2.149-130	30	123.10	162
Euthyphro		Sophocles	
14–15	92	Ajax	
14-15	82,96	176–178	93
14	82, 90	1/0-1/8	95
Laws		Antigone	
4.716–717	96	1005–1011	81
4.716	93	1005-1011	01
5.738	93	Strabo	
7.800	96	Geography	
11.931	200	7.3.4	99
11.931	200	8.6.21	36
Danuhlia			
Republic	02	8.6.23	26, 29
2.364	92	Count on the second	
2.364–365	92	Suetonius	
Diana di Elita		Lives of the Caesars	
Pliny the Elder		4.32.3	112
Natural History	124	17	
2.93–94	124	Nero	102
7.60	110	16.2	183

		Tibullus	
Tiberius		Elegies	
26	127	1.3.34-35	119
		2.1.25-26	113
Vespasian			
23.4	127	Ulpian	
		Digest	
Tacitus		50.2.3.3	189
Annals			
11.15	108	Varro	
15.44	183	On Agriculture	
		2.1.20-21	109
Histories		2.5.10	109
5.5	183	2.5.10-11	109
Theophrastus		Virgil	
Characters		Aeneid	
16.1	181	1.723–740	119
10.1	101	1.725-740	119
Thucydides		Xenophon of Athens	
History of the P	eloponnesian War	Memorabilia	
2.38	92	2.3.11	90

Papyri

P. Oxy.	
1485	131
1755	155
2791	155

Inscriptions

AGRW		8.10516	124
91	150		
		GRA	
CIL		2.113	194
6.971	111		
6.9824	112	SEG	
6.32323.92-99	115	11.923	127
6.32323.105-106	115		

Index of Moderns Authors

Gill, David 83

Adams, Edward 46 Aldrete, Gregory S. 109, 111 Arzt-Grabner, Peter 187-188 Barclay, John M. G. 65 Barrett, C. K. 1, 145 Boccaccini, Gabriele 17 Bookidis, Nancy 38, 40, 131, 133 Borgen, Peder 231 Bremmer, Jan N. 98 Burkert, Walter 80 Cadbury, Henry J. 253 Cheung, Alex T. 8, 14, 140 Ciampa, Roy E. 2, 244 Concannon, Cavan 24-25, 28, 35, 43 Conzelmann, Hans 12, 65 Dawes, Gregory W. 9, 152 DeMaris, Richard 74, 130, 155 Detienne, Marcel 86 Ebel, Eva 65 Ehrensperger, Kathy 8, 191, 243 Ekroth, Gunnel 79, 86, 97 Evans, Craig A. 152 Fee, Gordon 2, 13, 141, 144, 244 Fishwick, Duncan 128 Fisk, Bruce N. 13 Fitzmyer, Joseph 52-53 Fredriksen, Paula 52, 188, 195, 228, 231 Friesen, Steven J. 59, 61 Galinsky, Karl 128 Garland, David E. 52 Garnsey, Peter 118

Grossmark, Tziona 175 Harland, Philip A. 44, 47 Hedner Zetterholm, Karin 7 Herz. Peter 125 Heyman, George 126 Horrell, David G. 157, 230 Hoskins Walbank, Mary 26-28, 39 James, Sarah 26-27 Jameson, Michael H. 97 John J. Pilch 139, 161 Keener, Craig S. 147 Kloppenborg, John S. 46, 48, 55, 57, 60-61, 63, 65, 207, 230 Lamoreaux, Jason T. 186, 197 Lampe, Peter 62-63, 242 Last, Richard 20, 55-56, 60, 66-69 Levine, Lee 178 Lindemann, Andreas 12 Mack, Burton L. 43 Malina, Bruce J. 139, 161 Martin, Dale B. 181, 232-233, 237, 242 McIntyre, Gwynaeth 123, 125 Millis, Benjamin W. 20, 28, 32-33 Murphy-O'Connor, Jerome 55-56 Naiden, Fredrik S. 76, 80, 87, 96 Nasrallah, Laura 29 Newton, Derek 14-15, 157, 223, 263 North, John A. 115 Novenson, Matthew V. 148 Ogereau, Julien M. 215-216

Patton, Kimberley C. 85 Petropoulou, Maria-Zoe 77, 223 Price, S. R. F. 126–127

Rajak, Tessa 188 Rives, James B. 100 Rogers, Trent A. 1 Rosivach, Vincent J. 89 Rosner, Brian S. 2, 244 Rudolph, David 152 Rüpke, Jörg 116–117, 180, 182

Sanders, E. P. 4, 224 Scheid, John 40, 117, 168 Schäfer, Peter 177 Smith, Stephen A. 180 Spawforth, Anthony 29

Theissen, Gerd 56, 62–63, 189–190 Thiessen, Matthew 53, 249 Thomas, Christine 36 Tomson, Peter J. 1, 142 Tucker, J. Brian 163 Ullucci, Daniel 91, 93, 168, 221, 227 Vearncombe, Erin K. 155 Warren, Meredith J. C. 85 Wasserman, Emma 200 Weiss, Daniel H. 173 Weiss, Johannes 10 Weissenrieder, Annette 134, 157 Williams, C. K. 37 Willis, Wendell Lee 14, 148, 229, 230 Witherington, Ben 1 Zaas, Peter S. 6–7

Zetterholm, Magnus 16

Öhler, Markus 60

Subject Index

altar 84-85, 87, 102, 107, 110, 114, 122, 134, 217, 221–223, 227, 245, 247 - 250ancient associations 56, 58, 63, 66, 68, 155, 167, 170, 194 angel 147-150, 232-236, 241 Asklepios 133-135 baptism 48-49, 52 Christ followers 1 - Corinthian 1, 9, 13, 15, 21, 42, 46-47, 80, 132-133, 144, 151, 161, 163, 198, 213, 217, 229 - gentile 4, 7, 16, 50, 53, 205 - Jewish 54, 191, 193-194, 205 circumcision 2, 51-53, 196 Corinth 7 - a Greek city 24-27, 31, 38, 48 - a Roman colony 24-29, 31, 48 - cults in 34 cult 18-19 cultic - associations 48, 59, 230 - elements 48 - participation 14-16, 21, 157 - rituals 49-50, 85, 98, 102-105, 107-108, 110–111, 113, 116, 119, 132, 173, 222, 231, 247, 256 cup of daimonia 9, 21-22, 133, 213, 230, 242, 244-245, 258, 261 daimonia 84, 150, 199, 213, 216-220, 224, 226–227, 229–237, 239–245, 248 Demeter and Kore 36-38, 131-133 dining 38, 40, 80, 86, 89-90, 98, 101-103, 105, 110, 117-122, 132-133,

155, 186–188, 191–193, 197–198, 222-223, 256-258 see also meal and banquet ekklēsia - Corinthian 20, 23, 41, 44, 46–49, 53– 55, 58-63, 69 epispasm 51 Erastos 55, 57-58, 189 exta 112-114 see also divination food offered to idols (είδωλόθυτος) 1, 3, 9,11, 13-16, 21, 137, 139-140, 151-152, 155, 158, 164, 198, 203, 207-208, 212, 225, 244, 259 freedmen 29-30, 40, 58 God of Israel 7, 173-174, 189, 199, 224, 241, 257 Greek -language 31-34 - cults 35-36 - rituals 35 - sanctuaries 36 halakah 7–8, 175, 192 historical-critical method 17-18 idol's temple (εἰδωλεῖον) 156-158, 186, 191, 206-207, 228 Imperial cult 39-40, 123-124, 125-130 impurity 8, 81, 116, 152, 174, 239 initiation rites 20 Israel of God 53 Jerusalem collection 60-62, 64, 68-69 Jesus Movement 4, 7, 182, 184, 186, 190, 199 see also Christ cult

Jewish food laws 7 Julius Caesar 19, 24, 39, 124 participation (κοινωνία) 197, 213-217, 220-222, 228, 243 Latin 31-34 lectisternium 119-120, 127 libation 84-85, 102, 245-247, 249-252, 256, 258-259 Lord's supper 48-49, 60, 62-64, 156, 213, 216, 218 see also communal meal *m. Avodah Zarah* 171–179, 188, 192 market 120-121, 168, 191, 240, 253-255, 261 meat 14, 79, 86-89, 97, 100-103, 118, 120-121, 133, 135, 151, 153, 160, 168, 222–224, 227, 251, 253–255, 261 membership fees 64–69 Mishnah 175, 179, 185, 192 monotheism 144-149 Paul within Judaism 4, 6, 16-17 Pliny the Younger 166-171, 180, 182-185 prayer 107 private sacrifices 119 public sacrifices 90-91, 99, 101-102, 106, 110, 118 purity 116, 152-153, 181, 192 Qumran 3, 194, 219 Rabbinic Judaism 172, 174, 179-180,

192

rabbis 172, 174-178, 255, 258 religion 18-19 Roman - cults 35-36 - gods 35 - rituals 35 sacrifice - animal 20, 75-76 - Greek 75, 78 sacrificial animals 87-89, 109-110, 120, 227 socio-economic status 54, 58-60, 62, 101, 190-191 holocaust sacrifice 76, 87, 92, 97, 224 inner organs (σπλάγχνα) 83-84, 102-103, 133, 153, 231, 246, 251 strong ekklēsia members 11-13, 140-141, 143 consciousness (συνείδησις) 12, 142, 158, 206, 259-260 superstitio 179-182, 185, 189 see also δεισιδαιμονία table of *daimonia* 9, 21–22, 103, 213, 230, 242, 244-245, 250, 252, 261 temple of Jerusalem 100, 162, 218, 222-225 Tertullian 177 θεοξένια ritual 76, 84, 97, 119 τραπεζώματα ritual 76, 83, 97 unclean spirits 232, 237-240 weak ekklēsia members 11-13, 140-141, 143, 189, 206 zooarchaeology 75, 87